

TRIBAL CONFLICT AMONG PENTECOSTAL CLERGY IN ZIMBABWE: A PASTORAL
CHALLENGE

By

Nomathemba Nontokozo Msipa

Student Number: 17401233

Research Dissertation

Submitted to Professor Maake J. Masango

In Fulfilment of the Requirements for

Master of Theology Degree

PRT 894

Practical Theology

University of Pretoria

30th April 2020

Dedication

This study is dedicated to all the victims of tribal conflict within the church and also by the hands of Clergy, may the past pain propel you to be faithful custodians of Love, Peace, Truth and reconciliation.

To my Late Father, Mr. Elliot Msipa and my Late Mother, Mrs. Alice Nkomo – Msipa, if only you would have both been here to witness what your last born has become.

To my Children, my first born and Gentle Giant Richard, Mama's Boy Prince and the Only Sister to the Boys and Last Born Miss Repose (you are amazing and the best daughter for me).

Acknowledgements

The study would not have been a success without the support and involvement of the following; -

My utmost gratitude is to our Heavenly Father, Yahweh, Yahshua Ha Mashiach/ Jesus the Messiah, and Ruach Ha Chodesh/ Holy Spirit for always ordering my steps in paths of Righteousness and Being my Comforter. Surely I declare "If it had not been for Adonai who was on my side, where would I have been!" To You Alone, Holy One of Y'srael, be all glory and honour forever and ever! Amen!!

My heartfelt gratitude and appreciation goes to my Supervisor Par Excellence Professor Maake J. Masango who journeyed with me through this research process. He went beyond the call of duty and became a father-figure who was missing in my life. Sir, only our Heavenly Father can satisfactorily reward you for such excellence of spirit and demeanour. Thank you to Mama Masango and family for sharing you with us.

I would also like to make special mention and appreciate Mr. Dana Mahan and the Abundant Life Team. Thank you so much sir for walking this journey with me both financially and personally. You and your team are a true expression of the Abundant Love and Life of Our Lord!

Many, many thanks go to my Go-To Girl, my Best Friend/ My Personal Nurse/ My Prayer Partner/ My Nana, Prophetess Mulalo Tshikunde who has been a selfless and true friend through this journey. I would not have been able to accomplish this without your support, unwavering love, and prayers. Ndo Li Vhuwa Nana waSesi!!

I am most grateful to my only three biological children, and also my other Tendai for

your kindness and support.

The Feet Washers Tabernacle International Ministries (FWITM) for your prayers, support and kindness during this research process, especially Moruti Subeng, Thoriso and Granny!

The Class for sharpening my critical thinking skills, sharing their space, intellect and expertise.

Lastly but definitely not the least, I would like to thank the University of Pretoria for granting me the opportunity to study there and also for the Bursary that enabled me to meet the financial obligations of this Research Study. Of course, I have to make special mention and gratitude to my Faculty; the Faculty of Theology & Religion!! The Faculty that is numerically small but has the biggest heart and widest smile in all of UP!!

Preface

The basis for this research originally emanated from my personal exposure to the detriment of tribal conflict among Ndebele and Shona Clergy when I was the National President of a Para-church organization. The Para-church organization trained, ordained Pentecostal Clergy from different denominations in Harare and Bulawayo and I was at the helm of its leadership for two (2) years. Tribal conflict was the reason that I ended up not completing my five (5) year term as I was unceremoniously removed by a Shona majority clergy who wanted to put their own Shona leader.

It is from this background that the research study was pursued in order to find ways to deal with the scourge of tribal conflict, while also making sure that truth, justice, peace and reconciliation are realised among clergy in the Pentecostal church in Zimbabwe.

Declaration

I, Nomathemba Nontokozo Msipa, student number 17401233 hereby declare that this dissertation, “Tribal Conflict Among Pentecostal Clergy in Zimbabwe: A Pastoral Care Challenge,” is submitted in accordance with the requirements for the Masters in Theology degree at University of Pretoria, is my own original work and has not previously been submitted to any other institution of higher learning. All sources cited or quoted in this research paper are indicated and acknowledged with a comprehensive list of references.

Name of Student: Nomathemba Nontokozo Msipa

Signature: 

Date: ..17./..08../2020.....

Name of Supervisor: Maake Jacob Masango

Signature:

Date:/...../.....

Abstract

While there is a plethora of research on the church, healing and reconciliation, there is none that has taken cognisance of the need to find solutions to deal with tribalism between Ndebele and Shona clergy in the Pentecostal church of Zimbabwe. Clergy are deployed according to the language they speak, instead of the passion and call of Elohim upon their lives. Many Researches have been done on centuries of tribal conflict; however, they centred on socio-political influences instead of socio-religious influences and consequences of the tribal conflict between Ndebele and Shona clergy. Tribal conflict has transcended generations and crossed all social settings that it has found its expression even among the clergy and laity within churches across Zimbabwe. The main focus of this research is the conflict between Ndebele and Shona Clergy in the Pentecostal church in Zimbabwe and has sought to “lift the carpet” and remove all the hidden social and unspoken debris, that continues to split the church along tribal lines. The Researcher writes from the perspective of being a female clergy who is also born by a Shona father and a Ndebele mother hence she relates to both sets of people outside the church. However, within the conservative Pentecostal church setting, the researcher was made to feel like an outsider by both groups which was even aggravated by the fact that her denominational organisation doesn't ordain and recognise female ministers let alone those of mixed ethnicity.

The research established a participatory action research process so as to promote both education (creating curricula that deals with tribalism) and action (speaking against tribalism from the pulpit). The Research Methodology that was initially proposed was a Mixed Methods Action Research (Ivankova, 2015: 45), however during the course of the study it was changed to a qualitative method of enquiry as it thoroughly investigated and interrogated the tribal status quo among the Pentecostal clergy (Ndebele & Shona) in Zimbabwe. The research demography was two of Zimbabwe's largest cities (namely; Bulawayo and Harare), and the reason for choosing these two cities, was because they

are predominantly Ndebele and Shona concentrations, respectively. Zimbabwe is composed of these two as the major tribes and many other small tribes, however these small tribes seem to be insignificant to the social fabric of Zimbabwe compared to the two major tribes (namely the Ndebele and Shona). The effects of tribal differences between the Ndebele and Shona people was assessed, in order to ascertain their effect on pastoral care. An exploration of the history between the Ndebele and Shona tribes formulated part of this research, thereby creating an understanding of the underlying causes of the existing Tribal Conflicts. Most of the literature that deals with the Zimbabwean conflicts has not tried to bring to light the tribal conflict between the Ndebele and Shona clergy. An investigation on how this conflict began and what has been its contemporary influence among the Clergy of Zimbabwe was conducted via interviews, questionnaires, folk tales, books and journals.

The power of the church as the custodian of reconciliation was discussed in order to harness and promote a visible pastoral care drive that will promote real Truth and Reconciliation while bringing healing to the church of Zimbabwe, in particular. An interrogation of the effectiveness of previous truth and reconciliation efforts assisted to lay the foundation for engaging of the Clergy. This research sought to understand whether the 1983 to 1987 Gukurahundi incidents were clarion indicators of existing tribal tensions between the Ndebele and Shona people, in particular the clergy.

Key Terms: Awareness, Church, Clergy, Equality, Government, Healing, Laity, Participatory Action Research, Pastoral Care, Reconciliation, Trans-Generational Transmission of Trauma, Trans-Generational Violence, Punitive Justice, Restorative, Tribalism.

Acronyms

CBD	-	Central Business District
CCJP	-	Catholic Commission for Justice and Peace
DNA	-	Deoxyribonucleic Acid
DWF	-	Divine Word Fathers
FC	-	Football Club
GPA	-	Global Political Agreement
NPRC	-	National Peace and Reconciliation Commission
ONHRI	-	Organ for National Healing, Reconciliation and Integration
PAR	-	Participatory Action Research
PTSD	-	Post Traumatic Stress Disorder
TRC	-	South African Truth and Reconciliation Commission
ZANLA	-	Zimbabwe African National Liberation Army
ZIPRA	-	Zimbabwe People's Revolutionary Army

Table of Contents

Dedication.....	ii
Acknowledgements.....	iii
Preface.....	v
Declaration.....	vi
Abstract.....	vii
Acronyms.....	ix
List of Tables... ..	xv
List of Figures.....	xvi
1. STUDY OVERVIEW	1
1.1 Introduction.....	1
1.1.1 Case Study (Part 1).....	3
1.2 The Research Problem.....	3
1.3 Background of the Study	4
1.4 The Purpose of the Study	6
1.5 Aims and Objectives of the Research	6
1.6 The Research Questions.....	7
1.7 Demographic Scope of the Study	7
1.8 Summary of the Chapters	8
1.9 Research Methodology.....	10
1.10 Preliminary Conclusion.....	11
2. LITERATURE OVERVIEW	12

2.1	Introduction.....	12
2.2	Historical Background.....	16
2.3	Ethnicity	18
2.4	Tribal Conflict among Clergy	23
2.4.1	American View	23
2.4.2	African View.....	26
2.4.3	Biblical View.....	30
2.5	Preliminary Conclusion.....	32
1.1.2	Case Study (Cont.).....	33
3.	THE RESEARCH METHODOLOGY.....	35
3.1	Introduction.....	35
3.2	Research Methodology Selected.....	38
3.2.1	Research Design	38
3.2.2	Research Participants (Sample).....	40
3.2.3	Qualitative Process.....	42
3.2.4	Delimitations of the Study.....	44
3.2.5	Limitations of the Study.....	45
3.2.6	Preliminary Interview Report.....	45
3.2.7	Questionnaire Structure.....	46
3.2.8	Triangulation.....	46
3.2.9	Ethical Considerations	48
3.2.10	Data Collection.....	49
3.2.11	Coding	49

3.1.12 Reliability and Validity	51
3.2 Pastoral Care Methodology	52
3.2.1 Pollard's Positive Deconstruction.....	53
3.3 Preliminary Conclusion.....	55
4. TRAUMA AND TRIBAL CONFLICT	57
4.1 Introduction.....	57
4.2 Definition of Trauma.....	58
4.3 Trans-Generational Transmission of Trauma.....	63
4.4 Mechanisms of Transmitting Trans-Generational Trauma	65
4.5 Three Theories of Ethnic or Tribal Violence	67
4.5.1. Primordialist.....	67
4.5.2. Instrumentalist.....	68
4.5.3. Constructivist.....	68
4.6 Theological Hermeneutics of Trauma.....	69
4.7 Response Patterns to Trauma	71
4.8 Three Forms of Stress Reaction.....	72
4.9 Impediments to Understanding Trauma Responses	73
4.9.1. Researchers cannot control the circumstances surrounding traumatic events.....	73
4.9.2 It is Impossible to know who will experience trauma as it is extremely difficult to pre-test subjects to determine pre-trauma levels of psychological functioning.....	73
4.9.3 It is impossible to manipulate aspects of traumatic events in order to compare the effects of such variables on subjects' responses.....	74
4.9.4 It is difficult to get detailed information about the traumatic events	

themselves, due to the confusion frequently surrounding traumatic events.....	74
4.9.5. Treatment needs of trauma victims must always take precedence over the need to answer research questions.....	74
4.9.6. People are unlikely to be willing to participate in a research study soon after they have had a traumatic experience	74
4.10 Preliminary Conclusion.....	75
5. DATA ANALYSIS AND EVALUATION	77
5.1 Introduction.....	77
5.2 Questions That Were Asked	78
5.3 Coding.....	79
5.4 Co-Researchers Analysis	86
5.5 Audio Interviews Summary Transcriptions.....	87
5.5.1 Participant One (1)	88
5.5.2 Five Participants (The Disciplinary Committee).....	89
5.5.3 Five (5) Participants (Tribalism Victims).....	91
5.6 Questionnaires Summary Transcriptions	94
5.7 Preliminary Conclusion.....	100
6. HEALING AND RECONCILIATION	102
6.1 Introduction.....	102
6.2 Gathering of Church Elders	103
6.3 South African Truth, and Reconciliation Commission Template	104
6.4 Rwandan Reconciliation Template.....	105
6.5 Reconciliation: a Pastoral Concern	106
6.6 Pastoral Response to Historical Trauma.....	107

6.7	Healing: A Pastoral Concern	109
6.8	Preliminary Conclusion.....	111
7.	FINDINGS AND RECOMMENDATIONS	113
7.1	Introduction.....	113
7.2	Aims and Objectives Findings.....	114
7.3	Recommendations	117
7.3.1	Educational Curriculum	117
7.3.2	Conflict Resolution	117
7.3.3	Transmission of Trauma.....	117
7.4	Conclusion.....	118
	APPENDICES.....	119
	APPENDIX A: QUESTIONNAIRE FOR FEMALE CLERGY	119
	APPENDIX B: QUESTIONNAIRE FOR MALE CLERGY	121
	APPENDIX C: LETTER REQUESTING PERMISSION TO CONDUCT RESEARCH AT CHURCH.....	123
	APPENDIX D: CONSENT LETTER	124
	APPENDIX E: PARTICIPANT CONSENT FORM.....	126
	GLOSSARY.....	127
	SCRIPTURE INDEX (PARTIAL).....	128
	BIBLIOGRAPHY.....	129

List of Tables

Table 1 Comparison between Qualitative and Quantitative Methods	44
Table 2 Sample Coding List from Questionnaires.....	50
Table 3 Sample Coding of Thematic Frequencies	50
Table 4 Breakdown of Participants By Office	79
Table 5 Participants By Office & Gender	80
Table 6 Participants Affected by Tribal Conflict.....	82
Table 7 Thematic Frequencies to Tribalism	83
Table 8 Definitions of Participants' Emergent Themes.....	85

List of Figures

Figure 1 The Division of Zimbabwe By Provinces	15
--	----

1. STUDY OVERVIEW

1.1 Introduction

While this researcher is aware of the current scholarly arguments that are going on with regards to the use of the word 'tribe', and what some believe to constitute a tribe, this research does not seek to engage in that argument within this study. The word 'tribe' was used from a Zimbabwean national worldview. As a native of Zimbabwe, it has always been our worldview to refer to each other according to tribal distinctions. Other Zimbabwean scholars have also used the word 'tribe' in discussing the conflicts that exist in Zimbabwe among different tribes, as the notion of tribe is a Zimbabwean national worldview. While other scholars prefer to use ethnic or racial groups in their discussions, literature has shown the Zimbabwean worldview is actually discussing the same identifiable traits found in Western and other African cultures under review in this research. The nation of Zimbabwe is made up of smaller components of tribes and languages who behave differently from each other. Hence the issue of tribal conflict cannot be dealt with adequately without researching the fabric of the nation, in order to present proper pastoral care remedies that will affect the whole.

The role of Pastoral Care (if any) within the Pentecostal churches, was also investigated in this research with a major emphasis on participatory visibility of pastors to deal with tribal differences and distortions. Society is composed of many components that influence the very fabric thereof, while the family unit is the major component of society for without a family unit, they cannot be a continued growth or metamorphosis of societal values. The clergy also form part of the component of any given society; hence their influence and affluence imparts on society as a whole. Before one becomes a clergy, they belong to families that have societal values which influence their formative years and hence to deny those formative influences is to be unable to pastorally care for clergy and laity. This research was an inquisition into how these formative societal influences affect clergy when they are now serving in the congregations where they are appointed to forms part of this enquiry as it helps to understand what influences clergy

to be tribally sensitive or insensitive. The homogenous demography of the congregation in most Pentecostal churches also revealed that most clergy are comfortable to minister to people of their own tribal lineage and tend to respond differently when they have to pastor or shepherd members who are viewed as the significant others or those from different tribal groups. This research study then investigated why Clergy are comfortable to minister to their 'own people', to the point of even responding negatively towards 'other people' who do not belong to their tribe. The clergy were viewed in this research study as one of the components within the larger society of Zimbabwe hence their responses to societal challenges were investigated so as to determine how they affect the church in particular and the nation as a whole. This assisted in determining a practical theology praxis that would foster peace, truth, forgiveness and reconciliation.

While the nation of Zimbabwe has many denominations that range from mainline churches (Roman Catholic Church, Anglican, Methodist, Presbyterian, etc.), this research study chose to make an inquiry among the Pentecostal churches. The Zimbabwe Council of Churches (ZCC) which serves mostly mainline churches at the exclusion of the Pentecostal churches, was not approached for this research. As far as this enquiry was concerned, there was no need to approach the ZCC hence an independent umbrella organization was approached for (see methodology chapter). In most mainline churches, the deployment of clergy is not determined by a particular clergy's preference of a certain place (for example, choosing the Central Business District), however the situation is different among Pentecostal churches whereby the one who 'plants a church' becomes the benefactor of the church's decision-making processes. The phrase "plant a church" is what is commonly used among southern African Pentecostal clergy to refer to a new church that has been established through evangelistic work. Most of the contemporary Pentecostal churches do not have deployment strategies for their clergy that are administered by a central governing body hence statistics show that there are more Pentecostal churches in urban centers than there are in rural setups. In other Pentecostal churches, governing bodies led by senior clergy are decision-making institutions that even deploy other clergy within. In most Pentecostal churches, the clergy decide where they want to "plant a church" and in

most cases there is an influence of homogeneity involved. These choices are mostly evident in Harare and Bulawayo, whereby more Ndebele clergy are an oversight of Ndebele congregations, such that an interpreter is used for the few and rare occasions where there are Shona members in the minority. In most cases, there is no interpretation and the language of the majority rules the fellowship service and this is also influenced by the tribal affiliation of the oversight clergy.

1.1.1 Case Study (Part 1): - Pastor Simon Khumalo (not real name), found himself in a quagmire when his tribal beliefs were in conflict with his religious beliefs and the direction Elohim seemed to be ordering his steps. Pastor Khumalo was a member of one of the Oldest and largest Pentecostal churches in Zimbabwe, which had church branches on all of the cities and towns. His wife of fifteen years was promoted and transferred to Harare, and as much as the increase in salary was a needed reprieve for this six-member family, it also came with the challenge of relocation from Bulawayo. Pastor Simon loved the Lord, the ministry, and his Ndebele congregation, but he had a problem with relocating to Harare, as this would entail being a preacher to a predominantly Shona congregation. How was he going to preach on forgiveness, let alone love when he loathed and hated the Shona people, as he held them accountable for massacring most of his village relatives? While on the other hand, the National headquarters of his church was based in Harare and run by Shona leadership. The chairperson of the National Board, Apostle Simbarashe Chokuda (not his real name) was known to have a hatred for Ndebeles, which was an unspoken open secret. Was Apostle Chokuda going to approve Pastor Khumalo's transfer?

1.2 The Research Problem

Tribal conflict among the clergy is part of the cause for many failed peace, truth and reconciliation efforts in the church as well as the nation of Zimbabwe. A divided church at leadership level is an ineffective church at local and national level. Tribal Conflict among Ndebele and Shona Clergy within the Pentecostal church in Zimbabwe was the Research Problem. If tribal or ethnic or racial groups form part of a larger whole, then it is possible that whatever is seen manifesting at national arenas might be a symptom of

the smaller particles that are also infected with the same. In this case, the tribal tensions and manifestations that are witnessed throughout Zimbabwe's political fabric, employment structures, and economic structures is an indicator that there is a problem of tribalism among the people that is found among even the clergy. Tribalism among the Shona and Ndebele clergy within Pentecostal churches is the research problem.

1.3 Background of the Study

Although there have been other politically motivated Peace and Reconciliation efforts, in 2013 the Government of Zimbabwe enacted the National Peace and Reconciliation Commission (NPRC) under Section 251 of its New Constitution. According to an article by Accord, "the NPRC Bill was the first serious effort by Government to deal with reconciliation" (accessed on their website on the 26th April 2019). Be that as it may, it has to be noted that most government efforts still lack grassroots initiative and efforts at reconciliation. Accord points, "The NPRC Bill was signed into Law by President Emmerson Mnangagwa on the 5th of January 2018. This is the first attempt since independence, that Zimbabwe has tried to address its history of trauma, tribalism and violence". However, the NPRC bill has negated the aspect of accountability and tribalism in its effort to deal with trans-generational violence and trauma. The Commissioners of the NPRC are accomplished citizens however there is no one leading from the church (Clergy) and it continues to be a politically motivated reconciliation effort that has political undertones and manipulations that would not foster true and peaceful reconciliation.

It is this researcher's conviction that there can never be true and peaceful reconciliation that excludes the church, which is the biblical and true custodian of true reconciliation, hence the need for this investigative research. An example of South Africa's Truth and Reconciliation efforts, that were led by Arch-Bishop Desmond Tutu, is a good portrayal of how Truth and Reconciliation commissions, especially with regards to the involvement of the church. The church's role on peace, truth and reconciliation needs to be affirmed and entrenched as a legal prerequisite in any nation. However, the church

cannot be an agent of change, when it is socially and spiritually haemorrhaging by ignoring its cancerous conflicts especially among clergy (the supposed custodians of truth, peace and reconciliation). It is an unspoken fact that the Gukurahundi massacre of more than 20,000 Ndebele people was motivated by tribalism than anything. More than 30 years after the massacre, no public apology has been given by those responsible hence tribalism is an unattended and festering cancer that affects all sectors of society, including the church. This negation of accountability and acceptance has continued to be an unspoken sore even among the clergy. Stories of congregations refusing to have a Clergy, who is not of the majority tribe, are a reality across the church in Zimbabwe.

The previous government initiatives dealing with peace truth and reconciliation have not looked at conflict among different people groups. It seems that the Zimbabwean Government has capitalised on the conflicts that exist among different people groups. None of these initiatives looked at the conflicts that exist among the clergy, and even the church itself has not dealt with clergy conflict. As a secular government, it is unable to assist in sacred matters of dealing with conflict among clergy, hence there was no need to approach the National Peace and Reconciliation Commission (NPRC) in Zimbabwe. The church should be able to deal with its own conflict related issues without involving a secular Government. There have been stories of clergy discipline, yet nothing has been done to rehabilitate and reconcile the 'disciplined clergies' or even find out the reasons for any callous behaviour among the clergy. To ignore that clergy are also people, will give rise to clergy who are internally and externally bleeding, with the ripple effect of a bleeding congregation. The analysis and categorization of this research study is based largely on the issues raised by the research participants from Bulawayo and Harare clergy. Historical episodes informing this research span from the Ndebele raids of the 19th century and their consequent effects on its victims and the descendants, the Gukurahundi Massacre of the 20th century and the 21st century deliberate economic sabotage and subjugation of the Ndebele by the Shona political elite. These historical episodes are believed to be the cause of clergy tribal conflict, as there seems to be blurred lines of tribal roles and responsibilities.

1.4 The Purpose of the Study

The core of this research was to ascertain the existence and depth of tribal conflict among the Clergy in Zimbabwe. The research evaluated the effects of negating dialogue and accountability by the perpetrators of tribalism, violence and trauma, to ascertain what pastoral care method could be used to conscientize the clergy. It is an unspoken yet known fact how deep the tentacles of politically influenced tribalism and unrest have reached, such that even the issue of tribal conflict among the clergy is one of the offspring. At the core of this research was a desire to restore and affirm the message of reconciliation within the clergy in particular and church in general. It was an effort to contribute to the existing body of knowledge by creating awareness of a need to involve pastors in any form of truth and reconciliation efforts, thereby promoting a sustainable pastoral care model for future generations. The research sought also to suggest improvements on policy that would foster and promote good pastoral care administration against any conflict. As much as there is an extensive number of literatures dealing with racial conflict, there seems to none that deals with tribal conflict within Zimbabwe. The researcher sought also to investigate if there is a curriculum on pastoral care as a subject of study within Seminaries and Bible Schools in Zimbabwe that caters specifically for conflict resolution among clergy.

1.5 Aims and Objectives of the Research

1.5.1 To have a deeper understanding of the challenges of nonpartisan pastoral care in a tribally volatile environment.

1.5.2 To Develop Pastoral Care models or practices suitable to be recommended and implemented for the church in Zimbabwe.

1.5.3 To develop a Monitoring and Evaluation model for assessing the effectiveness of pastoral care in a tribally volatile environment.

1.5.4 To create an awareness of the predicaments and impediments involved with pastoral care in a tribally volatile environment.

1.5.5 To Bring the Church back to its mandate of reconciliation in the context of clergy tribal conflict.

1.5.6 To promote real Truth and Reconciliation among Clergy that will facilitate healing to the nation of Zimbabwe.

1.6 The Research Questions

1.6.1 To what extent do the teachings and practices of the Church in Zimbabwe influence peace and tranquillity?

1.6.2 How Sustainable are the current Pastoral Care practices of the church in Zimbabwe; a review of the Zimbabwean Pastoral Care Syllabus?

1.6.3 Do the dynamics of Zimbabwe's Socio-Political terrain have anything to do with Pastoral Care among Clergy?

1.6.4 What Pastoral Care Model would be Suitable for such volatile situations; differences in tribal affiliation do not diminish the image of Elohim in anyone?

1.6.5 What caused tribalism among the Clergy in Zimbabwe?

1.6.6 What continues to inflame tribal conflict among Clergy?

1.6.7 How deep is tribalism among the clergy?

1.7 Demographic Scope of the Study

This research study concentrated on the two main tribes of the nation of Zimbabwe, namely the Ndebele and Shona speaking people. It then targeted the Clergy from these two tribes to see how they have responded to tribal tensions as individuals belonging to any of these two warring tribes. The underlying causes of tribalism among the Clergy have been witnessed in the structure of the leadership that was selected to work together with the Clergy, especially among the congregation where the elections are influenced by the clergy. Deployments are conducted on the basis of tribal affiliation other than ability for a particular clergy to shepherd that particular congregation, for example those congregations that are financially affluent are given according to the majority of tribe that is leading. The two major cities in Zimbabwe, namely Bulawayo and Harare have the highest concentration of churches that have the highest number of either of the two tribes by virtue of their proximity to rural areas that represent this demography. The influx of urban migration has also precipitated this demographic reality, as the surrounding rural areas become the supply chain for urbanites. This

scenario has seen Bulawayo being mostly inhabited by Ndebele people, such that even the Clergy are from among the neighbouring villages.

While on the other hand, Harare is mostly inhabited by Shona people as the neighbouring rural areas are for Shona speaking people. It is this kaleidoscopic scenario that has made these two cities be chosen as sampling areas for this research, as the probability that most of the clergy represent all the people groups found in Zimbabwe. The probable accuracy of investigating tribalism among Clergy is also increased by the reality that such Metropolitan cities are very good ground for tribal interactions among different people groups even among clergy, as most people migrate from rural areas and other peri-urban setups to look for greener pastures in urban centres. The selection of these two tribes and cities is testimony that these are the best demographic options to give highly probable answers to this enquiry.

1.8 Summary of the Chapters

This research study is composed of seven (7) chapters that have been systematically structured to assist bringing clarity to the progressive enquiry that was followed. The first chapter summarises the whole dissertation by beginning with an introduction that briefly explains the research study. The introduction is then followed by the research problem to bring clarity of the problem that has precipitated this research, and then transcends to the purpose of this study, to show what this research intended or hoped to achieve. The aims and objectives point to ripple effects of this study and this is followed by the research questions, and then the scope of the study assesses the demography that would be used for investigative purposes. The summary of the chapters briefly summarises all the seven (7) chapters as an overview and this chapter ends with a conclusion.

