

**AN EXPLORATIVE STUDY ON THE INTERACTION
BETWEEN THE ARTS AND NARRATIVE PRACTISE.
A PASTORAL PERSPECTIVE**

by

HENDRIK ELMO PIENAAR

**SUPERVISOR:
PROF J C MÜLLER**

A THESIS SUBMITTED IN FULFILMENT OF THE REQUIREMENTS FOR THE
DEGREE OF

**PHILOSOPHIAE DOCTOR IN PRACTICAL THEOLOGY
(PASTORAL FAMILY THERAPY)**

**FACULTY OF THEOLOGY
OF THE
UNIVERSITY OF PRETORIA**

October 2005

List of contents

| | |
|--|--------------------|
| <i>List of contents</i> | <i>ii</i> |
| <i>List of figures and tables</i> | <i>xii</i> |
| <i>Multimedia disc and contents.....</i> | <i>xiii</i> |
| <i>How to survive the journey and technical data.....</i> | <i>xv</i> |
| <i>Synopsis.....</i> | <i>xvii</i> |
| <i>Chapter 1, Positioning.....</i> | <i>1</i> |
| 1.1 Introduction | 1 |
| 1.1.1 An Introductory metaphor, An Ordinary world | 1 |
| 1.1.2 Overview to the research study | 3 |
| 1.1.3 Traces of an underlying worldview | 7 |
| 1.2 Social construction | 9 |
| 1.2.1 Polyphonic post's | 10 |
| 1.2.1.1 Polyphonics; heed the warning and embrace the differentiation | 11 |
| 1.2.1.2 Points of agreement | 14 |
| 1.2.1.2.1 Refutation of essence | 14 |
| 1.2.1.2.2 Refutation of hidden structures..... | 16 |
| 1.2.1.2.3 Interrogating definitions | 17 |
| 1.2.1.3 Useful differentiation – social constructionism versus constructivism | 19 |
| 1.2.1.4 Levels of social constructionism..... | 21 |
| 1.2.1.5 Realism versus relativism; can they co-exist? | 23 |
| 1.2.2 Appreciative, reflexive inquiry into a foundational basis | 29 |
| 1.2.3 Research as acquiring a new language..... | 32 |
| 1.2.3.1 What, language again? | 35 |
| 1.2.3.2 Discourse | 38 |
| 1.2.3.3 Social construction of 'the good the bad and the ugly' | 39 |
| 1.2.4 Deconstructing the 'one truth' assumption!..... | 45 |
| 1.2.5 Possibility Theory..... | 51 |
| 1.2.5.1 Raising questions about God..... | 51 |
| 1.2.5.2 Background to academic pursuit..... | 52 |
| 1.2.5.3 Broadening the conversation | 53 |
| 1.2.5.4 Possibility theory employed from the arts | 59 |
| 1.2.5.5 A PhD focus group interrogation..... | 62 |
| 1.2.6 Interlude: How do you play the game? | 67 |
| 1.3 Theological positioning..... | 68 |
| 1.3.1 Theology or Practical Theology | 69 |
| 1.3.1.1 Theology and Art: an already established link | 74 |
| 1.3.1.2 Theology, arts and creation..... | 76 |
| 1.3.1.2.1 Human uniqueness and the imago Dei..... | 78 |
| 1.3.1.2.2 Arts and Creation | 83 |
| 1.3.1.2.3 Theology, and the personal narrative | 86 |
| 1.3.1.2.4 Theology informed by a reflexive community..... | 88 |
| 1.3.2 Pastoral positioning..... | 90 |
| 1.3.2.1 Researcher versus therapist-pastor..... | 95 |
| 1.4 Surveying the research theme..... | 97 |
| 1.4.1 Explorative | 99 |
| 1.4.2 Interaction | 99 |
| 1.4.3 Narrative practise..... | 100 |

| | |
|---|------------|
| 1.5 The Delta area – discovering other narrative disciplines | 102 |
| 1.5.1 Narrative practise..... | 103 |
| 1.6 Methodological positioning | 108 |
| 1.6.1 Positioning within the narrative | 111 |
| 1.6.1.1 “Let there be stories,” God said..... | 113 |
| 1.6.1.2 Metaphors and Narrative..... | 116 |
| 1.6.1.2.1 Narrative and social construction as metaphor | 116 |
| 1.6.1.2.2 Metaphor in comparison to symbols and signs | 118 |
| 1.6.1.3 Differentiating between performing narratives and story-tools | 121 |
| 1.6.1.4 Narrative in reaction to... | 124 |
| 1.7 Positioning within the arts | 127 |
| 1.7.1 A definition of the arts? | 130 |
| Chapter 2: Methodological Accountability and Co-authoring voices | 132 |
| 2.1 Preface | 132 |
| 2.1.1 Research as action | 134 |
| 2.1.2 Research as narrative..... | 134 |
| 2.1.3 Research as facilitating..... | 134 |
| 2.1.4 Research as responsibility..... | 135 |
| Section A | 135 |
| 2.2 Introductory metaphor..... | 135 |
| 2.3 A twofold research gap | 138 |
| 2.4 Research procedure: A Birdseye view | 143 |
| 2.5 Design | 145 |
| 2.5.1 Phenomenological | 146 |
| 2.5.2 Grounded theory | 147 |
| 2.6 All Beavers Drink Coke a cola Euphorically..... | 149 |
| 2.6.1 Introduction and method | 149 |
| 2.6.1.1 Action | 151 |
| 2.6.1.2 Background | 152 |
| 2.6.1.3 Development | 153 |
| 2.6.1.4 Climax | 154 |
| 2.6.1.5 Ending | 158 |
| 2.6.2 Usual criteria for good research design..... | 159 |
| 2.6.3 Graphical representations to research design..... | 165 |
| 2.6.3.1 Graphical representation 1..... | 168 |
| 2.6.3.2 Graphical representation 2..... | 169 |
| 2.6.3.3 Graphical Representation 3 | 171 |
| 2.7 Data sources?..... | 172 |
| 2.7.1 Qualitative Interviews..... | 172 |
| 2.7.1.1 Means of capturing information..... | 173 |
| 2.7.1.2 Reasons for interviews as data | 177 |
| 2.7.1.3 Skills required for qualitative interviewing | 180 |
| 2.7.2 Means of deriving data..... | 181 |
| 2.8 Co-authoring voices and criteria for involvement..... | 182 |
| 2.8.1 Criteria, an environmental view | 185 |
| 2.9 Ethics and accountability..... | 188 |
| 2.9.1 Ethical considerations in interviewing | 189 |
| 2.9.1.1 Informed consent | 191 |

