A Mini Dissertation

written in partial fulfilment of the requirements

for the degree

MMus (Music Education: Coursework)

Name: Kagiso Solomon Lerumo

Student number: 98309995

Address: Plot 95 Pelzvale Randfontein 1747

Cell phone: 082 554 3115

E-mail address: lerumo.kagiso2@gmail.com

Implementing Music according to the Curriculum and Assessment Policy Statement (CAPS): Experiences of Foundation Phase educators

Kagiso Solomon Lerumo

Mini-Dissertation submitted in partial fulfilment of the requirements for the degree of

MMus (Music Education)

Department of Music

Faculty of Humanities

University of Pretoria

Promoter: Prof. Theo van Wyk

Date: July 2018

DECLARATION

I hereby declare that the research done and the subsequent report contained in this mini-dissertation is my own and original work. Moreover, I declare that the study findings have not been previously presented in its entirety or in part for obtaining any qualification.

Kagiso Lerumo

July 2018

ABSTRACT

The implementation of Music according to the Curriculum and Assessment Policy Statement (CAPS) in the Foundation Phase is not adequate. Reasons for this incorporate inter alia lack of knowledge of Music pedagogy by Foundation Phase educators, lack of resources and poor assistance and monitoring from the Department of Education.

The study was based on qualitative case study method, exploring the experiences of Foundation Phase educators in implementing Music according to CAPS. Interviews were held with three Foundation Phase educators. Data was also collected by means of observations and analysing personal documents such as learners' class work books and educators' Music files.

Analyses of the data obtained showed that Foundation Phase educators who participated in the research did not have Music teaching experience before the introduction of CAPS in 2012. A key concern is that these participants did not plan for Music and the time allocated for it was used to teach the so-called core subjects such as Mathematics and Languages. Moreover, educators who participated in this study would only make learners to sing at the beginning of lessons of study areas such as beginning knowledge and Mathematics as an effort to integrate Music with other subjects.

Recommendations included development of a partnership between any University that offers Music and the North West Department of Education which may assist with Music pedagogy and to augment resources such as relevant books and Musical instruments.

Keywords used in the study

Curriculum and Assessment Policy Statement (CAPS); Social constructivism Outcomes Based Education (OBE); Foundation Phase educators; Arts integration; Music education

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

I would like to express my sincere gratitude and appreciation to the people listed below, without whose support this study would not have been possible:

- My promoter, Professor Theo van Wyk, for stimulating intellectual thought, meticulous technical guidance, unwavering support and continuous encouragement which motivated me to endeavour to complete the study;
- My former lecturers in Music Education, Drs Dorette Vermeulen, Rene Human and Kim Flores, for the sympathetic guidance in shaping this research and gave me the courage to complete this project;
- My wife, Nondumiso, for her unfailing belief in my abilities, as well as my champion sons, Kagiso Jr. and Ontlotlile, for their patience and understanding;
- My friends and colleagues Sarel Streicher, Thabiso Mokwena, Noa Katane and Victor Nemadodzi, who always inspired me to do my best;
- The Foundation Phase educators who were willing to share their experiences on Music implementation during interviews, and observations and without whose insights this study could not have been realised;
- My Savior Jesus Christ, who strengthens me during good and difficult times.

Acronyms and abbreviations used in the study

ANA	Annual National Assessment	
ANC	African National Congress	
BES	British Education System	
CA	Creative Arts	
CAPS	Curriculum and Assessment Policy Statement	
CNE	Christian National Education	
C2005	Curriculum 2005	
NDoBE	National Department of Basic Education	
GET	General Education and Training	
NCLB	No Child Left Behind	
OBE	Outcomes Based Education	
PSW	Personal and Social Wellbeing	
PE	Physical Education	
PLC	Professional Learning Committee	
RNCS	Revised National Curriculum Statement	
SNW	Standardised National Workbooks	
SUP	School-University Partnership	

TABLE OF CONTENTS

DECL	ARATION	ii
Keyw	ords used in the study	iii
Acron	lyms and abbreviations used in the study	٧
CHAF	PTER ONE	1
ORIE	NTATION	1
1.1	BACKGROUND AND RATIONALE	1
1.2	STATEMENT OF THE RESEARCH PROBLEM	3
1.3	RESEARCH QUESTIONS	4
1.4	AIM OF THE RESEARCH	5
1.5	RESEARCH METHODOLOGY	5
1.5.1	Research approach	5
1.5.2	Research design	5
1.5.3	Sampling strategy	6
1.5.4	Data collection strategies	6
1.5.4.	1 Observation	6
1.5.4.	2 Semi-structured interviews	7
1.5.4.	3 Document analysis	8
1.6	DATA ANALYSIS	8
1.7	RELIABILITY OF THE STUDY	8
1.8	SCOPE OF THE RESEARCH	9
1.9	ETHICAL CONSIDERATIONS	9
1.10	VALUE OF THE STUDY	10
1.11	CHAPTER HEADINGS	10
1.12	SUMMARY	11
CHAF	PTER TWO	12
IITE	PATURE REVIEW AND THEORETICAL ERAMEWORK	12

2.1	INTRODUCTION	12
2.2	CURRICULUM REFORMS IN SOUTH AFRICA AND MUSIC PEDAGOGY IN SOUTH AFRICA BEFORE AND AFTER 1994	12
2.2.1	Music pedagogy in South Africa before and after 1994	14
2.2.2	Indigenous African music in the classroom	15
2.3	CURRICULUM STRUCTURE OF THE CURRICULUM AND ASSESSMENT POLICY STATEMENT DOCUMENT (CAPS)	16
2.3.1	The purpose of creative arts	18
2.3.2	The role of Music in the holistic development of a learner in CAPS	18
2.4	ARTS INTEGRATION	19
2.5	CHALLENGES TO IMPLEMENTING MUSIC AS SUBJECT IN PRIMARY SCHOOLS	22
2.5.1	Music budget reduction	22
2.5.2	Decreased instructional time	23
2.5.3	Lack of in-service training and professional support	24
2.5.4	Lack of availability of resources	24
2.5.5	Limitations concerning educators' attitude and competence in teaching Music in primary schools	24
2.6	THEORETICAL FRAMEWORK OF THE STUDY	25
2.7	SUMMARY	27
CHAF	PTER 3	29
RESE	EARCH DESIGN AND METHODOLOGY	29
3.1	INTRODUCTION	29
3.2	RESEARCH APPROACH	29
3.3	RESEARCH DESIGN	29
3.4	DATA COLLECTION STRATEGIES	30
3.4.1	Semi structured interviews	30
3.4.2	Document analysis	31

3.4.3	Observations	32
3.5	SAMPLING STRATEGY: PURPOSIVE	33
3.6	RELIABILITY OF RESEARCH	34
3.7	SCOPE OF THE RESEARCH	34
3.8	DATA ANALYSIS	35
3.9	ETHICAL CONSIDERATIONS	35
3.10	SUMMARY	36
CHAF	PTER 4	37
DATA	PRESENTATION AND DISCUSSIONS	37
4.1	INTRODUCTION	37
4.2	EMERGENT THEMES AND DISCUSSIONS	37
4.2.1	Educators' Music Education experience	37
4.2.2	Music implementation process	38
4.2.2.	1 Planning for Music lessons	38
4.2.2.	2 Learner involvement in Music lessons.	38
4.2.2.	3 Integration with other subjects or study areas	39
4.3	Challenges of teaching Music in CAPS	40
4.3.1	Lack of resources	40
4.3.2	Limited teaching time	40
4.4	ASSISTANCE OF THE DEPARTMENT OF EDUCATION	41
4.5	POSITIVE ASPECTS OF TEACHING MUSIC IN CAPS.	41
4.6	DESIRED CHANGES REGARDING IMPLEMENTATION OF MUSIC	42
4.7	CONCLUSION	42
CHAF	PTER 5	43
CONC	CLUSION AND RECOMMENDATIONS	43
5.1	INTRODUCTION	43
52	SUMMARY OF THE MAIN FINDINGS	43

5.3	PROPC	SED RECOMMENDATIONS	44
5.4	RECOMMENDATION FOR FUTURE RESEARCH		46
5.5	SUMMA	\RY	46
REF	ERENCE	s	47
Арре	endix A.	Semi-structured interview schedule	62
Арре	endix B.	Observation schedule	63
Арре	endix C.	Application for permission: participation in research	64
Арре	endix D.	Letter of informed consent - Principal	66
Арре	endix E.	Letter of informed consent - Educators	68
Арре	endix F.	Letter of informed assent for learners	71
Арре	endix G.	Letter of informed consent for parents/guardians	72
Арре	endix H.	Research Ethics Committee Clearance Letter	74
Appe	endix I.	Arts Cluster Postgraduate Research Committee approval letter	75
Арре	endix J.	Music Department Research Committee approval letter	77
Арре	endix K.	Letter of informed consent	78
		LIST OF TABLES	
Tabl	e 2.1: M	lusic content according to CAPS Grade 1-3	15
Tabl	e 2.2: In	structional time in the Foundation Phase	23
Tabl	e 3.1 P	rofile of the school	34

CHAPTER ONE

ORIENTATION

1.1 BACKGROUND AND RATIONALE

Foundation Phase educators in South Africa are experiencing difficulty in implementing Music in their daily teaching (Van Vuuren & Van Niekerk 2015: 315; Van Vreden 2016: 3). Hence, I developed an interest in examining the experiences of Foundation Phase educators in implementing Music according to the Curriculum and Assessment Policy Statement (CAPS). CAPS is the latest National Curriculum Statement (NCS) for the South African education system and was introduced to improve curriculum implementation in schools. I believe that understanding the experiences of the Foundation Phase educators regarding their way of implementing Music according to CAPS, will shed light upon the situation and lead to solutions for their daily Music teaching challenges.

From 1994 until 2012, the South African National Department of Education (NDoBE) has introduced three national curriculum reforms. In 1997 the new national curriculum known as Curriculum 2005 (C2005) was instigated in South Africa. As Mouton, Louw and Strydom (2012: 1211) correctly point out, the primary aim of C2005 was to transform the Apartheid education system into a non-racial curriculum. C2005 was perceived as an authentic embodiment of Outcomes Based Education (OBE)¹ (Chisholm 2003: 3). It was regarded as a learner-centred pedagogy, grounded on the constructivist principles of Vygotskian theory (Skosana & Monyai 2013: 51). Underlying OBE is the optimistic premise that learners come to school already equipped with some knowledge and skills and can therefore be active participants in the learning process (Joseph 2002: 67).

⁻

¹Outcomes Based Education (OBE) is the approach of teaching and learning used in the South African education system since the introduction of C2005 in 1998. This approach is focused on desired results of education (De Villiers 2006: 3).

The implementation of C2005 was regarded as an inclusive plan for rectifying the previous educational injustices in South Africa (Botha 2002: 363; Van Deventer 2009:197). However, two years after its initiation, C2005 presented numerous implementation challenges. In 2000, Professor Linda Chisholm and a team were commissioned by the then Minister of Education, Professor Kader Asmal, to investigate its structure, design and implementation (Chisholm 2000: 1). The review committee found that the language and terminology of C2005 was not clear, thus creating challenges for educators regarding its implementation in the classroom (Chisholm 2000: 4). As a result of the above-mentioned findings, C2005 was redesigned and the Revised National Curriculum Statement (RNCS) was formed in 2002.

The RNCS could initially not be implemented due to controversies regarding the implementation plan and, "despite its noble intentions, it was clear that the process of turning a set of national outcome statements into classroom practice was a tremendous challenge" (Van Blerk 2007: 3). Some of the criticisms raised concerning the implementation of RNCS are:

- It under-valued the content;
- Educators were incapable of implementing it and;
- The idea that outcomes of learning should be defined before teaching commences was not well received (Killen 2007: 62).

The above controversies resulted in the RNCS being reviewed in 2009. The review panel recommended that "a single comprehensive CAPS² for every subject be developed to replace learning area statements, learning programme guidelines and subject assessment guidelines" (South Africa, National Department of Education 2009: 7). The task team suggested that inconsistencies and replication of information of the previous National Curriculum Statement should be resolved (South Africa, National Department of Education 2009: 7).

_

²CAPS is the new policy statement that guides the education system of South Africa as from the year 2012. It is in effect an amendment to the National Curriculum Statement (NCS) and not necessarily a new curriculum (Du Plessis 2013: 1). In other words, CAPS is an adjustment of the curriculum and not of the teaching methods. It still follows the same process and procedures of the NCS grades R-12.

The review of the RNCS did not only bring about certain changes such as replacing the Subjects Statements, Learning Programme Guidelines and Subjects Assessment Guidelines with Curriculum and Assessment Policy Statement for each subject (South Africa, National Department of Education 2011: 1) but also retained the following subjects in the Foundation Phase: Home Language, First Additional Language, Mathematics, and Life Skills. Music was placed under Creative Arts in the Life Skills as umbrella subject. Creative Arts was further organised in two parallel, but corresponding, streams namely: Visual Arts and Performing Arts (South Africa, National Department of Basic Education 2011: 8).

As the CAPS for Life Skills in the Foundation Phase is currently being implemented, this study will explore the experiences of general educators while teaching Music in their classrooms.

1.2 STATEMENT OF THE RESEARCH PROBLEM

Although the CAPS document has now been in use since 2012 in South African primary schools, there are reasons to suppose that Music in the Foundation Phase is not being implemented as prescribed in the curriculum. This claim is based on three premises.

Firstly, Music is taught within Life Skills as a broad subject that combines six other subjects, a phenomenon that Foundation Phase educators have cited reservations about. Moreover, Alter, Hays and O'Hara's (2009: 28) affirm that combining too many disciplines within one subject can be ineffective.

Secondly, in the past two decades since 1994, implementing Music in the Foundation Phase has been revised three times by the National Department of Basic Education. In 1998, Music was initially taught as part of Life Orientation learning programme; then, in 2002 it became part of the Arts and Culture learning area. Since 2012, it has been grouped as part of Life Skills in CAPS document. Studies have been conducted regarding the implementation of the Arts and Culture learning area and have all revealed that educators encounter serious challenges regarding the teaching of Music (Browne 2011: 77; Mbeshu 2010: 58; Vermeulen

2009: 1). Hence, I believe that altering RNCS requirements to CAPS Life Skills may have also negatively affected the teaching of Music.

Finally, during in-school monitoring sessions at the research site, I have observed that Foundation Phase learners' activity books at the research site mostly demonstrate Visual Art activities, while there are few references to performances of Physical Education, Drama and Dance, and scarcely any mentioning of Music. The lack of Music teaching experiences in the classroom suggests that the implementation of Music according to the requirements of the CAPS document for Life Skills is not occurring adequately.

Being a Grade 4 Life Skills educator for numerous years, I have a long-standing experience of teaching music. My observations regarding the minimal teaching of music in the Foundation Phase at the research site, motivated me to explore to which level music was taught at the research site, according to CAPS requirements. Recent studies (Nkosi 2014; Drummond 2015; Lewis 2014) regarding implementation of music in CAPS focused in Further Education and Training (FET). However, little has been paid to the experiences of Foundation Phase educators regarding implementing music in CAPS since its commencement in 2012.

