

CHAPTER TWO

LITERATURE REVIEW

2.1 A brief overview of relevant material accessed

In the process of attempting to draw together the many threads that constitute the fabric of a thesis concerning syllabus compilation, the writer accessed a fairly disparate and divergent selection of material. The selection is disparate, largely on account of the fact that there is comparatively little in the way of published material on the precise subject of compiling syllabuses for use in evaluating musicians who are already in a professional position; divergent because of factors *outside* the purely musical and instrumental that need to be taken into account, such as the sociological factors arising as a result of South Africa's recent political and economic history, which are mentioned in the following chapter, and further commented upon in Chapter 7.

After due investigation, this writer has come to the conclusion that very little material that suggests modifications to the instrumentation of parade or "marching" bands has been published, in spite of the observations of a number of bandmasters in this country who have been interviewed on the subject (Wright, Coetzer, Stevenson, Katz, Clayton, Pienaar, etc.). Anthony Baines (1957) incorporates opinions and guidelines in his *History of Woodwind Instruments*, but the present writer has found little in the way of outright proposals in that regard. Similarly, other than the Trinity College (King 2002) article quoted in this chapter, very little has been committed to writing on the subject of repertoire choice for wind and percussion evaluation syllabuses.

Current literature, as well as relevant material dating back to the 1950s, relating to the new paradigm of the Concert Wind Band as well as evaluation criteria of individual performance, was reviewed. The writer considered it

apposite to consult the various entries on military bands that have appeared in post-World War II times. These include the views of:

- Conductors such as Frederic Fennell;
- Composers such as Vincent Persichetti and Gordon Jacob;
- Authors of orchestration books such as Hector Ernest Adkins, Walter Piston, Josef Wagner, Cecil Forsyth and Stephen Douglas Burton;
- Specialists in wind instruments such as Anthony Baines, Archie Camden, Philip Bate, Stuart Dempster, Edward Kleinhammer, Donald Knaub, Lindsay Langwill, Geoffrey Rendall, Reginald Morley-Pegge, Larry Teal and Denis Wick;
- Band specialists such as Anthony Baines, James Walker and Harold Hind.

Also taken into consideration was the present writer's empirical experience in the field of wind instruments, their repertoire, and the various ensembles formed by them. Input received from various professionals in the field (referred to in a separate list) has likewise contributed to the conclusions reached in this study. To use a phrase of Geoffrey Sharp (1949: 310), much perspective was gleaned and "distilled from widely-ranging experience."

In order to gain a reasonably international perspective on standards and, to a lesser extent, repertoire, the grade and diploma syllabuses of a number of music-examining bodies were reviewed.

2.2 The development of the Wind Ensemble

While the researcher is by no means overwhelmed with literature on the subject, a significant amount of information pertaining to the development and evolution of wind bands, concert bands, military bands, and the symphonic wind ensemble has been written over the past half-century.

The article on Military Bands in Volume V of the 1954 edition of Grove's *Dictionary of Music and Musicians*, written by Harold C Hind (1954: 766-772), concerns itself largely with historical aspects of military bands. It is, however, extremely informative on the subject of the numbers of instruments employed in the most prominent military bands of the immediately post-war period. It is also clear that a number of conditions that obtained at that time are no longer the norm today, particularly in South African bands of the early 21st century. While internationalism in music has not entirely supplanted nationalism as far as instrumentation is concerned, the function of military bands as described in Hind's article is still almost purely military in nature, and few signs of the emerging, broader-based "entertainment" function of said units is discernable.

While wind ensembles in various forms and guises have existed since Renaissance times, it is only in the second half of the 20th century that the symphonic wind band or ensemble has consolidated into a partially standardised format. While the instrumentation is very much that of an augmented "military" band, it is the paradigm shift away from the "military" connotations that characterises this musical body.

While it may be argued on the one hand that the symphonic wind ensemble is an attempt to create an orchestra *sans* strings, the other point of view has it that, in the absence of upper strings at least, the winds are now afforded the opportunity of realising their full potential as soloists as well as *tutti* instruments. This viewpoint is confirmed in the article on the concert wind band by Hind and Baines in the New Grove's *Dictionary of Music and Musicians* (2nd edition, Vol 12) (Baines/Hind 1980: 316).

The "wind symphony" is a recent American modification [of the 'military' band] dedicated to the performance of weightier compositions and transcriptions, and giving **equal opportunities to players of each orchestral wind instrument**

[...] extra clarinetists are easily switched to alto, bass and contrabass clarinets [emphasis added by the present writer].

This contrasts significantly with the entry in the 1954 edition, which is content with the following description of wind ensembles as a whole (Hind 1954: 766):

The term "military band" is applied primarily to bands associated with the armed forces, but also to civilians bands of similar instrumentation.

In the 2nd edition of the *New Grove*, Raoul Camus (2001: 689) mentions that some special academy bands in the USA "may have as many as 165 members."

