ESTABLISHING A COMPUTER-BASED DATA SYSTEM FOR EARLY COMMUNICATION INTERVENTION IN SOUTH AFRICA

by

ALETTA MARGARETHA KRITZINGER

A Dissertation Submitted

in

Partial Fulfillment of the Requirements

for

the Degree of Doctor of Philosophy

in the

Department of Communication Pathology
Faculty of Humanities
University of Pretoria
Pretoria

October 2000

The financial assistance of the Centre for Science Development towards this research is hereby acknowledged. Opinions expressed in this thesis and conclusions arrived at, are those of the author and are not necessarily to be attributed to the Centre of Science Development.

This thesis is dedicated to the youngest children of South Africa ...

... our children, the most valuable citizens in any society and the greatest of our treasures

... we are all of us, as individuals, called upon to give direction and impetus to the changes that are vital to the future of our youth and our country

... our children are our nation's future

Nelson Mandela former President of South Africa

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

My sincere thanks to

Professor Brenda Louw, Department of Communication Pathology, University of Pretoria. It was a tremendous privilege to study with you— who started early communication intervention in South Africa. Thank you for your insight, guidance, encouragement, very hard work and high standards.

Professor Lou Rossetti, Director: Center of Communicative Disorders, University of Wisconsin, Oshkosh. My professional life has been tremendously enriched since I knew you. Thank you for your wisdom and guidance. It was a unique privilege to study with you.

Dr Bernard Nieuwoudt, thank you for the initial interest and enthusiasm for research which resulted in hard work, but a wonderful database. Without your creativity and expert knowledge there would never have been a CHRIB database.

Mrs Rina Owen, thank you for the hard work and very pleasant way in which you helped me to make sense of the volumes of data.

The 153 little subjects and their families who participated in the study. It was such a privilege to look through the window into your lives and learn so much. I will never forget that it is your lives that are stored in the database. May God bless you all.

My colleagues at the Department of Communication Pathology, University of Pretoria: Thank you so much for your concern and encouragement.

The final year students of 2000: Thank you for the stimulating early intervention planning and feedback sessions as well as the seminars. You were truly a remarkable class.

My dear family and friends: For your love, prayers and encouragement. May God bless you all.

Klippies, for your love, friendship, encouragement, fun and above all, for the wonderful enriching experience to be inspired by someone who is deeply committed and works tirelessly for the cause he believes in.

Marita, for your love, faith, understanding, laughter, warmth and your precious poems and messages sent e e cummings style by e-mail.

An African proverb says it takes a village to raise a child. My experience was the same. It took a support system to write a thesis.

ABSTRACT

TITLE Establishing a Computer-Based Data System for

Early Communication Intervention in South Africa

NAME Aletta Margaretha Kritzinger

PROMOTOR Prof B. Louw

CO-PROMOTOR Prof L. M. Rossetti

DEPARTMENT Communication Pathology

DEGREE D. Phil

Key words: Early communication intervention, early intervention, relational database, research tool, infants, young children, families, cleft lip and palate, early identification, risk conditions

The study identifies the increase in populations at risk for communication disorders world-wide and in South Africa as one the reasons for research to develop early communication intervention (ECI) services as a societal responsibility in South Africa. Since ECI is largely an unknown entity in the South African health system, but shares several mutual objectives, the dire need for data of populations at-risk validates the development of a computer-based relational data system as a 21st century research tool for ECI. Underpinnings for the development of a research database for ECI were obtained from the use of database management systems for early intervention in the USA, identified as

leaders in the application of database technology in the field of Speech-Language Pathology.

The aim of the study was to develop and establish a computerized database system to describe the characteristics of young children at risk for communication disorders enrolled in an existing ECI programme. Using a descriptive survey as research design, a rich description of 153 subjects and their families was obtained. The findings relating to the multiple risk profiles of the subjects revealed results not extensively described or emphasized in the literature, indicating the in-depth analysis of results that is possible when utilizing a database approach to research. The complex risk profile found in the subgroup of subjects with cleft lip and palate is an example of a need for further investigation. The results also indicated the critical importance of early identification of risk events throughout a child's life to improve the efficacy of ECI services. Further results emphasized the important role of parents to identify the early signs of risks for communication disorders in their children, provided they are equipped with the necessary knowledge. A conceptual framework for the early identification of risks for communication disorders is proposed for best practice in ECI in South Africa.