1.3 RESEARCH QUESTIONS

The main research question guiding this study is:

What are the experiences of Foundation Phase educators regarding the implementation of Music according to the requirements of the CAPS document?

Secondary research questions that relate to the main research question are:

- What positive experiences regarding implementing Music according to the CAPS requirements, do educators have?
- What challenges experienced by educators affect their teaching of Music according to the CAPS requirements?

1.4 AIM OF THE RESEARCH

The aim of this study was to explore the experiences of the Foundation Phase educators regarding their implementation of Music according to the requirements of the CAPS document. The author wishes to have a better understanding of the challenges which Foundation Phase educators at the research site face, as well as their positive experiences regarding the implementation of Music according to CAPS.

1.5 RESEARCH METHODOLOGY

This section focused on the methodology aspects of the proposed research, which include research approach, research design, sampling strategy, data collection strategies, issues of reliability, and ethical considerations.

1.5.1 Research approach

Qualitative research "focus on how individuals and groups view and understand the world and construct meaning out of their experiences" (Nieuwenhuis 2007a: 50). Therefore, a qualitative approach is ideal to explore the experiences of Foundation Phase educators while they are teaching Music according to the requirements of the CAPS document.

1.5.2 Research design

The nature of this research lends itself to a single case study (Fouché & Schurink 2011: 320; Fouché & De Vos 2011: 95) which, according to Mouton (2001: 280), is "an intensive investigation of a single unit". Delport, Fouché & Schurink (2011: 297) explain that "qualitative researchers have to use some form of case study when they want to immerse themselves in the activities of single or a small number of people". Barrett (2014: 118) argues that case studies can suitably express the multifaceted ecologies of life in music classrooms, while Fouché and De Vos (2011: 95) assert that an "exploratory case study can be conducted when there is lack of basic information on a new area of interest". Regarding the latter, the implementation of the CAPS document in the Foundation Phase only started in

2012 and as such, there is a lack of information regarding the experiences of educators in teaching Music.

1.5.3 Sampling strategy

Purposive sampling was used to choose the case most likely to possess the characteristics required by this study (Strydom & Delport 2011: 392). Nieuwenhuis (2007b: 79) sees purposive sampling as "selecting participants according to a particular research question". The chosen school is therefore a rural primary school in the Madikwe circuit of the North West Department of Education, where the author has been a principal. The author is aware that the CAPS have been fully implemented in the Foundation Phase at the school, and furthermore, since he is not a member of the teaching staff, there will not be conflict of interests between him and the educators at the school. The author is currently teaching CAPS Life Skills in Grade 4. In addition, the educators were trained in the 2011 Provincial Foundation Phase CAPS workshops for Life Skills Grade R-3.

Three Foundation Phase educators who were teaching Grade 1, 2, and 3 respectively, from the school were invited to participate in the research (see Appendix D).

1.5.4 Data collection strategies

The data collection strategy refers to "anything that a researcher can use to retrieve information from the participants" (Hofstee 2006: 115). Nieuwenhuis (2007b: 76) also maintains that "case study design uses multiple resources and strategies in the data gathering process", with which Delport et al.(2011: 321) agree. This study used the following data collection strategies:

- Observation;
- Semi structured interview; and
- Document analyses.

1.5.4.1 Observation

Strydom (2011: 330) emphasizes that observation is a qualitative research procedure that studies the natural and everyday set-up in a particular community or

situation. Nieuwenhuis (2007b: 83) adds that "observation is a systematic process of recording the behavioural patterns of participants without questioning or communicating with them". The author therefore used observation as one of the data collection strategies because it would allow him to witness how participants teach Music in the classroom (Nieuwenhuis 2007b: 84). The author observed Music lessons presented by each of the three educators in their classrooms to gain "first-hand experience" of how they teach Music according to CAPS requirements (Mouton 2001:196). Each lesson was 25 minutes long. My role was that of an observer only (Nieuwenhuis 2007b: 85), because this type of observation often makes the observer less obstructive and reduces the likelihood that he or she could influence the participants' behaviour (Delport et, el. 2011: 337). I made detailed observations (See appendix B) to generate data on aspects of Music that the sampled educators found easy to implement. In this way, it was also possible to ascertain challenges that affect their Music teaching.

Nieuwenhuis (2007b: 85) states that the position of an observer can give the researcher an opportunity to identify patterns of behaviour in a particular community in order to understand the experiences, values and the beliefs of the participants. I therefore remained uninvolved and did not influence the dynamics of the setting (Nieuwenhuis 2007b: 85).

1.5.4.2 Semi-structured interviews

Delport, et al. (2011: 292) describe semi-structured interviews as an organized conversation around areas of a particular interest. This data collection strategy permits researchers and participants much more flexibility than structured interviews (Greeff 2011: 351). It allows for the "probing and clarification of answers" (Nieuwenhuis 2007b: 87). Therefore, I used this strategy to allow me to enter into the participants' perspective regarding teaching Music according to the requirements of CAPS. It also enabled me to gain a detailed picture of participants' experiences regarding the phenomenon at hand (Greeff 2011: 351). The three educators from the school were asked to participate in a semi-structured interview (See Appendix A). Each interview was conducted after school at a time convenient for the individual respondents, lasting approximately 60 minutes per educator. The

participants' responses were audio recorded and recordings were transcribed. In this way, I was able to revisit the data to make and in-depth analysis of the educators' experiences.

1.5.4.3 Document analysis

Personal documents, such as educators' Music lesson plans and learners' class work books (Nieuwenhuis 2007b: 82-83; Strydom & Delport 2011: 378-379), were scrutinized as a further form of data collection.

1.6 DATA ANALYSIS

Hofstee (2006: 117) asserts that once a researcher has collected data of any kind, it must be transformed into information through analysis. Data analysis in this study took the form of non-numerical examination (Babbie 2007: 378). The analysis of data for this enquiry was an on-going, reflective process. The collected data, including field notes of observations and semi-structured interview transcripts will be organised and coded. Thematic analysis is the foundational approach to analysing qualitative, textual data emerging from a multiplicity of streams such as words, phrases, interviews, as well as informal conversations for which themes can be identified (Schurink, Fouche & De Vos 2011: 405). In thematic analysis, data is usually arranged according to themes on the basis of number of appearances of a word or concept within a phrase, sentence and paragraph (Schurink, et al. 2011: 405).

1.7 RELIABILITY OF THE STUDY

Nieuwenhuis (2007: 113) describes reliability as the "acid test" of data analysis, findings and conclusions of research. For this research, data from interviews, document analysis and observations will be applied to help me verify the findings of this study. After conducting the interviews, I provided the educators with the transcripts in order for them to verify whether my interpretation is accurate and correctly reflects their views (Nieuwenhuis 2007: 113; Delport, Fouché & Schurink 2011: 420). In addition, I ensured that there was consistency in the coding system throughout.

1.8 SCOPE OF THE RESEARCH

The study was limited to a single case at one primary school where experiences of a small group of Foundation Phase educators were explored. The findings are not generic or applicable to educators in other schools. Although reference was made to the CAPS document, the main aim of this study was not to focus on the CAPS in its entirety, but on Music in the Foundation Phase, according to the requirements of CAPS.

1.9 ETHICAL CONSIDERATIONS

This study involved interviews, lesson observations and document analyses at a sampled school. Therefore, permission for the school to partake in the research was obtained from the North West Education Department for conducting this research (see Appendix A). I further requested permission to do research from the management of the sampled school (see Appendix D). Information regarding voluntary participation and freedom to withdraw from participating at any stage was provided to each participant (Strydom 2011: 116-118; Wassenaar 2006: 72-73). Educators were informed about all the research procedures, including the use of audio and video recordings during interviews and observations, for which they were asked to sign a letter of informed consent (Kelly 2006:292; Strydom 2011: 116-117; Wassenaar 2006: 72-73). (See Appendix D).

I ensured that the participants did not experience any harm mentally or physically as a result of this study (Wassenaar 2006: 67). As a current school principal, I have experienced that educators often find lesson observations and interviews intimidating. Therefore, I informed all participants beforehand about the potential impact of the investigation in order to offer them opportunity to withdraw, if they so wish (Strydom 2011: 115). I was also sensitive to the needs and feelings of each participant.

Strict confidentiality was maintained. Only my supervisor and I would be allowed access to the data obtained from the respondents (Strydom 2011: 119). To protect the privacy of the participants (Strydom 2011: 119), no names or personal details of

the respondents were disclosed. The raw data would be kept safely (See appendix D) at the University of Pretoria for a period of 15 years, as required by the University policy.

1.10 VALUE OF THE STUDY

The findings of this research will provide better insight regarding the aspects of Music within CAPS which the educators in the Foundation Phase find challenging to implement.

1.11 CHAPTER HEADINGS

Chapter 1: Orientation

- 1.1 Background and rationale
- 1.2 Purpose of the study and research aim
- 1.3 Statement of the problem
- 1.4 Research questions
- 1.5 Delimitations

Chapter 2: Literature review

- 2.1 Introduction
- 2.2 Music education in South Africa
- 2.3 Curriculum and Assessment Policy Statement
- 2.4 Arts integration
- 2.5 Challenges of implementing music in primary schools
- 2.5.1 Decreased instructional time
- 2.5.2 Reduced budgets
- 2.5.3 Limitations concerning educators' attitude and competence in teaching Music
- 2.6 Theoretical framework: Constructivism
- 2.7 Summary

Chapter 3: Research design and methodology

- 3.1 Research approach
- 3.2 Research design
- 3.3 Data collection strategies
- 3.4 Sampling Strategy

- 3.5 Trustworthiness of research
- 3.6 Ethical considerations

Chapter 4: Data presentation and conclusion

- 4.1 Presentation of the data
- 4.1.1 Data from observations
- 4.1.2 Data from interviews
- 4.1.3 Data from document analysis
- 4.2 Emergent themes and discussions of findings
- 4.3 Conclusion

Chapter 5: Conclusion and recommendations

- 5.1 Summary of main findings
- 5.2 Proposed recommendations
- 5.3 Recommendations for future research
- 5.4 Conclusion

1.12 SUMMARY

This chapter outlined the background and rationale, statement of the research problem, research questions, aim of the study, objectives, research methodology, significance of the study, data analysis, reliability of the study, ethical considerations and value of the study. The following chapter focused on the review of literature and theoretical framework relevant to the study.

CHAPTER TWO

LITERATURE REVIEW AND THEORETICAL FRAMEWORK

2.1 INTRODUCTION

According to Hofstee (2006: 91), a literature review has numerous purposes in a study. It enables a researcher to further explore what has already been researched in the area of interest (Fouché & De Vos 2011: 109; Mouton 2001: 87) and validates the theory of the research (Hofstee 2006: 91). The literature discussions include:

- curriculum reforms and music pedagogy in South Africa before and after 1994;
- the curriculum structure of the CAPS document;
- the purpose of creative arts;
- holistic development;
- indigenous music;
- the global challenges of implementing music in primary schools; and
- Arts integration.

2.2 CURRICULUM REFORMS IN SOUTH AFRICA AND MUSIC PEDAGOGY IN SOUTH AFRICA BEFORE AND AFTER 1994

Before discussing curriculum reforms in South Africa, it is significant to start with a synopsis of the nature of education system this country had before 1994. Previously, South Africa had apartheid education system which was based on racial discrimination and encouraged separation development (Msila 2007: 147). Black Africans and whites had distinct education systems where black children were not allowed to study in the same schools as whites (Msila 2013:191). At the same time black learners were prohibited from learning subjects such as Mathematics and Sciences (Küpers & Van Dijk 2014: 375). Moreover, white schools received sufficient funding and resources from the government whereas poverty, unqualified educators and inferior education were prevalent in black schools (Botha 2002: 3; Küpers & Van Dijk 2014: 375; Lu & Treiman 2011: 1124; Msila 2013: 191; Vermeulen 2009:1). Nevertheless, after the dawn of democracy in 1994 the African National Congress government started to eradicate the apartheid education system

so that all South African learners would have access to equal quality education (De Villiers 2015:315).

South Africa has experienced three critical curriculum reforms between 1994 and 2012 (Mouton, Louw & Strydom 2012: 1211). For example, the National Department of Education has introduced Curriculum 2005 (C2005) in 1997, the Revised National Curriculum Statement (RNCS) in 2002 and the Curriculum and Assessment Policy Statement (CAPS) in 2011. Essentially, C2005 was an attempt to diverge from the apartheid content based curriculum and to include skills, knowledge and values in the new curriculum (Mouton, Louw & Strydom 2012: 1211). On the other hand, RNCS was introduced to streamline and strengthen C2005 (Chisholm 2003:193 & Msila 2007: 146). However, the CAPS is a review of the RNCS and it is intended to restructure the RNCS (Dada, Dipholo, Hoadley, Khembo, Muller and Volmink 2009: 65).

The CAPS is driven by the following values:

- Social transformation;
- · Active and critical learning;
- High knowledge and skills;
- Progression from simple to complex;
- Human rights, inclusivity, environmental and social justice;
- Valuing indigenous knowledge systems by acknowledging the rich cultural heritage of South Africa and;
- Credibility, quality and efficiency in order to compete globally (South Africa, National Department of Education 2011:4).

Most importantly, CAPS intends to produce learners who are capable of:

- Identifying and solving problems and making decisions using critical and creative thinking;
- Working effectively as individuals and with others as members of the team;
- Organising and managing themselves and their activities responsibly and effectively;
- Collecting, analysing, organising and critically evaluating information;

- Communicating effectively using visual, symbolic and/or language skills in various modes;
- Using science and technology effectively and critically showing responsibility towards the environment and the health of others and;
- Demonstrating an understanding of the world as a set of related systems by recognising that problem-solving contexts do not exists in isolation (South Africa, National Department of Education, 2011: 5).

2.2.1 Music pedagogy in South Africa before and after 1994

Nompula (2012: 292) explains pedagogy as standards and techniques of teaching and learning. She attributes the current unintended implementation methods of Music in schools to lack of a confident shift from the previous content based pedagogy to outcomes based pedagogy. Before 1994, Music Education in South African schools was based on Western education system and depended largely on "drill and practice" (Thorsen 2002:2 & Herbst, De Wet & Rijsdijk 2005: 64). African and Indian music were disregarded and therefore excluded in the school curriculum because it was perceived as indecent and "evil" (De Vries 2015: 315 & Nompula 2011: 91).

Essentially, music education was not part of black teacher training programmes in colleges and universities (Fredericks 2008: 128). As a result, black schools were deprived of music education and arts education in general (De Vries 2015: 315 & Fredericks 2008: 128). The new curriculum which was implemented immediately after 1994 gave all learners access to arts education irrespective of their racial groups (De Vries 2015: 315). Furthermore, the CAPS documents of 2012 directed educators to teach Music in a more constructivist way and also include indigenous musics from a wide range of South African cultures.

A constructivist approach implies a learner-centred approach which allows learners to participate actively in learning and in the construct of their own musical knowledge (Herbst et al. 2005: 64). The CAPS document recommends that learners should be given the opportunity to participate in group performances in order to develop their confidence and improve their creative and performance skills

(Nompula 2011: 372). It is therefore important that the subsequent discussion should focus on indigenous South African musics in the classroom.