It is a well-known phenomenon of modern musical history that, during the 20th century, it was chiefly the instrumental teaching programmes in United States schools – both primary and secondary – that gave rise to both the burgeoning and the ubiquity of the wind ensemble. A full sufficiency of young – and, for the most part, competent – players emerged, and performance opportunities had to be created for them. A full "orchestra" of winds and percussion very soon became the norm, operating in parallel with the school's symphony orchestra. In due course this momentum spread to the United Kingdom, although it is by no means as common at school level as in North America. The only facet that does not appear to have been standardised is the nomenclature. "Symphonic Wind Band", "Wind Ensemble", "Concert Wind Band" are all names that enjoy currency in the first decade of the 21st century. These names came about during the second half of the last century in order "to distinguish the strictly musical functions" of the school or college wind band from those of a military or purely entertainment band (Apel 1970: 821). Slight differences in instrumentation are encountered between these non-military wind bands – for instance, the inclusion of string basses and/or instruments such as the contra-bassoon and contra clarinets.

Further perspective on the issues of both nomenclature and function can be gained from the entry on the symphonic band in *The Harvard Dictionary of Music* (Apel 1970: 821):

Today's larger groups, connected with or representing specific branches of the armed services, are highly polished ensembles, able to perform deftly the most difficult contemporary wind literature. Indeed, in England the term "military band" has become synonymous with the "concert" or "symphonic" band of the United States, since only the larger branches of the service can support an adequate instrumentation.

While this comment was written 35 years ago, it indicates this paradigm shift that has taken place since the 1950s regarding the expanded performing nature of service bands in the Western world. The revised edition of 1986 amplifies and rewords the entry slightly:

An ensemble of as many as 50 or more woodwind, brass and percussion instruments, sometimes with the addition of a double-bass [...] with a significant number of [newly composed works] by composers of concert music generally (Randel 1986: 819-820).

Additional perspective is provided by the description of British composer Gordon Jacob, known as a prolific writer for winds, who wrote as follows of the American Symphonic Band (Jacob 1955: 67):

This is a much more lavish affair than the British military band [...]. The bass line is richer by far than in our bands, as a comparison of the lists of instrument shows. The whole outfit makes a fine array and an imposing sound. There is a vigorous effort being made to interest composers of advanced serious music in writing for it and one British composer at least has been commissioned to do so.

Significantly, it is the "additional" instruments – the low woodwinds in particular – that make these desirable qualities a reality. Jacob points out the necessity of adopting an encouraging attitude towards – and having a positive effect on – potential audiences "hovering on the border-line of appreciation" (Jacob 1955: 117). As observed in the preceding chapter, the move in South African service bands' literature choice and instrumentation was to be towards a more expanded adaptation of what had paved the way to the *status quo* of 1998. It was at this juncture that the present writer became involved in the process, being appointed syllabus coordinator by the Senior Staff Officer of the Army (Music and Ceremonial) and Chairman of IDMAC, Col Kevin Williams.

The first edition of Cecil Forsyth's *Orchestration* was published in 1914. This book, though first published over 90 years ago, should by no means be regarded as antiquarian. It contains accurate accounts of that which was considered the "norm" in orchestral and band music practices of its era, and, on page 245, delivers a useful corroboration of the present writer's contention concerning the use of the bass clarinet in military bands (this issue is addressed in Chapter 5.2.2 and 5.2.3.)

Walter Piston, in his *Orchestration* of 1955, discusses the methods of reading musical notation on the bass clarinet (treble clef, transposing a major 9th, or bass clef, transposing a major 2nd), claiming that "Bass clarinetists, as a group, do not show a preference for either way [of reading]" (Piston 1955: 179).

The present writer is inclined to take issue with this statement. While it may well have been true in the United States in the mid-1950s, this is by no means the case today. The clear majority of players of which the present writer – himself a professional bass clarinetist – has knowledge, prefers the first method of reading staff notation, that is, reading in the treble clef (as is the case with the ordinary Bb clarinet), transposing a major 9th. The second

method, though still necessitated on occasions in certain scores, is regarded as an inconvenience.

From a sociological viewpoint, it is also questionable whether one can pinpoint the predilections of *any* assemblage of bass clarinetists "as a group", as specialists on this demanding instrument are of an even more individual disposition than other woodwind players. The obtaining of consensus on such an issue as the above would, in the writer's estimation, be a hard-won achievement.

Burton (1982: 138), on the other hand, writes of the bass clarinet: "Most instruments in the West [...] have the same written range as the [soprano] clarinet, with the addition of a (written) Eb at the bottom of the range".

This is not altogether correct. While all alto and bass clarinets of current manufacture are equipped with a low Eb key (in contrast to pre-1940 instruments that descended only to written Eb), top-of-the range basses descend to written low C (concert Bb). This holds true for both Boehm and Oehler system instruments. The firms of Leblanc (France) and Conn (USA) used to manufacture a model to low D (concert C) in the 1950s-1970s. A bass clarinet with a range further extended to low Bb (concert Ab) was designed by the clarinetist Rosario Mazzeo of the Boston Symphony Orchestra in the 1950s (who also brought about improvements to the "throat" Bb on the Bb clarinet). The writer has not yet been able to ascertain how many instruments were actually produced or how many remain extant (Piston 1982: 178).