The study concluded that the CHRIB database system was successfully applied in the empirical research and is now established as a versatile 21st century research tool to be utilized in second generation research in ECI in South Africa.

OPSOMMING

TITEL Die Vestiging van 'n Rekenaargebaseerde

Datasisteem vir Vroeë Kommunikasie Intervensie in

Suid-Afrika.

NAAM Aletta Margaretha Kritzinger

PROMOTOR Prof B. Louw

MEDEPROMOTOR Prof L. M. Rossetti

DEPARTEMENT Kommunikasiepatologie

GRAAD D. Phil

Sleutelwoorde: Vroeë kommuniasie intervensie, vroeë intervensie, relasionele databasis, navorsingsinstrument, babas, jong kinders, gesinne, gesplete lip en verhemelte, vroeë identifikasie, risikotoestande

Die studie identifiseer die toename in populasies met 'n risiko vir kommunikasieafwykings wêreldwyd en in Suid-Afrika, as een van die redes vir navorsing om vroeë kommunikasie intervensiedienste (VKI) as 'n gemeenskapsverantwoordelikheid in Suid-Afrika te ontwikkel. Aangesien VKI hoofsaaklik 'n onbekende entiteit in die Suid-Afrikaanse gesondheidsisteem is, maar verskeie gesamentlike doelwitte deel, regverdig die groot leemte aan navorsing oor risiko-populasies, die ontwikkeling van 'n rekenaargebaseerde relasionele datasisteem as 'n 21e eeu navorsingsinstrument vir VKI. Die fundering vir die ontwikkeling van 'n navorsingsdatabasis in VKI is gegrond op

die gebruik van databasis bestuursisteme vir vroeë intervensie in die VSA, wat as leiers in die toepassing van databasistegnologie op die gebied van Spraak-Taalpatologie geïdentifiseer is.

Die doel van die studie was om 'n rekenaargebaseerde datasisteem te ontwikkel en te vestig, en dit aan te wend om die eienskappe van jong kinders met 'n risiko vir kommunikasieafwykings in 'n bestaande VKI program te beskryf. Die gebruik van 'n beskrywende opname as 'n navorsingsontwerp, het 'n ryk beskrywing van 153 proefpersone en hulle gesinne gelewer. Die bevindings wat met die veelvuldige risikoprofiele van die proefpersone verband hou, het resultate wat nie uitgebreid in die literatuur beskryf of beklemtoon is nie, aan die lig gebring, wat dui op die grondige analise van resultate wat met die aanwending van 'n databasisbenadering tot navorsing moontlik is. Die gekompliseerde risikoprofiel van die subgroep van proefpersone met gesplete lip en verhemelte is 'n voorbeeld van 'n behoefte aan verdere navorsing. Die resultate het ook die kritiese belang van die vroeë identifikasie van risikogebeure gedurende 'n kind se lewe om die effektiwiteit van VKI dienste te verbeter, aangedui. Verdere resultate het die belangrike rol van ouers beklemtoon om die vroeë tekens van risiko's vir kommunikasieafwykings in hulle kinders te identifiseer, mits hulle toegerus is met die nodige kennis. 'n Konsepsuele raamwerk vir die vroeë identifikasie van risiko's vir kommunikasieafwykings is voorgestel as beste praktyk in VKI in Suid-Afrika. .

Die studie kom tot die gevoltrekking dat die KHRIB datasisteem suksesvol toegepas is in die empiriese navorsing en dat dit gevestig is as 'n veelsydige 21e eeu navorsingsinstrument wat in tweedegenerasie navorsing in VKI benut kan word in Suid-Afrika.