2.2.2 Indigenous African music in the classroom

The transformation in the education system of South Africa affords learners the opportunity to connect with their cultural heritage and value one another's cultures, religion and music (Nompula 2011: 370 & Woodward 2007: 33). Furthermore, CAPS promotes the integration of indigenous knowledge systems and the rich history and heritage of South Africa in the classroom (South Africa, National Department of Education, 2011: 5). Educators should use Indigenous African Music in the teaching of Music (Morakeng 2010: 358).

According to Hildegard and Anundsen (2006: 62) as cited in Joseph (2012) African indigenous music is taught differently from Western music. Researchers (Joseph 2011: 42; Nompula 2011: 370; Phibion 2012: 3) maintain that indigenous African Music is informal, practical and is learnt orally through participation. Essentially, indigenous African music is not learnt from theory; instead learners observe, listen and then imitate. Hence, Ogunrinade (2014: 54) stresses that "rote learning and imitating" are the key techniques of teaching and learning indigenous music in African settings.

Studies have been conducted regarding the teaching of indigenous African music in the classroom (Emberly & Davidson 2011: 278; Morakeng 2010: 369; Nompula 2011: 369). The study conducted by Emberly and Davidson (2011: 278) revealed that it is practicable to integrate indigenous South African music in the teaching of music in the classroom. The researchers used *tshigombela*, a Venda children's indigenous musical dance, to demonstrate how indigenous African music can be conserved by "shifting it from community settings and into government-sanctioned classrooms". These researchers concluded that the shifting of indigenous Music from the community into the classroom should be implemented in other South African communities so that learners can "learn how to be musically in their own lives, communities and schools" (Emberly and Davidson (2011: 278).

The results of a study conducted by Nompula (2011: 369) to "explore the role and value of African music in education" suggested that learners performed Xhosa repertoires "expressively and significantly better" than when they were taught European folk songs. In another study conducted by Morakeng (2010: 369), it was revealed that educators in Limpopo found no serious challenges in including the Bapedi ba Ga Sekhukhune musical arts in their music lessons. These studies clearly indicate that it is feasible to integrate Indigenous African music in the daily teaching of music.

2.3 CURRICULUM STRUCTURE OF THE CURRICULUM AND ASSESSMENT POLICY STATEMENT DOCUMENT (CAPS)

In the CAPS document, Life Skills as a subject in the Foundation Phase (Grade 1-3) is organised into four study areas, namely:

- Beginning Knowledge (BK);
- Personal and Social Well-being (PSW);
- Creative Arts (CA) and;
- Physical Education (PE) (South Africa, National Department of Basic Education 2011:6).

Each study area has its specific goals which are referred to as topics. There are four general topics for the Creative Arts study area. These topics are specific to Performing Arts (Music, Drama and Dance) (South Africa, National Department of Basic Education 2011: 9).

According to the South African National Department of Basic Education (2011:14), "the use of topics is recommended as a means to integrate the content from different study areas where possible and appropriate". Furthermore, music content and scope is clearly outlined. In other words, educators are aware of which content to be covered in music. The following table (Table 2.1) shows music content in Grade1-3:

Table 2.1: Music content according to CAPS Grade 1-3

Grade 1	Grade 2	Grade 3
 Keeping a steady beat with changes in tempo whilst clapping or moving in time to music such as walking in fours. Singing indigenous songs using appropriate movements. Exploring beginnings, middles and endings of songs. Vocal exercises such as songs with focus and clarity in vocal exercises. Singing songs using contrasts such as soft and loud, fast and slow. Listening skills through music games using different tempo, pitch, dynamics, and duration. Clapping and moving to music rhythms in three or four time. Listening to music and describing how it makes you feel using words such as happy, sad, etc. 	unison, rounds, and call and response. Body percussion: keeping a steady beat and the use of different timbres (click, clap, and stamp). Playing percussion instruments/ body percussion in time to music and/or class singing. Performing rhythm patterns combined with locomotor movements such as clapping the rhythm of pony gallops, marching, skipping, etc. Performing songs focusing on dynamics such as: loud and soft, slow and fast Polyrhythms using body percussion instruments. Listening to music and identifying moods such as 'sad', 'happy', 'calm' and 'excited'. Warming up the voice: using songs and rhymes focusing on high and low notes and fast and slow tempo. Singing songs to improve the ability to sing in tune. Composing soundscapes, using dynamics, pitch,	simple polyrhythms in 2, 3 or 4 time on percussion instruments. Listen to South African music (indigenous and western) focusing on rhythm and beat, 2, 3 or 4 time. Perform notated rhythm patterns (notation or French note names or graphic scores) containing the equivalent of semibreves, minims, crotchets, quavers and rests, using body percussion. Rhythm games: listening skills, recall contrasting rhythm patterns, keep a steady beat, and use different timbres.

(Adapted from South Africa, National Department of Education 2011:14)

2.3.1 The purpose of creative arts

The main aim of Creative Arts³, as stipulated in the CAPS for the subject Life Skills, is "to create a foundation for balanced, creative, cognitive, emotional and social development of learners" (South Africa, National Department of Basic Education 2011: 9). Consequently, Creative Arts seeks to develop learners to become "creative and imaginative individuals with appreciation of the Arts" (South Africa, National Department of Basic Education 2011: 9). In addition, this study area trains learners on basic knowledge and skills so that they can easily participate in creative activities. Involvement in Music, Drama, Dance and Visual Arts activities are envisioned to afford learners opportunities for exploration and development of skills, knowledge, attitudes and values related to Creative Arts. Hence, learners should investigate and increase their "creative ideas based on their personal experiences, using their senses, emotions and observations" (South Africa, National Department of Basic Education 2011: 9). Learners should be guided to use their natural inclinations, to use their imagination, manipulate and work with materials, move and make Music (South Africa, National Department of Basic Education 2011: 9).

2.3.2 The role of Music in the holistic development of a learner in CAPS

Life Skills is the subject that focuses in the holistic development of learners (South Africa, National Department of Education 2011:8). This involve emotional, social, personal, intellectual and physical development of learners (South Africa, National Department of Education 2011:8). Researchers such as Van Vreden (2016: 1) and Cloete and Delport (2015:99) have identified Music as the major contributing factor towards the "holistic development" of children. According to Cloete and Delport (2015:99), learners who participate in "dancing and jumping" during musical performances, have their "ears, eyes and muscles interacting with the brain" which improves their "physical strengths" and coordination (Cloete & Delport 2015: 99).

³ Creative Arts is one of the four study areas in the new CAPS that form the subject Life Skills in the Foundation Phase in which Music is included (South Africa, National Department of Education, 2011:8).

Furthermore, studies have found that there is a "cognitive connection" between music and language acquisition in children (Nompula 2012:372; Hallam 2010: 271). Trinick (2011: 7) claims that after the learners have done several repetitions of a song, the language starts to be "internalized". This author further maintains that "after repetition of rhythmic songs", children seem to be able to speak more fluently than when they were learning words without music been added to them (Trinick 2011: 7). Nompula (2012: 372) adds that singing indigenous African music also has the potential to improve learners' language and vocabulary. She observes that through indigenous music singing, children acquire an opportunity to learn and remember idioms, names of events and other important rituals in their lives. Trinick's (2011:7) and Nompula's (2012:372) observations that singing enables learners to remember the "alphabet songs" and even "counting songs" during their adult lives clearly demonstrates the effect that learning through music has in the cognitive development of learners.

Lastly, music is able to help learners develop good social behaviours (Cloete & Delport 2015; Nompula 2012: 372). According to Nompula (2012: 372), when learners participate in group singing they are able to improve their listening and cooperative skills. Cloete and Delport (2015: 100) add that as learners collaborate and improvise during performances, their feelings of being accepted and a sense of belonging also improve. Hence, in their study regarding music in the Foundation Phase, Cloete & Delport (2015: 90) concluded that music encourages social cohesion and as a result it can be used as a panacea to the racial differences experienced in schools.

2.4 ARTS INTEGRATION

The concept of integration fits in well with my research: The CAPS recommends that integration of the arts should be applied by Foundation Phase educators across the study areas and the different art forms (South Africa, National Department of Basic Education 2011: 8; Skosana & Monyai 2013: 54). In addition, the Department of Basic Education (2011: 8) has classified Life Skills as a "cross cutting" subject that should be used to enhance teaching and learning of Mathematics and

Languages in the Foundation Phase. Above all, integration is a teaching approach that is approbated in constructivist theory (Silverstein & Layne 2010: 2).

Generally, arts integration is known as a strongly "contested and confusing" term (Mishook & Kornhaber 2006: 4; Russell & Zembylas 2007: 288). This claim is substantiated by the different viewpoints of various researchers regarding this term (Harlin & Brown 2007: 172; Russell-Bowie 2009: 1; Snyder 2001: 34). Different concepts of the term "integration" such as "cross-disciplinary, interdisciplinary, infused, thematic, trans-disciplinary, multidisciplinary, and holistic" adds to the uncertainty of the arts integration definition (Russell & Zembylas 2007: 289).

This study will focus on Russell-Bowie's (2009: 1) practicable techniques of arts integration, such as syntegration, service connections and symmetric correlations. I chose Russell-Bowie's (2009) techniques of integration because of its potential to provide learners with comprehensive and integrated learning experiences across the curriculum (Vermeulen, Klopper & van Niekerk 2011: 200). The three integration techniques of Russell-Bowie (2009: 5) are explained as follows.

Researchers (Barry 2008: 31; Russell–Bowie 2009: 5; Monroe 2015: 11 & Vermeulen, et al. 2011: 200) postulate that service connection technique occurs when an educator supports the teaching of the main subject by using actions from the Arts without mentioning the knowledge or concepts of the art form he or she is using. In other words, it is realized when music is used to support learners to achieve the outcomes of another subject. A commonly used example is when an educator uses an "alphabet song" in an English lesson to help learners to remember letters of alphabets, or "counting song" to assist them memorizing certain Mathematical concepts (Snyder 2001: 34; Russell-Bowie 2009: 5). Principally, learners do not get the opportunity to explore certain musical knowledge and skills such as tempo and dynamics.

Russell-Bowie (2009: 5) asserts that symmetric correlation happens when the goals of both subjects involved in a particular lesson are equally maintained and achieved. This is a form of integration where one subject does not rely on the other

to achieve its goals (Russell-Bowie 2009: 6). Hence, Vermeulen, et al. (2011: 200) conclude that this technique "uses common materials or resources to break down the barriers between subjects while still achieving specific results for each discipline". Therefore, symmetric correlation may be realized when an educator use "alphabets song" to help learners memorize letters of alphabets and in the same lesson ensures that a variation of singing "piano" and "forte" is observed (Russell-Bowie 2009:6).

Lastly, Russell-Bowie (2009: 8) purports that syntegration takes place when "educators plan purposefully to use broad themes that can move across subjects so that the theme is explored in a meaningful way by and within different subjects". Syntegration can enable learners to "achieve outcomes that can transcend those in each subject, such as the development of generic skills such as observation, research, problem solving and teamwork" (Russell-Bowie 2009: 8).

2.4.1 Benefits of integrating Music with other subjects

Integrated lessons have the potential to benefit learners in various ways as "connections can be established between subjects so as to assist learners to develop greater understanding of concepts across disciplines" (Still & Bobis 2005: 712). Research conducted by May (2013: 6) revealed that there is a close relationship between Music and Mathematics. This researcher further maintains that a connection between Music and Languages can be easily recognized in "reading, poetry, literature and in the performance of folk and other songs".

The study conducted by Lowe (2002: 18) offers probably the most comprehensive empirical evidence that indeed there are benefits of integrating Music with English. The results revealed that learners who were taught through an integrated lesson displayed a greater understanding of "contradictions, homophones and antonyms" in English and at the same time registered improvement in their knowledge of musical form and style (Lowe 2002: 18). In the same integrated lesson learners

⁴ Piano is a Latin musical term for soft (Suzuki 2007: 32).

⁵ Forte is a Latin musical term for loud or strong (Suzuki 2007: 32).

were able to improve their ability to "sing, play musical instruments, and improvising musical works" (Lowe 2002: 18). Moreover, learners were able to establish relationships between "all forms of communication and predictions made in both Music and English" (Lowe 2002: 18).

Another study describing how music can enhance language is that of Mizener (2008: 11), in which singing and rhythmic speaking were found to play a significant role in the development of learners' speech and "oral reading skills". This study revealed that singing is able to improve rhythm, form, dynamics and mood which are similarly found in music and languages (Mizener 2008: 11). Moreover, the research revealed that listening to music could assist learners to improve "modalities of communication which include transmitting information aurally and receiving information visually" (Mizener 2008: 11).

2.5 CHALLENGES TO IMPLEMENTING MUSIC AS SUBJECT IN PRIMARY SCHOOLS

Primary schools in South Africa are faced with various challenges regarding the implementation of music. These challenges include *inter alia* the music budget reduction, decreased instructional time and limitations concerning educators' attitude and competence in teaching music (West 2012: 75).

2.5.1 Music budget reduction

Budget reduction is another challenge to the teaching of Music in primary schools and has a negative effect towards the teaching of this subject in schools (Branscome 2012: 115). The global practice of focusing instructional time on tested subjects, as mentioned above, has resulted in funds being increased only for Mathematics and Languages, resulting in the reduction of allocations for subjects such as music (Branscome 2012: 115; Elpus 2012: 23 & West 2012: 75).

In South Africa, the huge part of the Education budget is spent on salary bills, which is estimated at being 85% of the education budget (Onwu & Sehoole 2011:125). This leaves little left to invest in the implementation of the new curriculum (Onwu &

Sehoole, 2011:125). Moreover, the teaching and learning resources delivered in primary schools from the Department of Education through programmes such as Quality Improvement Development Support and Upliftment Programme (QIDS-UP) only promoted the improvement of Languages and Mathematics in primary schools. It can be deduced that subjects such as Life Skills within which Music is taught, could not receive sufficient funding.

2.5.2 Decreased instructional time

Decreased instructional time seems to be another problem in the teaching of music in South African schools. Van Vreden (2016: 1) and Van Vuuren and Van Niekerk (2015: 278) observe that in the CAPS Foundation Phase, Creative Arts is allocated 2 hours per week and Music, Drama and Dance share one hour together (South Africa, National Department of Basic Education 2011: 14). This can be translated into 20 minutes of each discipline per week whereas Mathematics and Languages are allocated 8 hours each per week (South Africa, National Department of Basic Education 2011: 6). This correlates with Dada, et al's (2009) recommendation that much of time in CAPS should be redirected to the teaching of Mathematics and Languages. The table below reflects instructional time in the Foundation Phase as adapted from CAPS document Foundation Phase (South Africa, National Department of Education 2011: 6):

Table 2.2 Instructional time in the Foundation Phase

Subject	Grade 1	Grade 2	Grade 3
Home language	8	8	8
First additional language	2	3	4
Mathematics	7	7	7
Life Skills	6	6	7
 Beginning Knowledge Creative Arts Physical Education Personal and Social Well-being 	1 2 2 1	1 2 2 1	2 2 2 1
Total	23	23	25

2.5.3 Lack of in-service training and professional support

Joseph (2002: 70-71) states that effective curriculum implementation depends largely on the quality of in-service training and the professional support that educators receive from the department. However, the study conducted by De Villiers (2013: 19) revealed that majority of subject advisors who are supposed to advice and support educators in the music curriculum implementation are almost "under qualified". Researchers such as Jansen van Vuuren and Van Niekerk (2015: 278) and Klopper (2008: 58) confirm De Villiers' (2013: 19) findings when they state that qualified music subject advisors are scant. It can be deduced that majority of subject advisers do not possess the skills and knowledge to provide support to educators regarding music content and pedagogy. Hence De Villiers (2013: 18) concluded that although the National Department of Education seems to be committed regarding providing professional development programmes in schools but this does not benefit arts educators.