This somewhat specialised discussion of the bass clarinet serves *inter alia* to emphasize the increasing attention being paid to the formerly "under-utilised" winds and their accommodation in wind ensembles of all sizes. It also serves to illustrate the enthusiasm that players of this instrument -

having metaphorically clasped this "wooden serpent"* to their bosom – have for it.

Burton (1982: 425) characterises concert or symphonic bands as usually performing "more original, serious and difficult repertoire than other bands"; this was precisely the type of repertoire aimed for by the selection panels in the compilation of *Syllabus 2000*. Burton (1982: 427) continues with the statement "The Military band can be either a concert band or a marching band and often players are called upon for service in both"; this is very much the state of affairs that obtains in South African service bands today.

The pattern that emerges from the above-mentioned writings as a group, is that a burgeoning of *non*-military wind groups of varying dimensions – but with largely concurring instrumentation – has become the Western norm rather than the exception in the post-war period. This in no way impinges on either the status or the current number of specifically *military* bands, which continue to operate as "service" bands, albeit in a somewhat less traditional and somewhat more public-oriented manner.

What does strike the present writer as significant is the growing acknowledgement of what Burton (1982: 192) refers to as the "auxiliary" woodwinds: the piccolo, English horn (*cor anglais*), bass clarinet, and contrabassoon.

In addition, thanks to the introduction of the Provincial Education Departments' Music Centres in the 1970s, student wind bands have become the norm in the secondary school environment, at least in the major urban centres where sustained education in the playing of orchestral and band instruments exists.

* The early model of bass clarinet by Nicola Papalini (1810) was in fact "curved in serpentine fashion" (Rendall 1978: 141).

2.3 Specialised literature on wind instruments

The appearance of the type of highly specialised book referred to in this subsection is by no means a regular occurrence, and "successors" to these highly specialised volumes should not be expected with any degree of frequency. It is the writer's observation that perhaps only once a decade, on average, can the musical public reasonably expect a volume of this calibre to appear. The reason for this allegation will be found, principally, in the very personal approach the various authors have taken in relating what amounts to their life's experience in the chosen field.

Underscoring this contention is the fact that the publishers concerned made a point of commissioning a relatively small number of carefully selected experts at the time (1957-1980), and the entire literary project took a decade or more to complete: nearly two decades, in the case of the Ernest Benn series mentioned below. Additionally, with the almost sole exception of Wilhelm Heckel's *Der Fagott* (1931), a singular deficiency or even absence of books on the subject of individual wind instruments existed in the first half of the 20th century. It is the present writer's impression that a fairly lengthy gestation period is necessary in most cases, and it would be unreasonable – and unrealistic – to expect a plethora of books on these specific subjects to appear at anything like regular intervals.

Having said that, the writer has found the books of Anthony Baines to have been a fountainhead of knowledge, erudition and enthusiasm over the past half century or more. His *Woodwind Instruments and their History* (1957) and later *Musical Instruments* (1961) provided the present writer with oases in the intellectual desert that had previously been assuaged only by Curt Sachs' *The History of Musical Instruments* mentioned in the previous paragraph – his first book in English.

Baines' fascinating book of 1957 is virtually timeless in its intricate descriptions of the mechanism and characteristics of the widest possible spectrum of woodwind instruments. The enthusiasm with which the author writes on his chosen subject, has been a very real source of inspiration to enthusiasts and scholars alike for almost five decades, the present writer included.

Further reference sources, listed for convenience in score order, are:

- F Geoffrey Rendall. 1978. *The Clarinet*. London: Ernest Benn.
- Jack Brymer. 1979. *The Clarinet*. London: Macdonald and Jane's.
- Lindsey L Langwill. 1965. *The Bassoon and Contrabassoon*. London: Benn.
- Will Jansen. 1978. *The Bassoon* (5 volumes). Buren: Fritz Knuf.
- Archie Camden. 1965. *Bassoon Technique*. London: O.U.P.
- Larry Teal. 1969. *The Art of Saxophone Playing*. Evanston: Summy-Birchard.
- Reginald Morley-Pegge. 1973. *The French Horn*. London: Benn.
- Philip Bate. 1962. *The Trumpet and Trombone*. London: Benn.
- Denis Wick. 1965. *Trombone Technique*. London: O.U.P.
- Edward Kleinhammer. 1963. *The Art of Trombone Playing*. Evanston: Summy-Birchard.
- Donald Knaub. 1978. *Trombone Teaching Techniques*. Athens (Ohio): Accura.

Rendall has subtitled his book *Some Notes on its History and Construction*, and it contains a wealth of knowledge about the evolution of the clarinet in its various sizes, and its use in various ensembles. It also contains information on the bass clarinet which the present writer has not found duplicated elsewhere.

Brymer (1979: 192) contributes *inter alia* some extremely relevant views on the subject of doubling, stressing its necessity in the professional woodwind-playing world of today, and noting that "certainly, scores from across the

The reason behind the choice of these particular dates by Jooste is fairly obvious: 1652 is the year in which Jan van Riebeeck "colonised" the Cape; the first South African service band to take up permanent residence on the soil of the sub-continent was the SA Police Band, formed in 1904 (Coetzer 1999). Prior to this date, it appears that all military, concert or brass bands existing in South Africa had been either regimental (Dutch or British), volunteer, transitory or civilian in nature.