| | |
|--|------------|
| Section B | 193 |
| 2.10 Once upon a time... | 193 |
| 2.11 Sojourners/ co-researchers | 195 |
| 2.11.1 Jo Viljoen | 196 |
| 2.11.2 Pastoral community | 197 |
| 2.11.3 Berna..... | 199 |
| 2.11.4 Marinus Loots | 199 |
| 2.11.5 Bianca Pretorius..... | 200 |
| 2.11.6 Talitha Broos | 200 |
| 2.11.7 Hanneljie Straus | 200 |
| 2.11.8 Suzette van Tonder..... | 201 |
| 2.11.9 Fransien Schoeman..... | 201 |
| 2.11.10 Moré Niehaus..... | 201 |
| 2.11.11 Christo Möller..... | 202 |
| 2.11.12 Professor Hagemann's contributions | 202 |
| 2.11.13 Congregational creative arts examples | 203 |
| 2.11.14 Literary voices..... | 203 |
| 2.11.15 Mercédès Pavlicevic | 204 |
| 2.11.16 Henk du Plessis | 204 |
| 2.11.17 CFN Facilitation | 205 |
| 2.11.17 PhD Focus group | 205 |
| 2.11.18 Voices from the interface between the arts and theology..... | 205 |
| 2.11.19 Arts and Reconciliation conference | 206 |
| 2.11.20 Cape Town conference..... | 207 |
| 2.11.21 Leonard Sweet conference | 208 |
| Chapter 3, Artistic explorations..... | 209 |
| 3.1 Introduction | 209 |
| 3.1.1 Chapter three, outline | 209 |
| 3.1.2 Introductory positioning to chapter three | 212 |
| 3.1.3 Reiterating the research gap | 215 |
| 3.2 Cape Town | 216 |
| 3.2.1 "Wat is kuns?" / What is art?..... | 217 |
| 3.2.2 "Wat beteken kuns?"/ What does art mean? | 218 |
| 3.2.3 "Is daar iets soos Christelike kuns?"/ 'Christian' art?..... | 219 |
| 3.2.4 "Kan ons enige kuns gebruik?"/ Could we use any art? | 220 |
| 3.2.5 Art from the Biblical times | 222 |
| 3.2.6 An Educational task | 222 |
| 3.3 EPIC | 224 |
| 3.3.1 An image driven culture | 225 |
| 3.3.2 An experience seeking culture..... | 227 |
| 3.3.3 Participation – having a voice | 230 |
| 3.3.4 Connectedness | 231 |
| 3.4 CAM Reflection/ interpretation - about a rainbow (congregational story) | 234 |
| 3.4.1 Congregational involvement | 234 |
| 3.4.1.1 In the hands of God..... | 234 |
| 3.4.1.2 The cross our freedom | 236 |
| 3.4.1.3 The cross our joy..... | 236 |
| 3.4.1.4 In God we trust..... | 238 |
| 3.4.1.5 An historical journey | 238 |
| 3.4.2 CAM Reflection in action | 239 |
| 3.4.3 A silent photo montage | 247 |
| 3.4.4 Berna on the arts | 251 |