2.5.4 Lack of availability of resources

CAPS document guides that all Foundation Phase classes should have "standard materials" which include musical equipments. However, the study conducted by Van Vreden (2016: 2) revealed that majority of educators were still complaining about "insufficient musical instruments, CDs and props (such as scarves and ribbons for movement)" in their schools. In another study by Jansen Van Vuuren and Van Niekerk (2015: 273), "scarce resources" was still mentioned as one of the prevalent factors that impede the effective implementation of music in schools. The above findings support Klopper's (2008: 58) observation regarding "variables impacting on the delivery of music in the learning area Arts and Culture in Gauteng Province".

2.5.5 Limitations concerning educators' attitude and competence in teaching Music in primary schools

Another challenge regarding Music teaching in primary schools is the limitations concerning educators' attitude and competence in teaching Music. The study conducted by Van Vuuren and Van Niekerk (2015: 277) revealed that only less than 1% of Life Skills educators have the confidence to teach Music. This study

corroborates with Russell-Bowie's comparative study (2009: 24) which found that most educators, predominantly in post-colonial countries, including South Africa, have limited competencies to teach Music. This challenge is attributed to a lack of educator personal musical qualifications, experience, training and inadequate resources in schools to teach Music (Russell-Bowie 2009: 24; Van Vuuren & Van Niekerk 2015: 275).

2.6 THEORETICAL FRAMEWORK OF THE STUDY

The Vygotskian theory of social constructivism⁶(1978) provided theoretical underpinning for exploring the experiences of Foundation Phase educators in the implementation of Music according to CAPS. This theory has been advocated by Lev Vygotsky (1896-1934), a Russian psychologist who supposed that social cooperation and interaction amongst learners can lead to successful lessons (Powell & Kalina 2009: 244). Essentially, this theory was also promoted by Dewey in the late 19th and early 20th century, who contested that learners "extend their personal knowledge through active engagement with others" (Scott 2011: 5).

The Vygotskian theory of constructivism has informed the pedagogy and the philosophy of previous educational reform policies in South Africa such as OBE and the latest CAPS document (Skosana & Monyai 2013: 54). Hence researchers (Alexander & November 2010:101; Donelly 2007: 1; Muofhe 2008: 417; Nykiel-Herbert 2004: 25) have reiterated that learner centred approach which is still encouraged in CAPS is underpinned by social constructivist principles⁷, largely attributed to Vygotsky (Skosana & Monyai 2013: 54).

-

⁶ Vygotskian theory of constructivism is a social theory, which emphasises "the active role of learners in building knowledge (Kalpana 2014: 27). This theory provides opportunities for learners to learn through "social interactions and culture in the construction of knowledge and understanding" (Kalpana 2014: 27).

⁷ Social constructivist principles encourage learning that embraces learners' own experiences and beliefs, social activities, and collaboration (Powell & Kalina 2009: 243). Essentially these are the principles of Vygotskian theory of constructivism (Scott 2007: 35).

Vygotsky (1978: 85-86) states that constructivist learning happens in the socialcultural collaboration between a less experienced learner and an educator or more knowledgeable and skilled peers. According to this theorist, the collaboration takes place in the Zone of Proximal Development (ZPD), a stage where real support is given to learners when they are struggling with certain difficult tasks (Vygotsky 1978: 86). Küpers & Van Dijk (2014:375) describe scaffolding as a form of cooperative learning that occurs between an educator and a learner over a period of time in order to attain a particular goal. For Wood, Bruner and Ross (1976: 90) scaffolding provides assistance for learners to transcend set goals which would be impossible for them to achieve them without the assistance of an educator. Hopkins (2013:71) adds that learners are brought in the ZPD stage through the establishment of a constructive learning environment that makes it easier for them to learn new musical skills and knowledge. This allows learners to attain the highest level of performance in music than when they attempt alone and without any support from the educator (Hopkins 2013: 71). Hence, Rauhala (2014: 696) concludes that music skills and knowledge is sufficiently achieved during ZPD.

Through a constructivist approach, educators are able to provide support in order for learners to attain new knowledge while investigating their own music knowledge (Camp & Oesterreich 2010: 22). Therefore, educators are required to leave their traditional role as transmitters of knowledge and to rather act as facilitators by providing appropriate learning experiences (Aldridge, Fraser & Sebela 2004: 245; Pitsoe 2014: 391). In addition, educators who use a constructivist approach should display their music skills and knowledge to guide learners during music lessons (Scott 2011:193). They should allow learners to be actively involved in learning (Aldridge, et al. 2004: 245). Also, significant in a constructivist approach is that educators employ different strategies for assessment in order to accommodate the various ways in which learners "construct knowledge in social settings" (Stears & Gopal 2010: 591).

According to Scott (2011: 20), the following are acceptable practices in a constructivist music lesson:

• Educators should teach in groups where learners can explore their "musical worlds and negotiate a shared understanding". e.g. In CAPS Grade 3 learners

are expected "to listen to South African indigenous Music and Western Music focusing on rhythm and beat, 2, 3 or 4 time and give their analysis regarding rhythm and beat of the song". This will enable learners to share and compare their musical skills, knowledge and experiences (Rauhala 2014: 696). The groups can thereafter concur which analysis is the most appropriate.

- Instead of sticking to a rigid Music program or syllabus, educators should plan
 their lessons in responsive to the needs of the learners. e.g. Instead of having
 two separate lessons of 'playing percussion instruments in time to Music' and a
 separate one on 'dynamics' as required by the South African National
 Department of Education (2011: 47), the educator can address the two topics in
 one lesson.
- Learners should be provided with opportunities to explore Music and Music making. e.g. the South African National Department of Education (2011: 60) stipulate that learners should be given an opportunity to compose cyclic rhythm patterns based on South African music focusing on appropriate tempo and dynamics of their choices. This will widen their understanding and challenge their beliefs through active engagement in musical tasks.
- Finally, educators should constantly give learners time to reflect on their understanding of Music and their work as musicians.

2.7 SUMMARY

The literature review reveals the challenges in implementing Music in primary schools. Among the challenges identified is the reduction of instructional time, budget cuts and educators' limited knowledge and attitude towards the teaching of Music. On the other hand, the Vygotskian model of social constructivism suggests that educators should encourage active learning by allowing learners to be hands on in music activities and display their musical skills of singing, improvising, listening and composing. This theory has further reflected that learners need to bring their previous knowledge and skills in order to survive in the acquisition of the new knowledge. Essentially, this theory has suggested that educators need to

change their role of being knowledge providers and act as guides in constructing for effective implementation of music.

The next chapter will describe the research study and methodology used to gather and analyse data for it.

CHAPTER 3

RESEARCH DESIGN AND METHODOLOGY

3.1 INTRODUCTION

In this chapter, research design and methodology of this study is outlined. An explanation of the procedures used for the collection of data is also discussed. The purpose of the current study was to explore the experiences of Foundation Phase educators in the implementation of Music according to the CAPS. The chapter concludes with explaining ethical considerations of the study.

3.2 RESEARCH APPROACH

I have chosen to use a qualitative research approach since it is the most appropriate approach for this study (Mouton 2001: 149 & Niewenhuis 2007: 50). Niewenhuis (2007: 51) states that researchers employ qualitative research approach when they want to study "people or systems by interacting with and observing them in their natural environment". Furthermore, qualitative research allows for the "researcher's own supposition about the condition of the research site" (Creswell 2013: 44). Hence, qualitative research approach allowed me to enter the research site with my prior knowledge gained through the experience as a school principal. It is critical to state that this research approach assisted me to explore the experiences of Foundation Phase educators in implementing Music according to the CAPS.

3.3 RESEARCH DESIGN

Nieuwenhuis (2007: 70) asserts that a research design is a map according to which the researcher will select the participants and data collection tools, and how the data would be analysed in a study. Research designs may differ from one study to another due to "the purpose of a particular study, research questions and resources available to the researcher" (Delport et al. 2011: 312). For this study, I have decided to use an exploratory case study design in order to gain in-depth experiences of Foundation Phase educators regarding the implementation of Music according to

CAPS. This design is relevant for this study because the CAPS has just been introduced in the Foundation Phase and I believe that there is insufficient information with regards to the implementation of Music according to the CAPS. An exploratory case study enables a researcher to consider not just the views of one participant but also the voices of other appropriate people in a particular situation (Nieuwenhuis 2007:75). My choice of a case study research design is based on Fouché and De Vos's (2011:95) assertion that an exploratory case study is appropriate when little is known about a particular phenomenon.

3.4 DATA COLLECTION STRATEGIES

Hofstee (2006: 115) describes data collection strategy as "anything that a researcher can use to retrieve information from the participants". Nieuwenhuis (2007:76) also maintains that a "case study design uses multiple resources and strategies in the data gathering process", with which Delport et al.(2011: 321) agree. Hence, this study used the following data collection strategies:

- Semi structured interviews;
- Observations and:
- Document analysis

3.4.1 Semi structured interviews

According to Delport, Fouché & Schurink (2011:351), a semi-structured interview is a data collection strategy used to gather a "detailed picture of participants' beliefs, perceptions and accounts about a particular topic". It is commonly utilized to clarify answers and authenticate data emerging from other data sources (Nieuwenhuis 2007:87). Essentially, semi-structured interview "defines the line of inquiry" (Nieuwenhuis 2007:87).

Interviews have particular strengths. A researcher can gain a "large amount" of data within a short space of time and this can be an effective way of "obtaining depth in data" (Delport, Fouché & Schurink 2011:360).

3.4.2 Document analysis

Nieuwenhuis (2007:82) describes document analysis as data collection strategy that focuses on written materials that may provide information on the phenomenon being explored. Documents can be classified as primary of secondary source (Strydom & Delport 2011: 377; Nieuwenhuis 2007: 82-83). Primary sources are commonly unpublished and are often gathered directly from the participants. Hence Strydom and Delport (2011: 377) maintain that they are the "original written material of the author's own experiences and observations". They can include documents such as "minutes of a meeting, reports and correspondence". However, secondary sources may include "books and articles" (Nieuwenhuis 2007: 82-83).

I chose document analysis strategy because of the following (Strydom & Delport 2011: 382):

- It can provide a researcher with an opportunity to access the information even in the absence of the respondents (Strydom & Delport 2011: 382).
- The quality of the information being analyzed cannot be influenced by the interaction between the researcher and the producers of the documents and;
- Analyzing documents is not an expensive activity;

Furthermore, document analysis was employed to verify the data collected from semi structured interviews and observations. In this study, the documents that were analysed included educators' music lesson plans and learners' classwork books. These documents were used to explore methods that have already been introduced by educators to enhance their teaching strategies while implementing Music in the Foundation Phase.

I preferred to review documents after Foundation Phase teaching hours, between 1 and 3 p.m., focusing on one educator per day. When I arrived at school, educators were busy updating their Mathematics and English tasks preparing for the subject specialists' visit in the following day. As a result of that educators seemed uncomfortable with my visit. However, in grade 1, I reviewed four out of 40 learners' classwork books, in Grade 2 and 3 five books out of 47 and 48 respectively. The following day I returned to the educators to ask for clarity on some of the issues that were not clear in learners' work and in the teachers' file. In dealing with document

analysis, I kept in my mind that the documents might not be precise or might be incomplete (Creswell, 2009:180).

3.4.3 Observations

Nieuwenhuis (2007: 83-84) describes participant observation as a "systematic process of recording the behavioural patterns of participants, things and occurrences without necessarily questioning or communicating with them". In addition, Strydom (2011: 330) portrays it as "a qualitative research procedure that studies the natural and everyday set-up in a particular situation". It is considered as an essential data collection strategy of the qualitative approach as it can reveal "words and expressions" the participants use in specific situations (Strydom 2011:329). Moreover, participant observation can help a researcher to have a "deeper insight and understanding of the phenomenon being observed" (Nieuwenhuis 2007:84). I have chosen participant observation because of its strengths listed below (Strydom 2011: 329-330):

- It helps a researcher to obtain an "objective experience" of the participants;
- It gives an inclusive viewpoint of the problem under investigation and may enable the researcher to have new revelations regarding things that "previously went unnoticed";
- It can be used with a "high degree of success" even in cases which are unfamiliar.
- It is able to provide an extensive perspective on the problem being examined;
- It is precisely important for exploratory case studies as it can generate hypothesis in the course of inquiry (Strydom 2011: 338).

During this research, I observed Foundation Phase educators in the classroom, with the aim of collecting data on the aspects of Music that educators find easy to implement as well as their efficacy during the facilitation of music activities. In this way it was also possible for me to ascertain challenges that affect their music teaching, as well as the methods that educators apply to improve their Music lessons. The classroom observations in all Grade 1, 2 and 3 were conducted in different days between 10 a.m. and 11h00 a.m.

3.5 SAMPLING STRATEGY: PURPOSIVE

Sampling refers to the procedure used to select participants for a particular study (Nieuwenhuis 2007:79). It is precisely utilized to choose the "richest possible sources of information to answer the research question" (Nieuwenhuis 2007:79). Hence, the sampling strategy of this study was directed by the focus of this study, which is to explore the experiences of Foundation Phase educators in implementing music according to the CAPS. The study used purposive sampling which is clarified hereafter.

Nieuwenhuis (2007:79) describes purposive sampling as "a selection of participants based on their distinctive characteristics that makes them the holders of the data required for the study". In other words, this kind of sampling is applied in "special situations where the sampling is done with a specific purpose in mind" (Maree & Pietersen 2007:178). The above clarification given by Nieuwenhuis (2007:79) and Maree and Pietersen (2007:178) has influenced my choice of purposive sampling as the appropriate strategy for my study because the participants have been selected from my knowledge of their involvement in the implementation of CAPS in the Foundation Phase, as I was their principal.

Selection of site

As a sample for this study, I have chosen one primary school in the Madikwe circuit of the Northwest Province to conduct the research. The profile of the school is provided in the table 3.1 below. The school is situated in a poverty-stricken rural area of Moses Kotane Local Municipality.