Chapter Two (2) is a Literature overview that gives details some of the literature that was reviewed to verify this hypothesis and also to propound what has been previously written on the subject of tribalism, or ethnicity or racism. Racism or tribalism or ethnicity has been used interchangeably as these scholars believe that the distinctions used are a matter of language semantics and geographical affiliations. The demographic

Emphasis of this literature overview is around American Literature, African Literature and Biblical Literature on the subject of tribal conflict among clergy.

Chapter three (3) looked at the Research Methodology used during this research study and the message used is the qualitative method to collect the data, analyse the data and make recommendations. Within this chapter, Pollard's pastoral care process of Positive Deconstruction is also analysed as it relates to this research study, since there is a need to positively deconstruct the cultural, traditional and religious beliefs that have propagated tribalism among the clergy. A review of Waruta's and Kinoti's (eds. 2013) book entitled 'Pastoral Care in African Christianity: Challenging Essays in Pastoral Theology' so as to comparatively interrogate the tribal conflict among clergy and the proper method to respond to such.

Chapter four (4) is entitled Tribal Conflict as it now zooms in to the specific findings about tribal conflict among Clergy in Zimbabwe, such that it is subdivided into Ndebele Clergy Perspective and Shona Clergy Perspective. This balanced analysis of the two perspectives gives light to the reality on the ground in the two major cities of Zimbabwe and this chapter closes with a conclusion.

Chapter five (5) is mainly concerned with data collected and analysed for clarity of this research study. It is from this chapter that the responses of the research participants are analysed though pseudonyms will be used to protect the individuals. The statistics assisted to show the gravity of the matter and also to suggest the methods to be recommended for remedial action.

Chapter six (6) looks at healing and reconciliation as there is need to explore pastoral care healing and reconciliation practices that would be recommended to the affected clergy in particular and the church in general. This chapter would also look at the healing methods that have been applied in other different cases around the world to see if they can be tailor-made to suit this particular issue under investigation. An analysis of the theological perspective on healing and reconciliation would also constitute part of this chapter.

Chapter seven (7) is the final chapter of this research study and it is about a summary of the findings that were made during this investigative study. This chapter also makes recommendations in terms of further study that can be done and also remedial action

that can be taken to deal with the subject under review.

1.9 Research Methodology

Qualitative method was used during this research and it was complemented by Pollard's (1997) Positive Deconstruction pastoral care model of inquisitive or comprehensive assessment of someone's belief. Berg posits that qualitative researchers are most interested in how humans arrange themselves and their settings, and how inhabitants of the settings make sense of their surroundings (Berg, 1998; 8). The social settings of this research was that of the Ndebele and Shona Pentecostal clergy and an inquiry was made on how they respond or make sense of their surroundings that have clergy from different tribal affiliations. Qualitative research in this regard was selected, because it does not temper with the settings and also views the subjects within their natural habitations. Qualitative method explored to answer both confirmatory and exploratory questions by using closed and open-ended questions to inquire from the participants. Considering that this research is about divergent tribal worldviews, Berg further points that qualitative research methods allows researchers to share in understanding and perception of others (Berg, 1998; 9). With regards to this, the research study also sought to understand the perceptions and understanding of Ndebele and Shona Clergy concerning tribalism. The Qualitative research method also assisted by "enabling completion of a single research project more expeditiously and efficiently than conducting a multiple methods design" (Ivankova, 2015:12), which would then assist by saving on time and resources as they were limited. While on the other hand Pollard's (1997) positive deconstruction pastoral care techniques assisted in deconstructing tribal worldviews and reconstructing them with proper biblical beliefs that would enhance clergy pastoral care in Zimbabwe.

Most of the research was done via structured questionnaires and interviews that in order transcribe, code and analyse data specifically for this research. Considering how volatile and sensitive is the issue of tribalism in Zimbabwe, there was of necessity to engage co-researchers. The researcher comes from a very political family and is also an offspring of a Shona Father and Ndebele mother, hence the research was ethically

balanced and objective. It has to be noted that due to the non-acceptance of this researcher by both tribes within the church, there was of necessity need to involve male co-researchers from both tribes. In the age of technological advancement, it was imperative that the interviews be conducted via the net, as this made sure that a large number of people were engaged within a short period of time. Nick Pollard's Positive deconstruction process was used to confront, assess, confess and reconcile the Pentecostal Clergy from different tribes.

1.10 Preliminary Conclusion

Fried defined tribe as a social group speaking a distinctive language or dialect and possessing a distinctive culture that marks it off from other tribes¹. Fried went on to show that Hoebel's definition was not based on any political affiliations and this is the position of this research study (Fried 1975: 26). The use of the word "tribe" was on the basis of having identified two groups of people who are distinctly different in terms of culture, language, and even territorial alliance who then become Clergy. It is this trajectory of reason that then investigated and concluded these distinctions on these two people groups who have come together because of a common faith, yet still draw demarcation lines along the lines of ancient history, ancestry and languages to a point of putting the Gospel of Yahshua into disrepute. The language of love that is epitomised by the substitutionary death of our Lord and Saviour, Yahshua Ha Mashiach/ Jesus the Messiah must then be the language that unites a people even clergy. The citizenship of heaven should be the mindset that informs the clergy in particular that we have even been united territorially.

This research study doesn't claim to be exhaustive in uncovering the Truth but sought to provoke the discussions openly instead of ignoring the festering cancer of tribalism and even segregatory behaviour among the proponents of a supposedly 'common faith'.

¹ Quoted from Hoebel's Man in the Primitive World

2. LITERATURE OVERVIEW

2.1 Introduction

This research was brought about by the experiences of this researcher on tribal conflict within the Pentecostal setup where she got born again and was later commissioned for Bible Seminary Training. The researcher is a product of a Ndebele mother and a Shona father, as shown by the names (which are both Ndebele names) and a Shona surname. While growing up, this had not been an issue since the author was born and bred in Bulawayo which is a mainly Ndebele dominated city and her Ndebele names and fluency in Ndebele contributed to her “fitting in among the Ndebele”. In fact, she grew up thinking that she was Ndebele, since her paternal family all spoke Ndebele and also lived in Rural Ndebele where their ancestors had relocated to. Among her father’s people it was a known but rejected fact that their ancestry was Shona, and even now there are some who violently reject Shona Ancestry and prefer to be known and affiliated with the Ndebele. It was after Seminary Training and deployment to Harare, a Shona dominated City that she was then made aware that she is different. The fact that she was fluent in Shona and had a Shona surname did not deter other Clergy from disassociating with her or engaging with her with suspicion. It is from this background that this research was influenced and hence the literature review sought to understand the underlying factors and symptoms of any existence of tribal or racial conflict among clergy in the Western and African worlds.

In most of the literature that has been reviewed in this area, none addresses the tribal conflict among Pentecostal Ndebele and Shona clergy in Zimbabwe, with the exception of Reginald Mudenda who researched on a dissertation based on the prevalence of tribalism and racism among Presbyterian Zimbabweans (Mudenda 2011). Mudenda described tribalism within the Presbyterian churches in Zimbabwe, as a major problem that caused them not to worship together (Mudenda 2011). His research looked at the Presbyterian churches as a whole however this research investigated tribalism among Pentecostal clergy based on the tribal conflicts that have been happening. As a result of

the above, the researcher, using co-researcher interviewed some Ndebele and Shona Clergy in different Pentecostal church affiliations in Zimbabwe on tribal conflict. Although most addressed the socio-political conflict that came due to tribal conflict dating back to the 19th century, they assisted in understanding the origins of tribal conflict in whatever form it manifested itself in the Zimbabwean societal terrain. Ridley pointed out that “it is very important to undertake a literature review, so as to contribute to an ongoing story or debate, while giving context” (Ridley 2012: 6). Thus, this research is a contribution to what already exists, while contextualising tribal conflict on Pentecostal clergy as the demography under review. The context of this research is tribal conflict among the Ndebele and Shona Pentecostal clergy, and it acknowledges that some authors have written on tribal conflict from a political level.

Vail alluded to the existence of tribal conflict within the revolutionary party of ZANU, which led to the murder of Herbert Chitepo, who was a Manyika and a leader of ZANU (Vail 1989: 118). Although Vail pointed out to tribal conflict existing among political elites, he was only targeting Shona sub-ethnicities, namely the Karanga, Zezuru, Manyika, Korekore, Karanga people (Vail 1989: 119). However, this research sought and succeeded to investigate tribal conflict among the Pentecostal clergy (both Ndebele and Shona) and unlike Vail’s position, it also sought to verify if truly tribalism is a post colonial era issue or not. Tribal Truth and reconciliation can only be realised within the clergy and the laity when all original causes of tribal conflict are openly dealt with. Vail’s assessment ascribed these tribal factions to post-colonial events, thereby refusing that these tribal factions existed before colonialism (Vail 1989: 120). To ascribe tribal factions or conflicts to post colonial era, is to then erase a necessary portion of history that is needed for the process of truth and reconciliation among African natives. This makes use of the South African template for reconciliation untenable in the case of Zimbabwe, especially when trying to deal with the Ndebele versus Shona tribal conflicts that have proliferated into the church. For example, the Ndebele people are hated by the Shona people because of the raids that were conducted by the first Ndebele Tribes who crossed from the Zulu Kingdom of South Africa. The contemporary tribal conflicts are due to trans-generational transmission of violence and trauma of the yester-years to the

present day, with the Shona people on the one hand still hung up on the 19th Century territorial tribal wars and the Ndebele are also hung up on the Gukurahundi Massacres of the 20th Century.

This research study agrees with Manyonganise's position that the church in Zimbabwe is not an isolated institution which is free from societal and cultural influences (Manyonganise 2015). To isolate the church from the societal and cultural influences is to render ourselves incapable of knowing how to pastorally care for the church, let alone its clergy. With regards to tribal conflict among the clergy it became an imperative for this research to also observe the societal values within which the conflict had arisen. In this case, the issue of tribal conflict had not been dealt with since it reared its ugly head among the political elite and the general populace. Manyonganise further postulated that the church in Zimbabwe had not been active in facilitating healing, because the church has not functioned as a unified entity (Manyonganise 2015). This statement rings true, especially in light to this research, with regards to tribal conflict among clergy which has rendered the church unable to unite the church. This internal haemorrhaging within the church needs to be dealt with so that healing can be experienced internally and externally. While Manyonganise's study was concentrating on the church in Manicaland and responded from a womanist gendered perspective (Manyonganise 2015), this research looked at the Clergy in churches found in Bulawayo and Harare as samples for analysis and study.

Figure 1 The Division of Zimbabwe By Provinces

SOURCE: - https://www.researchgate.net/figure/Map-of-Zimbabwe-showing-countrys-10-provinces_fig1_295719951 (Accessed 18 November 2019: 14h55)

Campolo and Battle posited that “ethnic groups of any kind need to be delivered from the tendency to worship their own identities (Campolo and Battle 2005: 21). If we all come into relationships with the God who transcends all cultural deities and wants ‘no graven images we will take a step toward transcending racism” (Campolo and Battle, 2005: 21). Although this statement is made with regards to American churches in particular and the American nation in general, it rings true to every follower of Yahshua Ha Mashiach/ Jesus the Messiah including the clergy. The Clergy in Zimbabwe need to be delivered from the tendency to worship their own tribal affiliations that make them worship in conflict with the Elohim/ God of the Bible. There is an urgent need to take steps towards transcending racism or tribalism for those who profess to be disciples and followers of Yahshua (also known as Jesus). To claim to be followers and disciples of Yahshua while propagating racism or tribalism is an oxymoron of the highest religious order, that denies the very Yahshua by practice. A call to higher moral disposition is demanded from the clergy in particular, seeing that they are “supposed custodians of

Truth and reconciliation” who must lead by example and understanding. A clergy that has transcended racism or tribalism is a clergy that represents Yahshua well.

2.2 Historical Background

The distinctions of these two major tribes or ethnic groups in Zimbabwe are not only of geographical location but also of language and social demeanour. Nnoli explained ethnic or tribal distinctions by stating that ethnic groups in Sub-Saharan Africa are distinctively separated by their different communal characteristics, like language and geographical boundaries than physical appearance (Nnoli 1998: 353). With regards to this research, this fits with the boundaries and languages of the Ndebele and Shona people, such that when the other encroaches into the other’s space then conflicts ensue. The Ndebele are physically known to be very light in complexion as compared to their Shona counterparts. The Languages of these two tribes are also distinct in expression, with the Ndebele dialect using the letter “L” where the Shona dialect uses the letter “R”, (just to mention one of the many language distinctions and letter distinctions found among these two tribes). In terms of social demeanour, the Ndebele people are very reserved, while the Shona people are very loud.

The historical background that has brought tribalism into the church did not originate inside the church, but began within the political and social arena as was shown by Motsi in his doctoral thesis whereby he stated that the issue of tribal conflict among the two major tribes dates back to the pre-colonial era (Motsi 2010: 18). Motsi further posited that the weakening of and in-fighting among the Shona people was conducive for the invasion by the Nguni Speaking people of South Africa who had crossed into Shona territory (Motsi 2010: 18). According to Motsi, these Ndebele invasions saw the Shona people paying tribute to Mzilikazi, a Ndebele king so as to be protected from any other marauding tribes and the Portuguese merchants (Motsi 2010: 18). Motsi showed that this scenario continued until the invasion of Zimbabwe by the British settlers around 1893 before it became Rhodesia (Motsi 2010: 19). It is this history that has been passed down to Shona children and therefore the issue of tribalism is a trans-generational issue that has been transferred throughout generations through folklore and stories. This is

important to this research so as to understand the underlying causes of tribal friction among clergy, since they belong to their ethnic group before they become clergy. The issue of what pastoral care method should be used to deal with socialization issues that crop up when one is a clergy, are a good ground for further research.

The very fact that a people continues to foster anger and hate towards another people on the basis of a history of barbaric lifestyles and civilizations, who then did not find anything wrong with exercising their muscles for sustenance, is an indicator that the church has not fully dealt with the issue of forgiveness and reconciliation. If we cannot forgive others for their sins of ignorance, then should we be forgiven by our Lord? There is therefore a need to pastorally teach and guide through truth, peace, forgiveness and reconciliation. The issue of tribalism or racism should not be found among professing believers and followers of Yahshua ha Mashiach/ Jesus the Messiah, so as to restore the full message of reconciliation. History has to be dealt with, with the intention to foster hope, peace, truth, forgiveness and reconciliation and it must not be used to foster anger, unforgiveness and conflict especially with the Body of Yahshua. To deny history is to raise a people that do not understand their origin and purpose, therefore impacting future generations through history should be done with the sole purpose of knowledge, insight and gaining wisdom instead of creating strife.

Motsi further postulated that when the white colonisers settled in then Rhodesia, they made a deliberate effort to weaken the Ndebele dynasties and did not antagonise the Shona people who were considered to be already weak due to Ndebele raids and in-fighting among themselves (Motsi 2010: 20). It is a historical fact that the Ndebele people were weakened until even after Independence in 1980, whereby the Shona people saw that as an opportunity for revenge for the atrocities of the Ndebele ancestors. Motsi showed that the issue of tribal conflict did not end even during the War of Liberation as shown by the two armed wings' composition that had ZIPRA forces (Ndebele Liberation Fighters) and the ZANLA forces (Shona Liberation Fighters) (Motsi 2010: 22). This showed that even when they had identified a common enemy (their colonisers), they did not trust each other in order to form one Liberation Army but had to

have two (Ndebele and Shona) Liberation Fighter Armies. This information was important for this research as it showed how deep the tentacles of tribalistic influence were in the Zimbabwean society, including the Pentecostal Clergy. The tribal history that brought independence to the people of Zimbabwe did not end with independence but was even perpetuated after independence through a Government Machinery called the “Fifth Brigade”, that was trained to specifically thwart any Ndebele power or regrouping. Having viewed the history that brought the contemporary tribal conflict among the Ndebele and Shona people, it becomes clear that platforms for engaging in truth and reconciliation must be established in Zimbabwe. Although there have been many Truth and Reconciliation efforts that were done by government and some individuals in Zimbabwe, the issue of tribalism does not seem to have been solved. The existence of tribal conflict among the Pentecostal Clergy is clear proof that this issue has not been resolved.

2.3 Ethnicity

The term “ethnic or ethnicity” needs to be discussed in this research, so as to ascertain and establish why other cultures do not use the term “tribes or tribalism” when dealing with their conflict. Europe and the United States of America do not use the term “tribes or tribalism” to describe their social segregation based on homogenous differences including skin colour, languages, origins, etc. Since this research has compared literature from Europe and the United States of America, it is an imperative to seem to be digressing from the core of this research by reviewing “ethnicity, tribalism and racism” as terms that might mean the same thing. Nnoli defined ethnicity or tribalism as “a conflictual psychosocial phenomenon in which diverse ethnically conscious groups are competitively engaged” (Nnoli 1998: 354). This definition captures the essence of a need to research the “conflictual psychosocial phenomenon” with regards to Pentecostal clergy, as the very notion that this phenomenon might actually exist among the Pentecostal clergy is an oxymoron. Considering that the clergy are supposed to be propagators of truth and reconciliation in their pastoral capacity among Zimbabweans but, it became an issue for research so that a good pastoral care model would be

recommended to address this.

Hutchinson and Smith stated that; “The term ‘ethnicity’ is, quite clearly a derivative of the much older term and more commonly used adjective ‘ethnic’, which in the English language goes back to the Middle Ages. The English adjective ‘ethnic’ in turn derives from the ancient Greek term *ethnos*; it was used as a synonym of gentile, that is, non-Christian and non-Jewish pagan (Itself a rendering of the Hebrew *goy*). What these usages have in common is the idea of a number of people who share some cultural or biological characteristics, who live and act in common”. (Hutchinson and Smith eds. 1996: 4)²

This definition by Hutchinson and Smith (eds. 1996) is in tandem with the understanding of tribalism among Africans, whereby tribes are seen as people who “share common cultural and biological characteristics that make them act in the same way” (Hutchinson and Smith eds., 1996: 4). In the interest of this research, it therefore suffices to say that *ethnos* describes tribes and the distinction is only on who is being referred to. The importance of this clarity with regards to this research is that, the conclusions and recommendations will assist every clergy; whether European Clergy who subscribe to the notion of ethnic conflict or African clergy who subscribe to the notion of tribal conflict or American who subscribe to the notion of racial conflict. It is clear that these terms are synonymous in meaning and use, yet the distinctions are on the basis of language, social, and cultural affiliations. The very fact that conflict arises because another homogenously united group finds offense at the intrusion by another distinctly homogenous group among the clergy means that this is not only a Zimbabwean dilemma but a world dilemma that needs to be addressed with the sensitivity needed to bring truth, healing, reconciliation and peace.

Hutchinson and Smith further defined ethnic communities as “communities where the members interact regularly and have common interests and organizations at a collective level” (Hutchinson and Smith, eds. 1996: 6). This study concurs with Hutchinson and Smith (eds. 1996), as their description fits perfectly with observations made concerning the behaviours of the Ndebele and Shona people in general with behaviours also of the

² John Hutchinson & Anthony D. Smith concentrated their research on Ethnicity.

Ndebele and Shona Clergy in particular. The Ndebele Clergy and Shona Clergy “interact regularly” and have established a “common interest” with those of their ethnic or tribal affiliation and have also established a disdain towards those of different “common interest”. It is this “regular interaction and common interests within church organizations that seem to be also a breeding ground for tribal conflict, as other groups prefer to interact with those whom they share common ancestry and interests, instead of including those they have a history of conflict dating back to pre-colonization eras. To further clarify their point, Hutchinson and Smith referred to the meaning of ethnic groups by Schermerhorn;

An ethnic group is defined here as a collective within a larger society having real or putative common ancestry, memories of a shared historical past, and a cultural focus on one or more symbolic elements defined as epitome of their people hood. Examples of such symbolic elements are kinship patterns, physical contiguity (as in localism or sectionalism), religious affiliation, language or dialect forms, tribal affiliation, nationality, phenotypical features, or any combination of these. A necessary accompaniment is some consciousness of kind among members of the group. (Schermerhorn 1978: 12)³

Schermerhorn’s definition established and affirmed that ethnic groups are no different from tribal groups, or racial groups as they all have the same thread of seeking homogeneous harmony that makes them distinct from others. In the case of the Ndebele and Shona ethnic or tribal groups within the church, there are seemingly coherent ‘symbolic elements’ that are in total sync with Schermerhorn’s definition, for example, these groups are influenced by “same language or dialect, kinship patterns, shared historical past, common ancestry” (Schermerhorn 1978: 12). These “symbolic elements” have been seen to be the very cause for tribal conflict especially the issue of “memories of a shared historical past” (Schermerhorn 1978: 12). The Ndebele raids of the 18th century have made the Shona continue to harbour anger and animosity towards the Ndebele, while on the other hand, the Gukurahundi Massacres of the 1983 – 1987 era seem to have made Ndebele harbour anger and animosity towards the Shona. It is these ‘memories of a shared historical past that continue to permeate even among the Clergy who share a common ancestry with others within the nation of Zimbabwe in

³ Schermerhorn majored on Comparative Ethnic Relations.

general and some within the churches where they have oversight, thereby perpetuating animosity among the two tribes. To deny past atrocities towards their kin is seen as betrayal, thus even the clergy prefer to betray Our Lord, Yahshua Ha Mashiach/ Jesus the Messiah and stand in solidarity with their kinsmen to find social injustices by using whatever platform is within their means to do so. This has seen the issue of tribal conflict transcending generations and social strata, and even finding comfort in the pews such that clergy are even in cohorts with congregants to perpetuate tribal discord.

Schermerhorn pointed out that “ethnic groups are part of a larger society” (Schermerhorn 1978: 12), and this description fits well in the case of the Ndebele and Shona in Zimbabwe, hence to address the tribal conflict between the Ndebele and Shona Clergy will set a precedence that can be applied to the whole Body of Yahshua in Zimbabwe and the nation of Zimbabwe, thereby bringing total reconciliation. In this research, the Ndebele and Shona ethnic or tribal clergy were taken as a case study sample that assisted to understand the whole. As much as this research selected Ndebele and Shona Clergy as the sample for analysis or investigation, the recommendations and conclusions have a propensity to affect clergy from other ethnic or tribal groups as well as the nation of Zimbabwe.

Landrine and Klonoff postulated that the relationship between race and ethnicity is that races are always ethnic groups (Landrine and Klonoff 1996: 8). This is the position that this research study took, so as to draw parallels between the American literature that speaks of racism, while the African literature speaks of tribalism or ethnicity. In the context of this research study, the issues of race or tribe or ethnicity are viewed in the context of individual responses towards the distinctions of the significant others who are of the same faith. The issue of arising tribal conflict due to these distinctions is a cause for concern especially when tribalism is found among the Clergy as these hinders the propagation of the Gospel Message to the utmost parts of the world. The American view of racism is not distinct from the African view of tribalism, as these two definitions seem to be describing similar behaviours.

McLemore showed that the issue of prejudice and discrimination among people

is perpetuated through generations through what he calls “Cultural Transmission Theory of Prejudice” (McLemore 1984:122). McLemore states that;

“One important type of theory holds that children learn prejudice in much the same way they learn to speak a particular language, dress in a given manner, or use certain eating utensils. From this viewpoint, the building blocks of prejudice are contained within the society’s traditions or cultures and are transmitted to children in a natural way as they are exposed to those traditions in the home and community” (McLemore 1984: 123).

This research concurs with McLemore that cultural transmission is a reality; all of the justifications for tribalism are based on what has been culturally transferred from one generation to the other. The effect of cultural transmission has got its good sides when it helps to preserve good and godly cultural ethos and values, however it also has got the bad when it promotes and perpetuates hate among people on the basis of some historical myth. To then witness that cultural transmission finding its expression among believers in general and Clergy in particular among the household of faith, brings the question of the issue of introducing a counter-culture that portrays the message of reconciliation, love and peace. The issue of cultural transmission among those of the household of faith is seen in this research study as deserving further study and research. Since children are culturally assimilated from childhood, then the question is raised that at what level of Christian growth should a believer be assimilated into the counter-culture of those of the household of faith.

McLemore further showed that the other influencing factor for continued racial or ethnic or tribal prejudice is that members are pressurised to conform to the group’s norms by always being fearful of being ostracised or harmed by the in-group if they don’t join the group’s response towards the out-group (McLemore 1984: 153). It has been witnessed that not all Ndebele or Shona people are tribally hostile towards other tribes, however for the sake of tribal posterity and affiliation they then show indifference instead of taking a posture that disagrees with group ethos. It has to be stated that some of the Clergy are not tribally hostile towards Ndebele or Shona people, however, because the majority of their congregants are either Ndebele or Shona depending on geographical location of the church, they are forced to go with the flow. This scenario has made sure that the issue of tribalism is not dealt with among the Clergy in particular and the church in general.

Nash while defining ethnicity wrote that ethnicity has building blocks that bring clarity to what it is and he also posited that ethnicity identity, content and boundaries show that it is a historical product that is subject to change, redefinition and varied salience in the lives of the members of a particular ethnic group (Nash 1989: 5). This research study concedes that this definition assisted in the selection of a pastoral care method that would assist the Clergy to redefine their posture towards each other and those of different ethnic or tribal affiliation. This redefinition is important for the future production of literature and theological curriculum that would transform Clergy's perspective on tribalism.

2.4 Tribal Conflict among Clergy

2.4.1 American View

In his study of the Josephites, Ochs illustrated that the;

“tenacity and insidiousness of institutional racism and the tendency of churches to opt for institutional security rather than a prophetic stance in the face of controversial social issues. His book ably demonstrates that the struggle of black Catholics for priests of their own race mirrored the efforts of Afro-Americans throughout American society to achieve racial equality and justice” (Ochs 1993).

Ochs' analysis showed that the Clergy are also susceptible to tribal or racial prejudice to protect institutions instead of promulgating Biblical Truth (Ochs 1993). Although Ochs was centred on the Roman Catholic Josephites, whose history shows that initially they were receptive to incorporating African Americans into their Seminaries, they later reneged on their decision (Ochs 1993). Ochs showed that tribal or racial prejudice is found even among the American Clergy, in this particular case, Catholic Clergy (Ochs 1993). He further pointed out that the racial prejudices among the Catholics affected the growth of the church among African American until 1930 when the black clergy were now trained and ordained (Ochs 1993). Ochs' analysis helped this research by establishing that tribal or racial conflict does exist among clergy and church elites, however the distinction comes with the demography he reviewed, “examining the issue

through the experience of St. Joseph's Society of the Sacred Heart, or the Josephites, the only American community of Catholic priests devoted exclusively to evangelization of blacks" (Ochs: 1993).