CONTENTS

CHAPTER 1

A RATIONALE FOR DEVELOPING THE FIELD OF EARLY COMMUNICATION INTERVENTION IN SOUTH AFRICA

1.1	INTRODUC	TION	3
1.2	RATIONALE	FOR DEVELOPING ECI IN SOUTH AFRICA	6
1.3	SOUTH AFF	RICAN NATIONAL HEALTH POLICY AND	
	DISABILITY	STRATEGY	16
1.4	STATEMEN	T OF PROBLEM AND RATIONALE	18
1.5	TERMINOLO	OGY	19
1.5.1	'Established	risk', 'at-risk' and 'high risk'	19
1.5.2	'Early comm	unication intervention' and 'early intervention'	21
1.5.3	'Impairment'	, 'disability' and 'handicap'	21
1.5.4	Infant morta	lity	22
1.5.5	Levels of he	alth care	23
1.5.6	Poverty		24
1.5.7	Prevention		24
1.5.8	'Rehabilitation	on' and 'community-based rehabilitation'	25
1.6	ABBREVIAT	TIONS	25
1.7	USE OF ITA	LIC TYPE IN THE THESIS	27
1.8	ORGANISA	TION OF THE STUDY	28
	Chapter 1	A rationale for developing the field of early	
		communication intervention in South Africa	28
	Chapter 2	An overview of best practice in early communication	
		intervention	28
	Chapter 3	Strategies to develop early communication	
		intervention in the South African context	28

	Chapter 4 Database systems in early communication		
		intervention	29
	Chapter 5	Methodology	29
	Chapter 6	Results and discussion	30
	Chapter 7	Conclusions and implications	30
	References		31
	Appendices		31
1.9	CONCLUSIO	NC	32
1.10	SUMMARY		32

CHAPTER 2

AN OVERVIEW OF BEST PRACTICE IN EARLY COMMUNICATION INTERVENTION

2.1 IN	NTRODUCTION	35
2.2 T	HE EFFECTIVENESS OF ECI	37
2.2.1 Ir	ntroduction	37
2.2.2 C	current Questions regarding the Efficacy of El	40
2.3 F	RAMEWORK FOR BEST PRACTICE IN ECI	43
2.3.1 PF	HASE I: Entry into the ECI Process	43
2.3.1.1 Developmental Screening 44		
2.3.1.2 Developmental Surveillance		47
2.3.1.3	Epidemiological Data	49
2.3.1.4	Diagnosis of Infants with Established Risk Conditions	49
2.3.1.5	Caregiver Participation and Prevention of Communication	
	Disorders	52
2.3.2 PHASE II: Assessment in ECI		53
2.3.2.1	Critical Elements of the ECI Assessment Process	54
2.3.2.2	Multidisciplinary Team Approach to Assessment in ECI	57

2.3.2.	A Family–Centered Approach to Assessment in ECI	59
2.3.2.	4 Assessment Procedures in ECI	64
2.3.3	PHASE III: Provision of ECI Programme Services	71
2.4	CONCLUSION	80
2.5	SUMMARY	83

CHAPTER 3

STRATEGIES TO DEVELOP EARLY COMMUNICATION INTERVENTION IN THE SOUTH AFRICAN CONTEXT

3.1	INTRODUCTION	85
3.2	CHANGES IN HEALTH CARE IN SOUTH AFRICA	87
3.2.1	Adopting a Primary Health Care Approach	87
3.2.2	Collaborative Services between Primary Health Care and ECI	89
3.2.3	Unique Contributions of ECI in a Primary Health Care Context	92
3.3	CHANGES IN EDUCATION FOR CHILDREN WITH SPECIAL	
	NEEDS	94
3.3.1	Inclusive Education for All	95
3.3.2	The Role of ECI in the Education System	96
3.4	CURRENT VIEWS ON REHABILITATION OF PEOPLE WITH	
	DISABILITIES	99
3.4.1	Abandoning the Medical Model of Disability	99
3.4.2	Increase of Disability in Developing Countries	101
3.4.3	Adopting a Social Model of Disability	103
3.4.4	Community-Based Rehabilitation	104
3.4.5	Expansion of the Role of the Early Communication Interventionist	105
3.4.6	Challenges of Effective Community-Based Rehabilitation	107
3.5	PROFILE OF CLIENTS REQUIRING ECI IN SOUTH AFRICA	110