| | |
|---|------------|
| 3.4.5 The Iconoclastic Controversy | 253 |
| 3.5 Staying close to my theological home..... | 254 |
| 3.5.1 Considering community | 254 |
| 3.5.2 Church and art; unity and growing scepticism..... | 257 |
| 3.5.3 The survival of arts..... | 259 |
| 3.5.4 The Christian art debate | 261 |
| 3.5.4.1 Introduction and historical deliberation | 261 |
| 3.5.4.2 A three-fold view on what might be called Christian art..... | 264 |
| 3.5.5 Reception theory and a hermeneutical model | 266 |
| 3.5.5.1 Hermeneutical journey | 268 |
| 3.5.5.1.1 Rediscovering hermeneutics and epistemology | 268 |
| 3.5.5.1.2 A fusion between hermeneutics and epistemology | 268 |
| 3.5.5.1.3 Artistic/ interpretive exegesis | 269 |
| 3.5.5.1.4 Hermeneutics and exegesis as subjective focussed inquiry | 270 |
| 3.5.5.1.5 Exegetical considerations | 271 |
| 3.5.5.1.5.1 Text..... | 272 |
| 3.5.5.1.5.2 The world behind the text | 276 |
| 3.5.5.1.5.3 The world in front of the text | 276 |
| 3.5.5.1.5.4 Critical self reflection..... | 277 |
| 3.5.5.1.5.5 A Spiral of understanding | 277 |
| 3.5.5.1.5.6 Context..... | 278 |
| 3.5.5.1.5.7 A Creation informed conclusion to the exegetical pursuit | 280 |
| 3.5.5.2 Reception theory and a communication model..... | 281 |
| 3.5.6 The Art of faith | 285 |
| 3.5.6.1 Art versus Pictures from the Unconscious | 291 |
| 3.5.7 Tribute to Nic Grobler - Sculpture | 294 |
| 3.6 On Bianca's interaction with the arts..... | 297 |
| 3.6.1 Practical exposition of Vogler's model in Bianca's involvement | 297 |
| 3.6.2 A Story of survival – call to life by <i>Bianca & Elmo</i> | 297 |
| 3.6.2.1 Act 1: Meeting the mentor | 297 |
| 3.6.2.2 Act 2: Threshold to life | 299 |
| 3.6.2.3 Act 3: Return with the Elixir | 301 |
| 3.6.3 Images of hope | 302 |
| 3.6.4 Stepping over the edge of the world | 303 |
| 3.6.5 Rhythm is a Dancer | 305 |
| 3.6.6 Simulating life..... | 307 |
| 3.6.7 Problem's voice on compact disc | 308 |
| 3.6.8 Story as art - A survivors journeying testimony | 309 |
| 3.7 Christo's crossroad with the arts | 311 |
| 3.7.1 Practical exposition of Vogler's model in Christo's involvement..... | 311 |
| 3.7.2 A Story of victory – outgrowing disappointment by <i>Christo & Elmo</i> | 312 |
| 3.7.2.1 Act 1: Setting the stage | 312 |
| 3.7.2.1.1 Insert act 1: Description in terms of The Writers Journey | 314 |
| 3.7.2.2 Act 2, The True call to adventure | 315 |
| 3.7.2.2.1 Insert act 2: Description in terms of The Writers Journey | 317 |
| 3.7.2.3 Act 3, The Road back & Rebirth..... | 318 |
| 3.7.2.3.1 Insert act 3: Description in terms of The Writers Journey | 318 |
| 3.7.3 Closure..... | 319 |
| 3.7.4 Creative interaction in Christo's involvement..... | 320 |
| 3.7.4.1 Problem, an audio media presentation | 320 |
| 3.7.4.1.1 Problem, the personification | 321 |
| 3.7.4.1.2 CAM community on Problem | 322 |
| 3.7.4.1.3 The making of Problem..... | 323 |
| 3.7.4.1.4 The road back | 324 |

| | | |
|-------------|--|------------|
| 3.7.4.2 | Dramatic action | 325 |
| 3.7.4.3 | To book or not to book | 326 |
| 3.7.4.4 | Vogler, the ultimate solution?? | 327 |
| 3.7.4.5 | Genogram | 328 |
| 3.7.4.6 | Media Presentations | 329 |
| 3.7.4.6.1 | Informed by disability | 329 |
| 3.7.4.6.2 | Framing life, a silent photo montage..... | 330 |
| 3.8 | More's interaction with the arts | 332 |
| 3.8.1 | Practical exposition of Vogler's model in Moré's involvement..... | 332 |
| 3.8.2 | A Story about Spring by <i>Moré & Elmo</i> | 332 |
| 3.8.3 | Moré's interaction with the arts | 336 |
| 3.8.3.1 | Story as art | 336 |
| 3.8.3.2 | Crossing the threshold | 337 |
| 3.8.3.3 | Moré on Beading | 338 |
| 3.8.3.4 | Moré on music..... | 340 |
| 3.8.3.5 | Elementary school teachers and narrative therapists | 341 |
| 3.8.3.6 | Various other crafts and its therapeutic use..... | 343 |
| 3.8.3.6.1 | Resonancy with Charlene..... | 344 |
| 3.8.3.7 | Moré and dancing | 345 |
| 3.9 | Marinus and the Multimedia landscape | 347 |
| 3.9.1 | Practical exposition of Vogler's model in Marinus' involvement..... | 347 |
| 3.9.2 | A Story about a Multimedia dream by <i>Marinus & Elmo</i> | 347 |
| 3.9.3 | A Multimedia journey | 349 |
| 3.9.4 | A Multimedia congregational story..... | 351 |
| 3.9.5 | Describing multimedia..... | 353 |
| 3.9.6 | Following up on Photography | 353 |
| 3.9.7 | The return of The Good the Bad and the Ugly | 355 |
| 3.9.8 | Responses to Photographs | 357 |
| 3.10 | Professor Hagemann on the arts..... | 358 |
| 3.10.1 | Conversational Interaction | 362 |
| 3.10.1.1 | Selective Memory..... | 362 |
| 3.10.1.2 | The notion of conflict | 362 |
| 3.10.1.3 | Six thinking hats | 363 |
| 3.10.2 | Quality of art in narrative practise | 368 |
| 3.10.3 | Interpretational | 370 |
| 3.11 | Informed by Henk - A Learning experience..... | 374 |
| 3.11.1 | The Learning Theatre | 375 |
| 3.11.2 | Introductory fieldwork remarks..... | 378 |
| 3.11.3 | Dramamatic representation as externalisation | 383 |
| 3.11.4 | Art's focused intention..... | 384 |
| 3.11.5 | Awareness wheel..... | 385 |
| 3.12 | Narrative practice and organisational facilitation..... | 386 |
| 3.12.1 | Introductory CAM community remarks | 386 |
| 3.12.2 | Exploring the relation between narrative practise and facilitation | 387 |
| 3.12.3 | Facilitation, basic points of departure | 388 |
| 3.12.4 | A four-fold perspective on process design..... | 389 |
| 3.12.4.1 | A facilitators point of view (Table 3-2, Column A) | 391 |
| 3.12.4.2 | An unfolding process (Table 3-2, Column B) | 391 |
| 3.12.4.2.1 | Preparations and organisation | 391 |
| 3.12.4.2.2 | Analysis, diagnosis and interpretation..... | 392 |
| 3.12.4.2.3 | Discernment and vision | 392 |
| 3.12.4.2.4 | Priorities, process and strategy | 393 |
| 3.12.4.2.4 | Implementation and maintenance | 393 |