Friedland looked at the White American Clergy's response to racism and their support of the Civil rights movements between 1954 and 1973, and in his assessment he promulgated that the clergy's stand against social injustices of the day (Friedland 1998: 90). His posture agrees with other authors on how well the church will rally together with external racial or tribal injustices; however, it seemed to be socially mute when it came to dealing with tribal or racial conflict among the clergy. This research considered that it this was a deliberate inconsistency by the church, and in this particular instance clergy to deal with tribal conflict among its rank and file. The reaction and position of Clergy in dealing with civil issues is very clear and commendable by Friedland (Friedland 1998: 95) and this author is aware that the Clergy in Zimbabwe have also been very active during pre and post-independent Zimbabwe in dealing with civil injustices outside the church. However, there seems to be a silence even by Friedland and others on the participation of Clergy to deal with conflict or unrest within the church, let alone tribal or racial conflict among clergy. Friedland pointed out that;

"Most of the Clergy had argued their case in support of the Civil Rights movement that it was based on moral and religious grounds due to the common humanity under God" (Friedland 1998: 96)⁴.

This statement is very valid for this research as it shows the ground at which clergy should operate in within the church. A moral and religious higher ground is of necessity when handling matters of tribalism and racialism, whereby any clergy who refuses to acknowledge and accept the dictates of their oath by using segregative measures is one who operates at a lower than humanly acceptable ground. Moral and religious requirements of a clergy's confession demand that tribalism and racialism should not be used within or without the church, even among the clergy. It cannot be understated what other white clergy had to go through (Friedland 1998: 96) while standing for that which is morally, ethically and religiously good and this should be a clarion call that the Clergy

⁴ Friedland centered his research on White Clergy and the Civil Rights & Antiwar Movements between 1954 – 1973.

in Zimbabwe need to sacrifice themselves in order to deal with tribal conflict among clergy in particular, the church and nation in general.

In his book, entitled “Adventures in Black Catholic History: Research and Writing”, Foley wrote about the history of Roman Catholic Church and its struggle with racial prejudice among clergy by stating;

In the first ten years of its existence, the unvoiced intent of the Divine Word Fathers (DWF) was to recruit and ordain American Negro candidates for the priesthood in order to send them to missions in Africa. The DWF did this so as to take the heat off the American Bishops and remove from their list of problems, that of accepting the Black candidates in their own seminaries and placing Black priests in their parishes and other works (Foley 1986: 118)⁵

Foley wrote this article as a Black Clergy who was keen on capturing the experiences of some of the well-known Black Clergy within the Catholic, namely Bishop James Augustine Healy of Portland, Maine and his experiences within the Catholic Church (Foley 1986: 118). Foley further pointed out how he became a victim of racial prejudice within the Catholic Church, when doing his doctoral research on the life of Bishop James Healy was rejected due to the sensitive nature of what he captured, not to prove racial segregation, but portray the life of black clergy in Catholic America (Foley 1986: 118). This insight assisted this research to understand how sensitive the issue of racial or tribal segregation is within the church and how it can be used by those in authority against the very message of reconciliation which Clergy are supposed to be propagators of. Foley’s book (Foley 1986) while giving great insight into the nature of racism among American Catholic Clergy assisted this research to investigate beyond the obvious, investigating whether Clergy positions among Ndebele and Shona have been used to perpetuate tribalism.

McGreevy while describing the history of African American Catholic parishioners around the period 1919 to 1926 showed how the racial and ethnic tensions were in the American Catholic church, such that black parishioners had different schools, seminaries and even parishes from their white counterparts (McGreevy 1996: 32).

⁵ Accessed and Viewed on 23 May 2019)

McGreevy's posture was on the Roman Catholic Church in the urban north of the United States of America and how it responded to racial injustices (McGreevy 1996: 32). His research showed that racial injustices can be found within the church and if not dealt with can have adverse effects on the social fabric of any nation. This research used the American history as a sounding board to investigate tribalism among Pentecostal Clergy in Zimbabwe, unlike McGreevy's (1996) demography which was the African American Laity (McGreevy 1996). McGreevy further posited that the lack of clergy oversight among the African American laity caused some of the young people to leave the faith when they arrived in the North from the South (McGreevy 1996: 32). This study also shows that the formation of Ndebele Speaking only congregations and Clergy was a response to the tribal conflict that existed in Zimbabwe. This shows that people (even Clergy) can respond to tribalism or racial injustices by forming alliances and gatherings that make them feel safe.

McGreevy further showed that in response to this dilemma, African Americans had to ask to have parishes of their own that were separate from white parishioners since they had already felt unwelcomed and unwanted (McGreevy 1996: 32). This seems to be anyone's natural response to rejection, as has been seen by some clergy in Zimbabwean Independent Pentecostal-Charismatic churches living their mother churches to form smaller churches that are demographically sympathetic to their ethnic or tribal affiliations. McGreevy's assessment of the responses showed that it is an expected human response towards segregation and racial injustices to then want to move out of a "contaminated environment" (McGreevy 1996: 32). This aligns with observations made among clergy and laity in Zimbabwe, who then find comfort in establishing organisations outside of their initial affiliate churches as a response to tribal conflict. The above mentioned concepts of racism have proven that this issue is global, and with this in mind let us now analyse the African input of some scholars on this issue.

2.4.2 African View

According to Manyonganise, "the initial calls for the national healing in 1980 were criticised for being narrow-minded, individualistic, selfish while lacking the support of the

majority of victims of the pre-independence war” (Manyonganise 2015: 1). There is concurrence with Manyonganise’s view, which further compounded the need for this research as it probed some of the victims. However, while Manyonganise’s research was on women in Manicaland area, this research looked at Clergy in Harare and Bulawayo which are the two major cities of Zimbabwe. The need to look at these two major cities was driven by the demographic content of their respective habitants; namely Bulawayo is predominantly a city where most Ndebele people work and stay due to the fact that the surrounding rural areas are for mostly Ndebele speaking people. While on the other hand, Harare is dominated by Shona people and is also surrounded by Mashonaland region.

Chitando in his article concerning the role of the church in the Zimbabwean politics acknowledged that during the 2008 period which was the period under his article review concedes that the church remained both a problem and solution to the demise of the socio-political terrain of Zimbabwe. However, his article was mainly looking at the Church’s involvement in order to influence peace and reconciliation on the socio-political arena (Chitando 2010: 151). Chitando’s perspective, though necessary in interrogating the church’s role in influencing social changes still does not address the church’s implosion (or internal instabilities), vis, the clergy tribal conflict which is the main thrust of this research (Chitando 2010: 151). This researcher believes that as long as the church’s haemorrhaging is not dealt with, then everything it will try to externally deal with will explode. Hence this research sought to explore the internal implosion of tribal conflict among clergy as a first point of call in healing and reconciling the church.

Attah-Poku called the discussion about ethnicity a “slippery discussion” and suggested that a comprehensive and comparative assessment of the role played by ethnicity in influencing contemporary times will help develop a better understanding of the dynamics involved (Attah-Poku 1998: 45). This researcher concurs with Attah-Poku, thereby proposing that further studying of the ethnic fabric of the clergy in Zimbabwe will assist in better understanding the dynamics involved in order to formulate a conducive pastoral care model for the demographic terrain of Zimbabwe Clergy. Attah-Poku,

further suggested that the “hands-off approach”, that had been employed by many scholars, public analysts, and lay examiners when dealing with ethnic issues must be discontinued (Attah-Poku 1998: 53). She further pointed out that the Ethnic Issue is a global issue, however in the context of her book she decided to zero in on African Ethnicity (Attah-Poku 1998: 53). In view of this global awareness on ethnicity, this research did not seek to tackle the issue at global level or even at national level, considering all the different groups of tribes and languages found in Zimbabwe. The target demography is the Pentecostal clergy, and it has to be pointed out that there already is an awareness of the tendency by clergy in Zimbabwe to take a “tortoise posture” of going into its shell by pretending that tribal differences do not exist. A social problem does not disappear because the society has decided to go on “social voicemail” and not talk about it.

Dane posited that action research is defined as a research conducted to solve a social problem (Dane 1990: 8). This definition expounds the purpose of this research proposal, whereby the recommendations are intended to bring a solution to the problem of tribalism or ethnic discord among clergy. The aspect of practical theology demands that there be a social solution to the problem of tribal/ ethnic conflict among clergy. Action research was the preferred method that will be used to sample and collect data for further clarification and observation. There has been extensive study on the Gukurahundi Massacre (also known as the Matabeleland Massacre), and how the North Korean trained army (mostly Shona people) was used to kill more than 20,000 Ndebele people (Motsi, 2010; 4). Although Motsi promulgated that "the church is proposed as the agent for change in the community as light and salt due to its proximity to the community", he did not show how "the agent of change" needed to deal with the corruption (tribalism) within itself so that it can be a true agent of reconciliation and peace (Motsi, 2010; 4). The research work that has been done by previous researchers is the necessary foundation that is needed to further research this topic, although the emphasis is now on the Pentecostal clergy.

Motsi further alluded that "nothing has been done about the problem of the

Matabeleland Massacre of 1982 - 1987 even by the church" and this researcher concurs with Motsi on the silence of the church in Zimbabwe (Motsi, 2010; 6). Could this silence be due to the fact that the clergy themselves need to heal from previous injustices, so that they can be agents of healing and reconciliation? Before a person, is a clergy, they belong to a certain group of people, beliefs and traditions, hence their earlier formative years can hinder or promote certain practices that are in conflict biblically. The hypocrisy of Peter at Antioch when he showed a split personality while dealing with his fellow Jews and Gentiles is a reminder that tribal discord is a possibility even among the "called and anointed" (Galatians 2: 11 – 14). On the basis of Motsi's statement this research sought to find out the reasons for the silence of the church, hence the need to research the tribal fabric of the clergy, who are custodians of truth and reconciliation (Motsi, 2010; 6). There have been stories of Clergy being rejected by the national leadership of church organisations, because of their affiliation to a certain tribe. Paul, the apostle of Yahshua declared that there is no longer Jew or Gentile to them who are in Yahshua, yet the Clergy in Zimbabwe seem to see tribal demarcations.

Murambadoro and Wielenga, pointed out that in the past the Zimbabwean government has made efforts to reconcile, however all of these efforts were at political level "the Lancaster House Agreement in 1979, the Dumbuchena and Chihambakwe Commissions of Inquiry in 1981 and 1983, the Unity Accord in 1987, the Global Political Agreement (GPA) in 2008, which was followed by the Organ for National Healing, Reconciliation and Integration (ONHRI) in 2009, and finally the recent National Peace and Reconciliation Commission which was enacted into law in February, 2013" (Murambadoro and Wielenga 2015: 1). Murambadoro and Wielenga also pointed out that all these efforts were political efforts and none of them were reconciliation efforts that were grown from the grassroots, and the communities (Murambadoro and Wielenga 2015: 1). There seems to be no grassroot efforts towards truth, peace and reconciliation and this scenario poses a risk of dealing only with the outside while the inside is nothing more than a beautiful tombstone full of rotting flesh and bones. In light of this research, the Pentecostal clergy form part of one of the essential grassroot elements within a society and therefore needed also to be investigated to find

underlining causes and ways to deal with tribal conflict among them.

Murambadoro and Wielenga postulated that “Peace building and conflict resolution processes across the African continent have been criticised for their elite-focus, lack of legitimacy, lack of local participation and insensitivity to local needs” (Murambadoro and Wielenga, 2015: 2). The African scholars agree with the American Scholars on the need to review ways to deal with tribal, or ethnic or racial conflict among the church in particular and nations in general. The American and African views make it clear that tribal, racial and ethnic conflict has existed and does exist among the Clergy in particular and people in general. It then becomes imperative that this literature research analysis proceeded to analyse the perspective of the Bible with the regards to tribal, racial and ethnic conflict. It has to be stated that this researcher believes that the Bible is the Ultimate Authority on matters to deal with life and godliness, thereby making the Bible the final voice on this matter that would guide the curriculum needed to deal with tribal, racial or ethnic conflict among the Clergy in particular and laity in general. The Bible’s perspective in this research is not exhaustive, but it is enough to give clarity to the matter at hand, so as to make informed recommendations and suggestions with regards to Tribal Conflict among the Clergy.

2.4.3 Biblical View

The Bible mentions different people-groups, for example the Egyptians, Philistines, Moabites just to mention a few, however when it comes to tribes there is mention of the twelve tribes of Israel. The conflicts that are shown in Scripture were with regards to Elohim’s purpose and had nothing to do with people’s petty and carnal preference. Elohim regarded Philistines as His enemies with regards to their preference to worship and serve other gods, as much as He hated the sins and transgressions of Israel. While the heathens experienced death for their idolatry, Israel also experienced death due to her idolatry, there is no biblical evidence that shows or promotes tribalism. The Old Testament is full of territorial conflict that had nothing to do with racial, ethnic or tribal

conflict but had everything to do with territorial prowess over others. Other nations (for example Babylon and Medo-Persians) were used by Elohim as His rod of rebuke to idolatrous Israel, and it has to be noted that these incidences in no way prescribe using tribalism or racialism within the gathering of believers.

The Levitical Priesthood was mandated to take care of everyone including strangers who were among them. Their mandate was never to segregate anyone who seeks refuge within their people on the basis of language, cultural or social distinctions. The Levitical priesthood promoted a safe environment for all who became proselytised into the Hebrew faith, while also protecting those who remain indifferent to the Jewish faith and way of life.

Leviticus 19: 33 – 34, and if a stranger sojourn with thee in your land, ye shall not do him wrong. The stranger that sojourneth with you shall be unto you as the home-born among you, and thou shalt love him as thyself; for ye were sojourners in the land of Egypt: I am Jehovah your God.⁶

The disposition of the Levitical priesthood should inform any clergy to understand the heartbeat of Elohim or God concerning the treatment of strangers who sojourn among the saints in the household of faith. Some can be strangers according to tribal affiliation or confession of faith; however, it is the love of those of the household of faith that will win them over. To deny the mandate to love each other is to deny the very Elohim whom we claim to believe in, and this is noted and fully expressed by our Lord and Redeemer, Yahshua Ha Mashiach/ Jesus the Messiah in John 13;

John 13:34 – 35, A new commandment I give unto you, that ye love one another; even as I have loved you, that ye also love one another. By this shall all men know that ye are my disciples, if ye have loved one to another.⁷

The mandate to love one another should transcend tribal discord and historical myths of hate, in the church generally and Clergy particularly. The Lord set Himself in this text as the epitome or example to follow and that disposition cascades from His disciples to everyone who purports to be a believer and follower of Yahshua. It is in expression of

⁶ King James Version

⁷ King James Version

love for everyone in the household of faith that it becomes known whose we are, therefore, anything that contradicts this commandment proves that he or she is not a follower or disciple of Yahshua Ha Mashiach. This message needs to be made clear to all those who continue to promote tribal conflict, most especially the Clergy so that they are aware that by their very actions they are denying the very Lord and Redeemer they claim to represent.

Romans 10: 12 – 13, for there is no distinction between Jew and Greek: for the same *Lord* is Lord of all and is rich unto all that call upon him: for, whosoever shall call upon the name of the Lord shall be saved.⁸

Scripture is very clear that ours is a common faith and that in Yahshua the tribal, racial or ethnic distinctions fall off, thereby removing any root of bitterness from past hurts and injustices. To continue to perpetuate past hurts is to render ourselves also unforgiven according to the Lord's Prayer. The issue of tribal conflict among the Clergy in Zimbabwe needs to be addressed as a matter of urgency as it is a festering wound.

2.5 Preliminary Conclusion

The darkness that has engulfed the church due to tribal, racial and ethnic conflicts is expressed properly by John in the second Epistle as follows;

1 John 2:9 He that saith he is in the light and hateth his brother, is in the darkness even until now. He that loveth his brother abideth in the light, and there is no occasion of stumbling in him. But he that hateth his brother is in the darkness, and walketh in the darkness, and knoweth not whither he goeth, because the darkness hath blinded his eyes.⁹

Either the church has deliberately ignored or disobeyed what is obviously expressed in the Canon or most have acted out of ignorance of Scripture, and a call to repentance is an urgent matter for those in church leadership as well as the Laity. To perpetually continue to walk in darkness and be proponents of that which is against Scripture is to deny the very faith that one claims to be submitted to. In the church the issue of conflict that arises due to cultural, racial, tribal and ethnic distinctions needs to be something

⁸ King James Version

⁹ King James Version

that is not even spoken of. Lessons from the churches in America and Africa should be a clarion call for all and sundry to check their disposition towards their brothers and sisters in the faith lest they find themselves denying the very faith that they purport to follow. The American and African scholars have agreed that racial, or tribal conflict is a misnomer in the household of faith. The Bible also does not support racial, tribal and ethnic segregation and this should inform the need for behavioural change among Clergy in particular and laity in general.

1.1.2 Case Study (Cont.): Meanwhile, the regional leadership of Matabeleland had approved the transfer of Pastor Khumalo to Harare by also contacting Apostle Chokuda to begin to facilitate the smooth transition. Pastor Khumalo had applied for transfer to Harare at the insistence of his family although he had hoped that the regional office would refuse to release him. When Apostle Chokuda received the release and recommendation letters, he was very upset but feared another split of the church. Apostle Chokuda began to look for men and women within the church that were going to be led by Pastor Khumalo in Harare, and meetings were held at homes to plan the downfall of Pastor Khumalo before he had even arrived. Pastor Khumalo's wife and children were very excited that their husband and father respectively would be joining them soon; little did they know what this move will do to this young family.

3. THE RESEARCH METHODOLOGY

3.1 Introduction

Having established a common understanding of the phenomena of tribalism or racism or ethnic conflict via review of scholarly literature from the West and Africa, this chapter now explores the qualitative research method and the reasons for the choosing it as a suitable methodology. While the term “tribalism” is viewed by some scholars as a colonial term, it is imperative to state that the term is used in this research because tribalism is a Zimbabwean worldview. It is this researcher’s position that the very notion that tribalism is a colonial phenomenon is premised on the assumption that tribes did not exist before colonisation, which is no different from claiming that anything only exists because it was first captured on paper. Before colonialism, there were people of different language, social structures as well as physical built. It is these distinctions that saw people staying among their own people and this preference to feel comfortable among one’s kin cannot be classified as tribal conflict. Tribal conflict is the expression of violence and hate of other people due to past hurts or social beliefs such that it infringes on the other’s rights for freedom.

This research study does not seek to discuss the semantics of colonial notions of tribalism and the African pre or post-colonial notions of tribalism. The qualitative method has been chosen for this study, because it caters for the nominal aspect of enquiry as compared to the quantitative method that produces numerical data. The main disadvantage of the quantitative method with regards to this research study is that there is need to analyse a large masses of statistical data before one formulates a hypothesis and this demands more time spent on this process alone.

Qualitative research also enables a researcher to generate more data evidence by seeking to understand the clergy within their surroundings and social settings. The qualitative method assisted this researcher to understand the underlying reasons used by Ndebele and Shona clergy to want to violently maintain their social realities

'uncontaminated' by those they deem to be outsiders. While the quantitative method looks at the statistics and figures to validate the existence of a phenomenon under review, the qualitative method seeks to engage with clergy and use their responses as measures that qualify or disqualify the hypothesis about the existence of tribal conflict among Pentecostal clergy. The descriptive aspect was used by analysing research literature of previous tribal behaviours so as to have a comparative analysis with contemporary Pentecostal clergy practices on tribal conflict.

Practical theology by its own merit and intent is a qualitative research method that inquires into the practical aspect of theology, hence the selection of Nick Pollard (1997; 48) positive deconstruction process of enquiry and analysis has been incorporated to run concurrently with actual qualitative method of enquiry and analysis. The Pastoral Care Methodology that was applied is Positive Deconstruction by Pollard whereby he postulated four elements of the process of Positive Deconstruction as necessary for evangelism. While Pollard's emphasis was on evangelising four types of people who respond differently to the Gospel message, this research study used the Positive Deconstruction process to engage the Pentecostal Clergy in Bulawayo and Harare cities by identifying their underlying tribal worldview, analysing their tribal worldview in line with Scripture, affirming the elements of Truth contained in their tribal worldview and finally discovering the errors within their tribal worldview. This process was done using the Participatory Action Research (PAR) because it used two (2) male co-researchers who are members of the Para-church organisation and also to have the research participants actively involved in the construction or deconstruction process by way of interviews, questionnaires and discussions.

The research recommendations will be communicated (following approval) to the provincial and national leaders of the two Clergy groups who have agreed to participate in this research study. The second aspect of participatory research that was involved, is at an advisory level whereby the research will consultatively advise the national and provincial leadership beyond this study. The third aspect of PAR will be post-study revisiting of the Para-church organisation, in an effort to continue inquiry and seek

further understanding of this phenomenon. One may argue that there is no need to use Participatory Action Research (PAR) along with Pollard's Positive Deconstruction Model, however this researcher believes that these are two sides of the same coin that seek to engage and involve the research participants in order to not only establish a theory beyond research, but to also create awareness and responses that transform the researched problem into a solution for the demography under study.

This chapter draws a research design that caters for the research requirements' trajectory in view of the demography under review, the social and political dynamics of the country, as well as the sensitivity of this matter among the Ndebele and Shona people. Two male co-researchers have been engaged to assist during this research, with one based in Harare for the Shona demography while the other is based in Bulawayo for the Ndebele demography. The purpose of this research study was not to deal with the issue of patriarchy, to denounce or announce patriarchy, nor did it seek to investigate patriarchy. One may argue that the two metro cities are too young to harbour patriarchal behaviour, yet the social, political and leadership structural compositions reveal that Zimbabwe is still a patriarchal nation. The selection of the two co-researchers was based on their involvement with and affiliation to the Pentecostal Para-church organisation that has been approached for this research study and also consideration to the fact that Zimbabwe is still a patriarchal nation. Recently, the Pentecostal movements have established Para-church organisations in an effort to unite the many denominations that claim to be Pentecostal in their liturgical DNA. The approach of one such organisation was to ensure that an umbrella Pentecostal organisation would be suitable for accessing a broader base of participants under one roof, while reducing time and resource constraints.

This research used the term Para-church organisation to refer to Christian organisations that work outside church structures and dogmas to strengthen the church and bring unity among believers in Zimbabwe. The reason for approaching the Pentecostal Para-church is due to their endeavour to bring many clergies under one roof in an effort to foster a unity of faith. Pentecostal Para-church organizations have also managed to

cross denominational lines, thereby being good ground to access clergy from different denominations under one roof. By using pseudonyms, the research study has ensured that the identities of the clergy will remain anonymous in partial fulfilment of the ethical requirements of the university and also due to the sensitivity of the tribal conflict matter among the Clergy in particular, the Pentecostal church and nation in general.

3.2 Research Methodology Selected

3.2.1 Research Design

A case study design was selected for the enquiry of the tribal conflict between Ndebele and Shona Pentecostal clergy, because the case of tribalism within these two tribes is unique and has been in pro-longed existence in Zimbabwe. The literature review chapter has already established that the issue of tribal or racial or ethnic conflict among the clergy is not a Zimbabwean phenomenon only but a world phenomenon. The qualitative method was used to examine the tribal conflict between Ndebele and Shona Clergy of the Pentecostal churches in Zimbabwe's two largest cities, namely Bulawayo and Harare. These two tribes became the case study under review while appreciating that they are not exhaustive for all the tribes that are found in Zimbabwe. Kumar posited that a "case study can be an individual, a group, a community, an episode, a subgroup of a population, a town, a city (Kumar, 2011: 126). With regards to the research study there are two subgroups within the population of Zimbabwe that were chosen, and these are Ndebele and Shona sub-groups or tribes.

The Cities of Bulawayo and Harare are separated by more than four hundred (400) kilometres, and their selection was based on the composition of their citizenry due to their proximities to the two tribes' villages (which are the major suppliers of the urban population of these two cities), and the influence of rural to urban migration (see figure 1). Though separated by such a distance, the case of tribal conflict among the Pentecostal Clergy in Bulawayo and Harare respectively, was considered in this research to be a single case that affects only these two tribes due to their history. The singular aspect of this case study is based on the realisation that both these groups

seemed to be responding in similar manner towards each other, hence the need to understand this phenomenon further.

This research assumed a constructivist inquiry that investigates Tribal Conflict among Ndebele and Shona Clergy as the contemporary phenomenon that is based on real life issues that affect the Clergy in particular and church in general. Constructivism is close to interpretivism in that while Interpretivism looks at essential features or symbols of shared understanding and meaning, Constructivism complements by looking at the knowledge that has been produced and then interpret it. The interpretation aspect was captured under the findings and recommendations chapter (Chapter 7) of this research study. The participant clergy constructed their knowledge and understanding of the tribal conflict within their social context (Ndebele and Shona) that was also influenced by their history, language, politics, theology and socio-cultural knowledge and understanding.

Creswell and Plano-Clark defined the Constructivist worldview as;

“A worldview associated with qualitative approaches and forms an understanding or meaning of the phenomena formed through participants and their subjective views. When participants provide their understandings, they speak from meanings shaped by social interactions with others and from their personal histories. In this form of inquiry, the research is shaped ‘from the bottom up’ – from individual perspectives to broad patterns and ultimately to broad understandings” (Creswell and Clark 2011: 40)

The underlying selection of this research design is the fact that the realities of the phenomenon under enquiry were shaped by societal values, hence the need to understand the societal values that was influenced by tribal conflict between these two tribes of clergy. In order to emphasise or promote a Constructivist Epistemological discourse, two male clergy co-researchers were co-opted to construct a social reality based on their intimate relationship with the participants, as they are clergy from the two tribes who are affiliated with the Para-church organisation that has branches in both the two cities. The two male Pentecostal clergy chosen to fulfil the roles of co-researchers

are from the Ndebele and Shona tribes respectively and will ensure that the meanings emerge organically without manipulation or bias. Views expressed in this dissertation study are mostly reflective of Pentecostal clergy level opinions analysed from the clergy who voluntarily participated in this research study. The analysis and categorisation of this research study is based on the issues raised by the Pentecostal clergy participants from the Bulawayo and Harare sampled clergy, and the findings are not exhaustive but give a basis for further systematic investigations. Nnoli postulated that the “Ndebele and Shona are the two main ethnic or tribal groups in Zimbabwe; with the Shona constituting seventy-seven percent (77%) and Ndebele constituting nineteen percent (19%) of the black population of Zimbabwe” (Nnoli, 1998; 354). Since Literature Review has already established that the issue of tribal, or racial, or ethnic conflict among clergy is a global phenomenon, its findings will not only assist the church in Zimbabwe, but its conclusions and recommendations may be used to draw comparative inferences that might assist the church globally.

3.2.2 Research Participants (Sample)

The value of the participants (namely Ndebele and Shona Clergy) was on the basis of their contribution to bring clarity to this investigative enquiry about tribal conflict among clergy, hence the Questionnaires have open-ended questions to give room for the participants to state their position without manipulation. The total number of the individuals who participated in this study research was thirty (30), and the composition was split into two for each city, that is, fifteen (15) each for the two cities. The fifteen (15) Clergies included both males and females in Bulawayo, so as to ascertain whether tribalism affects only one gender or both genders. In Harare the same sequence of selection was used for male and female clergy and cognisance was acknowledged with regards to number representations of both. While the co-researchers were both males, the selection of participants made sure that patriarchy is not promoted. The ages ranged from twenty (20) years to eighty (80) years so as to have a balanced perspective that clarified the tribal conflict phenomena. The Clergies were selected from most senior and experienced leaders to the least junior and inexperienced leaders so as to cover all

spheres of influence thereby bringing varied perspectives about tribal conflict.