Table 3.1: Profile of the school

Quintile	1
Type of school	Ordinary Primary School
Grades	R – 7
Paying or No fee School	No Fee School
Home language of learners	Setswana
Language of teaching and learning in the Foundation Phase	Setswana and English
Number of learners in the Foundation Phase	88
Curriculum in the Foundation Phase	Setswana Home Language; English First Additional Language; Mathematics; Life Skills
Extracurricular music activities	Traditional Dance and Choral Music

3.6 RELIABILITY OF RESEARCH

Nieuwenhuis (2007:113) describes reliability as the "acid test" of data analysis, findings and conclusions of a research. For this research, data from interviews, document analysis and observations was applied to help me verify the findings of this study. After conducting interviews I provided the educators with the transcripts in order for them to verify whether my interpretation was accurate and correctly reflected their views (Nieuwenhuis 2007:113; Delport, Fouché & Schurink 2011:420). To verify validity of this study, I ensured consistency throughout coding.

3.7 SCOPE OF THE RESEARCH

The study was limited to a single case at one primary school where experiences of a small group of Foundation Phase educators was explored. The findings are not generic or applicable to educators in other schools. Although reference was made to the CAPS document, the main aim of this study was not to focus on CAPS in its entirety, but on Music in the Foundation Phase, according to the requirements of CAPS.

3.8 DATA ANALYSIS

According to Hofstee (2006: 117), once a researcher has collected data of any kind, it must be transformed into information through analysis. Therefore, data analysis in this study took the form of non-numerical examination (Babbie 2007: 378). The analysis of data was an on-going, reflective process. The collected data, including field notes of observations, semi-structured interview transcripts, and notes on learners' workbooks, was organised and coded. Thematic analysis was employed to analyse the qualitative, textual data emerging from a multiplicity of streams such as words, phrases, interviews, as well as informal conversations for which themes that could be identified (Schurink, Fouche & De Vos 2011: 405). In thematic analysis, data is usually arranged according to themes on the basis of number of appearances of a word or concept within a phrase, sentence and paragraph (Schurink, et al. 2011: 405).

3.9 ETHICAL CONSIDERATIONS

The study involved interviews, lesson observations and document analysis at a sampled school. Therefore, permission was obtained from the North West Education Department for the conducting of this research (see Appendix A: Letter of permission). Furthermore, I requested permission from the management of the sampled school (see Appendix D: Letter of permission from school management). Information regarding voluntary participation and freedom to withdraw from participating at any stage was provided to each participant (Strydom 2011: 116-118; Wassenaar 2006: 72-73). Educators were informed about all the research procedures, including the use of audio and video recordings during interviews and observations, for which they were asked to sign a letter of informed consent (Kelly 2006: 292; Strydom 2011: 116-117; Wassenaar 2006: 72-73). (See Appendix D: Letter of informed consent for educators).

I ensured that the participants did not experience any harm as a result of this study (Wassenaar 2006: 67). As a school principal I have experienced that educators often find lesson observations and interviews intimidating. Subsequently, I guaranteed that all participants were informed beforehand about the potential impact of the investigation in order to offer them opportunity to withdraw if they so

wished (Strydom 2011: 115). I was also sensitive to the needs and feelings of each participant.

Strict confidentiality was maintained. Only my supervisor and I would be allowed access to the data obtained from the respondents (Strydom 2011: 119). To protect the privacy of the participants (Strydom 2011: 119), no names or personal details of the respondents were disclosed. The participants were identified by the following codes: Ms M (Grade 3 educator), Ms Radio (Grade 2 educator) and Ms K (Grade 1 educator). The school was identified as a school. The raw data will be kept safely at the University of Pretoria for a period of 15 years, as required by the University policy.

3.10 SUMMARY

In this chapter, I have discussed the methods that I found most appropriate for my study. I have also clarified the research approach, design, data collection tools, sampling and population, and data analysis. Furthermore, I have included the reasons for the choice of the methods that I have used in this study. The next chapter presents data analysis and findings of the study.

CHAPTER 4

DATA PRESENTATION AND DISCUSSIONS

4.1 INTRODUCTION

The previous chapter explained the design and methodology approach used in this study. This chapter deals with the data presentation and discussion of qualitative data collected by means of semi structured interviews, observations and document analysis. After coding the data according to Nieuwenhuis (2007b:105), six general themes surfaced. These referred to Educators' Music Education experience, Music implementation process, challenges of teaching Music in the CAPS, positive aspects of teaching Music in the CAPS, the assistance of the North West Department of Education and, desired changes regarding Music implementation in the CAPS. Within some of the above mentioned themes, sub-themes could also be discovered. Most importantly, the verbatim comments of the respondents are accompanying the discussions below:

4.2 EMERGENT THEMES AND DISCUSSIONS

4.2.1 Educators' Music Education experience

This section presents and discusses the data on respondents' experience in Music Education. In this regard, I asked the respondents this question: "What Music Education experience did you have as a Foundation Phase educator before the introduction of the CAPS?" It appeared that although the respondents were expected to implement Music according to the CAPS, the interviews revealed that they did not have Music Education experience. Two of the respondents, Ms K and Ms M were trained as generalist educators while Ms Radio had a journalism degree. One of the respondents, Ms K expressed her experience as follows: "I didn't know anything about Music. I don't have any experience I just sing it for fun. I don't have any experience of that". Another respondent, Ms Radio added: "with Music I would say my experience come from church where I sing in choir and when I was in primary school I was singing but I did not go on with it. But most experience I found it in my church". Furthermore, Ms M commented: "I was just a chorister enjoying it but not doing it in the classroom". The data confirms Russell-Bowie (2009: 24) and Van Vreden's (2016: 2) observation that educators, predominantly in

post-colonial countries, including South Africa, are often not specialists and have limited competencies to implement Music. It further corroborate with Alter, Hays and O'Hara's (2009: 2) observation that primary school educators are commonly generalists with no proper Musical background and experience to assist them in implementing Music Education.

4.2.2 Music implementation process

4.2.2.1 Planning for Music lessons

Document analysis revealed that all three respondents do not have music in lesson plans. The respondents' Life Skills files comprised of Beginning Knowledge study area and Visual Arts lesson plans. This finding was confirmed during lesson observations. I noticed that all respondents were teaching without any guidance of a Music lesson plan. Even the songs that they used to introduce Beginning Knowledge lessons were never mentioned in their lesson plans. This was a clear confirmation that educators do not plan for Music. In addition, learners' class work books were only full of Beginning Knowledge and Visual Arts activities.

4.2.2.2 Learner involvement in Music lessons.

Regarding how and to what extent do the Foundation Phase educators involve learners in Music lessons, the data revealed that the three respondents did not involve learners as expected in the CAPS. The data is in contrast with the pedagogy and philosophy of the CAPS which is informed by the Vygotskian theory of constructivism (Skosana & Monyai 2013: 54). According to the CAPS, educators should leave their traditional role as transmitters of knowledge and act as facilitators by providing appropriate learning experiences (Aldridge, Fraser & Sebela 2004: 245; Pitsoe 2014: 391; Jia 2010: 198). However, the data from the interviews revealed a contrary role played by the Foundation Phase educators. One of the respondents, Ms K expressed the involvement of learners as follows: "No, I don't involve learners too much with the Music. We just sing when we start the topic and that's the end we don't sing for a long time". The data does not resonate with Hopkins' (2013:71) assertion that in a constructivist approach learners are taught in an environment that makes it easier for them to learn new musical skills and knowledge. Another respondent, Ms M had this to say: "Firstly I am just chatting

with them a simple story so that it can lead us to a lesson and to the Music related to the topic of the day or of the week. So if you can stand and ask them, they can't answer you but if you introduce it with Music they can enjoy the lesson and the lesson become successful".

The data from document analysis confirmed that all respondents did not involve learners in Music lessons. The lesson plans that I found in the respondents' files did not contain any activity that shows that learners were been actively involved in Music lessons. I also verified this during lesson observations where learners were only made to sing in the beginning and the end of lessons. This was done for the purpose of introducing particular topics in Beginning Knowledge study area and Mathematics.

4.2.2.3 Integration with other subjects or study areas

This section reports on the respondents' ability to integrate Music with other Foundation Phase disciplines and subjects. I asked the respondents this question "How do you integrate Music with other disciplines and subjects?" The interviews revealed that integrating Music with other disciplines and subjects was not well implemented. From the interviews the respondents were fully aware of their inability to integrate Music with other study areas or subjects as expected according to the CAPS. Ms M stated boldly: "No, I don't usually integrate Music with other subjects." The response by Ms K "I don't integrate it because I don't know how to integrate it, we do the CAPS but we did not know how to integrate it. Nobody shows us how to integrate the Music with other subjects. We just sing it with the topics (laughing) but we don't know how to integrate. Maybe let me say, I teach the children about how to keep healthy. We sing 'this is the way we wash our hands, wash our hands', but I don't know whether it is to integrate or what. I don't know (laughing)." is indicative of the concern expressed by the three respondents.

Data from lesson observations confirmed that all three respondents unknowingly used service connection technique because they supported the teaching of other subjects such as Beginning Knowledge by using actions from the Music without mentioning its knowledge or concepts (Vermeulen, et al. 2011: 200). For example,

during lesson presentations, the respondents used songs to introduce the topics at the beginning and the end of the lessons of other subjects or study areas. Moreover, document analysis revealed that the respondents' lesson plans did not show any integration of Music with other subjects or disciplines.

4.3 CHALLENGES OF TEACHING MUSIC IN CAPS

4.3.1 Lack of resources

In order to implement Music effectively, educators require adequate and relevant equipments. Hence, the National Department of Education (2012: 34) recommended that audio equipments with relevant music tapes or CDs, various musical instruments and charts should be made available to educators for the effective implementation of Music. However, the data from observations and interviews revealed that the North West Department of Education was unable to supply these resources to the school. Hence, the respondents were concerned about the Department's failure to supply them with the resources needed for the effective implementation of Music. One of the respondents, Ms K remarked: "The challenge is, we don't have the resources for Music". Another educator, Ms M shared the same sentiment "learners like Music, but we don't have enough resources".

4.3.2 Limited teaching time

The interviews revealed that although Music has been allocated a specific time in the CAPS, it appeared that the allocated time was a cause for concern. All respondents purported that the time allocated to Music was not adequate. One of the respondents, Ms K had this to say: "The time is very limited. We don't have time for Music. We use most of the time for other subjects like Maths, languages and we don't have time for Music". This confirms Dada, et al.'s (2009) conclusion that much of time in the CAPS has been redirected to the teaching of Mathematics and Languages.

4.4 ASSISTANCE OF THE DEPARTMENT OF EDUCATION

The assistance of the North West Department of Education was also an aspect of the interviews. Constantly, all the three respondents showed their unhappiness regarding the assistance they received from the North West Department of Education. During the interviews, the respondents pointed out that the subject specialists responsible for Foundation Phase gave support in other subjects such as Mathematics and Languages and Music was often left unattended. One of the respondents, Ms Radio described the situation in this way:

"In my phase, they did not contribute that much. It is just the CAPS, the books there, I don't think they did something because we do not have Musical instruments. If they would provide us with musical instruments". Ms K referred to a similar incident: "No...our specialists didn't come. They don't have time for that Music. They just check books for other things. They don't even assist us with Music". They don't assist at all when it comes to Music. They just check what they want to check and go and don't even say anything about Music".

Ms M had this to say: "That one I can say the department did not provide us with something for Music. We just taking copies and complete and be the end of the story till the following year. So, that's why I am saying that they did not assist us".

4.5 POSITIVE ASPECTS OF TEACHING MUSIC IN CAPS.

Despite the respondents not receiving proper assistance from the North West Department of Education and their lack of Music Education experience, it appeared that there were positive aspects of teaching Music in the CAPS. The three respondents revealed an insightful awareness of the range of benefits that Music has in the development of learners. One of the respondents, Ms M had this to say: "The thing that is good about teaching Music in the CAPS in the classroom is to arouse the interest of the learners. The learners love to come to school". Another respondent, Ms K added: "I think that the positive aspects will be that the children will understand the topic better when the music its included and maybe it will be easy for them to know what are you teaching about and they will have a lot of enjoyment because they will be dancing, singing and it will encourage their social skills because they will be dancing, laughing and all sort of things". The data

confirm Cloete & Delport's (2015: 90) study which concluded that music can develop social skills. Moreover, this data corroborate with Nompula's (2012: 372) finding that music can improve learners' language and vocabulary.

4.6 DESIRED CHANGES REGARDING IMPLEMENTATION OF MUSIC

This section looks in the changes or additions that the respondents would like to see with regards to the implementation of Music in the CAPS. The interviews revealed that the respondents had suggestions regarding the implementation of Music according to the CAPS. One of the respondents, Ms Radio described her desire as follows: "I think there should be time specifically time for Music. It should not be included in one subject like Life Skills. It should have its own period, Music period. So learners can learn more 35 minutes or 45 minutes of the subject per day". One of the respondents, Ms K suggested: "I think that the Department Education of Education should hire qualified music teachers, specialists who can help us to teach music maybe it could be better because we will be able to know it and teach children".

4.7 CONCLUSION

In this chapter, I presented the data from interviews, document analysis and observations. The data collection techniques were intended to explore the experiences of Foundation Phase educators regarding the implementation of Music according to CAPS. The data indicate that educators have serious challenges in implementing Music according to CAPS.

The data presented in this chapter enlightens what will be presented in the subsequent chapter, which will focus on the discussions of the research findings and recommendations.

CHAPTER 5

CONCLUSION AND RECOMMENDATIONS

5.1 INTRODUCTION

This is the final chapter of the study in which I present summary of the main findings, proposed recommendations, and recommendation for future research. I begin with the summary followed by the recommendations and concluding statement.

5.2 SUMMARY OF THE MAIN FINDINGS

The purpose of this study was to explore experiences of Foundation Phase educators regarding implementation of music according to CAPS requirements. The study explored challenges experienced and also educators' positive experiences regarding implementing music according to CAPS. Essentially, the main finding of this study is that there are challenges regarding implementation of music according to CAPS requirements. The fact that all the three respondents from the Foundation Phase revealed serious hindrances in their individual implementation of Music in their classrooms is indicative of such. The first theme that emerged related to educators' Music Education experience. The research confirmed that none of the respondents had Music Education experience or basic music knowledge before the introduction of the CAPS in 2012. The second theme related to the implementation process. The findings confirmed that although the respondents were expected to implement Music in the CAPS, they did not have music lesson plans at all. Furthermore, the findings showed that the respondents did not involve learners in the teaching of Music. The research found that the respondents did not integrate Music with other subjects or study areas. Furthermore, the research indicated that the respondents were not familiar with methodologies can enhance the teaching of music in the classroom.

The third theme that emerged focused on the challenges of teaching Music in the CAPS. In their responses the respondents mentioned resources and time allocated to music teaching as the main challenges. The fourth theme related to the assistance that educators received from the North West Department of Education. The research revealed the educators' unhappiness with regards to the assistance they received from the subject advisors responsible for Music in the Foundation Phase. The finding confirmed that educators were never assisted or supported with regards to the implementation of Music. The fifth theme related to the positive aspects of teaching Music in the CAPS. The research indicated that respondents were aware that Music contributes towards developing social skills and arousing learning interest of learners. The sixth theme addressed the educators' desired changes in the implementation of Music in the CAPS. The findings confirmed that the respondents had different desires. These included that Music should be taught as a separate subjects and the teaching time should be increased to 45 minutes per period.