3.5.1	Home languages and cultures of ECI clients	111
3.5.2	The literacy rate of families requiring ECI services	114
3.5.3	Age of parents of young children requiring ECI	115
3.5.4	Risks for communication disorders in ECI clients in South Africa	116
3.6	CONCLUSION	121
3.6	SUMMARY	122

CHAPTER 4

DATABASE SYSTEMS

IN EARLY COMMUNICATION INTERVENTION

4.1	INTRODUCTION	125
4.2	INFORMATION TECHNOLOGY IN SPEECH-LANGUAGE	
	PATHOLOGY RESEARCH	127
4.3	FEATURES OF RELATIONAL DATABASE SYSTEMS	129
4.3.1	Advantages of Relational Database Systems	130
4.4	DATABASE SYSTEMS AS MANAGEMENT TOOLS IN EI	132
4.5	DATABASE SYSTEMS AS RESEARCH TOOLS IN EI	137
4.5.1	The Individual Following Record to Early Intervention	
	(García- Sánchez, 1999)	137
4.5.2	Relational Database System to Integrate Early Childhood	
	Assessment Data across Pre-kindergarten, Kindergarten and	
	Grade 1 (Bezruczko & Zell, 1993)	139
4.5.3	Developmental Assessment and Instruction for Success in	
	Early Years (DAISEY) Data System (Mandeville, et al., 1988)	140
4.5.4	A Computerized Classroom Language Management and Recording	9
	System for Deaf and Hard of Hearing Children	
	(Bornstein & Casella, 1993)	141

4.5.5	Child Language Data Exchange System (CHILDES)	
	(MacWhinney, 1996)	142
4.5.6	Language Sample Analysis (LSA) (Miller, et al., 1992)	143
4.6	APPLICATIONS OF THE USE OF DATABASE SYSTEMS	
	FOR ECI	145
4.7	ECI RESEARCH RELATING TO RISK POPULATIONS IN SOUTH	ł
	AFRICA	146
4.8	CONCLUSION	151
4.9	SUMMARY	152
	CHAPTER 5	
	METHODOLOGY	
5.1	INTRODUCTION	155
5. 2	AIMS OF THE STUDY	159
5.2.1	First Main Aim	160
5.2.2	Second Main Aim	160
5.3	RESEARCH DESIGN	161
5.4	SUBJECTS	164
5.4.1	Selection Criteria of Subjects	165
5.4.2	Selection Procedures of Subjects	166
5.4.3	Description of Subjects	166
5.5	MATERIALS AND APPARATUS	170
5.5.1	Assessment Materials	170
5.5.1.	1 CHRIB Case History Form (Louw & Kritzinger, 1995a)	170
5.5.1.	2 CHRIB Assessment Protocol (Louw & Kritzinger, 1995b)	173
5.5.2	Features of the CHRIB Database System	178
5.5.3	Apparatus Requirements	184

184

5.5.3.1 Apparatus Requirements for the CHRIB Database System

5.5.3.	2 Apparatus Requirements of the CHRIB Assessment	Recordings 185
5.5.3.	3 Apparatus Requirements for Hearing Testing	185
5.6	PROCEDURES	186
5.6.1	Design of CHRIB Database System	186
5.6.2	Data Collection	187
5.6.3	Validity and Reliability	190
5.6.4	Data Analysis and Interpretation	191
5.7	CONCLUSION	192
5.8	SUMMARY	192