The research was done among Pentecostal Para-church organisations, who have tried to unite the different Pentecostal denominations and meet every month to promote the unity of faith. It was during one of these monthly meetings that participants were asked to participate and when they consented, then the questionnaires were presented to them for completing. Interviews were conducted with some members of the executive, as this enabled to hear from those in the Para-church leadership who had dealt with tribal conflict from some of their affiliate clergy. The familiarity and proximity of the environment minimised any discomfort that could have been caused by using unfamiliar settings.

Unstructured interviews were conducted with twenty (20) members of one of the Pentecostal Para-church organisations. This number was divided into two (2), with ten (10) coming from the Matabeleland provincial executive team based in Bulawayo, while the other five (5) were from Mashonaland provincial executive team based in Harare and the other five (5) being comprised of the National Executive members based in Harare also. This deliberately splitting into two sets from both cities, allowed for the perspectives from the leaders who might or might not have experienced tribal conflict within these organisations to be heard. This ascertained that the depth of tribal conflict was outside of known Pentecostal churches, to their affiliate organisations. The interactive nature of these interviews allowed observations to be made from leaders of clergy, thereby giving an oversight perspective and also allowed for understanding their body language.

There were ten (10) partly unstructured interviews with clergy who were victims of tribalism within the Pentecostal settings. Five (5) were from Harare who are originally from Bulawayo and experienced tribalism when they relocated to Harare due to personal commitments. The other five (5) were from Bulawayo who are originally from Harare and experienced tribalism when they relocated to Bulawayo due to personal commitments. These were selected so as to put a face to the tribal conflict phenomenon

and also to ascertain the depth of trauma caused by experiencing tribal conflict. The average age of these was forty (40) and they were six (6) males and four (4) females. The aspect of unstructured-ness was pertaining to adding to the already existing formatted questionnaire in an effort to probe further, where there seemed to be a need to seek clarity. The ten (10) were among the twenty who had been initially approached to use the questionnaire only, but on understanding their experience of tribalism, it was later decided to partly unstructure the inquiry for them specifically.

The participants are real people/ clergy who have had an encounter with tribal conflict within the Pentecostal settings and their identities will be kept confidential as pseudonyms are used. The participants were also made aware that they could withdraw from the research should they feel uncomfortable or exposed to danger and were not coerced to answer any questions that they were not comfortable with.

3.2.3 Qualitative Process

The qualitative aspect of this enquiry is such that it brought clarity to the reality and depth of tribal conflict among Clergy and how that has affected the pastoral execution of pastoral duties within the Pentecostal churches. This leeway to add a design during the study allowed for the researcher to be able to respond to the needs and arising issues of the demography under investigation. This eliminated rigidity and bias that could be caused by one way of conducting a research and was very suitable for the sensitive nature of the phenomena under research due to the unstable political environment in Zimbabwe and also the very sensitive nature of the tribal conflict phenomena among the clergy.

The preferred design under the qualitative enquiry was the Case Study design which explained the text or quality of tribal conflict among Pentecostal clergy instead of just an analysis of numbers (quantitative) that would demand a larger demography than what had been selected. The qualitative strand entailed two sets of questionnaires for male clergy and female clergy separately and the process involved sets of straight and open-ended questions, collecting data, analysing data and interpreting results based on the

that data.” This research study interactively incorporated text (qualitative) so as to bring clarity for further study and investigation should the needs arise.

The qualitative sample used the same individuals who are Clergy within the Pentecostal churches in Bulawayo and Harare. Although the distance between these two cities is more than 400 kilometres, it did not affect the findings of this research study. The distance between these two cities buttressed the severity of the phenomenon among the Pentecostal clergy from these cities since tribalism is affecting both. The selection of these two cities was due to their demographical composition which showed that most Ndebele people work and live in Bulawayo, while most Shona people work and live in Harare.

Table 1 Comparison between Qualitative and Quantitative Methods

Qualitative Research Method	Quantitative Research Method
Methods include focus groups, questionnaires, in-depth interviews and reviews of documents for types of themes	Surveys, structured interviews, observations, and reviews of records or documents for numeric information
Primarily inductive process used to formula theory or hypotheses	Primarily deductive process used to test pre-specifies concepts, constructs and hypotheses that make up a theory
Text Based	Number based
More in-depth information on a few cases(more and deep information collected but few cases)	Less in-depth but more breadth across a large number of cases(less and shallow information but large number of cases)
Fixed response options	Unstructured or semi-structured response options
Statistical tests used for analysis	No statistical tests
Can be valid and reliable: largely depends on measurement device or instrument used	Can be valid and reliable: largely depends on skill and detail of the researcher
Time expenditure is heavier on the planning phase and lighter during the analysis phase	Time expenditure is lighter on the planning phase and heavier during the analysis phase
More generalize	Less generalize
Human behavior model	Natural science model

<http://www.snapsurveys.com/blog/what-is-the-difference-between-qualitative-research-and-quantitative-research/> (accessed on 24th of July, 2019 at 14h24)

3.2.4 Delimitations of the Study

The research study only covered two main cities of Zimbabwe instead of the whole nation, because the main target groups were Ndebele and Shona Pentecostal clergy who were easily accessed in the two cities. The study also concentrated on only two major tribes within the Pentecostal movement in Zimbabwe. Other tribes who are

numerically smaller as compared to the Ndebele and Shona tribes seem to follow the behaviours of these two bigger tribes. For example, in Bulawayo there are also the Kalanga people who come from Plumtree district which shares the border with Botswana, and these prefer to be associated with the Ndebele tribe in terms of affiliation.

3.2.5 Limitations of the Study

The research study lacked resources to travel around the country, however the use of co-researchers who are based in those two cities reduced the risk of short-changing the enquiry. Denominational prejudices reduced access to other Para-church organisations, and hence only one Para-church Pentecostal organisation was approached. The use of one Para-church Pentecostal organisation did not affect the demographic content of the participants as it also has a substantial mixture of affiliate clergy from the Pentecostal body. The current civil and political unrest within the country did not permit for any group study or therapy sessions, hence all these clergies were approached via their umbrella body but interviewed individually. While the issue of opening up the wounds of those who had been victims of tribal conflict could have hindered progress of this research, the participants were made aware that they could withdraw should they feel uncomfortable. The organisation leadership also revealed that it was willing to find ways to deal with any rebuttals that may arise from the opened wounds.

3.2.6 Preliminary Interview Report

Four (4) participants were interviewed prior to the actual interview and questionnaire sessions so as to ascertain the existence of the research problem. The four (4) participants were equally chosen from the Ndebele and Shona Pentecostal clergy respectively. The average age of these participants was 40, as it had been established that the older generation seem to suffer from tribalism more than the younger generation. The four (4) participants were made to understand the context of this research and they also signed the Participant Consent Form (see Annex D). These were composed of two females and two males, with one male and female from the Ndebele tribe, while the other were also one male and female from the Shona tribe. It was from

this preliminary interview that it was understood how sensitive the issue of tribalism is still among the Ndebele and Shona people and how that had affected even the clergy. They also affirmed that tribalism existed among the clergy such that it was not an individual clergy and institutional issue.

3.2.7 Questionnaire Structure

There are two sets of questionnaires that have been tailor-made that are gender sensitive (see Annexes A and B). One questionnaire was for female clergy and the other was for male clergy. The questionnaires were both a mixture of structured and open-ended so as to bring balance in responses. Some of the questions were identical on both questionnaires and some were gender based so as to assist during collation and analysis. The same questionnaires were used during the interviews so as to make it easy to collate the responses for analysis. Tribal affiliation were included as structured questions in order to understand tribal conflict according to each tribe and also ascertain which tribe is more aggrieved than the other. The structure of leadership according to tribal affiliation also assisted in ascertaining the influence of each tribe on the clergy and members. Seeking to understand the age groups of clergies were affected by tribal conflict was covered through a question that probed the age of each participant.

3.2.8 Triangulation

The use of clergy who are leaders of churches as participants along the use of clergy who are leaders of Para-church organisation collaborated information is the data triangulation format that was selected. Welman et al postulate that “triangulation is a procedure to determine the correct position by comparing the two known points” (Welman et al. 2005; 142). The two known points with regards to this research study were Clergy within churches (who are oversights of congregants) and churches without churches (who are oversights of clergy). The differing perspectives due to their leadership vantage points assisted to bring further validity to the tribal conflict among clergy.

Patten and Newhart described triangulation as “the technique which uses multiple

sources for obtaining data (Patten and Newhart, 2018;156). This research study used multiple sources who are clergy who are in different levels of leadership within faith communities. The “clergy of clergy” would assist in describing policies (if any) that exist to deal with tribal conflict among clergy, previous incidences of tribal conflict among clergy they are overseeing and to also bring a national perspective of the tribal conflict phenomenon seeing that they are based at national offices. The “clergy of congregants” assisted this research by bringing their daily experiences and responses to tribal conflict as they related on the ground with other clergy, and this also assisted to ascertain tribal conflict at grassroots level.

A clergy who is a leader of just one church organisation gave a different perspective on the basis of their vantage point, while a clergy who is a leader or oversight of many clergies gave a differing perspective on the basis of his or her vantage point. The last group of clergies that was incorporated to form a three-some triangulation procedure, is that of clergy who had personal experience, whether as a perpetrator or victim of tribal conflict among the clergy. The analysis of these three sources of data, made this a data triangulation process and it was suitable for this research study, to assist in gathering enough data to make an analysis that is valid.

The second aspect of data triangulation process is the “methods triangulation”, whereby Patten and Newhart posited that “method triangulation is the use of more than one qualitative method to collect data” (Patten and Newhart, 2018;157). With regards to this research study, the two methods that have been used are the questionnaires and the interviews, so as to establish dependability and trustworthiness of the data collected. While questionnaire guided responses and may not reveal the expressions of the participant, the interviews (face to face) reveal the expressions of participants thereby helping to triangulate what was not said by completing a questionnaire. Patten and Newhart further posited that the distinction between the two triangulation techniques is that “the data triangulation includes two or more types of participants but uses the same method” (Patten and Newhart, 2018;156). The second distinction postulated by Patten and Newhart is that the methods triangulation “includes two or more methods to collect

data from participants (Patten and Newhart, 2018;156). To justify the data triangulation requirements, this research study used only clergy as research participants, however their distinction comes in the positions they hold within the households of faith, while also to justify the methods triangulation requirements, two (interviews and questionnaires) methods of collecting data were used.

3.2.9 Ethical Considerations

In fulfilment of ethical requirements of the University of Pretoria, the research proposal was submitted via the Research Supervisor to the particular Ethics Committee for approval before proceeding with the research. At the writing of this chapter, approval had been granted thereby granting the process of inquiry to continue. An informed consent (see Appendices C, D, and E) was also formulated and distributed via the two co-researchers to the participants, to maintain and preserve the participants' autonomy. Sensing postulated that, "autonomy is the right of participants to self-preserve and eliminate exploitation by withdrawing from a research" (Sensing, 2011;33). Christensen et al postulated that "gaining a participant's informed consent is considered vital because of the sacredness of the principle that individuals have fundamental rights to determine what is done to them" (Christensen et al. 2015; 125). The research respected that individual fundamental rights of all the participants by clearly articulating the purpose of the research study and making the participants understand that they can withdraw from the research as and when they feel uncomfortable or violated by the process. The participants were also made aware that their personal details will remain anonymous and confidential, as what will be made known are only their perspectives of the phenomenon.

Sensing further stated that, "a researcher has an obligation to respect the communities within which the research is conducted, by protecting the community from any harm" (Sensing, 2011; 33). In order to protect and respect communities, the researcher used two male co-researchers from both tribes and also exercised utmost confidentiality with any information that is sensitive and may cause disharmony.

All the foreseen and unforeseen risks were minimised by protecting the identity of the participants and also making the co-researchers sign a Non-Disclosure agreement. Pseudonyms were used for all the participants during the coding, analysing and reporting process. To safeguard against bias and researcher emotional and psychological interference, all questionnaires were drafted to eliminate the risk associated with interviews such as asking leading questions in order to get a particular answer that could enhance the researcher's suppositions. The co-researchers were selected on this basis to also eliminate the researcher bias.

3.2.10 Data Collection

The research study used one Para-church organisation that has branches/ chapters in Bulawayo and Harare metropolitan cities, respectively. The Para-church organisation consists of a substantial number of Pentecostal clergies within Zimbabwe who belong to both the Ndebele and Shona tribes, although not limited to these two tribes only. The researcher sent the questionnaires from Pretoria by bus to the two co-researchers who are based in Bulawayo and Harare, due to the unreliability of the Zimbabwean postal services, for security reasons and for cost cutting purposes. A distribution list was kept by both the researcher and the two co-researchers, to ensure that all the copies of the questionnaires were collected and collated. The completed copies were then sent back to the researcher by bus, for coding once all the copies were collected to ensure that one batch was sent. Due to the minimal number of questionnaires distributed, there was a hundred percent (100%) retention of the distributed questionnaires. The co-researchers also sent a description of all the participants, and the transcripts of the interviews that were conducted.

3.2.11 Coding

Welman et al postulated that "purpose of coding is to analyse and make sense of the data that have been collected" (Welman et al, 2005; 214). The research study used descriptive, pattern and remarks codes to summarise the responses from the participants in order to establish common descriptions and variances. In defining descriptive codes, Welman et al posited that "descriptive codes need little interpretation

and involve attributing a theme to a text” (Welman et al. 2005; 2014), for example, there is a summary description of the attitudes of participants on the basis of their responses to the open-ended questions. The participants’ responses were then collated to verify phenomenon to ascertain similar or variable patterns and remarks made during the interaction with the co-researchers.

Table 2 Sample Coding List from Questionnaires

Code	Themes	Definition
A	Attitudes	
PA	Positive Attitudes	
NA	Negative Attitudes	
POC	Position in the Church	
REOT	Relationship with other tribe (Ndebele/ Shona)	
REIT	Relationship with own tribe (Ndebele/ Shona)	
RERT	Relationship with other tribes (Rest of the Tribes)	

Table 3 Sample Coding of Thematic Frequencies

Theme	Code	Frequency
Attitudes	A	
Positive Attitudes	PA	
Negative Attitudes	NA	
Position in the Church	POC	
Relationship with other tribe (Ndebele/ Shona)	REOT	
Relationship with own tribe (Ndebele/ Shona)	REIT	
Relationship with other tribes (Rest of the Tribes)	RERT	

3.1.12 Reliability and Validity

Welman et al posited that “reliability is concerned with the findings of the research and relates to the credibility of the findings” (Welman et al, 2005; 145). The research study measured the tribal conflict phenomenon between Ndebele and Shona Pentecostal clergy and the process can be replicated to produce the same consistency of the responses from the participants. The reliability of the findings was established by use of co-researchers and verification from historical documents, and also the interviews of the clergy of clergy within the Para-church organisation to ensure credibility. The interviews of some of the clergy victims of tribal conflict also ascertained credibility and the random selection of the participants ascertained that the findings would not be manipulated.

Welman et al postulated that “validity is the extent to which the research findings accurately represent what is really happening in the situation” (Welman et al, 2005; 142). In order to ascertain accuracy of the findings, the research study used similar questionnaires for both Ndebele and Shona Pentecostal clergy and the question compositions were also similar for both male and female clergies except for those which are gender-specific. The interviews of the five (5) clergy who are in leadership positions of the Para-church organisation was used to verify accuracy of the existence of the tribal conflict phenomenon, considering that they are also part of the disciplinary board that oversees their affiliate clergy. The interviews of another set of five (5) clergy who have been victims of tribal conflict also ensured verification of the existence of the phenomenon among the clergy. Construct validity is defined by Welman et al as “the degree to which it measures the intended construct rather than irrelevant constructs” (Welman et al, 2005; 142). With regards to this research study, the intended construct is the issue of tribal conflict among Pentecostal clergy between Ndebele and Shona clergy in Zimbabwe. The irrelevant construct is tribal conflict within the church at large, hence the research study concentrated on the Pentecostal clergy in Bulawayo and Harare cities only where there are concentrated population of Ndebele and Shona people, respectively.

3.2 Pastoral Care Methodology

This is the theoretical and epistemological section of this research study as the study is a practical theological emphasis and about pastoral care. The emphasis is on the role of clergy in a tribal conflict. While Gherkin acknowledged the importance of wisdom, prophecy and priesthood in the Old Testament template of pastoral care, he further pointed out that “there is need to look at other forms of pastoral care that include the role of a Pastor/ clergy as a mediator/ reconciler” (Gherkin, 1997; 81). It is this pastoral posture that this research study enquired and sought to remedy in order to have clergy mediators or reconcilers who themselves are reconciled. Reconciliation in this case, looked at the ways in which the clergy can reconcile with their generational history in order to foster peace and justice. Gherkin postulated that “Our methods of reconciliation must now nearly follow the manner of listening, invitation to consider, and clarification of commitments” (Gherkin, 1997; 81). The role of clergy as reconcilers within the Pentecostal settings needs to be clarified and an invitation made for the clergy to consider new methods of dealing with tribal conflict among themselves before they deal with tribal conflict among congregants and the nation at large.

There seemed to be a vacuum of methods that deal with reconciliation among clergy in the Pentecostal movement, and these were pronounced by the perpetual existence of tribal conflict among the clergy. Gherkin proposed that “pastoral care methods of reconciling need to be modified to fit the changing situation of the times we are in” (Gherkin, 1997; 79). The last chapter of this research study therefore recommends methods in response to the data analysis, which would assist the clergy to be oriented to respond differently to tribal conflict within their ranks or from the congregants. An increase of rural to urban migration in the twenty-first century demands that the clergy understand the rampant changing demography of their congregants, hence there is need for clergy to revisit their responses to tribal differences.

Gherkin posited that “pastors are influenced by the popular culture they are embedded in, just as the parishioners are” (Gherkin, 1997; 146). This influence can only be dealt

with if “the pastor properly appropriates modes of critical thinking provided by theology and other disciplines and thereby avoid to consciously or unconsciously fall prey to popular cultural demands” (Gherkin, 1997; 146). With regards to the issue of tribal conflict going on among clergy in Zimbabwe, the clergy seemed to lack “proper modes of critical thinking to adequately deal with the pressures of popular culture. Gherkin also suggested that the “pastor must of necessity carefully exercise pastor’s interpretive skills to pastorally deal with any populist cultural norms” (Gherkin, 1997; 146). The essence of these interpretive and critical thinking skills when exercised properly will assist the pastor to reconcile himself to Truth and then reconcile others, such that peace and justice are exercised.

3.2.1 Pollard’s Positive Deconstruction

Pollard’s (1997) four-pronged model of evangelistically dealing with worldviews that are contrary to the Gospel, was used in this section to “identify the underlying tribal worldview, Analysing the tribal worldview, Affirming the Elements of Truth in the tribal worldview, and discovering the errors of the tribal worldview” (Pollard, 1997; 63). While Pollard used his Positive Deconstruction model for evangelistic purposes, this research study used the model to positively deconstruct the tribal conflict among Ndebele and Shona Pentecostal Clergy in Bulawayo and Harare, respectively. A summary breakdown of Pollard’s model is as follows; -

- a. Identifying the Underlying Worldview; - here Pollard used relativism as the underlying worldview and posited that “relativism is the belief that there are no absolutes, no absolute Truth, no absolute right or wrong...” (Pollard, 1997; 62).
- b. Analysing the Underlying Worldview; - Pollard postulated that all the people who claim that there is no absolute Truth, should realise that their very statement is making an absolute claim. He further shows that relativism is “logically inconsistent and incoherent, however there is need to acknowledge that the world we live in is not without absolutes: (Pollard, 1997; 65).
- c. Affirming Elements of Truth in Underlying Worldview; - Pollard probed the issue of whether relativism works, and through this he affirms that “relativists have managed to draw personal truths from propositional truths, thereby emphasising

the importance of not only knowing Truth, but experiencing Truth” (Pollard, 1997; 67).

- d. Discovering the Error in the Underlying Worldview; - Pollard then concluded his probe by showing the errors that he discovered in the relativism worldview, by stating that “relativists deny the existence of a body of knowledge yet they would want to mark examination papers, when that very premise suggests that there is a right and a wrong” (Pollard, 1997; 69)

Following Pollard’s four-pronged positive deconstruction model, the research study used the template to positively deconstruct the tribal worldview among the Ndebele and Shona clergy. The positive deconstruction model of the tribal conflict summarised the most common thread of participants’ perspectives about tribalism.

3.2.1.1 Identifying Underlying Worldview of Tribalism

The underlying worldview among both groups (Ndebele and Shona clergy), was that the issue of tribes is a biblical phenomenon that is seen throughout the Old Testament, whereby the nation of Israel was composed of twelve (12) tribes. This worldview made most clergy to play allegiance to their tribes even when they are now clergy. With some claiming that one must not lose their biological identity, after conversion or even after commission into ministry. Most believed in the power of defending and subscribing to tribal heritage and saw any disregard of tribal heritage as a betrayal of their lineage and believed that it did not affect their ministry activities.

3.2.1.2 Analysing the underlying Worldview of Tribalism

This worldview was also said to be based on the Old Testament for most of the clergy interrogated, and it disregarded the priesthood of every believer propagated in the New Testament that declares that “there is no longer any Jew or Gentile to those who are in Yahshua” (Galatians 3: 28). Their tribalism worldview assumed that other tribes are superior to others, thereby dividing the believers along lines of tribal affiliation instead of confession of faith. Instead of cultivating unity of faith, their tribalism worldview promoted division and mistrust among clergy and congregants. The inability to properly

interpret Scripture with regards to how one responds to tribal differences, has exacerbated the issue of tribalism between the Ndebele and Shona. The lines were blurred when it came to be responding in love towards those who are of different tribal affiliation, such that love did not seem to motivate peace and reconciliation among clergy.

3.2.1.3 Affirming Elements of Truth of the Underlying Worldview of Tribalism

Tribalistic perspective accepted the Truth that Elohim created people who are distinct, unique and beautiful, however it seemed to fail to embrace and celebrate those distinctions. Unity is not the absence of diversity; it is actually a bringing together of elements that would not normally come together but are brought together by the one common goal and purpose. The second aspect that this worldview brought out as Truth was the existence of a past that is influencing the present and future, however the acknowledgement of the past seemed to be tainted by bad memories of what one tribe did wrong to the other.

3.2.1.4 Discovering the Errors of the Underlying Worldview of Tribalism

The first error observed was that of the literal applying of the Scripture text without understanding the principles found within a text, for example, the issue of the twelve (12) tribes of Israel meant that tribes can also be embraced among the believers. The second error observed was that of not eliminating negative aspects of tradition that might endanger the propagating of the Gospel message. The third erroneous aspect observed was that of propagating a “Come Yea Therefore Gospel” that promotes preachers who stay in their “Jerusalem or that which is common and familiar” in this case staying within one’s tribe and not willing to venture to other tribes.

3.3 Preliminary Conclusion

This chapter looked at the methodology used to enquire about the tribal conflict phenomenon among the Ndebele and Shona clergy in the Pentecostal church in Zimbabwe. All ethical considerations were considered to full-proof the research study from any unethical practices. The qualitative method was selected because of its

emphasis to deal with text, thereby reveal the experiences of participants and understand the underlying causes of tribal conflict. In this chapter, also a Case Study design was defined, the size of the case study under review and reasons for the selection of that particular case study. A limited number of participants for sampling were also discussed so that enough time is given to the coding and analysing of their realities for this research study. The next chapter looks at Trauma with regards to tribal conflict.

4. TRAUMA AND TRIBAL CONFLICT

4.1 Introduction

This research study investigated and deduced that trans-generational transmission of trauma across generations beginning with the generation that experienced trauma of torture and murder. Trans-generational transmission of trauma is trauma that is transferred from one generation to the other through stories of pain endured during conflicts, violence, displacements and murders due to tribal conflict. Ngwenya and Harris posited that there are consequences that occur when victims of traumatic incidences fail to heal and pointed that one of those consequences is the transference of pain and trauma to others (Ngwenya and Harris, 2015; 45). Ngwenya and Harris also posited that “the younger generations of the participants who took part in his research expressed that their desire to revenge was seen as an obligation to avenge their parents’ humiliation and trauma” (Ngwenya and Harris, 2015; 47).

The aspect of trans-generational transmission of trauma was a major aspect of the reasons why tribal tensions and conflicts seemed to continue unabated between the Ndebele and Shona tribes. While interviewing the victims, relatives and children of the Gukurahundi Massacre in Matabeleland province, Ngwenya and Harris postulated that “there was a continuous reiteration from the participants about the intergenerational transmission of trauma, a desire to revenge, a mistrust of the mostly Shona led government, and a sense of guilt for ‘failing’ their communities” (Ngwenya and Harris, 2015; 42). The causal effects of intergenerational transmission of trauma have not been extensively researched, yet most of the tensions and conflicts that have happened in Rwanda, Zimbabwe, etc seem to have originated from this.

This chapter looked at definition of trauma, trauma caused by tribal conflicts and tensions, it also explored the consequences of traumatic experiences to a community. Truth, peace and reconciliation achievable when all aspects that concern a traumatic event are looked at truthfully. This chapter also looked at the theories of ethnic and tribal

violence and then expounded on one of these theories with special emphasis to this research study. Definitions and discussions of intergenerational transmission of trauma with regards to the tribal conflict among Ndebele and Shona tribes of Zimbabwe were highlighted and clarified responses to trauma.

4.2 Definition of Trauma

McCann and Pearlman defined trauma as “an experience that is sudden, unexpected, or non-normative, exceeds an individuals’ perceived ability to meet its demands and disrupts the individual’ frame of reference or other psychological needs” (McCann and Pearlman, 1990; 10). With regards to the historical facts stated by some Ndebele and Shona survivors of pre-colonial tribal wars and raids, and post-colonial Gukurahundi Massacres (which are the premises used to perpetuate contemporary tribal conflicts), the experiences were sudden and unexpected. The experiences exceeded individuals and communities’ ability to meet the demands, and they disrupted individuals and communities. The pre-colonial violence, raids, murders, displacements, and tortures that were suddenly and unexpectedly meted out by the Ndebele warriors to Shona groups were traumatic experiences.

The post-colonial violence, raids, murders, displacements, and tortures that were suddenly and unexpectedly meted out by the Shona Political Elites to the Ndebele people were also traumatic experiences. These two tribes had violently traumatised each other at some time in the history of their interaction as citizens of Zimbabwe, and both carry the scars of their traumatic experiences that have ensured that they continue to be arch-rivals even to this day. Although the generations that raided and killed each other during the 19th century have all since passed away, the 20th century Shona generation that massacred and displaced most 20th century Ndebele generation is probably a fourth generation and did not experience the 19th century wars and raids.