| | | |
|---|--|------------|
| 3.12.4.3 | The use of lenses (Table 3-2, Columns C & D) | 394 |
| 3.12.4.3.1 | Clay work..... | 395 |
| 3.12.4.3.2 | Body representations/ sculptures..... | 396 |
| 3.12.4.3.3 | Games | 396 |
| 3.12.4.3.4 | Story wall | 397 |
| 3.12.4.3.5 | Theoretical concepts artistically redesigned | 398 |
| 3.13 | Arts and Reconciliation conference, 14-20 March 2005 – a reflection | 400 |
| 3.13.1 | Tuesday 15 th March, session one..... | 401 |
| 3.13.1.1 | DramAidE: Arts for Social Therapy. | 401 |
| 3.13.2 | Tuesday/ Wednesday 15/16th March, afternoon sessions..... | 403 |
| 3.13.2.1 | Drama Therapy in Group Context..... | 403 |
| 3.13.3 | Wednesday 16 th March, session one..... | 416 |
| 3.13.3.1 | Fingerprints of Reconciliation in Culturally Significant Films. | 416 |
| 3.13.4 | Wednesday 16 th March, session two | 418 |
| 3.13.4.1 | Performance of time and related considerations | 418 |
| 3.13.5 | Wednesday 16 th March, afternoon session | 420 |
| 3.13.5.1 | Beyond the Physical Oddity | 420 |
| 3.13.5.2 | A Reflection letter | 422 |
| 3.13.6 | Evening lectures: 17 th / 18 th March | 439 |
| 3.13.6.1 | Archives of the Arts and Culture Com-munities and the TRC | 439 |
| 3.13.6.2 | In the TRC Translators' Box | 447 |
| 3.13.6.3 | Reconciliation Themes in New Media Productions of Selected Cape Artists | 449 |
| 3.13.6.4 | Video art | 450 |
| 3.13.7 | Arts and Reconciliation conference exhibitions | 456 |
| 3.13.7.1 | The Fatherhood project..... | 456 |
| 3.13.7.2 | Reconciliation Exhibition | 458 |
| Chapter 4, we live and die in the stories of others..... | 465 | |
| Section A | 465 | |
| 4.1 | Introduction, narrative as art | 465 |
| 4.2 | Story in therapy versus Story as therapy | 470 |
| 4.3 | Questioning the vitality of narrative practise | 474 |
| 4.4 | Considering the use of arts in narrative practise | 476 |
| 4.4.1 | Character-centeredness | 476 |
| 4.4.1.1 | Principle ideas in character centred scripts | 476 |
| 4.4.1.2 | Notions of character | 479 |
| 4.4.2 | Post-structuralist | 479 |
| 4.5 | Enriching narrative practise..... | 480 |
| 4.5.1 | Placement, Displacement & Replacement | 480 |
| 4.5.2 | Notions of time in narrative | 482 |
| 4.5.2.1 | Compressed time | 482 |
| 4.5.2.2 | Ellipsis | 482 |
| 4.5.2.3 | Screen time/ Narrative time..... | 482 |
| 4.5.2.4 | Stretched time | 482 |
| 4.5.2.5 | Zero-moment..... | 482 |
| 4.5.2.6 | In relation to narrativity | 483 |
| 4.5.3 | Acts sequences and scenes | 484 |
| 4.5.3.1 | Kernel's and Satellites..... | 484 |
| 4.5.3.2 | Entering into or a film/ or conversation | 485 |
| 4.5.3.3 | Closing Shots | 487 |
| 4.5.3.3.1 | The Embrace versus the Lone Individual | 487 |
| 4.5.4 | Type of narratives | 488 |