5.3 PROPOSED RECOMMENDATIONS

Despite the Department of Basic Education replacing the National Curriculum Statement (NCS) with the Curriculum and Assessment Policy Statement (CAPS), there are large Music implementation challenges in the Foundation Phase. Generally, Music is marginalised and not valued as part of the core subjects under Curriculum and Assessment Policy Statement (CAPS). Unless prioritisation is focused on in-service educators, the future does not look promising for the teaching of Music in the Foundation Phase.

In the light of the above findings, I recommend the following in order to improve the teaching of Music in the Foundation:

• The findings of this study clearly emphasise the need for the North West Department of Education to ensure that Foundation Phase subject advisors deliver quality assistance to educators. It is paramount that the issue of Music specialists needs to be considered. The North West Department of Education should consider employing qualified Music specialists in every district who will serve in rotating or pool posts. These specialists would be used to assist Foundation Phase educators with basic Music knowledge and skills as and when it is necessary. The Music specialists would also assist Foundation Phase educators with planning of music lessons and develop them through demonstrations and practice.

- Another finding of this study is that educators do not have adequate time to teach Music. I therefore recommend that educators should develop integrated learning programmes that will enable them to cover the learning experiences of Music and other subjects or disciplines. Russell-Bowie (2009: 2) maintains that integrated learning programmes can be a remedy especially when there is little time for Music teaching. Furthermore, educators should ensure that the time allocated to teach Music in the CAPS is dedicated only to that and not used for subjects like Mathematics and Languages.
- The other reason Foundation Phase educators gave for their ineffectiveness in implementing Music according to the CAPS is lack of knowledge and pedagogy of Music. In order to remedy this, I recommend that the North West Department of Education should improve its current in-service Music training programmes. I suggest that a partnership between the districts and any University that offers Music Education in the Province should be developed in order to assist in the improvement of educators' music knowledge and pedagogy. Various researchers (Addo 2003: 201; Carlisle 2011: 144 & Kruse 2011: 115) advocate for such partnerships as a way of "bridging the gaps between the teaching in the classroom and the in-service development of Music educators".
- Moreover, the School Management Teams should ensure that Continuing Teacher Professional Development programmes prioritise the improvement of Music teaching. The district should ensure that Foundation Phase educators form Professional Learning Committee (PLC) where they can share good practices and support each other.
- The lack of resources was also highlighted as hampering the effective implementation of Music in the Foundation Phase. Therefore, the school principal and the School Governing Body should prioritise the purchasing of

Music equipments in their annual budget. In other words, purchasing Music resources should be a non-negotiable item in the school's improvement plan. In addition, educators should use the local resources such as tribal museums and indigenous musical dance groups to improve their classroom music practices. Lastly, the school enrichment programme fund which is controlled from the district office should be decentralised so that schools can be able to buy their own music resources.

5.4 RECOMMENDATION FOR FUTURE RESEARCH

Regarding the findings of this study, I recommend a further mixed method study which would focus on a more comprehensive picture of the extent to which Music is being implemented in the Foundation Phase of the entire North West Province. I think that it would be helpful to extend the study to include the experiences of educators in other districts of the North West Department of Education. The study would then be able to generalise the extent to which Music is being implemented in the whole province as it was not the intention of this study.

5.5 **SUMMARY**

This study explored the experiences of Foundation Phase in implementing Music according to the CAPS. It revealed that the implementation of Music according to the CAPS has hindrances. The obstacles highlighted by the Foundation Phase educators were the unsatisfactory assistance from the North West Department of Education, limited music teaching time, and lack of provision of Music equipments. This study clearly indicated that Foundation Phase educators do not have Music Education experience. They do not have required knowledge and skills of integrating Music with other subjects and disciplines. Hence, they cannot implement Music according to the CAPS, as they do not have the relevant pedagogy. On the other hand, the educators acknowledged that Music help learners to understand concepts from other subjects with ease. The study revealed that educators are not familiar with methodologies that can be used to help them teach music in the classroom. At the same time the study showed that Foundation Phase educators do not have adequate understanding of concepts such as "integration" and learner involvement.

REFERENCES

Addo, A.O. 2003. Music teacher education: Assessing a community outreach partnership. *Teaching Education*, 14(2), 201-211.

Aldridge, J.M., Fraser, B.J. & Sebela, M.P. 2004. Using teacher action research to promote constructivists learning environments in South Africa. *South African Journal of Education*, 24(2), 245-253.

Alexander, G. & November, I. 2010. Outcomes in South African higher education: Imagine that! *Journal of Social Science*, 24(2), 101-109.

Alter, F., Hays, T. & O'Hara, R. 2009. The challenges of implementing primary arts education: What our teachers say. *Australian Journal of Early Childhood Development*, 34(4), 22-30.

Babbie, E. 2007. The practice of social research, (11th ed.). Belmont, CA: Thomson Wadsworth.

Baker, R.A. 2012. The effects of high stakes testing policy on arts education. *Arts Education Policy Review*, 113(1), 17-25.

Ballantyne, J., Barrett, M., Temmerman, N., Harrison, S. & Meissner, E. 2009. Music teacher Oz online: A new approach to School-University collaboration in teacher education. *International Journal of Education & Arts*, 10(6), 1-21.

Barrett, J.R. 2014. Case study in music education. In C.M. Conway (Ed.). *The Oxford Handbook of Qualitative Research in American Schools*. New York: Oxford University Press.

Barry, N.H. 2008. The role of integrated curriculum in music teacher education. *Journal of Music Teacher Education*, 18(1) 28-38.

Botha, R.J. 2002. Outcomes Based Education and educational reform in South Africa. *International Journal of Leadership in Education*, 5(4), 361-371.

Branscome, E.E. 2012. The impact of education reform on music education: Paradigm shifts in music education curriculum, advocacy, and philosophy from sputnik to race to the top. *Arts Education Policy Review*, 113(3), 112-118.

Browne, E. 2011. The implementation of Arts and Culture learning area in previously disadvantaged primary schools in the Nelson Mandela Bay area: Teacher experiences (Master's dissertation). Port Elizabeth: Nelson Mandela Metropolitan University.

Burns, C.D. 2009. The relevance of African American singing games to Xhosa children in South Africa: A qualitative study (Doctoral thesis). Missoula, MT: Montana State University.

Burton, S.L. & Gerhen, G.R. 2011. School-University partnership: Re-envisioning music teacher education: Foreword. *Arts Education Policy Review*, 112(2), 105-107.

Camp, E.M. & Oesterreich, H.A. 2010. Uncommon teaching in common sense times: A case study of a critical multicultural educator and the academic success of diverse student populations. *Multicultural Education*, 22(1), 20-26.

Carlisle, K. 2011. Arts Education Partnerships: Informing Policy through the Development of Culture and Creativity within a Collaborative Project Approach. *Arts Education Policy Review*, 112:144-148.

Chisholm, L. 2000. The making of South African National Curriculum Statement. *Journal of Curriculum Studies*, 37(2), 193-208.

Chisholm, L. 2003. The politics of curriculum review and revision in South Africa. Paper presented at 'Oxford' International Conference on Education and Development, 9-11 September 2003 at the session on Culture, Context and the Quality of Education: Pretoria.

Cloete, E. & Delport, A. 2015. Music education in the Grade R classroom: How three teachers learned in a participatory action inquiry. *South African Journal of Childhood Education*, 5(1), 85-105.

Coleman, M., Graham-Jolly, M. & Middlehood, D. 2006. *Managing the curriculum in South African schools*. London: Commonwealth Secretariat.

Creswell, J.W. 2013. *Qualitative enquiry & research design: choosing among five approaches* (3rd ed). Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.

Dada, F., Dipholo, T., Hoadley, U., Khembo, E., Muller, S & Volmink, J. 2009. Report of the task team for the review of the implementation of the national curriculum statement. Presented to the Minister of Education, Ms Angie Motshekga. Pretoria.

Delport, C.S.L., Fouché, C.B. & Schurink, W. 2011. Theory and literature in qualitative research. In A.S. De Vos, H. Strydom, C.B. Fouché, & C.L.S. Delport(Eds.). *Research at grass roots: For the social sciences and human service professions*. Pretoria: Van Schaik. 297-306.

De Villiers, M.R. 2006. A learning theory approach in support of outcomes based elearning. Paper presented at the *Conference on Information Technology in Tertiary Education, Pretoria, South Africa, 18 – 20 September 2006*: Pretoria.

De Villiers, A. 2013. The role of systemic and coherent policy in successful creative arts curriculum. *Musicus*. 41(1), 16-21.

De Vries, P. 2015. Music without music specialist: A primary school story. *International Journal of Music Education*, 33(2) 210-221.

Donelly, K. 2007. Australia's adoption of Outcomes Based Education: A critique. *Issues in Educational Research*, 17: 1-19.

Drummond, U. 2015. *Music education in South African schools after apartheid:* teacher perceptions of Western and African music (Doctoral Thesis) United Kingdom: Glasgow University.

Du Plessis, E. 2013. Curriculum and Assessment Policy Statement (CAPS). Curriculum & Instructional Studies. Pretoria: University of South Africa (UNISA).

Dzorkpey, T.K.A. 2011. Realising the objectives of the South African Schools Eisteddfod: A case study (Doctoral thesis). Potchefstroom: North West University.

Elpus, K. 2012. Music in U.S. federal education policy: Estimating the effect of "core status" for music. *Arts Education Policy Review*, 114(1), 13-24.

Emberly, A. & Davison, J. From the *kraal* to the classroom: Shifting musical arts practices from the community to the school with special reference to learning tshigombela in Limpopo, South Africa. *International Journal of Music Education*, 29(3) 265–282.

Fouché, C.B. & De Vos, A.S. 2011. Formal formulations. In A.S. De Vos, H. Strydom, C.B. Fouché, & C.L.S. Delport (Eds.), *Research at grass roots: For the social sciences and human service professions*. Pretoria: Van Schaik. 89-100.

Fouché, C.B. & Schurink, W. 2011. Qualitative research design. In De Vos, A.S., Strydom, H., Fouche, C.B. & Delport, C.L.S. (Eds.) *Research at grass roots: For the social sciences and human service professions*. Pretoria: Van Schaik. 307-327.

Fredericks, S. 2008. The use of indigenous and contemporary music pedagogies in South Africa. *Journal of Artistic and Creative Education*, 2(2), 127-149.

Fullan, M. & Stielgelbauer, S. 1991. *The new meaning of educational change*. London: Cassell.

Fullan, M. 2001. *The new meaning of education change (*3rd ed.). New York: Teachers College Press.

Gardner, R. D. 2010. Should I stay or should I go? Factors that influence the retention, turnover, and attrition of K–12 music teachers in the United States. *Arts Education Policy Review* 111: 112–21.

Glatthorn, A., Boschee, F. & Whitehead, T. 2006. Curriculum leadership development and implementation. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage Publications.

Greeff, M. 2011. Information collection: Interviewing. In A.S. De Vos, H. Strydom, C.B.Fouché & C.L.S Delport(Eds.). *Research at grass roots: For the social sciences and human service professions*. Pretoria: Van Schaik. 341-374.

Hallam, S. 2010. The power of music: Its impact on the intellectual, social and personal development of children and young people. *International Journal of Music Education*, 28(3) 269-289.

Harlin, R. & Brown, S. 2007. Issues in education: An arts integrated approach for elementary level students. *Childhood Education*, 83(3), 172-174.

Herbst, A., De Wet,J. & Rijsdijk, S. 2005. A survey of music education in the primary schools of South Africa's Cape Peninsula. *Journal of Research in Music Education*, 53, 260-283.

Hildegard, K. & Anundsen, T. W. 2006. Is there a Swahili way of teaching music? In M. Mans (Ed.), *Centering on African practice in Musical Arts Education*. South Africa: African Minds, Compress, 61-74.

Hofstee, E. 2006. Constructing a good dissertation: A practical guide to finishing a Master's, MBA or PhD on schedule. Sandton: EPE Publishers.

Hopkins, M. 2013. Programming in the zone: repertoire selection for the large ensemble. *Music Education Journal*, 99(4), 69-74.

Jia, Q. 2010. A brief study on the implication of constructivism teaching theory on classroom teaching reform in basic education. *International Education Studies*, 3(2), 197-199.

Joseph, D. 2002. Celebrating the use of African Music: Change in motion. *Music Education International*, 2 (2), 128-133.

Joseph, D. 2002. Teachers Reactions to Outcomes-Based Music Education in South African Primary Schools. *Research Studies in Music Education*, 18: 66-77.

Joseph, D. 2007. Sharing and speaking about African music: professional development with Swaziland primary school teachers. *In AARME 2007: Proceedings of the XXIXth Australian Association for Research in Music Education Annual Conference: Music Education Research: Values and initiatives*, Australian Association for Research in Music Education (AARME), Melbourne, 81-88.

Joseph, D. 2011. Cultural diversity in Australia: promoting the teaching and learning of South African music. *Australian Journal of Music Education*, 1, 42-56.

Kalpana, T. 2014. A constructivist perspective on teaching and learning: a conceptual framework. *International Research Journal of Social Sciences*, 3(1), 27-29.

Kelly, K. 2006. From encounter to text: Collecting data in qualitative research. In M.Terre Blanche, K. Durrheim, & D. Painter (Eds.). *Research in practice: Applied methods for the social sciences*. Cape Town: University of Cape Town. 286–319.

Killen, R. 2007. Teaching strategies for outcomes-based education. (2nd Ed.). Cape Town: Juta.

Klopper, C. 2008. The impact of educators' skills and training on delivery of music in learning area Arts and Culture within two districts of Gauteng province of South Africa. *British Journal of Music Education*, 25(1) 57-75.

Kos, R.P. 2010. Developing capacity for change: A policy analysis for the music education profession. *Arts Education Policy Review*, 111(3), 97-104.

Küpers, E., Van Dijk, M. & Van Geert, P. 2014. 'Look closely at what I'm doing!' Scaffolding in individual string lessons: Two case studies. *International Journal of Music Education*, 32(3), 375–391.

Kruse, N.B. 2011. Navigating on-site teaching experiences: Multiple perspectives from two school-university partnerships. *Visions of Research in Music Education*, 19(1), 1-21. Retrieved from http://www-usr.rider.edu/vrme-/ 05 November 2013.

Lewis, F.A. 2014. *Provision of music education in the Western Cape through focus schools for the arts* (Masters Dissertation). Pretoria: Pretoria University.

Lowe, A. 2002. Toward integrating music and other art forms into the language curriculum. Research studies in music education, 18(1), 13-25.

Lu, Y. & Treiman, D.J. 2011. Migration, remittances and Educational stratifications amongst blacks in apartheid and post-apartheid South Africa. *Social Forces*, 89(4)1119-1143.

Manganye, N.N. 2003. Emerging solutions for musical arts education in Africa. *Indigenous Music Theatre of the Tsonga People of South Africa*. Cape Town: African Minds.

Maree, K. & Pieterson, J. 2007. Sampling. In K. Maree (Ed.). *First steps in research*. Pretoria: Van Schaik. 172-181.

May, B.N. 2013. Arts integration: What's the problem? *General Music Today*, 26 (2), 5-8.

Mbeshu, N.C. 2010. An evaluation into the implementation of the Arts and Culture learning area in Bizana schools of the Eastern Cape Province (Master's dissertation). Port Elizabeth: Nelson Mandela Metropolitan University.