CHAPTER 6

RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

6.1	INTRODUCTION	195	
6.2	DESCRIPTION OF THE SUBJECTS' CHARACTERISTICS	198	
6.2.1	Gender of the subjects	198	
6.2.2	Age of subjects	200	
6.2.3	Subjects older than three years	201	
6.2.4	Subjects enrolled in ECI programmes prior to CHRIB assessment	205	
6.2.5	Main diagnostic classifications of subjects	206	
6.2.6	Time of identification of subjects' risk conditions	209	
6.3	ANALYSIS OF THE DIAGNOSTIC CLASSIFICATIONS FOUND		
	IN THE SUBJECTS	224	
6.3.1	Number of diagnostic classifications per subject		
6.3.2	Biological risk profile for communication disorders in the subjects	227	
	.1 Communication disorders	228	
	.2 Chronic otitis media	229	
	.3 Multiple births	230	
	.4 Birth weight and gestation	236	

	.5	Congenital heart defects	244
	.6	Subjects with cleft lip and palate	248
	.7	Subjects with Down syndrome	251
6.4	CHAR	RACTERISTICS OF THE SUBJECTS IN THE PERINATAL	
	AND I	POSTNATAL PERIODS	255
6.4.1	Chara	cteristics of the subjects in the perinatal period	255
6.4.2	Chara	cteristics of the subjects in the postnatal period	263
6.5	CHAR	RACTERISTICS OF THE SUBJECTS' FAMILIES	267
6.5.1	Gene	ral characteristics of the subjects' families	270
6.5.2	Biogra	aphical detail of the subjects' families	277
6.5.3	Subje	cts' home languages	279
6.5.4	Chara	cteristics of the subjects' biological mothers	282
6.6	CONC	CLUSION	287
6.7	SUMN	MARY	291

CHAPTER 7

CONCLUSIONS AND IMPLICATIONS

7.1	INTRODUCTION	293
7.2	CONCLUSIONS	296
7.2.1	Conclusions regarding the establishment of the CHRIB	
	database system	296
7.2.2	Conclusions to the results of the empirical study	302
7.3	IMPLICATIONS	309
7.3.1	Implications for clinical practice	309
7.3.2	Theoretical implications of the results	314
7.4	CRITICAL REVIEW OF METHODOLOGY AND RESULTS	315
7.5	RECOMMENDATIONS FOR FURTHER RESEARCH	319
7.6	CONCLUSION	321
7.7	SUMMARY	322

LIST OF TABLES

Table 1.1	Distribution of population groups, unemployment and	
	people with disabilities in South Africa	7
Table 1.2	Age profile of clients receiving rehabilitation services in	
	public hospitals in the Pretoria Region	10
Table 1.3	Low birth weight rate in the Pretoria Districts, 1996-1997	11
Table 1.4	Increased prevalence of risk conditions associated	
	with communication disorders in the infant population	
	in South Africa	13
Table 2.1	A framework for infant-toddler communication-based	
	assessment	70
Table 2.2	Characteristics and components of a selection of EI	
	programmes	73
Table 3.1	Percentage distribution of home languages in South Africa	112
Table 3.2	Recorded causes of infant deaths, 0-12 months during	
	1994 in South Africa	117
Table 3.3	Perinatal conditions recorded as causes of death during	
	1994 in South Africa	119
Table 4.1	South African studies describing young children mainly	
	under three years old requiring ECI	147
Table 5.1	Summarized description of subject characteristics (N=153)	167
Table 5.2	Communicative assessment materials used in CHRIB	174
Table 5.3	List of tables, their descriptions and types of data entered	
	in the CHRIB Database	180
Table 5.4	Sequence of data collection procedures during CHRIB	
	assessment, participants and recording measures to	
	ensure reliability and accuracy	188
Table 5.5	Qualifications and experience of data collectors	189
Table 5.6	Sub-aims of the empirical study and statistical procedures	191