| | | |
|-------------|---|------------|
| 4.5.4.1 | The Circular Tale..... | 488 |
| 4.5.4.2 | The Tale within a Tale: Frame narratives | 488 |
| 4.5.4.3 | Multiple point of view narrative..... | 488 |
| 4.5.4.4 | Collage narrative | 488 |
| 4.6 | The Writers Journey - Christopher Vogler | 489 |
| 4.6.1 | An evaluation of motive and criticism | 490 |
| 4.6.2 | Twelve story movements | 493 |
| 4.6.3 | More on story types and characters – Professor Hagemann | 495 |
| 4.6.3.1 | Seven basic stories | 495 |
| 4.6.3.2 | Four primary characters | 496 |
| 4.6.3.3 | Audience Identification | 497 |
| 4.6.4 | Character types and movements – modernistic?? | 498 |
| 4.7 | Relating Vogler to narrative practise | 502 |
| 4.7.1 | Story movements in the Writers Journey..... | 502 |
| 4.7.1.1 | An Ordinary World..... | 503 |
| 4.7.1.2 | A Call to adventure..... | 504 |
| 4.7.1.3 | Reluctance or Refusal of the Call..... | 505 |
| 4.7.1.4 | Support of a mentor | 505 |
| 4.7.1.5 | First Threshold to a Special World | 506 |
| 4.7.1.6 | Tests, Allies and Enemies..... | 507 |
| 4.7.1.7 | Approach to the Inmost Cave: second threshold | 508 |
| 4.7.1.8 | The Ordeal | 508 |
| 4.7.1.9 | Possession of the Reward | 509 |
| 4.7.1.10 | The Road back (the chase)..... | 510 |
| 4.7.1.11 | Resurrection and Transformation: Third Threshold | 510 |
| 4.7.1.12 | Return with the Elixir | 511 |
| 4.7.2 | Characters in the Writers Journey | 511 |
| 4.7.2.1 | The Hero | 513 |
| 4.7.2.2 | Mentor | 513 |
| 4.7.2.3 | Threshold Guardian | 514 |
| 4.7.2.4 | Herald..... | 514 |
| 4.7.2.5 | Shape shifter | 514 |
| 4.7.2.5 | Shadow | 515 |
| 4.7.2.6 | Trickster..... | 515 |
| 4.8 | Vogler and the arts..... | 515 |
| 4.9 | Drama therapy and story | 517 |
| 4.9.1 | A case study on story and drama therapy | 521 |
| 4.9.1.1 | General information..... | 521 |
| 4.9.1.2 | Creating the set..... | 521 |
| 4.9.1.2.1 | Extending images or pictures | 521 |
| 4.9.1.3 | Projection of Image | 522 |
| 4.9.1.3.1 | Extension of drawn image | 522 |
| 4.9.1.4 | Inhabiting the image | 522 |
| 4.9.1.4.1 | A Script | 523 |
| 4.9.1.4.2 | Creating characters..... | 524 |
| 4.9.1.5 | Therapist's thoughts and reflections | 525 |
| 4.9.1.5.1 | The participant's choice | 525 |
| 4.9.1.6 | Jumping between artistic expressions/ Increase to role-play | 528 |
| 4.9.1.6.1 | Preparation | 528 |
| 4.9.1.6.2 | The dramatic action 1 | 529 |
| 4.9.1.6.2.1 | Projection/ extending metaphors | 530 |
| 4.9.1.6.3 | The dramatic action 2 | 531 |
| 4.9.1.7 | In conclusion | 534 |

| | |
|---|------------|
| 4.10 Other story structures | 534 |
| 4.10.1 Story Spine | 535 |
| 4.10.1.1 Once upon a time..... | 535 |
| 4.10.1.2 Everyday | 536 |
| 4.10.1.3 But one day (or) But then | 536 |
| 4.10.1.4 Because of that | 536 |
| 4.10.1.5 until Finally | 536 |
| 4.10.1.6 and ever since..... | 536 |
| 4.10.2 Story as Sermon | 537 |
| 4.10.2.1 Introduction, story an sermon..... | 537 |
| 4.10.2.2 Sermon as story– Lowry (2001) | 540 |
| 4.10.2.2.1 OOPS? Upsetting the equilibrium for the sake of engagement | 543 |
| 4.10.2.2.2 UGH! Analysing the discrepancy..... | 544 |
| 4.10.2.2.3 AHA: Disclosing the clue to resolution | 547 |
| 4.10.2.2.4 WHEE! Experiencing the gospel | 548 |
| 4.10.2.2.5 YEAH: Anticipating the consequences..... | 549 |
| 4.10.2.3 Narrative or sermonic plot versus conventional structures | 549 |
| 4.10.2.4 The narrative sermon; the ultimate answer?..... | 552 |
| Chapter 5, Do what you want but tell me a story | 554 |
| 5.1 Introduction | 555 |
| 5.2 Preface to arts in/ as debate | 556 |
| 5.2.1 Cautionary differentiation: arts as, or <i>in</i> therapy | 557 |
| 5.2.2 The arts as therapy constituency – a musicological perspective | 560 |
| 5.3 Possible functions and considerations of the arts..... | 566 |
| 5.3.1 Art as a function of the assumed inner world | 566 |
| 5.3.2 Revisiting medieval art..... | 567 |
| 5.3.3 Localised understandings of the arts | 569 |
| 5.3.3.1 being sensitive..... | 570 |
| 5.3.3.2 Client Centred | 570 |
| 5.3.3.3 Clarifying/ selling the problem | 571 |
| 5.3.3.4 Point of view – Omni directional telling | 572 |
| 5.3.3.5 Multiple levels of interaction..... | 572 |
| 5.3.3.6 Re-membering..... | 573 |
| 5.3.3.7 Forgetting | 574 |
| 5.3.3.8 Sustaining alternative stories | 574 |
| 5.3.3.9 Framing | 575 |
| 5.3.3.10 Performance of meaning | 576 |
| 5.3.3.11 Deconstruction | 577 |
| 5.3.3.12 Revealing patterns | 578 |
| 5.3.3.13 Relationship between learning and teaching | 578 |
| 5.3.3.14 beyond conversational stuckness - process enhancement | 579 |
| 5.3.3.15 Discussion stimulators | 580 |
| 5.3.3.16 Expressive purposes | 581 |
| 5.3.3.17 Liberating/ re-inventing..... | 582 |
| 5.3.3.18 Accessing emotion | 582 |
| 5.3.3.19 crossing worlds..... | 583 |
| 5.3.3.20 Externalising | 584 |
| 5.3.3.21 swelling the moment | 585 |
| 5.3.3.22 Reflection | 586 |
| 5.3.3.26 Art as Transitional objects | 587 |
| Chapter 6, Personal reflection | 590 |
| 6.1 Introduction | 590 |

