

LEGITIMACY AND FEASIBILITY OF HUMAN RIGHTS REALISATION THROUGH REGIONAL ECONOMIC COMMUNITIES IN AFRICA: THE CASE OF THE ECONOMIC COMMUNITY OF WEST AFRICAN STATES

By Solomon Tamarabrakemi Ebobrah

Thesis submitted in partial fulfilment of the requirements for the degree of Doctor of Laws (LLD) at the University of Pretoria

Prepared at the Centre for Human Rights, Faculty of Law, University of Pretoria, under the supervision of Professor Frans Viljoen

30 September 2009



DECLARATION



DEDICATION

This work is dedicated to the memories of my fathers: Late Dennis B. Ebobrah (my biological father) who unfortunately, was not alive to see me grow up and Late Clement E. Okpokiti, who saw me through the early and formative stages of my life but unfortunately, was not alive to see how I turned out.



ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

My sincere gratitude goes to the Centre for Human Rights, University of Pretoria, for giving me the opportunity to do this programme. I am particularly indebted to my Supervisor, Professor Frans Viljoen for his patience and meticulous supervision of my work. I am grateful to everyone at the Faculty of Law, University of Pretoria who assisted me in one way or another. My gratitude goes especially to the Dean, Professor Christof Heyns, Mr Norman Taku, the Deputy Director of the Centre for Human Rights, University of Pretoria, and the wonderful people who work at the Centre for Human Rights. I appreciate the invaluable comments that I received on the draft of this work from my colleagues during the LLD meeting. The friendship and encouragement I received from my office mates at the Centre for Human Rights is deeply appreciated. I am also grateful to the Danish Institute for Human Rights for the support I received during my fellowship at that institution. It contributed in no small measure to my completion of this programme. I am also grateful to my friends in successive LLM classes for their comments, encouragements and friendship.

My heartfelt gratitude goes to various other people whose contributions facilitated my study: Prof and Mrs S Odiowei and family, Mr and Mrs B Seibidor and family, Mr and Mrs A Eseimokumoh and family, Pastor and Mrs BT Obunge, Prof ES Nwauche for your invaluable support, the Ojo family, Bishop Willy Bunting, Mr A Beredugo, Prof. Fekumo, Mr Inurio Wills, Prince O Shittu and Mr Isaac George for the various ways in which you all supported me.

My wife Christy, and my boys, Stanley and Derek, for enduring my absence for all these years and supporting me in your prayers. My mother, Chief R Y Akpoyibo for her patience and prayers. My employers, the Niger Delta University, especially the Vice Chancellor, Prof Okporikpo and my colleagues at the Faculty of Law. I am grateful to Uncle Komi, the Okudus, the Fohs, the Abiris and all the Ebobrahs for your support. My very special and ever-dependable friend I D Mbengue Eleke, your friendship, belief, support and understanding was priceless as always.

To all my friends and colleagues in Pretoria and back in Nigeria that I failed to mention due to the constraint of space (I know that you know yourselves), I am truly grateful. May the Lord reward every one of you for your encouragement and support.



Summary of thesis

Since 1981, when the African Charter on Human and Peoples' Rights was adopted on the platform of the Organisation of African Unity, one of the main challenges for players in the field of human rights in Africa has been to find effective fora in which the rights of the most vulnerable can be vindicated. The African Charter on Human and Peoples' Rights, together with other African human rights instruments, the global human rights instruments to which African states are parties and national bills of rights entrenched in the national constitutions of most African states make up the body of human rights norms that exist for the benefit of victims of human rights violation in the continent. This body of normative standards are expected to be given effect at the national level. However, given that the expectation has not always been met, international supervisory bodies have played an increasingly important role in the African human rights landscape.

At the continental level, the African Commission on Human and Peoples' Rights which was established under the African Charter was the original forum for the vindication of human rights for a number of years. Over the years, other continental human rights supervisory bodies have been established under the defunct OAU and the AU. National human rights institutions and these continental bodies have gained recognition as the structures of the African human rights architecture. However, since the early part of the new millennium, new institutional actors have begun to appear in the African human rights landscape. Originally established as vehicles for subregional economic integration, regional economic communities (RECs) in Africa have expressly or implicitly authorised their organs and institutions to engage actively in the field of human rights. This trend has been most evident in the operations of the Economic Community of West African States (ECOWAS).

The entry of African RECs in the continental landscape has raised several questions. From the perspective of international law, against the background of the principle of attributed competence that guides the existence and operations of international organisations, the question of legality and legitimacy is triggered. From the perspective of protecting the unity and continued existence of the African human



rights system, questions relating to the feasibility and desirability of REC involvement in the African human rights landscape emerge for determination.

Using ECOWAS as the main case study but also touching on the budding human rights activities of the East African Community and the Southern Africa Development Community, this study has sought to demonstrate that REC involvement in the field of human rights is legitimate and feasible. Combining descriptive, prescriptive and comparative analytical approaches, this study argues that African RECs, in particular ECOWAS, can be effective vehicles for human rights realisation in Africa without compromising their original stated objectives or upsetting the work of the structures in the traditional African human rights architecture. Extracting the challenges that can be associated with REC involvement in the field of human rights, this study sets up the criteria for a non-disruptive model for subregional realisation of human rights under the platform of RECs in Africa.