McCann and Pearlman posited that “a traumatic experience threatens the psychological core of an individual and thus an individual’s sense of awareness of the trauma determines the traumatic experience” (McCann and Pearlman, 1990; 12). While

appreciating that this definition looked at individuals clinically, it falls short to encompass the African worldview of “Umuntu ngu Muntu ngaBantu/ A Person is a Person through other People”. According to this definition, the traumatic experiences of Mass Murders and displacements that Ndebele and Shona people experienced at each other’s hands were not traumatic enough. The African concept of individual is that “it takes the whole village/ community to raise a child”, thereby promoting an idea that people belong to a community and the community belongs to the people, and thus a communal experience of trauma is no different than an individual experience of trauma. Hence the common adage “An injury to one is an injury to all” and this would mean that the validity of a traumatic experience in the African context is determined by the psycho-social impact it has on communities corporately and individuals specifically. This research study then analysed the individual responses to the phenomenon of tribal conflict as a traumatic experience as a representation of the whole community.

Leeuwen and Brouwer defined trauma as “injury or shock in psychological terms, caused by an event, which even if not traumatic on its own, causes the individual to become stressed and react adversely” (eds. Leeuwen and Brouwer, 2013; 2). While this definition is a psychological one, it emphasises the fact that there was an injury or shock to an individual that has causal effects. This research study investigated the responses to a traumatic event of tribal conflict and understanding the adverse reactions to the injury and hurt. While Leeuwen and Brouwer (eds. 2013) looked at the psychology of trauma of both chronic trauma and single-event trauma, this research study looked at events that have caused trauma to the Ndebele and Shona communities generally, but Pentecostal Clergy in particular.

This research study also looked at historical trauma, which Leeuwen and Brouwer defined as “the transmission of trauma throughout successive generations and forever alters the biological, psychological, social and economic development trajectory of a community” (eds. Leeuwen and Brouwer, 2013; 90). With regards to the Ndebele and Shona tribal conflict, there is a history of trauma that dates back to the raids of Shona villages by the Ndebele tribes who had crossed from South Africa into Zimbabwe and

settled in Bulawayo. Due to this historical trauma, there has been resentment of the Ndebele people by the Shona people and this resentment expressed itself fully with the Gukurahundi Massacre of the Ndebele people when a Shona lead government lead an ethnic cleansing during the period 1984 – 1987. The ripple effect of this massacre has however created a resentment of the Shona by the Ndebele.

Sotero postulated that “historical trauma theory integrates psycho-social, political-economic and socio-ecological theoretical frameworks and makes four assumptions” (Sotero, 2006; 94 – 95). As has been witnessed with the tensions between Ndebele and Shona communities, there is always underlying tones of anger and hate towards each other that has affected the psycho-social fabric of the nation that is even seen on soccer teams supported. On the political-economic aspect, since independence the nation of Zimbabwe has been dominated by the Shona elite and this has manifested itself through most high profile jobs in companies and government being occupied by Shona people, as well as in the political arena whereby the Ndebele are always ceremonial deputising Shona elite.

Sotero made four assumptions about historical trauma as follows:

1. Mass trauma is deliberately and systematically inflicted upon a target population by a subjugating, or dominant population (Sotero, 2006; 94).

With regards to the issue of tribal conflict in Zimbabwe as a nation, the traumas that were inflicted by the Ndebele on the Shona and vice versa, were and are systematic depending on the demographics of location and numbers. The Shona population inflicted systematic and deliberate trauma where they are the dominant population. While on the other hand the Ndebele also inflicted systematic and deliberate trauma where they are the dominant population. This sequence of events plays out in every social stratum including the church, thereby having clergy who inflict tribal trauma to those who they perceive as the insignificant other, as a continued projection of the trans-generational trauma.

2. Trauma is not limited to a single catastrophic event, but continues an extended

period of time (Sotero, 2006; 94).

Trauma caused by tribal conflicts between Ndebele and Shona people is not limited to one catastrophic event, but a chain of traumatic events throughout the historical interaction between the two tribes, and there have been many efforts at reconciliation. Trauma continues unabated even in the contemporary interactions of the two tribes, as witnessed by tribal conflict among Pentecostal clergy and other denominations. The issue of when it will stop and what needs to be done about continued trauma will be discussed under chapter seven (7) that deals with recommendations. The issue of trans-generational transmission of trauma is one of the reasons why trauma will continue for extended periods of time, while having morphed itself into different forms of expressions of trauma.

3. Traumatic events reverberate throughout population, creating a universal experience of trauma (Sotero, 2006; 95)

The effects of the traumatic events of the Ndebele raids and murders of the Shona people in the 19th century reverberated throughout the Shona population that it became a universal experience of trauma that has been passed on to younger generations of the Shona community. While on the other hand, the effects of traumatic events of the Shona-led Fifth Brigade Massacre of the Ndebele people in the 20th century reverberated throughout the entire Ndebele population, that Catholic Commission for Justice and Peace (2007) in Zimbabwe had to write about the atrocities.

4. The magnitude of the trauma experience derails the population from its natural projected historical course resulting in a legacy of physical, psychological, social and economic disparities that persists across generations (Sotero, 2006; 95).

The legacy has persisted especially among the Ndebele generations, with most of the younger generation migrating to neighbouring Botswana or South Africa to seek greener pastures, as there are very few opportunities for them in Zimbabwe. For those who remain in the country, most endure the psychological, social and economic disparities that are due to the continued marginalisation and frustration of the Ndebele people by the Shona elite. It is these disparities that continue to perpetuate animosity between these two tribes, such that tribal

conflict is expressed as and when an opportunity arises for one tribe to express itself towards the other. The Clergy have not been spared by this legacy, as they also use their authority and spheres of influence to preserve their own cultural and tribal norms.

Leeuwen and Brouwer posited that “the negative effects of historical trauma among the American Indians populations included survivor’s guilt, loss of cultural practices, use of language, pervasive alcohol abuse, suicide and homicide” (eds. Leeuwen and Brouwer, 2013; 91). In Zimbabwe, the negative effects of historical trauma have not been investigated to come to conclusive theories and are a subject for further research.

Becker, Dochhorn, and Holt (eds. 2014) posited that “In various Christian texts, trauma terminology is even constructed as *theologoumenon*; in other words, it is applied to a Christological idea” (Becker, et al. eds. 2014; 18). In their definition, they show that the bruising of Yahshua/ Christ was a ‘wounding’, thereby suggesting that trauma in Scripture refers to the wounding of a person or people. This wounding can be physical infliction of pain, and it can also be psychological infliction of pain as in the case of some Psalms in Scripture. Becker et al, (eds. 2014) further showed that the terminology used to define trauma is not only found in LXX writings but also in ancient Hellenistic writing to depict external and internal wounding (Becker, et al. eds. 2014; 18). This definition provides further understanding that the issue of trauma and traumatisation is not only an ancient phenomenon but is also a theological phenomenon. Though in ancient times the term was used metaphorically, the meaning was the same as the contemporary psychological trends that began in the 19th century.

This definition assisted this research study to further try to understand how the external wounds of the 19th century Ndebele raids and murders affected the Shona, thereby being able to empathise with them as victims through trans-generational transmission of trauma. The definition further assisted the research study to understand how the external wounds of the 20th century Gukurahundi massacre by the Shona political elite affected the Ndebele and how this external and internal wounding is now manifesting

through trans-generational transmission of trauma. Knowledge and understanding of these aspects of trauma, assisted to recommend suitable means of truth telling, justice, peace and reconciliation.

Becker, et al. (eds. 2014) postulated that “the recent interest in traumatology takes its departure point from the experiences of American soldiers during Vietnam wars and the psycho-somatic effects it had on them” (Becker, et al. eds. 2014; 19). The issue of trauma and traumatology needs to be addressed by the church through initially having theological engagement of church leaders to understand trauma and not shy away from dealing with its symptoms and consequences among believers. The Pentecostal church in Africa has been promoting “religious escapism” whereby every societal crisis is attributed to the demonic and then deliverance sessions are the prescribed way of dealing with everything. For example, there is a current outcry on women and children abuse in South Africa by male figures, and these issues cannot be adequately dealt with outside of enquiry about traumatic effects of absentee fathers in many African households due to urban migration and other socio-economic factors. The Pentecostal church needs to also play a pivotal role in engaging their own ‘spiritual version’ of abuse that has portrayed women and children being at the mercy of charlatan prophets who feed them rats and snakes, all in the name of deliverance. Once religious escapism becomes the preferred way of dealing with societal challenges, then dealing with trauma, its consequent behaviours will not happen. Pentecostal clergy are out of touch with the effects of trauma that they suffer from and how they are expressing themselves.

4.3 Trans-Generational Transmission of Trauma

Fromm posited that trans-generational transmission of trauma happens when there is an unconscious or conscious transference of trauma from one generation to the other (Fromm, ed. 2012; 6). This transference of trauma is not easily dictated when it is actually happening, however the consequences are seen when the recipients are responding to situations around them in the same manner that the victim would have. The desire for revenge is one of the symptoms that trauma victims and beneficiaries of trauma transmission portray, and it can be coupled with guilt for failure to protect one

from the trauma. The Ndebele and Shona anger towards each other seems to emanate from this symptom, and revenge takes any forms from political manipulation, economic sabotage of the other, denial of privilege by those in authority to do so, and even killing. The case of Rwanda is one to remember when one tribe reached melting point and went on a killing spree of the other tribe or ethnic group as an ethnic cleansing crusade.

Fromm (ed. 2012) pointed out that “children whose minds have been impregnated with mental representations of the atrocities of the Holocaust deposited by their parents, carry within themselves powerful feelings of loss, humiliation, guilt, and aggressions (Fromm, ed. 2012, 6). While his assessment looked at children, it does not proceed to show what happens when those children become adults who have not healed from trans-generational transmitted trauma. The research study has observed that both Ndebele and Shona people harbour aggression towards each due to the trauma of yesteryears that was transferred to them by way of historical stories, folklore, contemporary incidences of trauma that seem to invoke their relatives’ past history of loss and humiliation. Ngwenya and Harris (2014) explained that most of the participants (who were victims of the Gukurahundi Massacre) they interviewed in their group sessions declared that they had somehow managed to transfer their pain, humiliation and resentment to their children (Ngwenya and Harris, 2014; 45).

Volkan portrayed that “Within virtually every large group there exists a shared mental representation of a traumatic past event during which large groups suffered loss, or experienced helplessness, shame, humiliation in a conflict with another group” (Volkan, 2001; 87). Both the Ndebele and Shona people claimed that they experienced loss, pain, helplessness, shame, humiliation at each other’s hands at some point in the history of Zimbabwe. However, instead of dealing with their historical traumatic experiences and realising that they were not there when these atrocities took place, they seemed to perpetuate the anger towards each other. The need for truth, peace, justice, forgiveness and reconciliation are of paramount importance, if these two tribes are to avoid any future traumatic events taking place. Within the Pentecostal church, minor incidences of conflict are taking place, whereby one is denied a leadership

position on the basis of their tribal affiliation instead of ability or inability to perform. The tribal conflict among clergy is one of the symptoms of the effects of trans-generational transmission of trauma that makes clergy to fight among each other, and also prefer a certain tribe over the other because they belong to it.

Volkan posited that “The Trans-generational transmission of such a shared traumatic event is linked to the past generation’s inability to mourn losses of people, land, property, prestige, and indicate the large group’s failure to reverse the humiliation inflicted by another large group, usually, a neighbour, but in some cases, between ethnic or religious groups within the same country” (Volkan, 2001; 87). With regards to this research study, both the Ndebele and Shona claimed to have suffered humiliation from each through the Gukurahundi Massacres of the 10th century and the Raids of the 19th century, respectively. Both these ethnic or tribal groups claimed that there have never been efforts to deal with the inability to mourn their loss of people, land, property, prestige and this has led to a perpetuation of trauma that expresses itself as a need for vengeance and restitution from the each other. The role reversals as perpetrators and victims among the Ndebele and Shona people, continue unabated on any social platform that allows for such including political arenas and religious environments.

4.4 Mechanisms of Transmitting Trans-Generational Trauma

Fromm cited Kogan (2012), “trans-generational trauma is transmitted in two mechanisms, namely, primitive identification and deposited identification (Fromm, 2012; 6). These two mechanism were based on a parent-to-child transmission of trauma for the victims of the Holocaust, however this research study used parallel analysis against Shona adult victims of the 19th Century Ndebele raids with the contemporary Shona adult descendants (some of whom are participants in this research study) and also Ndebele adult victims of the 20th century Shona-led Gukurahundi Massacre of the Ndebele with the contemporary Ndebele adult descendants (some of whom are participants in this research study. Folklore, historical information, and history of the nation of Zimbabwe from the 19th century to date are the sources for gleaning from the adult victims of both the atrocities used to justify tribal conflict and injustice.

1. Primitive Identification refers to the child's introjections and assimilation of the damaged parent's self-images. This identification leads to a loss of the child's separate sense of self and the damaged parent (Kogan, 2012; 7).

This definition dealt with trans-generational transmission of trauma between a parent and a child. The African concept of self-image is such that one's image is representative of the society they originate from and it's propounded by the concept of Ubuntu that defines what a person is. The issue of cultural and historical influence among Africans plays a pivotal role in the definition of self in a homogenous setting. This research proposes that the aspect of "assimilation and introjections" does not happen only among a damaged parent and a child, but also happens within a community between one damaged generation to another generation. By "damage", the implication drawn is that an individual or generation or community has been adversely affected by the trauma experience, it does not imply that the victims are useless.

2. Deposited Identification is a concept that emphasizes the role of the parent, who unconsciously and sometimes even consciously force aspects of themselves on to a child (Kogan, 2012; 7).

This concept also is based on a parent to child trans-generational transmission of trauma however it can be used as a template for understanding one generation to another generation conscious or unconscious transmission of trauma. The issue of whether it is possible to transmit trauma from a victim to a recipient is not under discussion, as other scholars (Koga, 2012), (Fromm 2012), (Volkan, 2001), have already confirmed that it happens, however this research study was concerned with transmissions within communities, in particular the faith community where Ndebele and Shona victims of past traumas and contemporary expressions of rage that is a result of past trauma they never witnessed.

Fromm posited that "the terrible irony in the transmission of trauma is that the victimized often reverse their traumatic helplessness by becoming victimizers thus continuing the cycle of trauma" (Fromm, 2012; 205). This is a very relevant statement with regards to

this research study as it has been observed that the issue of trauma seemed to have a vicious cycle between the Ndebele and Shona, such that one wonders when it will come to a stop. This research study is one of many that have investigated trends of traumatic incidences that have reared their ugly head among the Ndebele and Shona people, however, there seemed to be no solutions in place. Government efforts to deal with past atrocities, have failed due to the unwillingness to honestly and truthfully open the past wounds so that there can be healing. An unhealed wound tends to be gangrenous until it affects the whole body, this is the case with the Ndebele and Shona tribal conflict that affected every societal vein including the church which is the supposed custodian of truth and reconciliation.

Fromm suggested that “the need to break the cycle of trauma can be achieved by translating the legacy of trauma received into a narrative of forgiveness and healing, thereby grieving its effect” (Fromm, 2012; 208). Chapter seven (7) which deals with recommendations will suggest ways that might be suitable for dealing with trans-generational transmission of trauma among the Ndebele and Shona communities in order to “break the cycle of trauma and violence” among these tribal/ ethnic groups in Zimbabwe. The church must play a pivotal role of ensuring that reconciliation takes place within its walls and without them, and the “tortoise syndrome” of hiding between

4.5 Three Theories of Ethnic or Tribal Violence

Musvosvi proposed three theories that are associated with ethnic or tribal violence and they are namely; Primordialist, Instrumentalist and Constructivist. (Musvosvi, 2010; 46). These theories are said to emanate from discussions among political scientists and have been arrived at from analysis of ethnic or tribal conflicts across the world (Musvosvi, 2010; 46). While this research study is a theology centred study, it found out that there is an inter-connectedness between what happens among communities and theology, as Elohim is the Originator of humanity. The summary of the theories of ethnic violence by Musvosvi (2010; 46) is as follows; -

4.5.1. Primordialist: - This theory is based on the belief that “that traditions of belief,

action towards primordial objects such as biological features and territorial location are important with any ethnic or tribe” (Grosby, 1994; 168). According to Musvosvi, the biological and territorial bonds among one ethnic or tribal group are then used to bring distinctions to who is a friend or an enemy (Musvosvi, 2010; 46). Although there have been ethnic or tribal groups who have fought for territorial prowess, this theory falls short in the contemporary tribal conflict of the Ndebele and Shona people. Their conflict is more on dominating the other than it is about territorial out-manoeuvring each other. The fact that the tribal conflict under review happens in urban set-ups of Zimbabwe, whereby people have their own homes makes this theory irrelevant to this research study. However, the initial tribal conflict of the 19th century where the Ndebele are alleged to have taken some of arable Shona land and their beautiful women seems to be one of the triggers of contemporary anger of the Shona towards the Ndebele.

4.5.2. Instrumentalist: Smith posited that “ethnic or tribal conflict is a product of community leaders who used their cultural groups for mass mobilization in their competition for power, and resources because they found them more powerful than social classes” (Smith, 2001; 54). This theory is plausible in a political setup, but it would be difficult to implement in a religious setup as clergy are not installed via the ballot. However, in Zimbabwe the Ndebele tribe believes that the politicians were at the forefront of the Gukurahundi Massacres that killed more than a hundred thousand Ndebele people across the Matabeleland and Midlands provinces of Zimbabwe. This awareness is the one that seems to fuel continued anger by the Ndebele people towards the Shona people. In the church setup, this theory has manifested itself when the leadership structures of churches take the ethnic affiliation fabric of the resident clergy and anyone who belongs to a different group is sabotaged from getting any leadership position.

4.5.3. Constructivist: - This theory proposed that “ethnic conflict is a result of a social construct based on experiences, knowledge and perceptions of one group as they interpret the other group” (Musvosvi, 2010, 46). This theory aligned with the investigative trajectory of this research study; hence the participants were from both the

Ndebele and Shona tribal groups who are Pentecostal clergy that bring their own experiences, knowledge and perceptions of tribal interactions and conflicts with each other. This assists the research by ensuring that both sides within the conflict are heard, so as to bring a balanced assessment of the Research problem. Musvosvi further posited that “this knowledge may be misunderstood or misinterpreted concerning certain events and there is selectiveness in the retained knowledge” (Musvosvi, 2010; 46). With regards to this research study, the use of both Bulawayo and Harare as demographic places and specifically targeting the Ndebele and Shona clergy in the Pentecostal church was to ensure against selective amnesia concerning certain events that fuelled tribal conflict. The constructivist theoretical perspective also asserts that “humans actively create and construe their personal realities and this experiential scaffolding of structural relation becomes the framework upon which individual apportions experiences” (McCann and Pearlman, 1990; 14). This theoretical perspective is the fulcrum upon which all the interviews and selection of participants rested on; hence both the Ndebele and Shona clergy were selected in order to bring their experiential understanding of tribal conflict.

4.6 Theological Hermeneutics of Trauma

The Poetry books of the Bible reveal that even in sacred Scriptures there was a physical and mental ‘wounding/ trauma’ that takes places in our daily interactions with each other. Becker, Dochhorn, and Holt posited that “investigating the psychic states of individuals and groups in history, theology, and the humanities can widen the picture of the human and its living conditions in the past and present” (Becker et al, 2014; 16). Scripture texts are replete with historical, theological and humane stories of people dealing with the trauma or wounding; however, it is only in the poetry books that one gets to hear of psychic wounding of the patriarchs. The research study approached the investigation of the tribal conflict among Ndebele and Shona Pentecostal clergy with an understanding that no one is exempt from experiencing trauma even believers and church leaders. The fact that we hear news of clergy who commit suicide and other such acts that are socially deemed uncouth for believers, shows that hermeneutically

and theologically the church has not adequately addressed the issue of trauma among believers. The Pentecostal church in Zimbabwe, recently buried one of its church fathers, who committed suicide by throwing himself from the fourth floor parking building. The immediate response by the church to try and cover up that he committed suicide and also that he was under a lot of psychological trauma, revealed how the Pentecostal church is failing to practically accept and address the effects of trauma even among the clergy.

Lyall posited that “In the pastoral and spiritual context an understanding of what it means to be human cannot be contained solely within psychological models” (Lyall, 1995; 80). This assertion rings true when the praxis of pastoral care and spiritual expressions has incorporated psychological models of understanding humanity; however, the Pentecostal church in Zimbabwe is yet to embrace such pastoral care techniques. The reluctance by Pentecostal preachers to embrace the marriage between psychology and theology in dealing with humanity’s traumatic incidences is most due to a warped theology that mixes African voodoo and Greek mysticism while ignoring Scriptural Truth. One discussion between this researcher and a Pentecostal clergy revealed that they do not find anything wrong with expressing tribalism towards the other groups, or even caring to understand the origins of such dispositions.

The Bible has many references (Whole Book of Job; Isaiah 53: 5 – 7; Acts 19, 19; 2 Corinthians 11: 23; Luke 10: 34, Luke 20: 12, just to mention a few) that gives us enough room for hermeneutic exploration to understand and appreciate that trauma is not an extra-biblical phenomenon. This knowledge would assist to then approach the subject of trauma and its consequent expressions within or without the church. The biblical hermeneutics of the Pentecostal church needs to be revamped in order for the church to be able to with violent traumatic experiences and also the mental trauma that comes from having one’s belief shattered or challenged by trauma. The questions of Job and the Psalter in Psalms are good indications that within the Christian’s walk of faith, there are life’s events that can challenge the very core of one’s faith. The issue of how then one responds to the traumatic challenges, is then based on how one is

grounded in their theology and understanding.

Becker et al posited that “the framework within which biblical texts depicting justified violence are interpreted is of crucial importance” (Becker et al. 2014: 73). Since this research study targeted Pentecostal clergy, it has been of paramount importance to see what role exegetics has played in the issue of viewing other tribes as enemies. The trending view that was attributed by the fact that most clergy “had called themselves” due to the lucrative and appealing lifestyle of many urban clergies who have merchandised the Gospel for filthy lucre. The other influence of the misinterpretation of Scripture text was the rampant allegorical use of “psalms that speak about violence to enemies”, and lack of standardized hermeneutic that respects context and intent of Scripture. Statements like “Back to Sender”, “Suffer the Witch to Die”, or “cursing one’s enemies” are very rampant among many Pentecostal and even Charismatic settings, which renders the issue of dealing with tribal enemies a norm.

Acts 19: 16; “And the man in whom the evil spirit was leaped on them, and mastered both of them, and prevailed against them, so that they fled out of that house naked and wounded” (KJV). Cherry picking verses is also very rampant among Pentecostal Preachers, which then makes the above verse appeal to those who follow “spiritual escapism” that over-emphasizes the demonic influence on people above anything else. Most Pentecostal believers would rather blame the seen (people) and unseen (demonic) enemies than to take responsibility for their actions, thereby making the issue of Truth and reconciliation difficult. High value is placed on the spiritual aspect of religion at the exclusion of common sense and reason; such that dealing with tribal conflict is an issue that needs even having a Bible School curriculum that would specifically address such.

4.7 Response Patterns to Trauma

Psychologists suggest that there are many responses to trauma, and these are indicators or red flags on the depth of traumatic influence upon and individual or communities. McCann and Pearlman outlined a range of responses from “emotional,

cognitive, biological, behavioural and interpersonal response patterns and these from fear, depression, anger, shame, aggression, suicidal, etc” (McCann and Pearlman, 1990; 42 – 46). This research study noted that most of the response patterns mentioned have been exhibited by the Ndebele and Shona people, during their interactions with each other, and sadly no diagnosis has been made in order to assist with healing and reconciliation. The African culture also believes that some of the response patterns are only found among white people and it is rare to find black people seeking psychological help. They are comfortable visiting a hospital and private doctors for physical ailments, but rarely do they consult psychologist to deal with a mental problem. Mental sicknesses like bipolar disorder are quickly ascribed to witchcraft and demonic influences, hence the issue of dealing with traumatic response patterns using medical or psychological approaches is far-fetched and remote among Africans in general and Pentecostal believers in particular. The researcher noted that experts on trauma agree that there are great variables on how people respond to trauma and trans-generational trauma, hence the findings and recommendations do not follow a “cookie-cutter” model.

4.8 Three Forms of Stress Reaction

According to Becker, Dochhorn, and Holt, “the European International Classification of Diseases (ICD-10) made three distinctions of stress disorder reactions to trauma and these are namely; Acute Stress Reaction, Post-Traumatic Stress Disorder, and Adjustment Disorders: (Becker et al, 2014; 32). Becker et al further posited that “for acute stress reaction and post-traumatic stress disorder (PTSD), the traumatic event is of exceptional or catastrophic nature, whereas Adjustment Disorders are reactions of a subtle nature” (Becker et al, 2014; 32). During the enquiry, it was noted that the experiences of the Shona victims of 19th century raids by Ndebele warriors and also the experiences of the Ndebele victims of 20th century Gukurahundi massacres were both exceptional and catastrophic in nature; however, their stress reactions could not be measured except by way of observing their descendants. All of the 19th century Shona victims of Ndebele raids are deceased; hence any investigations to ascertain stress disorders and levels were futile and not plausible. While on the other hand, there are some of the Ndebele victims of the 20th century Gukurahundi Massacres who are still

alive, it would still be culturally unacceptable to request that they undergo medical tests to verify how stressful the incidents were towards them. The effects and intensity of traumatic incidents that happened before anyone took the oath of priesthood should be verified and understood prior to appointment, in order to avert future outbursts that can affect ministry.

4.9 Impediments to Understanding Trauma Responses

Carlson pointed out impediments to understanding responses to trauma as follows (Carlson, 1997; 21); -

4.9.1. Researchers cannot control the circumstances surrounding traumatic events.

Should a traumatic event be controllable by a researcher in order to promote a certain narrative, then it loses its importance to bring efficient hypothesis. The research study had no control over any previous or current traumatic events caused by tribal conflict among Pentecostal clergy in Zimbabwe.

4.9.2 It is Impossible to know who will experience trauma as it is extremely difficult to pre-test subjects to determine pre-trauma levels of psychological functioning.

This research study did not seek to pre-test any of the traumatic events that seem to cause perpetuation of tribal conflict among Ndebele and Shona clergy, since all the incidents of trauma fall under the category of historical trauma. The second reason is that this is a theological discourse of investigation that appreciates the importance of psychology in understanding behaviours of clergy; hence there was no emphasis for doing any pre-tests of the participants to determine pre-trauma levels of psychology. Within the Zimbabwean context, it is also considered a taboo to test people for their psychological disposition and also that it would have ethically violated the rights of the chosen participants. This Impediment did not affect the research study.

4.9.3 It is impossible to manipulate aspects of traumatic events in order to compare the effects of such variables on subjects' responses.

Since all the traumatic events that are affiliated to the issue of tribal conflict among Ndebele and Shona clergy happened years before the starting of this research study, there were no aspects of the traumatic events that were manipulated. However, the variables of the participants' responses to trauma are based on their experience, knowledge, cultural, historical, and contemporary context.

4.9.4 It is difficult to get detailed information about the traumatic events themselves, due to the confusion frequently surrounding traumatic events.