| | | |
|---|---|------------|
| 6.1.1 | Outline to chapter six | 591 |
| 6.2 | Personal remarks | 591 |
| 6.2.1 | Cursory remarks on some things I have learned..... | 591 |
| 6.2.2 | On wanting to use art in therapy..... | 592 |
| 6.2.3 | Dissemination of once clearly defined boundaries | 593 |
| 6.2.3.1 | Arguing for responsibility and unity | 598 |
| 6.2.3.2 | Argument for eclecticism | 600 |
| 6.2.4 | Expectations | 601 |
| 6.2.4.1 | Shortcomings and frustrations | 601 |
| 6.2.4.2 | Surprising moments | 602 |
| 6.3 | Reflections on communities | 603 |
| 6.3.1 | Who benefits, is heard, is silenced? | 603 |
| 6.3.1.1 | In consideration of who is heard..... | 603 |
| 6.3.1.2 | In consideration of who is silenced..... | 606 |
| 6.3.1.3 | In considering who benefits..... | 606 |
| 6.3.1.4 | Social issues, marginalised voice, power relations..... | 607 |
| 6.4 | Reflection on the process | 608 |
| 6.4.1 | A dream is a goal with a deadline..... | 608 |
| Addenda | | 612 |
| Addendum A: Common misconception on the arts | | 612 |
| Addendum B: A Catalytic event around music involvement..... | | 615 |
| Addendum C: Towards the same horizon: Music Therapy and Community Music..... | | 618 |
| C1. | Music Therapy | 620 |
| C2. | Shared Territory, Different Maps? | 624 |
| C3. | Community Music Therapy: A Third Way? | 626 |
| C3.1 | Identities and Roles | 629 |
| C3.1.1 | Definition | 629 |
| C3.1.2 | Client/Therapist relationship | 629 |
| C3.1.3 | Knowledgeable/ interpreter | 630 |
| C3.1.4 | A Community Music Therapy answer | 630 |
| C3.1.4.1 | Dual role | 630 |
| C3.1.4.2 | In context | 630 |
| C3.1.4.3 | Respectful interaction/ deconstructing structures..... | 630 |
| C3.1.4.4 | Morale client/ therapist relationship | 631 |
| C3.1.4.5 | Dispersion of knowledge..... | 631 |
| C3.2.1 | A Community Music Therapy answer | 632 |
| C3.3.1 | A Community Music Therapy answer | 633 |
| C3.4.1 | A Community Music Therapy answer | 634 |
| C4. | In conclusion | 634 |
| Addendum E: Distinctions between art therapy and phototherapy | | 639 |
| Addendum F: Photographic exhibition, Fahterhood Project | | 643 |
| Addendum G: Dance therapy and depth-psychology | | 644 |
| G1. | Dialectical relationship; body and psyche..... | 645 |
| G2. | Reflections on the self..... | 647 |
| G3. | The functioning of emotions..... | 648 |
| G.4 | In conclusion | 650 |
| Addendum H: Fundamentals of drama therapy over psychotherapy | | 652 |
| H1. | Staged nature of humanness..... | 652 |
| H2. | Shape..... | 653 |
| H3. | Change effected through the ordinary | 655 |