Table of cases

International tribunals and quasi-judicial bodies

African Commission on Human and Peoples' Rights

SERAC v Nigeria (2001) AHRLR 60 (ACHRP 2001)

East African Court of Justice

Katabazi and 21 Others v Secretary General of the East African Community and The Attorney General of the Republic of Uganda (2007) AHRLR 119

Prof Nyoungo'o & 10 others v The Attorney General of Kenya & others, Ref No. 1 of 2006

The East African Law Society and 3 others v The Attorney General of Kenya and 3 others (Reference No 3 of 2007)

ECOWAS Community Court of Justice

Afolabi Olajide v Federal Republic of Nigeria Unreported Suit no. 2004/ECW/CCJ/04

Alice Chukwudolue and 7 Others v Senegal, Unreported Suit No. CW/CCJ/APP/07/07

Essien v The Gambia, Unreported Suit No ECW/CCJ/APP/05/05

Executive Secretary v Lijadu-Oyemade Suit No. ECW/CCJ/APP/01/05

Keita v Mali, Unreported Suit No. ECW/CCJ/APP/05/06

Koraou v Niger, Unreported Suit No: ECW/CCJ/APP/08/08

Lijadu-Oyemade v Executive Secretary of ECOWAS, Unreported Suit No. ECW/CCJ/APP/01/05

Manneh v the Gambia, Unreported Suit No ECW/CCJ/APP/04/07

Ugokwe v Nigeria, Unreported Suit No ECW/CCJ/APP/02/05

Ukor v Laleye, Unreported Suit No. ECW/CCJ/APP/01/04



European Court of Human Rights

Funke v France, 256-A Eur Ct HR (Ser. A) (1993)

Goodwin v United Kingdom (1996) 22 EHRR 123

Murray v United Kingdom (1996) 22 EHRR 29

Niemietz v Germany, 16 Eur HR Rep 97 (1993

Pellegrin v France (1996) 22 EHRR 123

Rees v United Kingdom, (2/1985/88/135), Series A, No.106 ECHR

Saunders v United Kingdom (1996) (1997) 23 EHRR 313

European Court of Justice

Commission v Italy (Case C-49/00) [2001] ECR

Brasserie de Pecheur v Germany Joined cases C-46/93 and C-48/93 [1996] ECR I-1029

Booker Aquaculture and Hydro Seafood v The Scottish Ministers C-20/00 and C-64/00 [2003] ECR I-7411

Bosphorus Hava Yollari Turizm Ve Ticaret Sirketi v Ireland App No 45036/98 (2006) 42 EHRRI

Costa/ENEL Case 6/64 (1964) ECR 1251

Erich Stauder v City of Ulm Sozialamt (Stauder) Case 29/69 [1969] ECR 419

Geitling v High Authority Joined cases 36-38/59 and 40/59 [1960] ECR 857,889].

Hoechst AG v Commission, Cases 46/87 and 227/88, [1989] E.C.R. 2859

Kadi v Council and Commission (2005) E.C.R. II-3649

Kremzow v Austria Case C-299/95 (29 May 1997) ECR I-2637

Netherlands v European Parliament and Council Case C-377/98 (2001)

Nold v Commission of the European Communities Case 4/73 [1974] ECR 491

Orkem v Commission Case 375/87 (1989) ECR 3343



P v S and Cornwall County Council CC Case C-13/94 [1996] ECR 1-2143

SA Roquette Freres v Council of the European Communities Case 138/79 [1980] ECR 3333

Rutili v Minister for the Interior Case 36/75 (1975) ECR 1219

SA and Others v Fédération Nationale des Cinémas Français [1986] 1 CMLR 365

SPUC v Grogan (1991) 3 CMLR 849

Van Gend en Loos v Nederlandse Administratie der Belastingen Case 26/62 (1963) ECR 1

Wachauf v Germany Case 5/88, [1989] ECR 2609

Yusuf and Al Barakaat International Foundation v Council and Commission (2005) E.C.R. II-3533

International Court of Justice

Aegean Sea Continental Shelf (Greece v Turkey) ICJ Reports 1978

Reparation for Injuries Suffered in the Service of the United Nations, (Advisory Opinion of 11 April 1949) ("Reparation Case"), (1949) ICJ Reports

Permanent Court of International Justice

Jurisdiction of the European Community of Danube between Galatz and Braila Advisory Opinion [1926] PCIJ Series B, no.14