This research study did not seek to get detailed information about the traumatic events of the 19th and 20th century killings among Ndebele and Shona people, as they are already existing literature on those events. Since those traumatic events are known historical events in Zimbabwe and outside, this research study sought to understand how the traumatic events are connected to the contemporary incidents of tribal conflict that exist in political, social and economic streets of Zimbabwe.

4.9.5. Treatment needs of trauma victims must always take precedence over the need to answer research questions.

While appreciating this impediment, this research study was not for clinical purposes, neither was it for diagnosing adequate medical treatment for trauma victims. Hence this impediment did not apply to this research study; however, the security and comfort of participants in any research must always be preserved above the need to complete a research study.

4.9.6. People are unlikely to be willing to participate in a research study soon after they have had a traumatic experience.

All the participants approached for this research study had recently not had a traumatic experience; however, among them were some victims of tribal conflict. The statements from some participants revealed that past incidents of trauma can and have been

transmitted from one generation to another, such that unless current generations deliberately seek to end the enmity between Ndebele and Shona clergy, it will continue unabated.

4.10 Preliminary Conclusion

There is no event that just happens in the lives of people that is not tied to some historical or future event, and this makes research a very important part of seeking to understand underlying causes of conflicts. This chapter revealed that the tribal conflicts in Zimbabwe are connected to the trauma that the previous inhabitants endured at each other's hands. While Zimbabwe has evolved to a modern society of fully clothed men and women who can fit in any society in the world, it still seems to be clasped by the traumatic history of the "primitive years" of engaging in warfare. This chapter looked at tribal conflict as a causal product of historical trauma between Ndebele and Shona clergy in the Pentecostal church in Zimbabwe. Definitions of trauma were explored in order to clarify the symptomatic aspects of tribal conflicts that are happening within the Pentecostal church in Zimbabwe. Out of these definitions, there was a summary of the meaning and mechanisms of trans-generational trauma as a consequent by-product of historical trauma that has a potential to influence contemporary tribal tensions and conflict should there be socio-economic factors that trigger anger. Theories of ethnic or tribal conflict assisted to bring light to a theory that is relevant to this research study. Since this is a theologically based research study, it also looked at the theological hermeneutic of trauma. This researcher believes that Scripture is the ultimate authority in matters that pertain to life and godliness; hence even the issue of trauma has been seen to have its origin from ancient texts of Scripture. There is need to also bring this

hermeneutic to Bible schools and seminaries so as to align theological students' understanding of trauma that will produce good Christian counsellors. The response patterns to trauma assisted this researcher to align the findings from this research with what other scholars know, in order to have a holistic approach to recommended ways of seeking recourse while dealing with clergy tribal conflicts. Having understood trauma, this chapter links with the next chapter that deals with data analysis and evaluation in the hope of understanding the phenomenon of tribal conflict among clergy.

5. DATA ANALYSIS AND EVALUATION

5.1 Introduction

In this chapter, the data that is being analysed is from the Pentecostal clergy who voluntarily participated in this research study and were selected from Bulawayo and Harare, which are two of the largest Central Business Districts (CBD) of Zimbabwe. The analysis is based on information gathered using structured questionnaires of twenty (20) participants and face to face interviews of ten (10) Ndebele and Shona Pentecostal Clergy with fifteen (15) coming from each tribe so as to bring a balanced perspective of the phenomenon under investigation. The structured questionnaires and face to face interviews were the primary data sources to glean the necessary analysis and to understand the tribal conflict phenomenon within the Pentecostal movement in Zimbabwe. While the population of Pentecostal Clergy is extensive and found in all the cities and towns of Zimbabwe, this small case study was representative of the whole with regards to the issue of tribal conflict among Ndebele and Shona clergy. The issue of tribal conflict has been investigated from a case study model of qualitative data that recorded participants' perspectives and experiences from Ndebele and Shona clergy in the Pentecostal movement.

This is a textual analysis of data collected using closed and open-ended questions in two sets of questionnaires that were drafted to cater for the male and female clergy within the Pentecostal movement. The coding aspect of this analysis used numbers to arrive at an acceptable conclusion on the basis of the data provided and it does not make this a quantitative research. The numeric aspect of this research was used to show the percentages of males against females who participated, while also looking at the age groups that responded. From the thirty (30) participants who volunteered and completed the questionnaires forms and face to face interviews, the rate of retention of the completed questionnaires and interview responses was hundred percent (100%). The distinction between questionnaires and interviews was such that it clarified that one was a set of eleven (11) structured and open-ended questions while the other was a

face to face engagement of participants using the same structured questions (see annex A and B attached). On the basis of the 100% response, the initial intention to engage all the targeted participants was totally and successfully achieved, and this was attributed to the two male co-researchers who had to be recruited as Zimbabwe is still a patriarch nation and church.

To ease and simplify the coding process, the interview questions were structured in a way that ensured that all participants will respond to the same questions, and it is their different or similar responses that would be coded to come to a plausible conclusion. Twenty (20) participants completed the structured questionnaires, while the other ten (10) were interviewed face to face using the same questions in the questionnaires. Fifty percent (50%) of the ten (10) that were interviewed were overseers of other clergy, while the other fifty percent (50%) were clergy who had personally experienced tribal conflict. Pseudonyms were used to protect the identity of the participants and some information that is very sensitive has been eliminated from this analysis.

5.2 Questions That Were Asked

There were eleven (11) questions that were asked to participants and they summarily are; -

- 5.2.1 How old are you? The age ranges were between 35 and 65.
- 5.2.2 How many years have you been a member of your church?
- 5.2.3 What is your experience in terms of tribalism in Zimbabwe?
- 5.2.4 Which tribe do you belong to?
- 5.2.5 As a black male/ female in the Pentecostal Church in Zimbabwe, share with me your experience of tribalism?
- 5.2.6 In your own words, what was the role of the church in dealing with tribalism?
- 5.2.7 How is your church's leadership structured?
- 5.2.8 As a leader/ clergy, what are the ways you are dealing with tribalism when it raises its head in the congregation?
- 5.2.9 Suggest a way in which the church or clergy can begin to address

tribalism?

5.2.10 Is there any other ground that you can suggest to deal with tribalism?

5.2.11 From your own experience, what is the source that has caused tribalism to emerge within the church?

5.3 Coding

The coding system used considered the composition of the participants and it was also analytic so that both similarities and differences in participants' responses can be analysed to arrive at a plausible conclusion. The questionnaires' template was used in the coding breakdown so that all the questions and their respective answers are included in the data analysis. To eliminate using different and numerous codes, all the participants were asked the same questions, and this eased the collating process. Impromptu questions were asked to seek clarity during the interviews.

Table 4 Breakdown of Participants by Office

Offices	Number of Participants	Percentage
Apostle	9	30%
Prophet	4	13%
Pastor	7	23%
Evangelist	3	10%
Teacher	5	17%
Bishop	2	7%
Total	100	100%

The above table reveals that more Apostles were involved in this research study than the other offices that are found within the Pentecostal movement in Zimbabwe. This was attributed to the fact that most people find the title "apostle" appealing in the Pentecostal movement than others. The second largest number of participants by office was that of Pastors and this was attributed to the fact that the office of pastor is still also appealing to most people. The third number was that of teacher who is involved in the teaching

ministry of the church and also oversees the Sunday School portfolios of their respective churches. It is not clear how these groups of participants arrived at appointing people to these offices, however it is interesting to note that this particular group of clergies have tried to implement Ephesians 4: 11 – 16 (Apostles, Prophets, Evangelists, Pastors, and Teachers). As a topic for further research, it would be of interest to further research in a different study, the effects of this rampant distribution of fancy titles on the congregation and clergy. Of particular interest is the title of Bishop which seem to be part of the fivefold, contrary to what is seen in Ephesians 4, and the Bishop title seemed to enjoy leadership supremacy. Paul the apostle instructed his protégé, Timothy the conditions that pertain to one becoming a Bishop, however within the Pentecostal settings, these biblical conditions seemed to be ignored.

Table 5 Participants by Office & Gender

Office	Number of Males	Number of Female	Percentage of Males	Percentage of Females	Total Percentage
Apostle	6	3	67%	33%	30%
Prophet	1	3	25%	75%	13%
Pastor	5	2	71%	29%	23%
Evangelist	2	1	67%	33%	10%
Teacher	0	5	0%	100%	17%
Bishop	2	0	100%	0%	7%
Total	16	14	53%	47%	100%

The selection of participants according to gender was such that fifty-three percent (53%) of the thirty participants were male, while forty-seven percent (47%) were female clergy. This number does not point to the fact that the Pentecostal church in Zimbabwe is slowly addressing the issue of patriarchy in its hierarchy; however, this reflects the deliberate recruitment that had hoped to have a balanced representation of both males and females. Also noted during this investigation, was the tendency by most of the young Pentecostal clergy who are founders of their denominations, to give their

spouses the titles of prophet or prophetess (depending on the gender of the spouse). The issue of dishing out of titles among Pentecostal clergy is a topic worthy of research, as they are now self-appointed organisations that call themselves “Apostolic-Prophetic Councils” who recruit people and ordain them.

The actual numbers revealed that there are more male than female clergy in the Pentecostal movement in Zimbabwe. For the purposes of this research study, the selection of participants deliberately sought to bring a balanced perspective from both male clergy and female clergy with regards to tribal conflict among clergy. Within this demography, the study revealed that there are no female Bishops and there are also no male teachers within the Pentecostal movement. This was attributed to people self-appointing themselves. It also revealed that there are more male apostles and evangelists than females, and there seems to be an acceptance of only exceptional females in these offices who are gifted. There were also more male pastors than female pastors who participated. These numbers are also attributed to the growing trend among Pentecostal clergy who ordain or appoint their spouses, especially husbands appointing their wives to positions within the churches that they are leading. Still the issue of whether, these spouses are called is an issue for further research however this trend is attributed to promoting of an increase in the visibility of women in leadership positions within the Pentecostal movement in Zimbabwe.

Table 6 Participants Affected by Tribal Conflict

Participants by Office	Number of Participants	Number of Affected Participants	Percentage of Affected Participants
Apostle	9	8	90%
Prophet	4	4	100%
Pastor	7	7	100%
Evangelist	3	3	100%
Teacher	5	5	100%
Bishop	2	2	100%
Total	30	29	97%

Of the thirty (30) participants that participated, it emerged that ninety-seven percent (97%) have been affected or encountered by tribal conflict. Some were affected by tribal conflict outside the church; while for others it was within the church and there was also a third group that was affected through their leadership involvement in disciplinary matters. On further investigation it also emerged that tribal conflict was a daily reality that touched all spheres of society, such that thirty percent (30%) stated that they experience tribal conflict from outside the church. The other sixty percent (60%) experienced tribalism and tribal conflict within the church, with experiences ranging from people who refused to engage others in their own language to outright hate for other tribes.

All the participants from Bulawayo seemed to have deep seated anger towards their Shona counterparts, and showed that they were unwilling to accommodate them within the churches they were leading. Historical, political and social injustices were attributed to this disdain towards the Shona clergy, such that in response to question eleven (11) of the Questionnaire, Participant 6 from Bulawayo declared that their Shona counterparts think that they are the superior tribe. Participant 6 further alluded that the leadership of his denomination, which is based in Harare always marginalised clergy from Matabeleland province by appointing Shona clergy to big and financially stable

branches in the city. Some participants cited the history between the two tribes as a cause for continued conflict and found it hard not to respond to the ongoing socio-political injustices that were perpetrated by the “powerful tribe” to the weaker one. This summary ascertains that tribal conflict among clergy in the Pentecostal movement is a reality.

Table 7 Thematic Frequencies to Tribalism

Theme	Code	Frequency
Attitudes	A	9
Positive Attitudes	PA	5
Negative Attitudes	NA	8
Position in the Church	POC	Clergy
Relationship with other tribe (Ndebele/ Shona)	REOT	3
Relationship with own tribe (Ndebele/ Shona)	REIT	10
Relationship with other tribes (Rest of the Tribes)	RERT	5

The above table portrays the frequency of attitudes that were shown during the participation and answering of the questionnaires and interviews. Hundred percent (100%) of the participants were clergy within the Pentecostal church in Zimbabwe, who occupy different positions as has been previously stated. The attitudes were measured on the scale of between zero (0) for the no attitude and ten (10) for the extreme attitude towards tribalism and other tribes. This study revealed that most of the clergy had very negative attitude towards the other tribe, however it was also noted that there existed a moderate or gentle response to the rest of the other minor tribes who are not members of these two major tribes (Ndebele and Shona

Some clergy had a neutral or laissez faire attitude towards the other tribes and this is

attributed to their need to serve Elohim and seeking to live peacefully with other tribes. One participant clergy, who experienced tribalism when he relocated from one Bulawayo to the Harare, stated that he still struggled to forgive the perpetrators of the ill-treatment who used tribalism to advance their anger. Participant twenty-five (25) described his face to face encounter with tribalism after he was elected to be the national Bishop of his congregation and that promotion entailed him relocating with his family to Harare. Participant twenty-five (25) pointed out that the tribal wars to dislodge him from the position lasted two years, during which clergy were using laity to fight him and his family. Asked what the effect of the tribal conflict was to his family, participant twenty-five (25) pointed out that even his wife and children developed deep seated anger and hate towards Shona people. Participant twenty-five (25) also revealed that the fights escalated until he prematurely resigned from the position before completing his ten (10) year term.

Negative attitudes towards these two tribes emerged as being very high and they emanate from the historical hostility and past of these two tribes with each other, with five Ndebele clergy claiming that their Shona counterparts do not try to even learn their language. This refusal by the Shona clergy and laity in general to learn the Ndebele language even when they are moved to Bulawayo, was perceived by the five Ndebele clergy to mean that they demeaned the Ndebele people, culture and language. The issue of tribal conflict continues to divide the two clergy groups to such an extent that some only attend meetings organised by their tribesmen and would always want an interpreter during meetings. According to five (5) participant clergy, the resultant trajectory for liturgy and dogma was such that the Ndebele clergy conducted services only in their language, while the Shona clergy also followed suit. The cascading effect was that there were few instances where Shona people were welcomed and accepted in the Ndebele churches and the Ndebele people were not welcomed and accepted in the Shona churches. This meant that Shona churches were found in Bulawayo (which is mainly a Ndebele habitat), to cater for Shona laity, and also Ndebele church were found in Harare (which is mainly a Shona habitat) in order to cater for their own kith and kin.

Participant twenty-five (25) highlighted that national conferences were split according to regions to avoid cultural, language and liturgical compromise between the Ndebele and Shona. Participant twenty-five (25) further pointed out that the church organisation that he is affiliated with still tried to have combined national conferences that were held in Gweru; however, he pointed out that one could witness the obvious marginalising of the Ndebele clergy. He pointed out that all services during the national conferences were conducted only in Shona, with a Ndebele interpreter to accommodate people from Matabeleland province. Asked on whether a Ndebele preacher was allowed to preach during the national conference, participant twenty-five (25) pointed out that they would only be allowed to preach if they were fluent in Shona.

Table 8 Definitions of Participants' Emergent Themes

Code	Themes	Definition
A	Attitudes	The attitude of the clergy towards the notion of tribalism among the clergy
PA	Positive Attitudes	Positive attitudes towards removing tribalism in the church
NA	Negative Attitudes	Negative attitudes towards removing tribalism in the church
POC	Position in the Church	All the participants were clergy with different positions of oversight in the church
REOT	Relationship with other tribe (Ndebele/ Shona)	This was an evaluation that a Ndebele/ Shona clergy has towards a Shona/ Ndebele clergy respectively
REIT	Relationship with own tribe (Ndebele/ Shona)	This was an evaluation that a Ndebele/ Shona clergy has towards a Ndebele/ Shona clergy respectively
RERT	Relationship with other tribes (Rest of the Tribes)	This was an evaluation that a Ndebele/ Shona clergy has towards other tribes who are not Ndebele/ Shona.

The attitudes of all the clergy towards other tribes which are not Ndebele or Shona emerged to hinge between love, kindness, to indifference and when further probed it also emerged from three of the participants that this was because there is no history of violence and hatred towards these smaller tribes. This information showed that the continued tribal conflicts that exist between Ndebele and Shona people in general emanated from a long history of violence and hatred towards each other that has not been dealt with. When asked on how it is possible for tribal conflict to find breeding ground among professing Christians, let alone among clergy, the two male Bishops stated that clergy were people who also got affected by the goings on in society at large and their own immediate families. The Bishops suggested that there is an urgent need for dialogue within the church in Zimbabwe as many people are affected by this within and without church.

5.4 Co-Researchers Analysis

The two male co-researchers who are Ndebele and Shona respectively were aware of the need to exercise extreme confidentiality while conducting the research study as they had voluntarily signed non-disclosure agreements. Their identity will remain anonymous so as to protect them from any rebuttals that may come from this research study, especially from the hard-handed ruling political party. They both have disclosed that they were aware that tribalism exists but had not realised how deep it was even among the clergy and raised the issue of promoting open dialogue with church leaders. Since they had direct access and interaction with the participants, they stated that there seemed to be deep seated resentment and mistrust between the two tribes. Asked on whether they themselves had any problems with tribal differences, they both ashamedly admitted that it is difficult to stay among friends and family who had hostility towards the other and not be influenced. The Ndebele co-researcher pointed out that the fact that these two tribes had soccer teams that they supported on the basis of their Ndebele and Shona roots, and this showed how deep were the past wounds inflicted by each tribe on the other have not healed.

When asked on what they could have done differently, in conducting this research study, the co-researchers unanimously suggested that there is need for increasing the time spent with participants. The Shona co-researcher went further to suggest that joint group consultative meetings among Ndebele and Shona clergy were needed as a way to initiate justice, healing and reconciliation. On further quizzing how that would be logistically possible to have such meetings, considering that these groups stay more than five hundred kilometres (500km) from each other, the Shona co-researcher suggested use of regional and national conferences of respective church organization. He further suggested that the consultative meetings can be conducted to suit the churches' leadership conferences when annually they all come together. It was clear from their experience that, the issue of tribal conflict among clergy cannot be ignored as to do so betrayed the very tenets of our faith. It was further suggested that the education curriculum in schools and seminaries must promote unity by making sure that both languages are used and taught from primary school irrespective of what the home language is and where the school is situated. As an endnote, the issue of marginalising smaller tribes was also raised and would be a very interesting research topic that addresses the unity of the faith within a diverse people. Asked on how they protected the data from their tribal and personal bias, both the co-researchers stated that it was during their interactions with participants that they realised how important this study for promoting justice, peace, and reconciliation in the church and nation was. This realisation was the catalyst that safe-guarded any contamination from researcher bias and manipulation. They also pointed out that the presence of the Board chairperson during the sessions was also a necessary safeguard as they were accountable to his oversight.

5.5 Audio Interviews Summary Transcriptions

The audio interviews were conducted for only ten (10) clergy, with five (5) being the General Overseers of clergy and the other five (5) being the clergy who experienced intense tribal conflict that almost cost them their lives. The reason for conducting audio interviews for these two sets of clergies was so as to get the perspectives from those who conducted disciplinary hearings due to their oversight positions and also from those

who personally experienced intense tribal conflict from another clergy. The other twenty (20), although they had experienced tribalism it was not from clergy but from church laity. This research was researching tribal conflict among clergy, hence the twenty (20) would not be extensively analysed in this thread, and however their response to the overall experience of tribalism is captured.

For further study, a look at the response and understanding of laity about tribalism and tribal conflict would add value to the understanding of tribalism. The effect of tribalism perpetrated by laity on clergy is a topic that was revealed during the study and need further investigation. Some clergy revealed that tribalism and abuse at the hands of clergy is very prevalent in the church in Zimbabwe but is not properly addressed, hence it continues unabated.

5.5.1 Participant One (1)

Participant one is an ordained Bishop who is also the chairperson of the Board of Trustees of Zimbabwe Interdenominational Ministers Fraternal (not its real name). He described what his function was and that of his co-trustees by stating that they were the custodians of the Trust that oversees disciplinary hearings among clergy. He narrated an incident where one Clergy was accused of making tribally insensitive statements during a Sunday sermon that was recorded by a laity member. On further investigation, it was discovered that the allegations were true; however, what the video had not captured was the reasons why such a statement had been made in the first place. From further probing, the Bishop stated that the said laity had doctored the evidence to leave the comments only because he had been sent by another clergy to make the video and get incriminating evidence to remove this clergy from that particular church. The Bishop indicated that there were rampant cases of clergy using laity to do their dirty work in fighting tribal wars within the church. The Bishop stated that as an interdenominational organisation that accredits clergy within the Pentecostal movement, they have put in place policies that deal with conflict among clergy. However, he further pointed out that it is difficult to implement those policies because their members voluntarily join the organisation and they have autonomous authority within their churches.

The Bishop suggested that there is need for restructuring the way church leadership within the Pentecostal movement as it left a lot of room for abuse and unaccountability of clergy. He recommended that further national study is needed for this topic that caters for the Zimbabwean context. While explaining African religions, Mbiti promulgated that “African religions are not universal but are tribal or national” (Mbiti, 1969; 4) and this statement explains how the clergy and laity have responded to tribalism. They have created what I would call a Christian tribal religion that embraces their own tribal distinctions and expressions in their liturgy and dogma. This position has promoted a rejected of any tribe that might influence and synergy of other tribal religious values and in the process becoming tribally insensitive to other tribes. The situation is aggravated between the Ndebele and Shona clergy who have a longstanding history of tribal hostility.

5.5.2 Five Participants (The Disciplinary Committee)

The five (5) participants, who are analysed in this thread, are also members of the Board of Trustees of Zimbabwe Interdenominational Ministers Fraternal (not its real name). Two (2) of these are female clergy who are ordained Apostles, while the other three (3) are male who are also ordained by the same organisation as Apostles and a Prophet, respectively. Due to the issue of distance and administrative demands of the organisation, these clergies are all Shona and based in Harare together with their Board Chairperson. While they are all leaders in this interdenominational organisation, they are also clergy of their respective church organisations where they are full time in ministry. Their ages range from fifty (50) years to sixty-seven (67) years, which makes them the ‘elders at the city gates’ of this organisation and this serves as an advantage for influencing transformation within and without this interdenominational organisation. The concept of ‘elders at the city gate’ is taken from the book of Ruth, in the Bible whereby Boaz had to seek the counsel and approval of elders at the gate for permission to marry Ruth (Ruth 4: 1 – 11). These members of this Para-church organization have been approached because of their oversight role within church represents that of the ‘elders at the gate in Ruth’ and their disciplinary interaction with perpetrators and victims

of tribal conflict.

While they all acknowledged that tribalism existed among the clergy, their experience with tribal conflict has been through their involvement with this organisation and they have all expressed concern about lack of disciplinary mechanisms within the church to deal with tribalism. They attributed this lack of disciplinary mechanisms that were tailor-made to deal with tribalism to the views about tribalism and the silent diplomacy used to sweep the issue under the carpet. When initially they were interviewed together, they showed that they had reservations and were uncomfortable about disclosing their personal convictions and this is attributed to the fact that they were aware of the existence of tribal conflict. It was after they were separated that they each were able and comfortable to disclose their personal convictions about tribalism. This behaviour is attributed to distrust among each that has been planted by the current scourge of abductions and witch-hunting that is being done by the current political administration. Due to this current socio-political scenario in Zimbabwe, the participants had to ensure that any information that is sensitive and can jeopardise the participants will be totally eliminated, and pseudonyms will be used where there is need. It is also due to this unstable socio-political climate that meeting in large groups was discouraged; hence the enquiry trajectory was not to engage with participants using the groups method. The issue of water shortage in these two central business districts hindered any large group engagement.

When asked if there was any counselling done for the clergy who had experienced tribalism, to deal with unresolved issues of anger, all the five (5) elders pointed out that the Pentecostal movement over-emphasised miracles more than any other forms of truth, justice, healing and reconciliation. They opt for spiritualising pain instead of using available non-spiritual methods to ensure that the whole person is healed. One elder even declared that if an individual seems to be stuck in unforgiveness and nursing the pain, that individual is considered to be lacking fruits of the spirit, instead of just needing a platform to properly heal. This caused a lot of people to be afraid to express their true feelings, to avoid being labelled and this has created hurting congregants in general and

hurting clergy in particular. One elder even further stated that for the Pentecostal church, they believed in one Counsellor who is stated in the Bible and he is Ruach Ha Chodesh/ Holy Spirit as indicated by the Lord in John 14. This raised the concern of the unwillingness by some Pentecostal believers to accept human psychologists and counsellors, and their propensity to over-spiritualise everything. While appreciating the significance and importance of the work and Person of Ruach Ha Chodesh, the understanding of the shepherding role of counsellor is a topic that demands further investigation and research among Pentecostals. The only counselling that they had, was done for couples who are about to get married, but individuals would only approach clergy for prayers. The over-spiritualising of everything made counselling to be associated with the 'world' and not the church.

When asked about the origins of tribal conflict among clergy, all of them attributed it to the historical tension that has existed between the two tribes and stated that the current spate of social injustices depicted through unequal deployments politically and financial catalysed the tribal tension among these two tribes. Asked whether that kind of mentality should be found among clergy in particular and believers generally, the response was that no believer was exempt from experiencing the pain of tribal conflict and injustice, hence to exclude believers from what has previously happened and what is currently happening is to render the church irrelevant to the very people that need it. One participant went further to claim that people do not eat or live on doctrine, thus doctrine should never be emphasised above what people are experiencing.

5.5.3 Five (5) Participants (Tribalism Victims)

These five (5) participants were recommended and selected on the basis of their unique and almost similar stories about their personal experience with tribalism. One of them is a Bishop in one of the biggest Pentecostal churches in Zimbabwe, and it has a policy of rotating clergy from one place to another irrespective of tribe and language. Bishop Khumbulani (not his real name) found himself in a very difficult predicament when he was transferred from Bulawayo to Harare, where he was supposed to assume the leadership role of National Overseer. He was born and bred in Bulawayo and was a

staunch Ndebele, who had his own reservations about his Shona counterparts, after having stayed among them during his Seminary days. Since the seminary days, he had matured and rose in the ranks of the organisation and was the Matabeleland Regional overseer. When his name came up during the national conference which had been held in Matabeleland, the numbers of electorates were in his favour for him to be nominated to the five-year tenure of National Overseer. However, his Shona counterparts began to fight his ascendance into that position such that it took two (2) years before he could move to Harare and by that time a lot of his 'enemies' had resigned from the organisation.

Bishop Khumbulani was quick to point out that the church had not helped in dealing with tribalism, because they were afraid to lose members should they take a stand for one tribe against the other. By church, here he quickly pointed out that he was referring to the leadership structures that had the authority and mandate to stand for that which is godly. However, for convenience the church opted for opulence of numbers instead of standing for Truth and Bishop Khumbulani became a victim of compromise and ignorance (laity were used by other church leaders to fight him). According to Bishop Khumbulani, the main cause for tribalism in the church is historical, socio-political and economic strife, and people are continuing to fight wars that they heard about but were never part of. According to Bishop Khumbulani, it was not an easy transition, but he fought on because he intended to use his position to influence change and he managed to mix his leadership to accommodate both the tribes. This managed to quell the assault, and by the end of his tenure he had won the respect of even some of his critics. He was quick to also point out that the failure of the church is that they still pretend that tribalism does not exist and is not even willing to have dialogue about its effect on the unity of Christians. He suggested that more consultative meetings are needed whereby people are willing to engage in uncomfortable conversations that are necessary for healing and reconciliation. He also pointed out that the older generation of clergy is now more accommodating of each other, although they still need to help the younger generation of clergy who in their zeal are doing more damage than good.