| | |
|---|------------|
| Addendum I: List of plays for drama therapy | 657 |
| Addendum J: Moré’s creations..... | 658 |
| J1. Beadwork I: My life story/ “Die storie van my lewe” | 659 |
| J2 Additional beadwork examples | 679 |
| J2.1 Beadwork II: The story of Moré and Mark/ “Die Storie van More en Mark”..... | 679 |
| J2.2 Beadwork III: People in my life/ “Die mense in my lewe” | 680 |
| J2.3 Beadwork IV: Beadwork about Stefan/ “Stefan”..... | 680 |
| J2.3 A Letter to Chantelle/ “Vir Chantelle”..... | 680 |
| Addendum K: Afrikaans transcriptions | 682 |
| K1. Art from the Biblical times (Afrikaans to paragraph 3.2.5) | 683 |
| K2. An Educational task (Afrikaans to paragraph 3.2.6)..... | 683 |
| K3. Marinus’ multimedia presentation description - Afrikaans | 684 |
| K4. Fieldwork remarks – Learning Theatre | 685 |
| K4.1 Key voices | 685 |
| K4.2 Reflection letter a) to Henk | 686 |
| K4.2 Reflection letter b) to Henk..... | 687 |
| K5 Bianca | 688 |
| K.5.1 Bianca on Problem, the audio medium (heading 3.6.2.1) | 688 |
| K.5.2 Bianca’s threshold to life (heading 3.6.2.2) | 689 |
| K6. Christo..... | 691 |
| K6.1 The voice of Problem (heading 3.7.4.1.1) | 691 |
| K6.2 Christo on the sermon where Problem was played (Under section 3.7.4.1).... | 692 |
| Addendum L: Pastoral accountability reflection illustration..... | 694 |
| Addendum M: An example of critical reflection..... | 695 |
| Addendum N: Focal points in drawings – in aid of rich conversations | 700 |
| Addendum O: Bornedal on the comparison between Classicism and Romanticism | 707 |
| Addendum P: Paul Ricoeur on the hermeneutical arc | 710 |
| P1: Mimesis 1: Prefiguration | 710 |
| P2: Mimesis 2: Configuration | 711 |
| P3: Mimesis 3: Reconfiguration | 712 |
| Addendum Q: Sculpture – Nic Grobler | 713 |
| References | 714 |
| Index | 733 |

List of figures and tables

| | |
|--|-----|
| Figure 2-1 Reflective process | 167 |
| Figure 2-2 The process of inferential credibility..... | 168 |
| Figure 2-3 The research process with an emphasis on time. | 169 |
| Figure 2-4 Intersecting conversations | 171 |
| Table 2-1 Nonprobability & Probability sampling..... | 184 |
| Figure 3-1 Religion of Israel (adapted, Albertz 1992:21) | 233 |
| Table 3-1 Silent photo montage | 248 |
| Figure 3-1 Reception model | 267 |
| Figure 3-2 Hermeneutical/ Exegetical process (Smit 1987:47)..... | 272 |
| Figure 3-3 From interpretation to final text (adapted, Smit 1987:21). | 274 |
| Figure 3-4 The art of faith (White 1997). | 288 |
| Table 2-2 Four angles in process design (adapted, Newby and Smit 2004:80) | 390 |
| Figure 3-5 Story wall..... | 398 |
| Figure 3-6 The roller coaster of change (adapter, Newby & Smit 2004:27,30)..... | 399 |
| Figure 3-7 Continuum structured/ unstructured..... | 425 |
| Figure 3-8 Towards role differentiation..... | 426 |
| Figure 3-9 The relationship; artist, participant, therapist | 427 |
| Figure 3-10 Integrating understanding of arts in/as therapy | 428 |
| Figure 4-1 The relationship; narrative as therapy versus narrative in therapy | 473 |
| Table 4-1 Exploring metaphors | 522 |
| Figure 4-2 Localities of story (according to Ewald van Rensburg)..... | 538 |
| Figure 4-3 The homiletical plot (Lowry 2001:26). | 541 |
| Figure 4-4 The relationship between music, therapist and client (Garred 2002:40) | 564 |
| Table Addendum D, Music for music therapy (adapted image, Espenak 1981:180-185)..... | 638 |
| Table Addendum I, Plays for dramatherapy (Andersen-Warren & Grainger 2000:195) | 657 |
| Table Addendum O, Classicism versus Romanticism (adapted, Bornedal 1996:4) | 709 |

Multimedia disc and contents

Find enclosed on the inside of the back cover a multimedia compact disc – take note this is a DVD *data* disc – for computer not DVD player – that contains all the photographs, audio-video files and illustrative examples used in this document. Where relevant, I will reference to this multimedia compilation. The disc does not contain explanations to examples; these are found in this document.

The main advantage of this disc: The vibrancy of colours present better on screen and could be digitally projected to enlarge photos. Take note that in this hard copy and the electronic version of this document the highest quality resolution in JPEG format was used to enable enlargements on screen in programs that allow this. Also take note that the blurry look on some photographs should look like that (example: Diane Victor's, Smokeheads) while some photographs are included regardless of its blurriness for illustrative purposes.

Any standard computer should be able to run this disc and do so automatically.
For further inquiries email, eminent.productions@gmail.com

We recommend the following specifications:

Hardware

DVD Rom drive (will not work without)

256 MB RAM

64 MB Graphics card

Pentium III

Software

Windows Media Player 8, or higher

Microsoft PowerPoint, from 2000, XP, 2003

On the media disc the contents are provided along the following layout.