From the detail provided in Jooste's Summary of his thesis (Chapter 14), the clear picture emerges that while the initial influences were from Holland, it was the presence of British regimental bands that provided the impetus to the wind band movement in South Africa during the 19th century, leading eventually to the formation of the first SA Police Band as mentioned above and – some three decades later – the Bands of the SA Defence Force and their various arms of service.

The presence of British regimental bands not only ensured that wind(band) music was performed throughout the country, it stimulated the development of an intrinsic interest in wind music. With the encouragement of British conductors and band musicians, a large number of amateur wind groups were formed and the practice of wind playing became extremely popular within the South African community during the second half of the 19th century. This general awareness of culture even spread to outlying villages that were seldom – if ever – visited by British forces and bands, with the result that amateur wind bands became a regular occurrence and played a significant role in the (country's) musical life [...]. What is more, this general awareness of wind music even led to the formation of wind groups by the blacks [...]. (Jooste 1987: 371 – translation by the present writer).

Jooste also suggests a link between the early Cape Malay slaves' bands and the current "Cape Carnival" bands seen and heard in Cape Town traditionally on 2nd January every year (Jooste 1987: 371), pointing out that they, too, were

Atlantic seem to make the most remarkable demands of this sort." The present writer can attest to this in his personal capacity, having on occasions been confronted with instrumental parts calling for bassoon, Bb *and* bass clarinet and baritone saxophone (Reed V); alternatively, tenor saxophone, Bb clarinet, flute and oboe (Reed IV). In actual practice, doubling players tend to specialise in certain "groups" of instruments; in this particular case the writer was obliged to exclude the flute, and was less than comfortable on the oboe.

Brymer (1979: 209) wryly adds an observation that is pertinent to the military band: "Possibly the use of the [clarinet] as the mainstay of the music of the armies of most of the world accounts for [...] its sheer inert mass, with its resistance to the player's demands."

Another specialist who provides valuable perspective on doubling is saxophonist Larry Teal (1969: 95-97), dedicating an entire chapter to the subject in his *Art of Saxophone Playing*. Expanding on Brymer's statement, Teal (1969: 95) writes:

Doubling - an inadequate term, since the word implies only two [instruments]. Demands on both the present-day music educator and the professional performer often require that he be a "tripler" or a "quadrupler" and sometimes more ... much credit must be accorded the individual who acquires a working knowledge of all the wind instruments [...].

The disadvantages of doubling are apparent [...] however, the limits of individual versatility are constantly being extended, and there are many examples of a high degree of artistry on several instruments. A realistic view of the musical scene will reveal that the advantages outweigh the disadvantages.

We have much to learn from the traditions of woodwind performance, and the study of additional instruments cannot but improve both musicianship and concept.

The present writer can personally attest to the veracity of this last paragraph.

Langwill's *Bassoon and Contrabassoon* was the first really comprehensive book on the subject to be published in English. Its only contender is Wilhelm Heckel's previously-mentioned *Der Fagott* (1931), which Langwill translated into English during the 1930s. The use of the masculine article in the German title is deliberate; as Juritz (1958) notes, Herr Heckel would not countenance a neuter or feminine prefix to the *Fagotten* of his manufacture, regardless of grammatical protocol. An extremely informative volume on the full history of the bassoon in its various forms and guises, Langwill's book is particularly valuable for the list of solo music for bassoon and contrabassoon that forms Appendix III. Langwill acknowledges the assistance of William Waterhouse (UK), Gerald Corey and Don Christlieb (USA) in the compilation thereof.

A volume on the bassoon has been written by Archie Camden: *Bassoon Technique* (1965); however, as the title implies, this is chiefly pedagogic in content. This publication was extremely well-received on publication by amateur and professional alike, and describes the transition from the French (Buffet) to the German (Heckel) model of bassoon that took place in the UK during the post-war era. Interestingly, Camden did not play an instrument of Heckel's manufacture, but the slightly lighter-toned Adler, as did his contemporary Gwydion Brooke.

Jansen's monumental work of 1978 is a fund of information on players, designs, repertoire and variations of the bassoon and contrabassoon. The illustrations in Volume V of the work are of immense historical value, as is the research contained in the previous four volumes.

Morley-Pegge's book on the French horn covers the entire spectrum of the instrument's evolution in fascinating detail. Written by a true enthusiast and researcher, this book contains *inter alia* a particularly lucid explanation of both the rotary and the piston valve mechanisms, essential for the understanding of brass instruments from *circa* 1825 onwards. There is information on horn

players and manufacturers that is of great value to amateur and professional alike.

In addition to historical aspects contained in *The Trumpet and Trombone*, Bate (1962) manages to view these instruments in a balanced perspective, credibly reflecting the post-war status and activities of the instruments in Europe and, to a lesser extent, in the USA. The only other contemporary writing to achieve this that the present writer has come across in the case of the trombone is Denis Wick's *Trombone Technique* (OUP), published circa 1965.