The other four (4) participants range in age between thirty years (30) and fifty years (50) of age, with two coming from Matabeleland province and the other two from Mashonaland province. Two (2) of these participants were female clergy and the other two (2) were male clergy. All the four participants are founders of ministries that they are leading and have autonomous authority in their ministries that they are treated like demi-gods. Mbiti points out that “African religions have neither founders nor reformers” (Mbiti, 1969; 4). While this statement described that scenario around 1969, as Mbiti has described, it is not true of what is currently happening among African religions including Pentecostal churches in Zimbabwe. Due to the fact that Pentecostal religion has syncretised some of the African traditional practises, it is considered within this discourse as an African religious entity. The Pentecostal churches in Zimbabwe do have ‘founders’ who lead churches as their personal fiefdoms and they are ‘alpha and omega’ of their church organizations such that even the election of a successor is decided by them. This scenario makes the issue of dealing with tribalism very untenable as most of them are not submitted and accountable to anyone. The Para-church organisation was started as a response to this unaccountability and submission of most Pentecostal ‘church founders’ who are clergy.

According to them, they decided to start independent churches so that they have a say in the running of the church affairs, after having encountered tribalism in big churches that sent them to Bible Seminary. They all admitted that tribalism exists in the church and its roots are from family backgrounds and history, such that by the time people are in ministry there is too much influence that has taken root. Asked if they are willing to relocate to another city for the sake of the work of the Lord, two of them were willing while the other two refused to be associated with any other tribe except their own. It has to be noted that the variance in response was divided according to preference instead of tribe.

There is no distinction between their role as clergy, and as custodians of truth, peace and reconciliation with that of being loyal members of their family and tribal associations, such that one of the participants actually vowed that he will not betray his

forefathers by 'sleeping with the enemy'. The 'enemy' that was being referred to, were members of the other tribe, and their common faith did not change how they felt about each other. Without alluding to the fact that all four of them have diplomas in theology might be a cause for such a narrowminded perspective of reconciliation, and that it has any part to play then there is necessity to deliberately have a theological curriculum that deals with such. While engaging these participants it become apparently clear that most of the Ndebele and Shona people in general need healing and forgiveness if the nation will forge ahead in peace. It is a very unhealthy scenario to have unforgiving clergy who are very quick and comfortable to spew their venom to the laity. The existing yet unspoken stand-off between the two tribes of clergy is further exacerbated by the socio-economic instability being felt by everyone and any external effort to have dialogue is viewed as intrusion. It became understandable why this group of clergies had such strong feelings of resentment towards their counterparts from the other tribe, as they were projecting their pain, humiliation, regret and anger after being victims of tribal conflict.

5.6 Questionnaires Summary Transcriptions

The term 'questionnaire' in this regard refers to written down questionnaires that were formulated to maintain a structured order of enquiry that would produce a structured order of response from the participants (see Appendices A & B). This was done so that it becomes easy to collate all the responses, and where the responses are the same then probability is used as a measure for a conclusive position. There were twenty (20) participants who were engaged using this kind of enquiry where two sets of questionnaires were tailor-made for male and female clergy in the Pentecostal church in Zimbabwe. All the twenty (20) participants are Pentecostal clergy who are based in Bulawayo and Harare respectively who have had direct or indirect experience of tribal conflict within their ranks. As had been alluded to in the previous chapters, these twenty (20) clergy belong to the Ndebele and Shona tribes. The responses from these participants are hereby comprehensively analysed on the basis of the eleven (11) questions found in the two sets of questionnaires as follows; -

Question #1: How old are you?

Responses Analysis of Question #1: - The overall average age range for the twenty (20) clergy participants was 48. The age ranges were between twenty-six (26) and sixty-five (65), whereby the youngest of them all was a Shona male aged twenty-six (26) and the oldest was also a Shona male aged sixty-five (65). In order to bring gender balance, the average age of the female clergy was thirty-eight (38) and she is a clergy together with her husband who was not a participant but is a clergy. The ages of the clergy also revealed that all of the clergy were not born when the Ndebele wars on the Shona were carried out. It also revealed that the majority of the clergy were already born when the Gukurahundi massacres took place. These age distinctions also reveal that whatever trauma these clergies felt that has caused them to have tribal hostility towards each other, it is due to something that was transmitted to them by previous generations within their tribe.

Question #2: - How many years have you been a member of your church?

Responses Analysis of Question #2: - Half of the participants had been members of their current churches for more than ten (10) years, while the other half varied between two (2) years and nine (9) years of consistent fellowship in their current churches. Of those who had more than ten (10) years, their longevity of service in one church was attributed to their position in the church (they were all founders of these churches). The other ten (10) clergy attributed their leanness of service to their youth and the effects of church politics and tribal conflict on their family and themselves. Of particular interest were four (4) young clergy who had left different denominations to be clergy in their current denominations, due to the frustrations they experienced when they relocated from one city church to another to serve in other city churches. The cities that were involved in the demise of these four (4) young clergy are Bulawayo and Harare, respectively.

Question #3: - What is your experience in terms of tribalism in Zimbabwe?

Responses Analysis of Question #3: - The tribal experiences among these clergies ranged from social, political, to church platforms. Most of them stated that they experienced tribalism as a daily thing within the social structures of Zimbabwe, for example during the soccer season, two rival soccer teams (namely Highlanders FC for the Ndebele people and Dynamos FC for the Shona people), reveal how tribally polarised Zimbabwe was. Instead of people enjoying social gatherings like football tournaments, every year it ended up being about these two tribes showing their disdain for each other through the football. The other scenario that was unanimously agreed upon was the political arena, whereby the tribes tolerated each other so as to win votes while it was known that there was no love lost between the Ndebele and Shona people. The historical incidences of the Ndebele raids of the Shona and the Shona sponsored Gukurahundi massacres were also brought in as incidences that perpetuated tribal conflict among families. The church incidences of tribalism were also mentioned, as happening in Zimbabwe, with five (5) mentioning how they left their former church denomination when it Split on tribal grounds around the 1980s.

Question # 4: - Which tribe do you belong to?

Responses Analysis of Question #4: - The selection of participants had been deliberately done such that fifteen (15) belonged to the Ndebele tribe, while the other fifteen (15) belonged to the Shona tribe. This had been done in order to bring a balanced perspective from these two (2) tribes. The answers also reflected this reality.

Question #5: - As a black female/ male in the Pentecostal church in Zimbabwe, share with me your experience of tribalism.

Responses Analysis of Question #5: - The gender breakdown of twenty (20) clergy that completed the questionnaires is eleven (11) for males and nine (9) for females. The responses are reflective of this ratio. Out of the twenty (20), only three had not

experienced tribalism at a personal level, however they had experienced from colleagues and society at large. The experiences ranged from tribalism in the church at the hands of laity who were used by other clergy to perpetuate division. Some experiences were claimed to have happened in other church organisations that were not Pentecostal. Some claimed that they experienced tribalism every day in society as people were not very welcoming of each other, especially the Shona and Ndebele.

Question #6: - In your own words, what was the role of the church in dealing with tribalism?

Responses Analysis of Question #6: - Most participants revealed that the Pentecostal church has played minimal to no role in dealing with tribalism. They would rather play diplomatic silence than to address tribal as they are afraid of losing members. They stated that there is competition for membership numbers among Pentecostal churches and the most powerful clergy is the one who has a large following. The laity are aware of this hunger for mega churches, that they now play clergy against each other through church hopping. This has made disciplining laity who abuse clergy on tribal lines very difficult such that clergy opt for silent diplomacy than risk losing members. The only response that has been implemented was that of establishing tribe or language sensitive churches. They now refer Shona members to Shona churches and vice versa for the Ndebele tribes, thereby eliminating the issue of tribal polarisation. Some have opted for introducing interpreters during the preaching session to accommodate those who do not speak the other language. The Pentecostal church has not openly corrected or rebuked those who promote tribal conflict, and they are not realising that their silence is actually promoting tribal conflict. Others stated that the first time they saw tribal conflict being addressed was at a non-denominational gathering of church leaders. The existing disciplinary committees would rather deal with the issue of congregants' sexual misconducts, stealing and other such issues instead of addressing tribal conflict.

Question #7: - How is your church's leadership structured?

Responses Analysis of Question #7: - Most stated that their leadership structure was determined by the larger demography represented among the congregants, since the leadership was appointed via elections. The outcome was such that if the majority of members were Shona, then the leadership structures will have Shona people, while the same was done in the Ndebele churches. Such that the mainly Ndebele church had a Ndebele clergy and Ndebele administrative team, and the same was said of the Shona churches. None of them saw any problem with how tribally sensitive even their members were responding to even the appointment of leaders, stated that they were allowed to have freedom of association.

Question #8: - As a leader/ clergy, what are the ways you are dealing with tribalism when it raises its ugly head in the congregation.

Responses Analysis of Question #8: - fifteen (15) clergy stated that they had not seriously taken into consideration the need to deal with tribalism, as they were still stuck on their need to recover from the experience themselves. They claimed that some of their scars were very recent that they were still stuck on "traumatic experience" itself to be able to deal with it in the church. In response to this, an impromptu question was asked about their biblical understanding of tribalism and most responded by claiming that tribalism is there in the Bible and God allowed Israel to have twelve tribes. It was not clear how the existence of twelve (12) tribes of Israel promotes the notion of tribal conflict among believers, however most were proud of their tribal lineage and looked down on the other tribes regardless of their confession of faith. The remaining five (5) clergy had tried to address tribalism through their weekly teaching where the emphasis was on forgiveness and the love of Elohim. These were open to further interactions about the issue of tribal conflict within the church and wanted the matter to be addressed.

Question #9: - Suggest a way in which the church or clergy can begin to address

tribalism?

Responses Analysis of Question #9: - Most stated that the church needed to have open dialogue about tribalism and to also promote forgiveness between these two tribes. It was also suggested the church must avoid sensationalising this issue by going to national platforms before dealing with tribalism at grassroots level. All the clergy declared that healing for the clergy was an urgent need that would begin the healing process across churches. Some pointed out that the church has expected them to be super spiritual and ignored that they were also human beings who hurt and struggled. Others felt that if they can show any weakness, then their members will not look up to them as spiritual oversight and hence they have not fully dealt with their pain that was induced by tribal conflict. It was also suggested that there was need to introduce disciplinary statutes within the church which would assist in specifically dealing with tribalism. Three clergies suggested that the church must also involve the communities surrounding them in dealing with tribalism, by having truth and healing seminars that promoted open dialogue with neighbouring locals.

Question #10: - Is there any other ground that you can suggest to deal with tribalism?

Responses Analysis of Question #10: - The Bible Seminary curriculum would go a long way by making sure that counselling is introduced for the student clergy, before they venture into ministry. The church to lead the nation in peace, justice, healing and reconciliation whereby everyone takes responsibility for their part in perpetuating tribalism and tribal conflict.

Question #11: - From your own experience, what is the source that has caused tribalism to emerge within the church?

Responses Analysis of Question #11: - All of the participants attributed tribalism to the previous incident of wars and Gukurahundi massacres as the catalysts that have caused a continued tribal conflict within the Ndebele and Shona people. It was stated

that the people in the church also belong to families where they see tribalism being celebrated and they bring the same attitude to the church. The clergy are not exempt from feelings of loyalty to their biological families at the expense of their spiritual families. Most of the clergy work among their own people and have not been deployed to different tribes, thereby being good grounds for continued exposure to the tribal conflict. The day to day experiences of the socio-economic and political challenges have been one of the causes why tribalism has found expression in the church, as no church members are immune to the challenges.

5.7 Preliminary Conclusion

The aspect of trauma that clergy experience at the hands of other clergy and laity in the church needs to be openly dealt with so that clergy become healed shepherds who will foster healing among the congregants that they oversee. Most participants have been deeply wounded by the tribal conflict that has caused some to be displaced from their original churches, while others had to prematurely resign from their deployment in an effort to self-preserve. While the perpetrators of the tribal conflicts have a sense of accomplishment for having gotten rid of their purported rivals, their behaviour reveals that they are also traumatised. One author stated that hurt people hurt other people and if the hurt is not dealt with, then the circle of hurt will be transferred from one generation to another. There is a connection between past hurts with contemporary expressions of hurt and anger, until they are dealt with the circle of carelessly removing a bandage keeps creating a new and fresh wound every day. The intensity and length of a traumatic event is one of the determinant factors that influences the level of trans-generational transmission of trauma. The responses of the participants have revealed that trans-generational transmission of trauma has caused the continued conflict between the Ndebele and Shona clergy in particular and all Zimbabweans in general. Transmission of trauma is done consciously or subconsciously by one generation to the other, and older clergy have not been aware of their role in transmitting trauma.

The church in Zimbabwe needs healing from historical trauma caused by tribal conflict between Ndebele and Shona clergy and laity. The awareness of the existence of the

historical trauma between these two tribes has caused politicians to use it for their political agenda regardless of the consequences on citizens. The fear of politicians by clergy has made many clergies not confront politicians for perpetuating hate between Ndebele and Shona. The Pentecostal Bible schools and seminaries in Zimbabwe do not have a curriculum that helps clergy-in-training to deal with their traumatic past before they venture into ministry. This makes clergies to be ill-prepared to deal with tribal conflict, as they are also emotionally and psychologically scarred by the history of trauma that their families endured at the hands of the other tribe. Instead of being custodians of reconciliation, clergy in the Pentecostal church have become perpetrators of tribal conflict.

The following chapter looks at peace and reconciliation and compares what Rwanda and South Africa did to heal past hurts. The comparative analysis will assist to see if there are templates to use for the church in Zimbabwe. The preliminary conclusion will assist in transitioning to the final chapter.

6. HEALING AND RECONCILIATION

6.1 Introduction

From the previous chapters, it has become apparent that there is need to implement truth, justice, peace, healing and reconciliation among clergy as the first point of call in the many processes that will follow. Other Zimbabwean scholars (Motsi, 2012), (Ngwenya, 2015), (Manyonganise, 2014) and many others have researched on the issue of tribal conflict between Ndebele and Shona people that has spanned centuries, all point out that there is a need for dialogue. The time is ripe to unite and foster reconciliation in the church across denominational lines, as the nation of Zimbabwe has been in years of different forms of trauma. While there have been many church voices in Zimbabwe that have been pushing for healing at National and political level, healing must begin in the church. This chapter looks at the role of the church to deal with healing and reconciliation within itself and the processes that must be followed in establishing a biblically sound platform for healing and reconciliation. The role of Elder clergy as a beginning of establishing healing and reconciliation reservoirs for the church will be analysed with regards to the Zimbabwean cultural model of a village disciplinary system. Theologically, healing and reconciliation is placed in the church and in the case of the Zimbabwean scenario the custodianship of healing and reconciliation must be placed back in the hands of the church.

The role of younger clergy will cascade from the recommendations of the elders, in order to make sure that the elderly efforts for healing and reconciliation are handed over to the next generation. The effects of trans-generational transmission of trauma have to be acknowledged and addressed in an endeavour to deal truthfully with past hurts. A look at what has been previously suggested by other studies, as a way of dealing with unforgiveness of past atrocities will assist in building upon. While the church joined other voices, after the 2000 politically motivated killings and abductions, it had not raised the same voice within its walls to deal with tribal conflict. According to the world population review, Zimbabwe is known to be eighty-four percent (84%) Christian, yet it

socially behaves as if the majority are non-believers in the way it responds to tribal and social distinctions among itself.

This chapter summarises church efforts in promoting justice, peace and reconciliation within its four walls, especially with regards to tribal conflict. The template of South Africa's Truth and reconciliation tribunal will be look at with regards to the role of the church in leading those efforts. The Rwandan post genocide efforts to foster peace, justice and reconciliation will also be looked, and the emphasis is on the role of the church as the biblical custodian of the message of peace and reconciliation. The conclusion will bring a summary of the chapter and bridge to the seventh (7th) and final chapter of this research study that will look at the findings and recommendations of this research study.

6.2 Gathering of Church Elders

The Chronicle Newspaper article (2015) the then Head of the National Healing efforts of the government in Zimbabwe, Vice President Phelekezela Mphoko made a statement that acknowledged the role of the church in fostering peace, justice and reconciliation (The Chronicle, 15th February 2015). However, his acknowledgement was just a public statement that was not further anchored on action and involvement in bringing the church to the fore. Following the interaction with the participants, it became clear that there was need to put a strategy that will promote peace, justice and reconciliation within the church. While the then Vice President Mphoko was referring to the role of the church in the political arena, the church needs to first deal with its inside wound. The role of the Pentecostal church elders who are also clergy was seen as enabling the environment for continued tribal conflict as the elders opted for diplomatic silence.

The Clergy elders seem to opt for the traditional view of dealing with conflict, whereby they avoid dealing with conflict. Robbins posited that the "traditional view is the notion that promotes diplomatic avoidance of conflict in the hope that it will gradually dissipate" (Robbins, 2015; 36). This notion promotes the "tortoise stance" of dealing with any conflict, and it may work where conflict is just minor misunderstandings, however in the

case whereby conflict has been going on for centuries this stance does not work. By “tortoise stance” the researcher borrows from the behaviour of a tortoise when faced with danger and hides inside its shell. Despite the fact that the tortoise is hiding inside its shell, it does not mean that it has dealt with external danger and this “tortoise stance” is what the Pentecostal church has taken about tribal conflict. Each denomination goes inside its own shell (denominational walls), while pretending that there is no imminent danger outside. The research suggests that forgiveness and reconciliation cannot be fostered when clergy in particular and the Pentecostal church at large are taking the “tortoise stance” of hiding and hoping that tribal conflict will solve itself.

6.3 South African Truth, and Reconciliation Commission Template

In a public lecture in Belgium the Dr Boraine (who was the vice-chairperson of the Truth, Reconciliation Commission) "South Africa has decided to say no to amnesia and yes to remembrance; to say no to full-scale prosecutions and yes to forgiveness" (Boraine, 2016). For a people to forge ahead there is need to have honest dialogue that would promote justice, peace and forgiveness. The set-up of the Truth, Reconciliation Commission (TRC) of South Africa was quasi-legal that did not offer further counselling for the victims of political violence of the Apartheid era. This set-up cannot be applied to the Zimbabwean situation because the judicial system of Zimbabwe is much politicised, such that instead of helping victims it might further traumatise them. While the TRC has been hailed as successful with regards to meeting its objectives, it still falls short with regards to dealing with historical trauma that is continuing in the church. The Pentecostal church in Zimbabwe particularly and the rest of the Christian body needs a platform that is not politically polarised. While appreciating that Arch-Bishop Tutu, a renowned clergy was the chair of the TRC, the previous efforts in Zimbabwe have not put a clergy to guide the proceeding, thereby making the TRC template untenable in the Zimbabwean scenario. The Zimbabwean scenario needs grassroots platforms of truth and reconciliation that will not be politicised to gain votes.

Only a small percentage of the total South African population participated in the TRC hearings to seek restitution, and this minimal figure can mean that the rest of the South

African population did not get closure from the traumatic experiences of Apartheid. In order to achieve national truth, justice and reconciliation, then a small percentage will not make that a reality as people experience traumatic events differently. Consultative meetings at grassroots level are a good starting point that will trigger national healing and assist in dismantling societal rage. With the case of Zimbabwe, the two tribes need to be engaged at their tribal level whereby the tribal elders like chiefs and clergy can engage each other. This has not been done in Zimbabwe, and the wounds of trans-generational trauma keeps festering and reproducing gangrenous offspring of expression among the Ndebele and Shona people.

6.4 Rwandan Reconciliation Template

The case of Rwandan genocide of the 20th century and how the nation transitioned to foster peace and a way to live harmoniously is a good template to try and superimpose on the Ndebele-Shona debacle that continues to mar peaceful coexistence. The case of Rwanda is a reminder that dialogue is an ongoing process that must not be delayed until one ethnic or tribal group rises up to take matters into their own hands. It is a reminder that no tribe or ethnic group must claim supremacy over the other and hope that history will not catch up with its reckless claim to be over the other. While appreciating that the template of Rwanda cannot be “a one size fits all” that can now be used in the Zimbabwean situation, appreciation is given for the effort that was taken by the Rwandan government to hold everyone responsible to forgive. The pre-genocide parallels with Zimbabwe are that there was an injustice done by one tribe or ethnic group to the other, and vice versa, and also that this was not addressed before it exploded. This makes the pre and post genocide Rwandan scenario of interest to the Zimbabwean scenario. The fact that some prisoners had to be released earlier due to the overcrowding in Rwanda, shows that punitive justice is not always the way to go.

According to Potter, “Punitive justice which is also known as retributive justice is a form of justice that seeks a corresponding punishment for the perpetrator, that is, an eye for eye” (Potter, 2006; 71). Punitive justice does not promote forgiveness but promotes revenge and it does not seek to reconcile the victim and perpetrator. The alternative to Punitive Justice is Restorative Justice. Potter defined restorative justice as “the justice that seeks restoration and forgiveness as the ultimate goal” (Potter, 2006: 67). There is need to consider forgiveness in Zimbabwe and the process must involve the victims accepting to forgive, while also the perpetrators openly apologise as was the case of Rwanda.

6.5 Reconciliation: A Pastoral Concern

The title of this subheading was inspired by a book which was edited by Douglas Waruta and Hannah Kinoti, entitled ‘Pastoral Care in African Christianity: Challenging Essays in Pastoral Theology (Waruta and Kinoti, eds., 2013). Waruta and Kinoti emphasised the need to employ the African worldview in dealing with forgiveness and reconciliation (Waruta and Kinoti, 2013; 10). While this may be true for the African context, the situation in Zimbabwe has to take into cognisance that the two tribes (Ndebele and Shona) have their separate worldview (which they would be quick to bring to the fore so as to prove how distinct they are from each other). The way to go would then to bring a counter worldview from both in order to forge unity of purpose (unity and reconciliation. This counter-culture would then be the biblical worldview, which gladly both parties are submitted to though with a skewed theology when it comes to tribal conflict. Reconciliation thereby needs to be founded on Scripture alone, as these are clergy who subscribe to biblical ethos. It has to be emphasised that reconciliation is pastoral concern, and every clergy must ensure that they endeavour to keep the bond of peace with their neighbour.

6.6 Pastoral Response to Historical Trauma

Peter Kanyandago alluded that “proper pastoral solutions are able to assist to curb the violence in Africa” (Kanyandago, 2013; 41 – 71). The historical empirical evidence that Kanyandago used from “the writings of Africa’s evangelists and colonialists show that, aggression against and onslaught on African culture and people has resulted in psychopathology” (Kanyandago, 2013; 41 – 71). For African to continue being aggressive to herself by seeing another tribe as inferior than the other, is not different than a person who drinks poison with the hope that their enemy would die. In the same manner, the Pentecostal church cannot nature unity without first uniting within herself and doing away with the historical theology on tribal distinctions. Kanyandago also showed that internal causes of violence should not be excluded in an effort to bring a lasting solution to deal with the violence to Africa (Kanyandago, 2013; 41 – 71). His psychotherapy suggestion is that “collective efforts must be exerted in an effort to heal and rehabilitate Africa through a process that will establish harmony and equilibrium” (Kanyandago, 2013; 41 – 71). His four step approach highlights: -

1. The church needs to correct past theologies which have tended to justify white supremacy and superiority.

Critique 1: - While this approach deals with the issue of white supremacy and superiority as a requisite for correcting past theologies in the church, there is also needed to deal with past theologies which have tended to justify tribal supremacy among blacks in Africa. Independence from colonialism in Africa was one when different tribes within a country came together and fought for freedom from a common enemy (colonialism), however there is no

independence when the same tribes come back and start killing each other. The idea of behaving as if there is always at war when there is no one to fight will make Africa try to kill her own shadow. The church is not yet delivered if it is still fighting within itself and trying to gain supremacy among itself. There

2. Christian theology needs to distinguish between redemptive and oppressive suffering and depart from narrow interpretation that accommodates violence and glorify suffering.

Critique 2: - There is an urgent need within the Pentecostal church in particular and the whole church in Zimbabwe to revisit their theology when it comes to the issue of violence. African theology that helped Africa to be emancipated served its purpose and now there is a need to bring a new theological discourse that would foster justice, truth, peace, and reconciliation. The notion that there must always be an emotional and psychological explosion going on among believers is a notion that glorifies violence and discord at the expense of peace and harmony. A Theological Praxis that promotes peace and reconciliation is a necessity within the church and among clergy.

3. For real reconciliation to take place in Africa, Africans need to reaffirm their culture by spreading knowledge of the African culture through various channels of communication.

Critique 3: - While emphasis is on Africa and its need to have real reconciliation, there has to be first real reconciliation at national level cascading down to grassroots level (whereby dialogue for restitution happens

among tribes). In the case of the Pentecostal church tribal conflict among clergy, real dialogue must begin with clergy acknowledging that there is a need to revamp their theological position on tribal issues.

4. Justice is a prerequisite to reconciliation and therefore past and present injustices by developed countries must be addressed through the International Courts of law, so that necessary restitution can be realised.

Critique 4: - Restorative Justice is a prerequisite for reconciliation instead of punitive justice. In a scenario where perpetrators of historical trauma may have long died and the trajectory for seeking justice must be viewed in line with restoring justice. Where restitution can be administered as a means to get justice then it must be done in a manner that promotes reconciliation and peace, instead of revenge. With regards to the Pentecostal church in Zimbabwe, there is need for restorative justice, as no form of punishment will bring back what was lost.

6.7 Healing: A Pastoral Concern

Mwaura outlined five steps by which pastoral care should be effected in the African church; these are Physical, Social, Psychiatric/ Emotional, Moral/ Spiritual, and Environment (Mwaura, 2013; 72). While Mwaura looks at the whole of Africa, preference is taken by looking at only the Pentecostal church in Zimbabwe and it is true that these five steps are also needed within the Pentecostal church in Zimbabwe. In the Pentecostal church in Zimbabwe there is an element of having effectually implemented pastoral care concerning the spiritual and physical among the congregants. Most Pentecostal clergy consider healing to be about physical ailments only and they

advance it to the point of even faking miracles of people being physically healed. There is therefore a need for revamping the Pentecostal mindset, to being to consider emotional and psychological healing as also part of pastoral care. There is still a lot that need to be done when it comes to the emotional or psychiatric part of the church even among Pentecostal clergy. The issue of tribal conflict among clergy is an indication that there is need to address the historical traumas that cause tribal conflict. The fact that some clergy do not want to address the existence of tribal conflict among their peers, is also an indicator there is still an element of denial or embarrassment about it.