Media 1. Church productions

- Media 1.1 Ministerial Fame or Illusion
- Media 1.2 Contemporary Poetry Production

Media 2. Points versus Images

Media 3. Décor ministry

- Media 3.1 the cross our freedom
- Media 3.2 in U hande (In Your hands)
- Media 3.3 Cross with nails

Media 4. Multimedia ministry

- Media 4.1 Quest youth ministry presentation
- Media 4.2 Creative arts ministry presentation
- Media 4.3 Phyllis Robertson home
- Media 4.4 Capture to Cross

Media 5. Individual research participants

- Media 5.1 Moré
 - Media 5.1.1 Songs
 - Media 5.1.2 Beading
- Media 5.2 Marinus
 - Media 5.2.1 A multimedia journey
- Media 5.3 Bianca
 - Media 5.3.1 Songs
- Media 5.4 Gladys Agulhas (Agulhas Theatre Works)
- Media 5.5 Nic Grobler
- Media 5.6 Christo
 - Media 5.6.1 Voice of Problem

Media 6. Media montage

Media 7. Arts & Reconciliation conference

- Media 7.1 Reconciliation exhibitions
- Media 7.2 Fatherhood project

Media 8. The Art of Faith

How to survive the journey and technical data

Due to the vastness of this document I present the reader with a few helpful remarks. This idea has become important since I chose for several reasons – which will become apparent – not to present the research thematically. What this means is that various topics are not written about and done with at a specific section. The internal logic is that of providing an ongoing discussion. Please find therefore a network of ideas and story fragments that resonate with each other at different places in the document.

Referencing: Where applicable I have indicated that a specific topic has been mentioned elsewhere. I would remark: as elsewhere noted, forthcoming, see, as mentioned earlier. To follow up I have in some instances included references to pages in the *Index*. The index is not meant as a comprehensive index but will most probably give the reader a good grasp of the spirit of this document. Where specific words are found on various pages close to each other in the index; this signifies important discussions on the theme in question. Sporadically references will be made in the document itself to indicate strong resonancy with some other voice in the document. Note that prominent themes with regard to positioning (arts, methodology, and epistemology etcetera) have not been duplicated in the *Index*; they could easily be traced in the *List of Contents*.

Irregular date references: A source which is not a literary source but maybe a lecture or conference is followed by the date when the information was obtained. Such sources are also cited in the *References* section. For example: Demasure (year/month/day)

Italics: Often italics have been chosen for emphasis or concepts: *emphasis* instead of ‘emphasis.’ I have done so since the apostrophe system is being used to indicate that the reader is circumspect of a certain notion or concept. An example: In narrative research we would rather speak of *stories* instead of ‘data.’ (Note italics for emphasis and the apostrophe system for caution.) I use this

system since in some cases the conventional language is necessary for an argument, but that the reader should take notice of the writers caution in using such a concept.

Brackets: Brackets [] are used in direct quotations to distinguish personal comments, emphasis and so on of the writer of this document from the quotation.

Synopsis

In this thesis we consider how one may use the arts in narrative practise. The use of the word narrative *practise* as oppose to narrative *therapy* extends the grounding metaphor's reach beyond its use in therapy to facilitation and all other disciplines that adopts the use of this metaphor.

The arts in a contemporary perspective include dance, drama, fine arts, music and multimedia. The choice for the arts is found in the research gap, which emphasise that most conventional psychological therapies including narrative therapy has a conversational/ verbal approach. In contrast an exploration into the arts acknowledge the importance of being physically and creatively involved in the construction of meaningful realities. The exploration of the arts in light of possible interaction with narrative practise is not confined to professional voices but is inclusive of recreational skills in the arts and crafts.

The risk involved in extending the scope of the narrative metaphor beyond therapy, which may render an unmanageable amount of data, is minimized by a positioning in a pastoral perspective; pastoral in this sense, the discipline of practical theology is situated in a (one) faith community.

Chapter one considers questions of positioning relating to the arts and theology. These are informed by a certain epistemology. While methodological concerns and a positioning therein is all ready found in chapter one, chapter two is reserved for method and practical methodological concerns. Our research participants will be introduced here. Everything that this study says about the arts and its consideration in narrative practise is found in chapters three and four. Chapter three refers to all exposure from conferences attended to numerous individual conversations based on the highly reflective research design found in chapter two. In chapter three all the arts that this study was confronted with are included. Chapter four focuses in on story as art.

I regard the differentiation between arts as therapy as opposed to arts in therapy as the most profound consideration. A distinction is advocated, drawing on narrative social constructionist epistemology, between story as tool versus story as grounding metaphor; telling narratives versus performing narratives, human story telling versus narrative identity.

It is important to notice that this thesis is not presented according to themes. It is my intention that through the way in which this thesis is presented (especially so chapter three) fragments of the *story* of the research process will be evident. For this reason chapter five is included, giving the reader a better understanding of the ways in which the arts were found to function. Chapter six entails a personal and critical reflection on the research; it has the purpose of saying *well, I don't assume that this study is at the pinnacle of academic achievement nor is it the ultimate truth.*

I have myself wondered about the numerous addenda and I'm not sure that it is in an explorative study something one can too easily do without. Some addenda fit its conventional use while others contain highly relevant information. Since I did not want to force these into arguments I present them in addenda.

What I hope the reader finds is a truthful reflection on what has to me been a meaningful research journey on the use of the arts in narrative practise; a journey accounted for in academic yet participant informed language; language about ways of being with people that at times can transcend the boundaries of the spoken word.

Key concepts

Narrative Practise; Story; Social Constructionism; The Arts; Truth; Knowledge; Interpretation; Resonancy; Arts as Therapy versus Arts in Therapy; Non-verbal; Catharsis. Also see *Index* for concepts that the author view as important.