Table 6.1	Characteristics of subjects (N=153)	200
Table 6.2	Print out of CHRIB Database query of subjects older than	
	3 years (N=12)	202
Table 6.3	Print out of the datasheet view of the CHRIB Database	
	Table "Persons involved" (N=16)	204
Table 6.4	Prenatal diagnosis of the subjects' risk conditions (N=8)	210
Table 6.5	Subjects identified with a risk condition or communication	
	delay after the perinatal period (N=47)	212
Table 6.6	Number of subjects per risk condition identified after the	
	perinatal period (N=47)	214
Table 6.7	Characteristics of subjects identified with expressive	
	specific language impairment (N=9)	216
Table 6.8	Ages of subjects identified with communication delay	
	after the perinatal period (N=45)	218
Table 6.9	The roles of parents and professionals in identifying	
	risk conditions in subjects after the perinatal period (N=47)	220
Table 6.10	Analysis of diagnostic classifications per subject	224
Table 6.11	Diagnostic classifications of the subjects (N=153)	225
Table 6.12	Print out of CHRIB Database query of subjects without	
	speech and language delay (N=4)	228
Table 6.13	Subjects relating to multiple births and age at CHRIB	
	assessment (N=23)	232
Table 6.14	Subjects with low birth weight and/or premature	
	birth (N=52)	237
Table 6.15	Number of subjects in each diagnostic classification with	
	low birth weight and premature birth (N=52)	239
Table 6.16	Occurrence of small for gestational age but full-term in the	
	subjects (N=15)	243
Table 6.17	Number of subjects in each diagnostic classification with	
	congenital heart defects (N=16)	244

Table 6.18	Diagnostic profiles of subjects with congenital heart	
	defects (N=16)	246
Table 6.19	Characteristics of subjects with Down syndrome (N=23)	252
Table 6.20	Characteristics of perinatal risk factors experienced by the	
	subjects (N=153)	256
Table 6.21	Subjects who succeeded with breast feeding (N=34)	259
Table 6.22	Subjects with successful bottle feeding only after 8-150	
	days (N=51)	261
Table 6. 23	Type and number of surgical procedures performed on the	
	subjects (N=93)	265
Table 6. 24	General characteristics of the subjects' families (N=145)	269
Table 6.25	Biographical detail of the subjects' families (N=145)	277
Table 6.26	Characteristics of subjects' parents not belonging to medica	I
	aid funds (N=36)	278
Table 6.27	Languages spoken in the subject's homes (N=153)	280
Table 6.28	Environmental risks found in the subjects' families	281
Table 6.29	Characteristics of biological mothers of subjects during	
	pregnancy (N=145)	282
Table 6.30	Risk conditions of subjects whose mothers had	
	spontaneous abortions and stillborn infants (N=24)	284

LIST OF FIGURES

Figure I.I	Analysis of problem areas relating to ECI service delivery	
	in South Africa	8
Figure II.I	The early communication intervention process	42
Figure II.II	Diagram to indicate the difference between Lahey's	
	assessment model (1988) and assessment in ECI	55
Figure II. III	Levels of family interaction patterns	61
Figure II. IV	Continuum of parameters for efficacy in ECI service	
	delivery	82
Figure III.I	ECI professional functions in relation to community-	
	based rehabilitation	105
Figure V.I	Schematic representation of the research methodology of	
	the present study (Based on Guralnick, 1997)	158
Figure V.II	Print out of relationships between the tables of the CHRIB	
	Database	182
Figure V.III	Print out of a CHRIB Database form for the phonetic	
	inventories of vowels and consonants	183
Figure VI.I	Overview of results presented in the chapter	197
Figure VI.II	Outline of results pertaining to the characteristics of the	
	subjects	199
Figure VI.III	Scatter graph distribution of subjects' ages (N=153)	201
Figure VI.IV	Outline of results regarding the characteristics of	
	the subjects' families	268
Figure VI.V	Scatter graph of ages of subjects' biological mothers at the	
	time of the subjects' birth (N=145)	283
Figure VII.I	Outline of chapter contents	295
Figure VII.II	Research capabilities of the CHRIB database	298
Figure VII.III	Risk profile of subjects with cleft lip and palate	304
Figure VII.IV	Conceptual framework for the early identification of risks for	
	communication disorders	307

APPENDICES

Appendix A	CHRIB Information Letter to Parents
Appendix B	CHRIB Case History Form (Louw & Kritzinger, 1995a)
Appendix C	CHRIB Assessment Protocol (Louw & Kritzinger, 1995b)
Appendix D	Structure of the CHRIB Database
Appendix E	Subjects and their ICD-10 (CSS, 1996) Classifications