While providing excellent literature lists for the tenor trombone, Edward Kleinhammer (1963: 106) encapsulates the specific repertoire situation for the *bass* trombone as it obtained in the mid-1960s:

Though somewhat limited in volume, literature written especially for the bass trombone can be augmented by material for the bassoon, tuba or 'cello [...]. The bass trombonist is generally required to manoeuvre in the tonal range of the tenor trombone in addition to the added lower tones of his instrument, so all literature for trombone is applicable to the bass trombonist.

Today, it is interesting to note that the published solo literature for bass trombone has at least trebled since the above was written. The present writer would, however, take issue with the highly respected Mr Kleinhammer concerning the tenor trombone literature being "applicable" to the bass. There is a fair number of works, both of the modern French school (published by Leduc) and contemporary North American composers, that can best be described as being unremittingly and unambiguously designed or intended for the higher tessitura and lighter tone quality of the *tenor* trombone. There is, in this writer's considered opinion, little point in pursuing this particular segment of the trombone literature on a large-bore bass trombone equipped with a Bach 1¼G or Schilke #59 or 60 mouthpiece. Today, a sufficiently wide-

ranging repertoire for the bass trombone does exist, and is readily obtainable. However, one should compare Kleinhammer's view with that of George in 2.7 below.

Kleinhammer (1963: 106) also comments on the trend towards the double-valve bass trombone, one which he was instrumental in initiating in the early 1960s:

Since the trend to the complete bass trombone with two valves has been gaining momentum, it is suggested to the players of these instruments that they alter the slide positions and valve markings of existing bass trombone methods [...] with reference to two-valve bass trombones [...].

The more widespread use of this heavier but more versatile bass trombone has, in the intervening 40 years, further enriched the capabilities of the concert band. Stuart Dempster (1979: 100/1) replicates a similar enthusiasm for the advent of the "double-trigger" bass trombone in his *Modern Trombone*:

[T]he fact that the "double trigger" instrument is now becoming very common among bass trombonists is something to be welcomed with opened arms [...]. [T]his [increase in technical facility] is affecting composers and how they write for bass trombone. It is bound to continue to help define the bass trombone as a separate entity [...].

Dempster, predominantly a solo recitalist rather than an orchestral player, actually had a second rotary valve fitted to his Conn symphony tenor trombone, making the instrument even more versatile in that regard. He has also done pioneering work in introducing the art of *Didjeridu* playing to Western audiences.

The current reality of the recognition of the fully chromatic bass trombone as a "separate entity" from the tenor instrument was a crucial factor in assembling the repertoire lists for that instrument in *Syllabus 2000*.

Donald Knaub (1978: 15), another highly respected performer and teacher who, co-incidentally, has recently retired at approximately the same time as Kleinhammer, considers the trombone to be "a recognised solo instrument with band, but feels that, "[A]s far as I'm concerned, [it] cannot compete with the piano, voice, violin or 'cello as a solo instrument with a symphony orchestra". The present writer does not share that view; the only shortcoming in this regard is a comparative paucity of literature in comparison to that of the other instruments mentioned by Knaub.

2.4 Articles from specialist publications

A wide variety of articles on topics ranging from instrumental performing practice to reviews of new models of musical instruments was perused. Typical publications are the quarterly *Journal* of the International Trombone Association, the *Journal* of the International Double Reed Society, and a review from *Das Klarinette* sent to the writer by an overseas correspondent, the Dutch bass clarinet virtuoso Harry Sparnaay (1987).

The periodical publication of Trinity College, London, *Flourish*, was also contributory in conveying current philosophy on the music examination process, in particular, the methods by which suitable works for inclusion in syllabuses are selected (King 2002).

A valuable attribute of all the above is that the articles are written by active instrumentalists in their chosen fields, thus direct feedback from the performer is received. This is useful in terms of instrument selection, in addition to the more obvious area of syllabus compilation. The present writer has found it advantageous - in some cases mandatory - to inform himself and his students of "what the rest of the world is doing/using" in any specific area.

In the process of gaining a valid perspective on curriculum planning and syllabus design, input is necessary from both sides of the adjudicator's desk: the vision and ideals of the educationist, and the practical and aesthetic considerations of the executive instrumentalist.

2.5 Syllabuses of examining bodies in the United Kingdom and South Africa

The grade syllabuses for woodwind, brass and percussion of the following institutions were consulted – for purposes of comparison only – during the compilation of *Syllabus 2000* and the writing of this thesis:

- Trinity College, London (1991-98)
- The Guildhall School of Music (1992-95)
- The Associated Board of the Royal Schools of Music (1991-98)
- The University of South Africa Department of Music Examinations (1988-95).

The current instrumental syllabuses of Trinity College (2003-2005) are consulted on an ongoing basis by IDMAC and the writer, with the possibility of further joint examinations of band personnel in mind.