Merriam, S.B. 1998. *Qualitative research and case study applications in education.* San Francisco: Jossey-Bass.

Mishook, J.J. & Kornhaber, M.L. 2006. Arts integration in an era of accountability. *Arts Education Policy Review*, 107(4) 3-11.

Mizener, C.P. 2008. Enhancing language skills through music. General Music Today, 21(2), 11-17.

Munroe, A. 2015. Curriculum integration in the general music classroom. *General Music Today*, 29 (1), 12 – 18.

Morakeng, E.K.L. 2010. An evaluation of the integration of indigenous musical arts in the creative and performing arts syllabus and the implementation thereof in the preschools early elementary schools curriculum in Sekhukune area, Limpopo Province in South Africa. *Tidsskrif Van Kreativitet, Spontaneitet en Laering.* 1(3), 357-372.

Mouton, J. 2001. *How to succeed in your master's & doctoral studies*. Pretoria: Van Schaik.

Mouton, N., Louw, G.P. & Strydom, G.L. 2012. A historical analysis of post-apartheid dispensation education in South Africa (1994-2011). *International Business & Economics Research Journal*, 11(11), 1211-1222.

Msila, V. 2007. From Apartheid Education to the Revised National Curriculum Statement: Pedagogy for Identity Formation and Nation Building in South Africa. *Nordiac Journal of African Studies*, 16(2)146-160.

Msila, V. 2013. Democratic Education through the eyes of the poor: Appraising the post-apartheid experience. *Universal Journal of Educational Research*, 1(3) 191-199.

Muofhe, L.T. 2008. The interpretation and implementation of reform: A case study of Simon. *Equity & Excellence in Education*, 41(4), 417-425.

Niewenhuis, J. 2007a. Introducing qualitative research. In K. Maree (Ed.). *First Steps in Research*. Pretoria: Van Schaik. 47-63.

Niewenhuis, J. 2007b. Qualitative research designs and data gathering techniques. In K. Maree (Ed.). *First Steps in Research*. Pretoria: Van Schaik. 70-92.

Nkosi, D.N. 2014. *Modern African classical drumming: a potential instrumental option for South African music curriculum* (Doctoral Thesis) Pretoria: Pretoria University.

Nompula, Y. 2011. The role of indigenous song: a critique of the dominant discourse in Education. *Indinga-African Journal of Indigenous Knowledge Systems*, 10(1) 89-97.

Nompula, Y. 2012. An investigation of strategies for integrated learning experiences and instruction in the teaching of creative art subject. *South African Journal of Education*, 23: 293-306.

Nykiel-Herbert, S. 2004. Mis-constructing knowledge: The case of learners centred pedagogy in South Africa. *Prospectus*, 34(3), 24-31.

Ogunrinade, D.O.A. 2014. Teachers' perception of indigenous music knowledge as a panacea to music curriculum in Nigerian schools. *Journal of Culture, Society and Development*, 3: 52-60.

Onwu,G.O.M. & Sehoole, C.T. 2011. Why teachers matter: Policy issues in the professional development of teachers in South Africa. University of Pretoria.

Phibion, O.S. 2012. Ditlhaka music learning and practices through transmission among the Batlokwa and Balete of Botswana. *Journal of Music and Dance*, 2(1), 1-8. doi:10.5897/JMD11.002

Pitsoe, V.J. 2014. From an instructionist to a constructivist classroom management: a dialogue. *International Journal of Educational Science*, 7(2), 391-399.

Poutiainen, H. 2009. Educational reforms in South Africa: The Role of the Teachers in the Implementation of Educational Reforms in Post-Apartheid South Africa 1994 – 2008 (Masters dissertation) Finland: University of Jyväskylä.

Powell, K.C. & Kalina, C.J. 2009. Cognitive and social constructivism: developing tools for an effective classroom. *Education*, 131(2), 241-250.

Ramparsad, R. 2001. A strategy for teacher involvement in curriculum development. South African Journal of Education, 21(4), 27-292.

Rauhala, R. 2015. Students' experiences of studying music in small groups. *Procedia-Social and Behavioural Sciences*, 171: 695-702.

Richard, B. & Treichel, C.J. 2013. Increasing secondary school teachers' capacity to integrate the arts. *The Clearing House*, 86, 224-228.

Russell-Bowie, D. 2009. What, me? Teach music to primary class? Challenges to teaching music in primary schools in five countries. *Music Education Research*, 11(1), 23-26.

Russell, J. & Zembylas, M. 2007. Arts integration in the curriculum: A review of research and implications for teaching and learning. In L. Bresler (Ed.). *International Handbook of Research in Arts Education*. Dordrecht:Springer. 287-311.

Schurink, W., Fouché, C.B. & De Vos, A.S. 2011. Qualitative data analysis and interpretation. In A.S. De Vos, H.Strydom, C.B.Fouché & C.L.S. Delport (Eds.), Research at grass roots: For the social sciences and human service professions. Pretoria: Van Schaik, 397-423.

Scott, S. 2007. Multiple perspectives for inquiry-based music education. *Musicien Educateur au Canada*, 49(2), 35-38.

Scott, S. 2009. Exploring an inquiry- based stance for planning and instruction in general music education. *General Music Today*, 21(3), 13-17.

Scott, S. 2011. Contemplating a constructive stance for active learning within music education. *Arts Education Policy Review*, 112(4), 191-198.

Silverstein, L.B. & Layne, S. 2010. What is Arts Integration? In L. Silverstein, A.L. Duma & S. Layne. *Arts Integration Schools: What, Why, and How* (1-7). Washington, D.C: The John F. Kennedy Center for Performing Arts/Changing Education Through the Arts (CETA) program.

Skosana, P.S. & Monyai, R.B. 2013. Learner-centred policies with reference to constructivism in the implementation of the curriculum. *International Journal of Humanities and Social Science Intervention*, 2(9), 51-58.

Snyder, S. 2001. Connection, correlation and integration. *Music Educators Journal*, 87(5), 32-39.

Soudien, C. & Sayed, Y. 2004. Managing our transition: Cultures of implementation and their challenges. *A speech delivered at the AMASA conference*. Cape Town: University of Cape Town.

South Africa, National Department of Education. 2002. *Revised National Curriculum Statement Grades R-9 (Schools) overview*. Pretoria: National Department of Education.

South Africa, National Department of Education. 2009. Report of the Task Team of the Review of the Implementation of the National Curriculum Statement. Pretoria: National Department of Education.

South Africa, National Department of Basic Education. 2011. *Curriculum and Assessment Policy Statement for Life Skills*. Pretoria. National Department of Education.

Stanovich, K. 2007. How to think straight about psychology: (8thed.). Boston, MA: Allyn & Bacon.

Stears, M. & Gopal, N. 2010. Exploring alternative assessment strategies in science classrooms. *South African Journal of Education*, 30: 591-604.

Still, K., & Bobis, J. 2005. The integration of mathematics and music in the primary school classroom. In P. Clarkson, A. Downton, D. Gronn, M. Horne, A. McDonough, R. Pierce & A. Roche (Eds.). *Proceedings of Annual Conference of the Mathematics Education Research Group of Australasia. Building Connections: Theory, Research and Practice* (pp. 712-719). Melbourne: Deakin University Press.

Strauss, J. & Myburgh, C.P.H. 2001. Centre for distance education, Faculty of Education and Nursing, Training and Development. *Research Methodology Study Guide 81416*. Johannesburg: Rand Afrikaans University.

Strydom, H. 2011. Ethical aspects of research in the social sciences and human service professions. In A.S. De Vos, H. Strydom, C.B. Fouché & C.L.S. Delport (Eds.). Research at grass roots: For the social sciences and human service professions. Pretoria: Van Schaik.113-129.

Strydom, H. & Delport, C.S.L. 2011. Sampling and pilot study in qualitative research. In A.S. De Vos, H.Strydom, C.B.Fouché & C.L.S. Delport (Eds.). *Research at grass roots: For the social sciences and human service professions*. Pretoria: Van Schaik. 390-396.

Suzuki, S. 2007. Suzuki violin school volume 2. USA: Alfred Music Publishing

Terre Blanche, M., Kelly, K. & Dürrheim, K. 2006. Why qualitative research? In M.Terre Blanche, K. Dürrheim & P. Painter (Eds.). *Research in practice: Applied methods for the social sciences*. Cape Town: University of Cape Town. 271-284.

Thorsen, S. 2002. The second liberation struggle –cultural identities in South African music education. *Swedish Journal of Musicology*, 84: 1-14.

Trinick, R.M. 2011. Sound and Sight: The Use of Song to Promote Language Learning. *General Music Today*, 25(2), 5-10.

Unluer, S. 2012. Being an insider researcher while conducting case study research. *The Qualitative Report*, 17(58), 1-14.

Van Blerk, S. 2007. *Teachers' perceptions of the implementation of the Arts and Culture Learning Area in the Senior Phase* (Master's dissertation).Port Elizabeth: Nelson Mandela Metropolitan University.

Van Deventer, K. 2009. Perspectives of teachers on the implementation of Life Orientation in Grades R-11 from selected Western Cape schools. *South African Journal of Education*, 29: 127 -145.

Van Vreden, M. 2016. Maestro for a moment: A conceptual framework for music integration in Grade R. *South African Journal of Childhood Education*, 6(1)1-10.

Van Vuuren, E.J. 2010. Subject music in rural South African schools: Challenges and solutions within a comparative context (Doctoral thesis). Pretoria: University of Pretoria.

Van Vuuren, E.J & Van Niekerk, C. 2015. Music in the Life Skills classroom. *British Journal of Music Education*. 32(3), 273-289.

Vermeulen, D. 2009. *Implementing music in an integrated curriculum for South African Primary schools* (Doctoral thesis). Pretoria: University of Pretoria.

Vermeulen, D., Klopper, C. & Van Niekerk, C. 2011. South-South comparisons: a syntegrated approach to the teaching of arts from primary school teacher preparation in South Africa and Australia. *Arts Education Policy Review*, 112: 199-205.

Vygotsky, L. 1978. *Mind in Society: the development of higher psychological processes*. Cambridge. Cambridge, Mass: Harvard University Press.

Wassenaar, D.R. 2006. Ethical issues in social science research. In M. Terre Blanche, K. Dürrheim, & D. Painter (Eds.). *Research in Practice: Applied methods for the social sciences*. Cape Town: University of Cape Town.60-79.

West, C. 2012. Teaching music in an era of high stakes testing and budget reductions. *Arts Education Policy Review*, 113(2), 75-79.

Wood, D., Bruner, J. S. & Ross, G. 1976. The role of tutoring in problem solving. *Journal of Child Psychology and Psychiatry*, *17*(1), 89–100.

Woodward, S.C. 2007. Nation building-one child at a time: Early childhood music education in South Africa. *Arts Education Policy Review, 109*(2), 33–42.

Appendix A. Semi-structured interview schedule

- 1. What music education experience did you have as a Foundation Phase educator before the introduction of CAPS?
- 2. When you realised that music should be implemented within CAPS in your phase, how did you feel?
- 3. What are the main challenges you experienced in teaching music within CAPS?
- 4. How do you integrate Music with other disciplines and subjects?
- 5. To what extent and how do you involve learners during Music lessons?
- 6. In your own experience, what are the positive aspects of teaching Music within CAPS?
- 7. In your own words, what methodologies have you already effected to enhance your efforts to implement Music in your classroom?
- 8. In what ways do you think that the formal training of educators in music could improve the implementation of Music in the Foundation Phase? Please elaborate
- 9. In your own experience, what effect did the assistance of the North West Department of Education have regarding the implementation of Music according to the requirements of CAPS? Please elaborate
- 10. What would you like to see changed or added regarding the implementation of Music in the Foundation Phase Curriculum?

Appendix B. Observation schedule

Aspects which will be observed	Comments
Music integration approach.	
Educators' Music facilitation skills	
3. Types of Music activities and learner involvement.	
Aspects which educators find challenging regarding the facilitation of Music activities.	

Appendix C. Application for permission: particina in recent



Faculty of Humanities Department of Music Date:

The Manager (Madikwe Circuit)
North West Department of Education

Dear Sir/Madam

I am a Master's student at the University of Pretoria, and I hereby kindly request your permission to conduct research at Mokgatlha Primary School in order to research the following topic.

Title of the study: Implementing Music according to the Curriculum and Assessment Policy Statement (CAPS): Experiences of Foundation Phase educators

Background to the study:

The Curriculum in South Africa has changed dramatically during the last few years. Instead of separate syllabi for each subject in the Foundation Phase, educators are now expected in the current Curriculum and Assessment Policy Statement (CAPS) to implement music within CAPS in the subject Life Skills. The new curriculum places high demands on Foundation Phase educators and it is imperative to explore experiences of Foundation Phase educators regarding implementing music within CAPS with the view to assist with relevant and effective pedagogies.

Research procedures:

The voluntary participation of the school in this study will involve individual interviews of 60 minutes each with a Grade 1, Grade 2 and Grade 3 educator, respectively. Interviews will be arranged at a time which will not disrupt the normal functioning of the school, and which will be convenient for each educator. All interviews will be audio recorded. Furthermore, the research entails a class observation of one Music lesson (of approximately 25 minutes) presented by each educator. These lessons will be audio-visually recorded. Lastly, I plan to do an analysis of documents related to teachers' preparation, such as class time tables, music lesson plans and a sample of learners' workbooks from each grade.

Risks, confidentiality and rights of participants

Information that will be disclosed during interviews is not foreseen to be of a sensitive nature. Apart from the time which class observations, document analysis and an interview may take, participation should not involve any disadvantages or risks to the school and participants. Although the identities of the participants are known to me, all information will be treated as strictly confidential and participants' identities will not be disclosed in any of the research outputs. Participants are free to withdraw from the study at any time with no consequences whatsoever. Only the supervisor and I will have access to the data. Data will be stored safely at the

University of Pretoria for 15 years, during which time it may be reused for further research purposes.

Benefits of participation in the study

The study will provide more insight into the implementation of Music according to according to the requirements of the CAPS document. The outcomes of this study will be made available to any interested participants, including the office of the principal and the circuit manager.

I hope that you will favourably consider this request for participation in this research.

Yours sincerely,

Kagiso Lerumo (MMus student)

Contact details of study leader:

Prof. Theo van Wyk Tel: (012) 420-2602

E-mail: Theodore.vanwyk@up.ac.za

lerumo.kagiso2@gmail.com

Contact details of researcher:

Kagiso Lerumo (MMus Student)

Tel: 073 240 8157 E-mail:

Appendix D. Letter of informed consent - Principal



Faculty of Humanities Department of Music Date:

The Principal
Mokgatlha Primary School
P.O. Box 9342
Mokgatlha
2848

Dear Sir/Madam

I am a Master's student at the University of Pretoria, and I hereby kindly request your permission to conduct research at Mokgatlha Primary School in order to research the following topic.