Mwaura suggested that “mainline denominations ought to effect the pastoral ministry more comprehensively in order to facilitate wholesome living” (Mwaura, 2013; 73). While he is looking at the mainline denominations (Roman Catholic Church, Anglican, Lutheran, etc), it is imperative to include the Pentecostal and Charismatic churches as well. If the ear is injured then the whole body is also in pain, and there is need to address all forms of Christian expression so as to wholly foster healing. Pastoral Theology is defined by Mwaura as the branch of theology that discusses how a pastor assists (duties, obligations, and functions) with the wellbeing of people under his oversight (Mwaura, 2013; 74).

Pastoral Theology is also shown by Mwaura as a study that aims at making pastors to be “fit servants of Yahshua as well as stewards of the mysteries of Yahweh”, thereby being able to “restore humankind to a state of wholeness/ wellness (Mwaura, 2013; 84). With regards to the clergy in the Pentecostal church in Zimbabwe, there is need to bring

healing to them first before they can be fit to heal the laity. The schisms that have been instigated by the clergy are a reflection of an urgent need to bring healing to clergy.

Mwaura defined who the church is, and this definition includes both Clergy and Laity as active priests in discipling of the baptised as well as witnesses of Yahshua (Mwaura, 2013, 87). Therefore, pastoral care is not the responsibility of Bishops and Clergy alone, but for the whole congregation to minister to its spiritual and temporal needs. The need to bring wholesome healing to the church starting with clergy and cascading to laity until it touches even those outside the church can be addressed by restoring biblical truth about reconciliation. The church is therefore faced with a problem of addressing social, psychological, political, moral and economic ills so that total healing may be experienced by those who come into contact with its “saltiness and light”. Mwaura shows that the term healing is not used only to deal with physical ailments alone, but every aspect of human life that might deprive humanity of a harmonious existence, thus the church comes in as an agent of healing to address all social ills (Mwaura, 2013; 90).

6.8 Preliminary Conclusion

This chapter analysed the aspect of truth and reconciliation with regards to the Pentecostal church in Zimbabwe. The truth and reconciliation templates of South Africa and Rwanda were summarily analysed so as to draw parallels for use within the Pentecostal church in Zimbabwe. While it is appreciated that both these templates were done at national and political platforms, the Pentecostal scenario needs grassroots efforts. The Government of Zimbabwe has already established a politically and nationally motivated National Peace and Reconciliation Commission (NPRC), as has

been stated in chapter one (1). The effort of the Government of Zimbabwe cannot be disregarded in terms of its terms of reference; however, the church needs to administer its own truth and reconciliation that is submitted to biblical ethos. The gathering of church elders as a first point of reference has been suggested within this chapter, as one of efforts that must spearhead the Christocentric and bibliocentric truth and reconciliation. The ministry of reconciliation needs to be restored as a necessity and mandate of clergy in particular and church at large.

The following chapter addresses the findings that were made with regards to the aims and objectives of this research, and also the recommendations based on the aims and objectives stated in chapter 1. The purpose is to measure whether the aims and objectives were met and also to suggest further research on the subject.

7. FINDINGS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

7.1 Introduction

The previous chapter dealt with the issue of truth and reconciliation as a way of healing clergy perpetrators of tribal conflict within the Pentecostal church in Zimbabwe. The discussion zeroed in on the South African TRC and Rwandan template as African nations that had succeeded in their own way in engaging in transitional justice at political level. While appreciating that the dynamics of truth and reconciliation efforts in any nation may vary due to the socio-political fabrics of each nation, the efforts by the two nations to have transitional justice and reconciliation are applauded. Zimbabwe as a nation failed to utilise the celebratory atmosphere immediately after gaining independence, to bring total reconciliation to the Ndebele and Shona tribes. The previous chapter's emphasis was on how the Pentecostal church can glean from the TRC template and bring it to the church level without seeking punitive justice.

This final chapter explores how the initial aims and objectives were either fulfilled or not fulfilled and suggest recommendations on the basis of the aims and objectives that had been set. A recap at the aims and objectives from chapter ones hereby presented below; -

- To have a deeper understanding of the challenges of nonpartisan pastoral care in a tribally volatile environment.
- To Develop Pastoral Care models or practices suitable to be recommended and implemented for the church in Zimbabwe.
- To develop a Monitoring and Evaluation model for assessing the effectiveness of pastoral care in a tribally volatile environment.
- To create an awareness of the predicaments and impediments involved with pastoral care in a tribally volatile environment.
- To Bring the Church back to its mandate of reconciliation in the context of clergy tribal conflict.
- To promote real Truth and Reconciliation among Clergy that will facilitate healing

to the nation of Zimbabwe.

These are now going to be analysed point by point on the basis of the findings, to ascertain if the objectives were met. Other findings that were not part of the objectives would also be added to further bring clarity to the phenomenon of tribal conflict among Pentecostal clergy in Zimbabwe's two main cities, namely Bulawayo and Harare.

7.2 Aims and Objectives Findings

Aim #1

- To have a deeper understanding of the challenges of nonpartisan pastoral care in a tribally volatile environment.

Finding #1

It was discovered that due to the hardships faced due to the economic meltdown in Zimbabwe, many clergies have compromised on the Gospel by pushing a partisan agenda. While some hide their political preferences in fear of being marginalised some who support the ruling party are not ashamed to flaunt their political associations and connections. This has made clergy to even have tribal preferences which makes the issue of tribal conflict within the church, difficult to thwart. It is difficult for clergy to remain unattached to a political, considering that even the laity have their own political preferences, and this makes the clergy to be very careful not to speak against any political. There is high mistrust among clergy themselves as there is a clear stance of survival of the fittest with some being feared to be on payroll to spy others. Warnings were made during the interviews to be careful with what is discussed.

Aim #2

- To Develop Pastoral Care models or practices suitable to be recommended and implemented for the church in Zimbabwe.

Finding #2

It was suggested that there is need to bring new platforms of interaction with and among clergy, as most of the existing platforms were either politically polarised or those who have been leading them were not willing to implement new ideas and ways to promote pastoral care wellness. The other suggestion was that even if new platforms of interaction could be implemented, there would always be an element of suspicion about the “new kid on the block” and its intentions about existing, tried and tested platforms. The socio-political environment does not help to forge new ways and platforms for interacting with clergy.

Aim #3

- To develop a Monitoring and Evaluation model for assessing the effectiveness of pastoral care in a tribally volatile environment.

Finding #3

The existing organisations can be approached to propose a monitoring and evaluation model whereby clergies are accountable for growth, training, counselling and even deployment. The currently existing models are about monitoring church growth and expansion, but they do little or nothing about helping the clergy. This has made many clergies feel that they were left to fend for themselves and disconnected with the mother bodies, such that this disconnection has given rise to immorality and dishonesty with church funds. Most clergy suggested that accountability should not be done in a manner that it becomes a witch hunting exercise, but instead it must be for the well-being of the clergy. Most voiced that they need to have a sense a belonging that would help them deal with the traumatic events in their lives

Aim #4

- To create an awareness of the predicaments and impediments involved with pastoral care in a tribally volatile environment.

Finding #4

It is not easy to create awareness as a female clergy, as the church in Zimbabwe is still patriarchy on most of its leadership structures. The best option would be to

begin with a small group of clergy elders who have an established following and can advance the awareness. Most of them are not willing to do it without any financial incentives, hence one has to use their conferences and seminars as platforms for awareness campaigns. This would still need to begin by getting a buy-in from male clergy who can catalyse and be the face of the spreading of the message.

Aim #5

- To Bring the Church back to its mandate of reconciliation in the context of clergy tribal conflict.

Finding #5

The interviews made it clear that the message of reconciliation was not of utmost importance among the clergy, hence the need to conscientize the church about the doctrine of reconciliation. Some understand only one aspect of the reconciliation mandate; the evangelism aspect whereby a sinner is reconciled with Elohim through hearing the Gospel and repenting. However, the aspect of reconciliation that involves a fellow clergy being reconciled with a fellow clergy through forgiveness and peace is still foreign to most clergy. Relationships can be disposed of if they no longer serve the carnal purpose that made them to exist, while ignoring that continued interaction promotes prolonged fellowship that is born out of overlooking one's faults.

Aim #6

To promote real Truth and Reconciliation among Clergy that will facilitate healing to the nation of Zimbabwe.

Finding #6

There is an urgent need to establish awareness campaigns, group therapies, seminars and theological curriculum that would assist to promote real truth and reconciliation among clergy. At the moment, there are non-existent platforms that

promote real truth and reconciliation among clergy.

7.3 Recommendations

7.3.1 Educational Curriculum

The curriculum in the Bible schools, seminaries and universities in Zimbabwe needs to be revamped to include studies on trauma, counselling and reconciliation. Refresher courses must also be introduced to cater for those who are already in ministry and do not intend to further their studies. Some of the courses must be tailor made to response to seen lack of understanding among clergy, such that they are always academically challenged.

7.3.2 Conflict Resolution

Conflict resolution must be prioritised and taught among Pentecostal clergy and religious escapism must be totally eradicated. Not everything is caused by demons, people must learn to take responsibility for their own actions and seek proper recourse like forgiveness and repentance. Openness to deal with any conflict that might arise should not be shunned from, and clergy elders must be invited to oversee any conflict resolutions among each other. Keeping quiet when injustices are perpetrated against fellow clergy is no different than being a co-perpetrator in traumatising others.

7.3.3 Transmission of Trauma

There is need to have a curriculum that is tailor made for the African clergy that deals with trans-generational transmission of trauma. While most elders in the Zimbabwean families have not grasped the need to have a will and testament about their assets in

the event of death, they have successfully managed to transfer their trauma to generations after them. Support groups need to be set up among communities in Zimbabwe to assist them to understand how trauma can and is transferred from one generation to another.

7.4 Conclusion

One of the purposes of this study was to ascertain what pastoral care role method could be used to create awareness about tribal conflict and also to assist victims and perpetrators to heal. Pollard's Positive Deconstruction of engaging in dialogue with clergy was a very relevant strategy, as it was found that dialogue was lacking among clergy. The type of dialogue that would interrogate theological positions and praxis in order to align with Scripture while also bringing complete healing among fellow believers and clergy. This deliberate roundtable dialogue that would pursue real truth and reconciliation and establish restorative justice among clergy. The kind of dialogue that would restore the biblical role of clergy as custodians of reconciliation and truth, as well as setting the clergy as worthy prophetic voices in the nation of Zimbabwe. A healed clergy fosters and endeavours to lead a healed congregation, thus influencing a healed nation that is open to dialogue instead of responding with violence to any form of dialogue. The church as a whole in Zimbabwe needs to learn how to talk to each other instead of talking about each other, so that it may be the salt and light that shows secular government how to honestly and truthfully engage its citizens without using intimidation to garner coherence.

APPENDICES

APPENDIX A: QUESTIONNAIRE FOR FEMALE CLERGY

Note: Honestly answer the question and also tick where appropriate. Your identity and responses will be treated with utmost confidentiality.

1. How old are you?

Years				
16 - 20	21 - 40	41 - 60	61 - 90	91 and Above

2. How many years have you been a member of your church?

Years				
1 - 10	11 - 20	21 - 40	41 - 60	61 and Above

3. What is your Experience in terms of Tribalism in Zimbabwe?

4. Which Tribe do you belong to?

Ndebele	Shona	Other

5. As a Black Female in the Pentecostal Church in Zimbabwe, share with me your experience of tribalism.

6. In your own words, what was the role of the church in dealing with tribalism?

7. How is your church's leadership structured?

Ndebeles Only	Shonas Only	Ndebeles & Shonas Proportionally

8. As a Leader/ Clergy, what are the ways you are dealing with tribalism when it raises its head in the congregation?

9. Suggest a way in which the church or clergy can begin to address tribalism

10. Is there any other ground that you can suggest to deal with tribalism?

11. From your own experience, what is the source that has caused tribalism to emerge within the church?

APPENDIX B: QUESTIONNAIRE FOR MALE CLERGY

Note: Honestly answer the question and also tick where appropriate. Your identity and responses will be treated with utmost confidentiality.

1. How old are you?

Years				
16 - 20	21 - 40	41 - 60	61 - 90	91 and Above

2. How many years have you been a member of your church?

Years				
1 - 10	11 - 20	21 - 40	41 - 60	61 and Above

3. What is your Experience in terms of Tribalism in Zimbabwe?

4. Which Tribe do you Belong to?

Ndebele	Shona	Other

5. As a Black Male in the Pentecostal Church in Zimbabwe, share with me your experience of tribalism.

6. In your own words, what was the role of the church in dealing with tribalism?

7. How is your church's leadership structured?

Ndebeles Only	Shonas Only	Ndebeles & Shonas Proportionally

8. As a Leader/ Clergy, what are the ways you are dealing with tribalism when it raises its head in the congregation?

9. Suggest a way in which the church or clergy can begin to address tribalism

10. Is there any other ground that you can suggest to deal with tribalism?

11. From your own experience, what is the source that has caused tribalism to emerge within the church?

**APPENDIX C: LETTER REQUESTING PERMISSION TO CONDUCT
RESEARCH AT CHURCH**

The Chairman
ZIMF
Harare,
Zimbabwe

**TITLE OF THE STUDY: TRIBAL CONFLICT WITHIN CLERGY IN ZIMBABWE:
A PASTORAL CARE CHALLENGE**

Greetings in the name of our Soon Coming Lord, as a former member of the organisation who is currently pursuing studies with the University of Pretoria, I request permission to do a research on the above-mentioned subject within two of your Chapters, namely Bulawayo and Harare. The study can be done after one of your monthly meetings, so as to access as many participants as reasonably possible.

The Study will involve some of your Ndebele and Shona Clergy who are male and female, to answer some questions (see attached copy of the questionnaires). Participants will make informed consent before commencing with the study by signing a Consent Form (also attached). All participants will remain unidentified and records obtained during this study will be regarded as confidential.

Yours Sincerely

Nomathemba N. Msipa
Researcher

APPENDIX D: CONSENT LETTER**INFORMED CONSENT LETTER**

Surname: Msipa
Title: Apostle
First names: Nomathemba Nontokozo
Date of birth: 01 April 1971
ID number: DN514694
Citizenship: Zimbabwean

Purpose of the Study

The purpose of this research is to investigate and understand why there is tribalism among the clergy. To hear from the clergy about the issue of tribalism within their rank and file, and further find out what mechanisms or systems of pastoral care are there in the Church to help and assist clergy to deal with tribalism. To come up with a pastoral care model that can address tribal conflict among clergy.

Procedures to be followed

The researcher is planning to have clergy drawn from an inter-denominational organisation called International Ministers Fellowship – Zimbabwe (IMFZ) chapters situated in Bulawayo and Harare, respectively to source information. A Mixed method will be used to gather this information and it will be through a questionnaire (see proposed appendices A and B) and interviews.

Risks and Discomforts

The participants will be expected to share their experiences to the research individually in order to protect their responses. The information will be treated with

utmost confidentiality and therefore there will be no risk involved.

Benefits

This is a voluntary exercise; there will be no gain, either in cash or in kind. The only benefit will be that the participants will be able to share experiences knowledge and empower one another in the process.

Rights of Participants

The research will make sure that the rights of participants are respected throughout the process. It will be voluntary, and participants may withdraw at any time if they feel so without any negative consequences. The researcher will explain the process at the beginning of every meeting so that participants are reminded of their rights.

Confidentiality

The researcher will make sure that the whole exercise and process is done confidentially. The identities of participants will be protected. The researcher and the University of Pretoria will access the information collected during this research.

Declaration

In order to ensure that all participants of the interviews have agreed to participate, the researcher will prepare a form of declaration in this way. Having received detailed explanation by the research on the aims and objectives of this research,

APPENDIX E: PARTICIPANT CONSENT FORM

TITLE OF THE STUDY: Tribal Conflict Among Pentecostal Clergy in Zimbabwe:
A Pastoral Care Challenge

I..... hereby voluntarily consent to participate in the above-mentioned study. I understand that it is completely voluntary, and I can withdraw at any stage. I have been assured that my name will not be used when writing down what was discussed with me. The purpose and Objectives of the Study have been explained in full to me.

Participant: Date:/...../..... Place:

Researcher: Date:/...../..... Place:

Witness: Date:/...../..... Place:

GLOSSARY

Elohim: This is a Hebrew name for God used in Genesis 1: 1

Gukurahundi: Is a Shona Word that means Cleansing/ Washing Away

Ndebele: A Nguni Tribe found mostly in Southern Zimbabwe

Shona: A tribe found mostly in two thirds of Northern Zimbabwe

Ruach Ha Chodesh: This is also a Hebrew name for Holy Spirit.

Yahshua Ha Mashiach: Hebrew name for Jesus the Messiah.

Yahweh: Hebrew name for God.

Trans-Generational Trauma: Trauma Transferred Through generations.

SCRIPTURE INDEX (PARTIAL)

Note: This Scripture Index does not list all Scripture references in this Research Project, only those where a passage is discussed to bring out interpretative clarity and doctrinal understanding.

	Page
Acts 19.....	69
2 Corinthians 11: 23.....	32
Galatians 2: 11 - 14.....	27
Isaiah 53: 5 – 7	85
John 13: 34 – 35.....	31
John 14	90
1 John 2: 9	32
Leviticus 19: 33 – 34	31
Luke 20: 12	69
Luke 10: 34	69
Romans 10: 12 - 13.....	32
Ruth 4: 1 – 11.....	88

BIBLIOGRAPHY

- Attah-Poku, A. 1998. *African ethnicity: History, conflict management, resolution and prevention*. Lanham, Maryland: University Press of America.
- Becker, E., Dochhorn, J. and Holt, E. K. (eds.). 2014. *Trauma and Traumatisation in Individual and Collective Dimensions: Insights from Biblical Studies and Beyond*. CT, USA: Vandenhoeck and Ruprecht LLC.
- Boraine, A., 1996. *Justice in cataclysm: Criminal tribunals in the wake of mass violence. Lecture in Belgium*.
- Catholic Commission for Justice and Peace. 2007. *Gukurahundi in Zimbabwe: A report on the disturbances in Matabeleland and Midlands 1980 – 1988*. Johannesburg: Jacana Media.
- Chitando, E. and Togarasei, L. 2010. “June 2008, Verse 27’: *The church and the 2008 Zimbabwean political crisis*,” *African identities*, 8(2), pp. 151–162.
- Christensen, L. B., Johnson, R. B. And Turner, L. A. 2015. *Research methods, design, and analysis*. England: Pearson Education Limited.
- Dane, F. C. 1990. *Research Methods*. Pacific Grove, California: Brooks/Cole Publishing Company.
- Edward, T. E. 1962. *A theology of pastoral care*. USA: John Knox Press.
- Fink, A. 1998. *Conducting research literature reviews; From paper to the internet*. Thousand Oaks, California: Sage Publications Inc.
- Fried, M. H. 1975. *The notion of tribe*. Menlo Park, California: Cummings Publishing Company Inc.
- Friedland, M. B. 1998. *Lift up your voice like a trumpet: white clergy and the civil rights and anti-war movements, 1954 – 1973*. Chapel Hill: University of Carolina Press.
- Fromm, E. 1950. *Psychoanalysis and religion*. New Haven, CT: Yale University Press.
- Fromm, M. Gerard. ed. 2012. *Lost in transmission: Studies of trauma across generations*. London: Karnack Books.
- Graham, E. L. 1996. *Transforming practice*. London: Mowbray.

- Grant, H. J. 1975. *The trauma of transparency: A biblical approach to interpersonal communication*. Portland, Oregon: Multnomah Press.
- Grosby, Stephen. 1994. *The verdict of history: The inexpungable tie of primordiality – A response to Eller and Coughlan*. *Ethnic and Racial Studies*. Vol. 17. No. 1: 164 - 171
- Harrowitz, D. L. 2000. *Ethnic groups in conflicts* (2nd Ed). California: University of California Press.
- Hessel, T. D. (Ed). 2000. *Social ministry*. Westminster Louisville: Know Press.
- Hobel, E. 1958. *Man, in the primitive world*. 2nd Ed. New York: McGraw-Hill.
- Hutchinson, J. And Smith A. D. (Eds). 1996. *Ethnicity*. New York: Oxford University Press.
- Ivankova, N. V. 2015. *Mixed methods applications in action research: From methods to community action*. Thousand Oaks, California: SAGE Publications Inc.
- Kanyandago, P. 2013. Violence in Africa: *Pastoral response from a historical perspective*: in Waruta, W.D. and Kinoti, H. W. (eds.) *Pastoral care in African Christianity: challenging essays in pastoral theology*. pp 41 – 71, Nairobi: Acton Publishers.
- Kelman, H. C. 1992. *Transforming the relationship between former enemies: A social psychological analysis* in R. Rotherstein (ed). *After the peace resistance and reconciliation*, (pg. 193 – 205), Boulder, Lynne Prienner
- King, G., Keohane, R. O., and Verba, S. 1994. *Designing social inquiry; Scientific inference in qualitative research*. Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press.
- Kumar, R. 2011. *Research methodology; A step by step guide for beginners*. London: Sage Publications Limited.
- Kogan, I. 2012. *The second generation in the shadow of terror*. In: Fromm, 2012
- Landrine, H. And Klonoff, E. A. 1996. *African American acculturation: Deconstructing race and reviving culture*. Thousand Oaks, California: SAGE Publications Inc.
- Lloyd, R. and Bresser, K. 1998. *Healing the wounds of ethnic conflicts*. Northern Wales, UK. Mercy Ministries.
- Legal resources foundation and Catholic Commission for Justice and Peace (CCJP). 1994. *Breaking the silence, building true peace: A report on the disturbances in*

- Matabeleland and Midlands (1980 – 1988)*. Zimbabwe: Catholic Commission for Justice and Peace and the Legal Resources Foundation.
- Leedy. 1997. *Practical research planning and design*. 6th ed. London, UK: Prentice Hall.
- Linthicum, R. 2005. *Building a people of power: equipping churches to transform their communities*. World Vision. Waynesboro Press.
- Lyall, D. 1995. *Counselling in the pastoral and spiritual context*. Buckingham: Open University Press.
- John, T. McGreevy. 1996. *Parish boundaries: The catholic encounter with race in the twentieth century Urban North*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press.
- King, M. and Miller, C. 2006. *Teaching model: Non-violent transformation of Conflict*. Switzerland: University of Peace.
- Van Leeuwen, T. and Brouwer, M. (ed.) 2013. *Psychology of trauma*. New York: Nova Publishers.
- May, J. 1993. *Social research: Issues, methods and process*. Milton, Keynes: Open University Press.
- Mason, J. 1996. *Qualitative research*. London: Sage.
- Marshall, C. and Rossman, G. B. 1989. *Designing qualitative research*. London: Sage.
- Maggay, M. 1994. *Transforming society*. Lynx, Australia: Pegnum.
- Mbiti, J. 1970. *Concepts of God in Africa*. London: SPCK.
- McCann, I. L. and Pearlman L. A. 1990. *Psychological trauma and the adult survivor: Theory, therapy and transformation*. Philadelphia: Brunner/ Mazel Inc.
- McLemore, S. D. 1994. *Racial and ethnic relations in America*. Needham Heights, MA: Allyn and Bacon.
- Mollica, R. F. 2006. *Healing invisible wounds (Part of hope and recovery in a violent world)*. Nashville, TN: Vanderbilt University Pres.
- Mwaura, Philomena, N. 2013. *Healing as a pastoral Concern*: in Waruta, W.D. and Kinoti, H. W. (eds.). *Pastoral care in African Christianity: challenging essays in pastoral theology*. pp 72 – 100. Nairobi: Acton Publishers.
- Nash, M. 1989. *The cauldron of ethnicity in modern world*. Chicago: The University of Chicago Press.

- Ngwenya, Dumisani and Geoff Harris. 2015. *Healing from violence: An action research project among survivors of Gukurahundi, Zimbabwe*. Doctoral Thesis. Durban University of Technology, Durban, South Africa.
- Ngwenya, Dumisani and Geoff Harris, 2015. *Healing from violence: An action research project among survivors of Gukurahundi, Zimbabwe*. Peace and Security Review Press.
- Nnoli, O. and Codesria .1998. *Ethnic conflicts in Africa*. Dakar, Senegal: Codesria (Codesria book series).
- Patten, M. L., and Newhart, M. 2018. *Understanding research methods; An overview of the essentials*. New York; Routledge Publishers.
- Petersen, W., Novak, M., and Gleason, P. 1980. *Concepts of ethnicity*. Cambridge, MA: The Belknap Press of Harvard University Press.
- Pollard, N. 1997. *Evangelism made slightly simple, less difficult*. Leicester: Inter-Varsity Press.
- Potter, N. N., 2006. *Trauma, truth and reconciliation: healing damaged relationships*. Oxford; University Press
- Sensing, T. 2011. *Qualitative research: A multi-methods approach to projects for Doctor of Ministry theses*. Eugene, Or; WIPF and STOCK Publishers.
- Sotero, M. M. 2006. *A conceptual model of historical trauma: Implications for public health practice and research*. Journal of Health Disparities Research and Practice, (1), 1, pp 93 – 108.
- The Chronicle Newspaper. 15th February 2015. *More Time Needed to Heal*. Reported by Auxillia Katongomara. Bulawayo: The Chronicle.
- Togarasei, L. and C. E. (2011) “*Be therefore reconciled to one Another’: The church’s role in justice, healing and reconciliation in Zimbabwe*,” *Missionalia*, 39(3), pp. 210–227.
- Vail, L. (1991) *The creation of tribalism in Southern Africa*. 1st Publication; Print Edition. Berkeley: University of California Press (Perspectives on Southern Africa, 43).
- Volkan, V.D. 2001. *Trans-generational transmission and chosen traumas: An aspect of large group identity*. *Group Analysis*. Vol 34, pp. 77 – 79.
- Volkan, V. D., Ast, G, and Greer Jnr, W. F. eds. 2002. *The third Reich in the unconscious: Trans-generational transmission and its consequences*. New York:

Routledge.

Waruta, W.D. and Kinoti, H. W. eds. 2013. *Pastoral care in African Christianity: challenging essays in pastoral theology*. Nairobi: Acton Publishers.

Wimberly, E. P. 2017. *The gathering of the village for justice and participatory democracy: The concerned black clergy of Atlanta*. Atlanta; GO: The Interdenominational Theological Centre Press.

Wodak, R. and Kryzyzanowski, M. Eds. 2008. *Qualitative discourse analysis in the social sciences*. New York; Palgrave Macmillan.

EJOURNALS

Albert, S. Foley, S. J. 1986. 'Adventures in black Catholic history: Research and writing'. U. S. Catholic Historian, Vol. 5, No. 1, The Black Catholic Experience, pp 103 – 118, (accessed 23 May 2019 from <http://www.jstor.org/stable/25153747>)

Musvosvi, J. 2010. *Race, ethnicity, and tribal conflict*. Journal of Adventist mission studies. <http://digitalcommons.andrews.edu/jams/vo16/iss1/5> (accessed 09/30/2019)

World Population Review. 2018. *Zimbabwean Population*. <http://worldpopulationreview.com/countries/zimbabwe-population/> (Accessed 18 November 2019 at 15h00)