The present writer found that there is considerable common ground between the repertoire of the ABRSM and Trinity College, London. This appeared to be due not so much to aesthetic factors such as "national (or international) taste", but due to the availability and – to a somewhat lesser extent – affordability of the music publications appearing in the respective repertoire lists. As far as standards of proficiency were concerned, there were minimal differences in the requirements of the two bodies. In general, and over the period described, the writer found that Trinity's oboe and string lists were fractionally more demanding than those of the ABRSM, while the ABRSM's brass lists were a little more adventurous. Delineation of the performance

standards required by these two bodies was clear, well-balanced and unambiguous.

The grade and diploma syllabuses of the Guildhall School of Music and Drama were, in the writer's view, even better suited as a yardstick for IDMAC's purposes, for two reasons. Firstly, the repertoire lists had been drawn up by the actual instrumental lecturers themselves, all of whom were performers in the highly competitive environment of the London professional. Secondly, adequate provision for the inclusion of sufficiently challenging jazz repertoire was made, with an improvisation option for many of the winds. This is a desirable factor in South African service bands, where the public are entertained with a broad spectrum of musical styles and *genres*.

It is interesting to note that, since the commencement of this thesis, Trinity and Guildhall have officially joined forces regarding external music examination, and with effect from 2006 will share what is largely a common syllabus in respect of Grade examinations. Bearing in mind the current negotiations being held between IDMAC and Trinity, this development is likely to bear fruit in the South African context as well.

The music examination syllabuses of UNISA had of necessity to be regarded in a somewhat different light. While the repertoire lists for the various wind instruments had been compiled by recognised specialists in their field, these had taken place at different times, and the syllabus was not chronologically integrated. This writer made substantial contributions in 1987 to the forming of syllabi for the low clarinets, saxophones and low brass, which had hitherto been either incomplete or non-existent. Unfortunately, when a subsequent revision of the wind syllabuses took place, much important detail was omitted, and it appears that with the sole exception of the flute syllabus the UNISA wind syllabuses have enjoyed a declining popularity and support among specialist teachers of wind instruments in the last decade and a half.

Consequently, when comparisons were made by the IDMAC compilers, it was mainly the 1987/88 syllabuses that were perused, rather than the current ones.

2.6 The music libraries of the SAMHS and SAPS Bands

In compiling the lists of band extracts for the various IDMAC evaluations, the catalogues and actual contents of these music libraries in Pretoria were freely utilised. Every band extract listed in *Syllabus 2000* – with two exceptions only – can be found in the music library of the SAPS Band at the Police College in Pretoria West, Tshwane. The two exceptions are Ippolitov-Ivanov's *Procession of the Sardar* and Robert Jaeger's *Toccata for Band*.

The music libraries of all the SANDF and SAPS Bands remain accessible to the writer, both in his individual capacity and as a civilian member of IDMAC, and to any of the selection panel members who were engaged in the compilation of *Syllabus 2000*.

2.7 References to wind and percussion syllabuses in other MEUSSA-related and wind band-oriented theses

During the writing of this thesis, the writer accessed the theses of Drs R Bosman, J P Grové and C Devroop for relevant material. While his outlook was in accord with that of Devroop and Bosman on common issues, it was only in the case of the Bosman thesis that the writer encountered material that had a direct bearing on his own research. This was for the most part Bosman's conclusions on outcomes-based education and curriculum for aerophones, more specifically the flute (Bosman 2001). However, a doctoral thesis written in 1987 by Professor S J (Fanie) Jooste of Potchefstroom University provided a good deal of functional detail. The English title of his thesis is *The Playing of and Instruction in Western Wind Instruments in South Africa from 1652 to 1902: a Socio-Historical Evaluation* (Dr Jooste's own translation of the Afrikaans title).

duly influenced by the presence and instrumentation of the British regimental bands. This is clearly visible today: in addition to the traditional banjos, guitars, violins, and even a 'cello (strapped around the neck like an oversize guitar), the "Christmas" band winds have until recently been dominated by trumpets and alto saxophones. Today, however, one finds a few trombones and euphoniums, tenor and baritone saxophones in addition. One might reasonably take for granted that the baritone saxophone provides a substantially more audible bass than a *pizzicato* 'cello, particularly out-of-doors.

A connecting link between the period covered in Jooste's thesis and the present writer's work is the PhD thesis of E Albert Honey, *The History, Organization and Training of Wind Bands* (Honey 1972). Not only does Jooste quote extensively from this work, but the late Dr Honey was the joint supervisor (with Dr Norbert Nowotny) of this writer's MMus thesis at Rhodes University during the mid-1980s.

While much useful material pertaining to the training and running of wind ensembles is present in Honey's work, there are minimal specific references to a formal evaluation process, or to a structured syllabus *per se*. In his Conclusion to the thesis, Honey (1972: 2) praises the North American system of giving "an important place in High School education to the study of Wind Instruments", but deplores the tendency to make:

[. . .] little or no provision for their further continuance of these activities when school days are finished [. . .] in order to avoid the colossal waste of trained or partly-trained instrumentalists [. . .] there should be a further organisation [. . .] fostering and encouraging the study of musical instruments by all or any who wish to learn them.