Title of the study: Implementing music with according to the Curriculum and Assessment Policy Statement (CAPS): Experiences of foundation phase educators

Background to the study:

The Curriculum in South Africa has changed dramatically during the last few years. Instead of separate syllabi for each subject in the Foundation Phase, educators are now expected in the current Curriculum and Assessment Policy Statement (CAPS) to implement music according to the requirements of CAPS in the subject Life Skills. The new curriculum places high demands on Foundation Phase educators and it is imperative to explore experiences of Foundation Phase educators regarding implementing music with the view to assist with relevant and effective pedagogies.

Research procedures:

The voluntary participation of your school in this study will involve three Foundation Phase educators from a grade 1, grade 2 and grade 3 class respectively. Each educator will be required to participate in a 60 minutes interview. The interview will be arranged at a time which will not disrupt the normal functioning of the school as well as at a time which is convenient for the educator. The interview will be audio recorded. Furthermore, the research entails a classroom observation of a 25 minute Music lesson taught by each of the three educators. The lessons will be video recorded.

Risks, confidentiality and rights of participants

Information that will be disclosed during interviews is not foreseen to be of a sensitive nature. Apart from the time which interviews may take, participation should not involve any disadvantages or risks to the school and participants. The name of the school as well as the identities of the participants will be kept strictly confidential and will not be revealed in any of the research outputs. Participants are free to

withdraw from the study at any time without any ill consequences. Only the supervisor and I will have access to the data. Data will be stored safely at the University of Pretoria for 15 years, during which time it may be reused for further research purposes.

Benefits of participation in the study:

The study will provide more insight regarding implementing Music according to the requirements of CAPS. The outcomes of this study will be made available to any interested participants including the office of the principal and the circuit manager.

I hope that you will consider this request for participation in this research favourably. Yours sincerely,

Kagiso Lerumo (MMus student)

Contact details of study leader:

Prof. Theo van Wyk Tel: (012) 420-2602

E-mail: Theodore.vanwyk@up.ac.za

Contact details of researcher:

Kagiso Lerumo (MMus Student)

Tel: 073 240 8157

Email: lerumo.kagiso2@gmail.com

Appendix E. Letter of informed consent - Educators



Faculty of Humanities Department of Music Date:

Dear Sir/Madam

I am a Masters' student at the University of Pretoria, and I hereby kindly request your permission to participate in a research in order to investigate the following topic.

Title of the study: Implementing music with according to the Curriculum and Assessment Policy Statement (CAPS): Experiences of foundation phase educators

Background to the study:

The Curriculum in South Africa has changed dramatically during the last few years. Instead of separate syllabi for each subject in the Foundation Phase, educators are now expected in the current Curriculum and Assessment Policy Statement (CAPS) to implement music according to the requirements of CAPS in the subject Life Skills. The new curriculum places high demands on Foundation Phase educators and it is imperative to explore experiences of Foundation Phase educators regarding implementing music with the view to assist with relevant and effective pedagogies.

Research procedures:

Your participation in this research will include an interview, an observation of a lesson as well as studying documents.

- Firstly, an individual interview of 60 minutes will be conducted with you which will be audio recorded. The interview will be arranged at a time which will not disrupt the normal functioning of the school as well as at a time which is convenient for you. After I have transcribed the interview, I will ask you to read it to verify that it is a true reflection of your views.
- Secondly, I would like to observe you while you are presenting a Music lesson of 25 minutes to learners. This lesson will be video recorded to allow for a more detailed capturing of information.
- Lastly, I request to study your Music lesson plans and a sample of your learners' workbooks.

Possible risks or disadvantage for participation in this study:

Information that will be disclosed during interviews is not foreseen to be of a sensitive nature. Apart from the time which interviews may take, participation should not involve any disadvantages or risks to you or the learners. Your identity and that of the school and the learners will be kept strictly confidential and will not be revealed in any of the research outputs.

Benefits of participation in the study:

The study will provide more insight regarding implementing Music according to the requirements of CAPS. The outcomes of this study will be made available to any interested participants including the office of the principal and the circuit manager.

Rights of participants and confidentiality

Your consent in these matters would be greatly appreciated and would enable me to gain important information concerning implementing Music within CAPS. No confidential information will be requested, and all information provided during the interview, classroom observation and document analysis will be treated with strict confidentiality. Audio and video recordings will be stored securely and no one except my study supervisor and I will have access to such recordings or to any information derived from document analysis. The identities of all participants and the school will be kept strictly confidential and will not be revealed in any of the research outputs. You will be able to withdraw from participating in this research at any time, with no ill-consequence whatsoever. Only the super and I will have access to the data. Data will be stored safely at the University if Pretoria for 15 years, during which time it may be reused for further research purposes.

Yours sincerely,	
Kagiso Lerumo (MN	/lus student)

Contact details of study leader:

Prof. Theo van Wyk Tel: (012) 420-2602

E-mail: Theodore.vanwyk@up.ac.za

Contact details of researcher:

Kagiso Lerumo (MMus Student)

Tel: 073 240 8157

E-mail: lerumo.kagiso2@gmail.com

Informed consent form - Educators

	ate in this study, please sign this letter as a declaration of lete and return the section below.
that the researcher may stuplans and learners' workbo The interview will be The music lesson I p I will be provided wit All information will be My identity will not b I may withdraw at ar No one but the study data; The data will be stor	, hereby give my d and observed as described above. I also give consent dy documents related to my teaching, such as lesson oks. I have been made aware of the following: audio-recorded; resent will be video-recorded; a transcript of the interview to verify my views; a treated confidentially; revealed in any of the research outputs; by stage of the research process with no ill-consequence; a supervisor and the researcher will have access to the red safely at the University of Pretoria for a period of 15 time it may be reused for further research purposes.
Name of participant: Signature of participant: Date:	
MMus student: Signature of student: Date:	
Supervisor: Signature of supervisor: Date:	

Appendix F. Letter of informed assent f



Faculty of Humanities
Department of Music
Date:

Dear Learner

I am glad to inform you that you have been selected to participate in one Music lesson which will be presented right here at your school. This is part of a project that I am doing at University of Pretoria for a Master's degree. I will observe your teacher while she is doing music lessons with your class, and the session will be 25 minutes long. The lesson will be audio-visually recorded so that I can see how learners respond to the music activities. I will also look at your workbooks.

You can stop taking part in the project at any time, and nothing unpleasant will happen should you choose to stop. I will not give your name to anybody reading about my research project. Nobody, except for me and my study leader, will be allowed to see the video recording or your work.

am confident that you wi	Il enjoy the music lessons!
Kindly,	
Kagiso Lerumo	

Appendix G. Letter of informed consent for parents/guardians



Faculty of Humanities Department of Music Date: _____

Dear Parent/Guardian

I am a Master's student at the University of Pretoria, and I hereby kindly request your permission to include your child in a research project in order to investigate the following topic.

Title of the study : Implementing Music according to the Curriculum and Assessment Policy Statement (CAPS): Experiences of foundation phase educators
Your child
Your consent for your child to participate in this project would be sincerely

Your consent for your child to participate in this project would be sincerely appreciated. Should you respond in the affirmative, your child will participate in one Music lesson of 25 minutes, presented by the school teacher, which I will observe. The lesson will be audio-visually recorded. I will also look at workbooks and worksheets which learners have completed during music lessons. Your child's identity will not be revealed in any way, and only my supervisor and I will have access to the data. The video recording will be stored in a secure place at the University of Pretoria for a period of 15 years. Should you have any questions or concerns, please do not hesitate to contact me or my supervisor.

Sincerely,

Kagiso Lerumo(MMus student)

Contact details of study leader:

Prof. Theo van Wyk Tel: (012) 420-2602

E-mail: Theodore.vanwyk@up.ac.za

Contact details of researcher:

Kagiso Lerumo (MMus Student)

Tel: 073 240 8157

E-mail: lerumo.kagiso2@gmail.com

Informed consent form - Parents/Guardians

Please complete and return this page:
I,
 recordings. The video-recordings will be stored for 15 years at the University of Pretoria during which time it may be reused for further research purposes. My child may discontinue with participation at any time with no negative consequences.
Signature of parent/legal guardian:
Date:

Appendix H. Research Ethics Committee Clearance Letter



Faculty of Humanities Research Ethics Committee

29 July 2016

Dear Prof Johnson

Project:

Implementing Music according to the Curriculum and

Assessment Policy Statement (CAPS): Experiences of

Foundation Phase educators

Researcher:

KS Lerumo

Supervisor:

Prof Theo van Wyk

Department:

Music

Reference number:

98309995(GW20160712HS)

Thank you for the application that was submitted for ethical consideration.

I am pleased to inform you that the above application was approved by the Research Ethics Committee on 28 July 2016. Data collection may therefore commence.

Please note that this approval is based on the assumption that the research will be carried out along the lines laid out in the proposal. Should the actual research depart significantly from the proposed research, it will be necessary to apply for a new research approval and ethical clearance.

The Committee requests you to convey this approval to the researcher.

We wish you success with the project.

Sincerely

Prof Maxi Schoeman

Deputy Dean: Postgraduate Studies and Ethics

MMShirm

Faculty of Humanities

UNIVERSITY OF PRETORIA

e-mail:tracey.andrew@up.ac.za

Kindly note that your original signed approval certificate will be sent to your supervisor via the Head of Department. Please liaise with your supervisor.

Research Ethics Committee Members: Prof MME Schoeman (Deputy Dean); Prof KL Harris; Dr L Blokland; Dr R Fasselt; Ms KT Govinder; Dr E Johnson; Dr C Panebianco; Dr C Puttergill; Dr D Reyburn; Prof GM Spies; Prof E Taljard; Ms B Tsebe; Dr E van der Klashorst; Mr V Sithole

Appendix I. Arts Cluster Postgraduate Research Committee approval letter



UNIVERSITY OF PRETORIA
Pretoria 0002. South Africa, Tel 012 420
4111
e-mail: http://www.up.ac.za
Faculty of Humanities

Arts Cluster Postgraduate Research
Committee

12-04-2016

Dear Mr Lerumo

Thank you for the application that was submitted for review. I am pleased to inform you that your research proposal was **approved with comments** by the Arts Cluster Postgraduate Research Committee on **12 April 2016**.

Comments:

Reviewer 1

This is a very interesting study and a well written proposal.

P2 par 1 Briefly clarify the controversies at stake P2 Par 2 'Certain' changes - namely?

Literature review could be a touch clearer i.t.o. identifying main sources and discussing their particular relevance, but I would leave it as is as the information is there.

Reviewer 2

This is a well-constructed and outlined study. Congratulations to the study leader and the candidate.

This study is situated to investigate and focus on the experiences of Foundation Phase educators regarding the implementation of Music. This is explored to assess the efficacy of implementing Music according to the requirements of the Curriculum and Assessment Policy Statement (CAPS). In addition to the research aim, I wonder if the remarks below may not strengthen this study's positionality. These suggestions should be facilitated according to the discretion of the candidate and supervisor:

- 1) How can the candidate see/define/position the role of Music pedagogy as critical within the South-African context or within the South-African educational system?
- 2) I wonder if the candidate can demonstrate broadly the conceptual and tangible factors that will necessitate how the acquisition of music, as motor skills may contribute to enhanced social development, functioning and so on. This is specifically pertinent as the candidate states on p 4 that music educators was encouraged to teach music in a more

constructivist or even transactional manner. So perhaps the reasoning of what I suggest above may strengthen the benefit hereof for students.

3) Furthering to this, on p 5 the very implication of "appreciation of the arts" captured in CAPS should propel the candidate to critical engage with this notion. This very notion is problematic and highlights a generic and almost institutionalized motivation by the South-African Department of basic education. The candidate should be motivated to challenge this to at least provide a conceptual engagement, awareness and nuanced motivation why music education should be explored in schools as part of foundation phase education. Perhaps even, how does or can arts education (music) contribute to mobilizing individuals to become active participants in their own learning. Schön's (1987) ideas on self-reflection, participation, or stimulating self-reliance in education may be of benefit here. This will definitely strengthen this study as the CAPS document already alludes to learning that should take place in an integrated manner. Music teaching or the Arts already contributes to whole brain learning strategies. This argument can significantly strengthen this study's position.

In short, what I would like this study to do, in a brief way even, without expanding the scope of the study is a short literary review to explicate how the application of music skills as part of Foundation Phase education may contribute to social skills or whole brain learning strategies. This is perhaps not for the teachers, but the knowledge hereof can optimize the pedagogical strategy and the teachers own knowledge in transactional exchange - of that should be or is the aim of the CAPS document.

I wish the candidate and supervisor the best with this study.

Please complete the Ethics Clearance online and make the changes as suggested for the Ethics Committee.

This approval is based on the assumption that the research will be carried out along the lines laid out in the proposal. Should the actual research depart significantly from the proposed research, it will be necessary to apply for a new research approval and ethical clearance.

Also make sure that your letter(s) of informed consent (if applicable) accompany the ethics application and include information on re-use of data for further research and that data will be stored for a minimum of 15 years in the department.

This approval letter from the cluster committee must also be attached to this application.

We wish you success with the project. Sincerely,

Dr Chris Broodryk

artsproposals@up.ac.za

Chair: Arts Cluster Postgraduate Research Committee

Appendix J. Music Department Research Committee approval letter



UNIVERSITY OF PRETORIA

Pretoria 0002. South Africa, Tel 012 420 4111

e-mail: http://www.up.ac.za

Faculty of Humanities

Music Department Research Committee

9 October 2015

Dear Mr Lerumo

I am pleased to inform you that your proposal was **approved** the **Music Department's** Research Committee on **9 October 2015**. Please submit your final proposal via e-mail for cluster approval to: artsproposals@up.ac.za. After cluster approval you may proceed with the online application for ethical clearance.

We wish you success with the project.

Alexander F. Johnson

Sincerely,

Prof Alexander Johnson

Chair: Music Department Research Committee

Appendix K. Letter of informed consent

01/01/2006 00:00

0145070044

MOKGATLHA

PAGE 01/01

EMIS no.: 600101320

Stad section

Mokgatlha

2848

Tel: 014 507 0044

SEKOLOPOTLANA SA MOKGATLHA MOKGATLHA PRIMARY SCHOOL MOKGATLHA LAERSKOOL



P. O Box 9342

Mokgatlha

2848

Fax: 086 715 2445/086 766 4518

E-mail:

600101320mokgatlhaprimary@gmail.com

Τo

30

._

: Mr. K. S Lerumo

From

: Mokgatlha Primary School

Subject

: PERMISSION TO CONDUCT RESEARCH SURVEY

Date

: 11 August 2015

Receipt of your correspondence regarding the afore-going matter is hereby acknowledged. The content is noted and accordingly, approval granted for you to conduct the research as requested.

Please take note that such permission is granted subject to the following provision.

- That you notify the Area Office and District Office concerned of your visit to our school.
- That you notify the educators of our school in advance to arrange logistics for your envisaged visits.
- That in the course of carrying out your research, such should not tamper with the normal process of learning and teaching.
- That you will make your research product available to the school and NW Department of Education should you be requested to do so.

With my best wishes.

Kindest Regards

M. P Mogale

Acting Principal

PRIMARY
SCHOOL
OFFICE OF THE PRINCIPAL

2015 -09- 1
School stamp
TELIFAX: 014 507 0044
STAD SECTION
KOFFIEKRAAL 2848