In his introduction to the thesis, Dr Honey's words find particular resonance with the present writer when he passes the opinion that:

The Wind Band *par excellence* would, in my personal opinion, consist basically of the old Military Band instrumentation plus those newer instruments which have lately appeared in Europe and the USA, to give greater colour and refinement to a combination which would then be far removed from the warlike function of its earliest predecessors. The Wind Band, possibly the most ancient of instrumental combinations, has, during the last two decades, risen tremendously in popularity and importance as an artistic medium in many musical centres of the world (Honey 1972).

In his Master's thesis dealing with the selection of a Baroque repertoire for the trombone, Stanley P George (1969: 2) pinpoints the desirability of transcriptions in the case of certain wind instruments:

Modern composers have shown a real interest in writing for the trombone. The last thirty years have been gratifying in the quantity of respectable (*sic*) solo works written for trombone. However, trombone solo literature of a high musical level written before 1938 is not available in abundance. After a study of the literature of contemporary composers and of various trombone transcriptions, the serious trombone student comes to realise that he has exhausted the solo repertoire for trombone.

This very neatly delineates one of the problems with which the syllabus compiler has to contend, one which is by no means limited to the trombone. George adds:

With the increased technical virtuosity of today's players and the refined technical perfection of today's instruments, it is entirely possible for the trombonist to take advantage of the wealth of solo material written for other instruments. The Baroque era, with its limited emphasis on writing for the peculiar technical features of instruments, has already seen some of its music used by trombonists.

George's thesis lists over one hundred Baroque works, with incipits of each, coming to the conclusion that only 38 are truly "idiomatic" for the instrument

(George 1969: 299). This unpublished work – obtained *via* the International Trombone Association – is of considerable value to the syllabus compiler.

Even in the first decade of the 21st century, however, a lack of original repertoire for the trombone is still being experienced "despite the very courageous attempts of some modern composers to write reasonably playable and pleasant music for the instrument" (Roberts 2005: 3). Complaining of the intractability of many of "those appalling works written by Conservatoire hacks in the 1960s", Roberts suggests that "What we need is more attention to the provision, without any hidden agenda, of original music that's pleasant to play, enjoyable to listen to, and of a standard that can be attained by all young performers who take the trouble to apply themselves."

2.8 Articles with specific reference to syllabus or curriculum design

The following material on the subjects of syllabus compilation, repertoire selection and evaluation procedures in instrumental music were accessed via the Internet:

- Elliott, D. 1988. An article entitled Key concepts in multicultural education, published in issue 13 of the *International Journal for Music Educators*, New York;
- Gillis, G. 2003. Constructing Effective Syllabi for the Studio and Ensemble, published in *The Canadian Music Educator* 44/4;
- Goodman, J. 1987. An article entitled Teaching Preservice Teachers a Critical Approach to Curriculum Design: A Descriptive Account, published in *Curriculum Inquiry*, Vol. 16, No. 2 (University of Toronto);
- Robinson, M. 2001. *The Evolution of a Methods Course*, published in the 11/1 edition of *Journal of Music Teacher Education*;
- Smith, B. B. 1987. A revised version of the Charles Seeger Memorial Lecture, published in *Ethnomusicology*, Vol. 31, No. 2 under the title of Variability, Change, and the Learning of Music;

- Wolff, J. 1990. Questioning the Curriculum: Arts, Education and Ideology, published in Vol. 31, No. 4 of *Studies in Art Education*.

While these articles without exception provided stimulating reading, they were of limited value in the assembling of germane material for this thesis, as they were mainly concerned with situations encountered in music education at secondary level, rather than at tertiary or professional level. For this reason, this avenue of research was not continued further. An article in the February 2002 edition of the Trinity College publication *Flourish* was in fact the only recent publication to directly shed light on these processes (King 2002).

However, Smith (1987: 208), in quoting her experience at the University of Hawaii, identified a music literacy problem that finds a parallel in an experience of the present writer in training instrumentalists:

Of the students in the first-year theory course, only the pianists could read both treble and bass clefs; other instrumentalists read one or the other; and less than half the vocalists could read either clef!

This corresponds closely with the current state of literacy in the Band of the National Ceremonial Guard in Pretoria. Likewise, the writer found that high school students who took trombone, bassoon or 'cello as their major instrument in the 1980s and '90s, while fluent in bass clef reading, experienced difficulty with the treble clef.

2.9 Music publishers' catalogues employed in repertoire selection

Publishers' catalogues available to the writer and the syllabus team at the time of compiling *Syllabus 2000* included the Woodwind, Brass and Percussion catalogues of:

Accura Music, Athens, OH, USA (1991)
 C L Barnhouse, USA (1995)
 Boosey & Hawkes, London (various)
 Bosworth, London (1992)
 Edition Breitkopf, Wiesbaden: *Soloinstrumente* (1991)
 Elkan-Vogel, USA (1992)
 June Emerson, Yorks, UK (1995)
 Faber & Faber Ltd., London (1983)
 Carl Fischer, London and New York (1984)
 Editio Musica, Budapest (1992)
 International Music Company, USA (various)
 Edwin Kalmus Music Publications, New York (1985)
 Kendor Music, New York (1988)
 Alphonse Leduc, Paris: *Musique pour Trombone*, 3rd Edition; *Musique pour Saxophone*, 2nd Edition (undated)
 Henry Lemoine, Paris (1989)
 Hal Leonard, USA (1987-88)
 Ludwig Music, Cleveland USA: *Woodwind and Brass Catalogue* (1986-87)
 Norcat Music Press, MD, USA (Norman Heim) (1992)
 Novello (1984)
 Oxford University Press Music Department: *Woodwind & Brass* (1994)
 J W Pepper (USA) *Instrumental Catalogue* (1993)
 Edition Peters (Brass, Woodwind, Strings) (1990)
 Editions Marc Reift, Switzerland: *Brass Catalogue* (1988)
 Ricordi (London): *Complete Sales Catalogue* (1995)
 Rubank Publications, FL USA: *Instrumental Music Guide* (1981)
 G Schirmer, New York: *Wind Instrument Music* (undated)
 Shawnee Press, Inc., USA (1987)
 Universal Edition *Woodwind and Brass catalogue* (1992).

As alluded to in Chapter 3, the wind repertoire in the majority of these catalogues was found to have remained comparatively static over the decade 1984-94. Where new compositions were published, these were usually announced in an additional leaflet from the publisher concerned, publicising the new additions, and did not appear in the main catalogue until revision thereof took place a few years later, in the majority of cases.

To an identifiable degree, compilers are at the mercy of prevailing trends in music publishing, and are by no means buffered by aesthetical considerations when it comes to prescribing music over such a wide field as is required for the instruments of the Concert Band. Nicholas King (2002: 4) of TCL places this activity in perspective when he writes:

All of this is an extremely complex operation, and may well be affected by commercial decisions taken by publishers about items remaining in their catalogue – or not.

2.10 Other sources accessed

A very early yet rewarding publication is the English translation, made by Roger E Chapman in 1964, of Marin Mersenne's *The Books on Instruments*, a section of his monumental *Harmonie Universelle*, first published in 1636 (Mersenne 1964). While the wind and percussion instruments have evolved considerably since that era, it is significant that Mersenne (1964: 23) made wide-ranging observations on the temperament of an instrument *vis-à-vis* that of an individual performer or listener:

The difference of temperaments which are found in men similarly causes the sound of some [instruments] to seem more agreeable to that one than the others, so that these reasons and many others that can be related can hinder the sincerity of the judgement.

This observation, albeit it cloaked in Renaissance terms, holds significance for the examiner and the syllabus compiler alike. It touches on the need for neutrality on the part of the examiner, as well as the need by the syllabus compilers to accommodate a wide variety of musical taste.

2.11 Summary of literature reviewed

A general description of the variety of literature consulted has been supplied in the opening paragraphs of this chapter. Similarly, an assessment of the extent of the value of each source to this writer's research has been included in each division.

It seems necessary to add only that there is need for continuous research on the subject of syllabus compilation; as in the production of a road map, a syllabus is in danger of being slightly out-of-date by the time it is published. In the particular case of *Syllabus 2000* material is constantly being added and/or modified as considered appropriate, thus minimising the possibility of rapid obsolescence.

The main burden or message emerging from the selection of pedagogic articles consulted is, indeed, one of the desirability of revising or reviewing the entire *status quo* on a fairly regular basis. Conversely, Eugene Weigel (1959: 49), writing in the *Journal of Music Theory*, pleads for reviewing the past in integration with the present, and that today

a performer is faced more than ever before with the need for understanding and synthesising the creative philosophies of the past. We need, above all, performers who can bring to their art and study and teaching the fullest resources of insight and skill. Music is ONE study, in which theory and practice function together.

It is indeed an integration of resources that has led the present writer to his conclusions. It would be impossible to identify any *one* piece of writing – scholarly or otherwise – as having been uniquely seminal in researching the issues at hand. Not one of the volumes, theses or articles perused was found to deal organically with the specific undertaking of syllabus compilation and structure, other than the syllabuses of ABRSM, TCL and UNISA. Much has been written on "military" and symphonic bands – Adkins, Wagner, Honey, Jooste *inter alia* – but little on the evaluation methods employed in the musical examination of their members. It must be conceded, however, that the

specialised books and articles on wind instruments and the specific references to the activities of wind ensembles, past and present, were in general the most informative and the most constructive sources of material in filling gaps in the present writer's knowledge of the subject.

A particularly apposite quotation is made by Goodman (1987: 184) from James MacDonald and Dwight Clark's "critical value questions and the analysis of objectives and curricula" (1973):

Curriculum designs, unlike those of engineering and Newtonian physics, are not governed by fixed variables and mathematical formulas, but are largely a matter of social and moral choice.

This was one of the "understood" factors in compiling *Syllabus 2000*, and finds accord with the processes described in Chapter 3.

The last quotation is left to Mersenne (1964: 23):

[...] for to judge things sanely, it is necessary to call in those who have more experience than the others, otherwise the arts would be miserable, as though those who make it a profession would depend on the judgement of the first comer.

With this observation, the syllabus compiler rests his case.