Mosul Boundary case PCIJ Series B, no.12

SADC Tribunal

Campbell and 78 others v Zimbabwe SADC (T) Case No.2/2007



List of treaties and instruments

African Union and Organisation of African Unity

African Charter on Human and Peoples' Rights1981

African Charter on the Rights and Welfare of the Child 1990

African Union Constitutive Act 2000

African Economic Community Treaty 1991

African Union Convention on Preventing and Combating Corruption 2003

African Charter on Democracy, Elections and Governance 2007

Charter of the OAU 1969

OAU Convention Governing the Specific Aspects of Refugee Problems in Africa 1963

OAU Convention on the Prevention and Combating of Terrorism 2004

Protocol to the African Charter on Human and Peoples' Rights on the Establishment of an African Court on Human and Peoples' Rights 1998

Protocol to the African Charter on Human and Peoples' Rights on the Rights of Women in Africa 2003

Protocol relating to the Establishment of the Peace and Security Council of the African Union 2002

Protocol on the Statute of the African Court of Justice and Human Rights 2009

Protocol to the Treaty Establishing the African Economic Community relating to the Pan-African Parliament 2001

Council of Europe

European Convention for the Protection of Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms 1951

East African Community

EAC Treaty 1991



Economic Community of West African States

Accra Declaration on War-Affected Children in West Africa 1991

Convention Regulating Interstate road Transportation between ECOWAS Member states 1982

Declaration on Political Principles 1990

ECOWAS Treaty 1975

Protocol Relating to the Mechanism for Conflict Prevention, Management, Resolution, Peace-Keeping and Security 1999

Protocol A/P.1/5/79 Relating to Free Movement of Persons, Residence and Establishment

Protocol A/P2/8/94 on the ECOWAS Parliament 1994

Protocol A/P1/7/91 On the Community Court of Justice 1991

Protocol A/SP/12/01 on Democracy and Good Governance Supplementary to the Protocol relating to the Mechanism for Conflict Prevention, Management, Resolution, Peacekeeping and Security 2001

Revised ECOWAS Treaty 1993

Supplementary Protocol A/SP.1/7/85 on the Code of Conduct for the Implementation of the Protocol on Free Movement of Persons, the Rights of Residence and Establishment 1985

Supplementary Protocol Adopting Community Rules on Investment and the Modalities for their Implementation With ECOWAS 2008

Supplementary Protocol A/SP1/6/89 Amending and Complementing the Provisions of Article 7 of the Protocol on Free Movement, Right of Residence and Establishment. 1986

Supplementary Protocol A/SP1/01/05 Amending the Protocol (A/P.1/7/91) relating to the Community Court of Justice 2005

Supplementary Protocol A/SP.3/06/06 Amending Protocol A/P.2/8/94 Relating to the Community Parliament 2006

Supplementary Protocol A/SP2/06/06 Amending Article 3 Paragraphs 1, 2 and 4, Article 4 Paragraphs 1, 3 and 7 and Article 7 Paragraph 3 of the Protocol on the Community Court of Justice 2006

Supplementary Protocol A/SP1/06/06 Amending the Revised Treaty 2006

European Union

Community Charter of Fundamental Social Rights for Workers 1989

EU Charter of Fundamental Rights 2000

Treaty of Amsterdam 1997

Treaty of Lisbon 2007

Treaty of the European Union (TEU) at Maastricht in 1992

Treaty of Nice 2001

Treaty of Paris for the establishment of the European Coal and Steel Community 1952

Southern Africa Development Community

Charter of Fundamental Rights in SADC 2003

SADC Protocol on Gender and Development 2008

SADC Protocol on Politics, Defence and Security Cooperation 2001

SADC Treaty 1992

United Nations

Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination Against Women 1979

International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights 1966

Statute of the International Court of Justice 1945

Universal Declaration of Human Rights 1948

United Nations Charter 1945

Vienna Convention on the Law of Treaties (1969)

Χİİ



List of abbreviations

AAPC All African Peoples' Conference

ACP African-Caribbean–Pacific

AEC African Economic Community

AHRLJ African Human Rights Law Journal

APRM African Peer Review Mechanism

AMU Arab Maghreb Union

AU African Union

AUPSC African Union Peace and Security Council

CEDAW Convention on the Elimination of all forms of

Discrimination Against Women

CEMAC Central African Economic and Monetary Community

CEN-SAD Community of Sahel Sahara States

CEPGL Great Lakes River Basin

CESCR International Covenant on Economic, Social and

Cultural Rights

CFSP Common Foreign and Security Policy

CFR EU Charter of Fundamental Rights

CIAS Conference of Independent African States

COMESA Common Market for Eastern and Southern Africa

CoE Council of Europe

CT Consolidated Treaty of the European Community

EAC East African Community

EACJ East African Court of Justice

EC European Communities

ECA United Nations Economic Commission for Africa

ECCAS Economic Community of Central African States



ECCJ ECOWAS Community Court of Justice

ECHR European Convention for the Protection of Human

Rights and Fundamental Freedoms

ECJ European Court of Justice

ECOMOG ECOWAS Monitoring Group

ECOWAS Economic Community of West African States

ECSC European Coal and Steel Community

ECtHR European Court of Human Rights

EEC European Economic Community

EGDC ECOWAS Gender Development Centre

ESCRs Economic, social and cultural rights

EU European Union

Euratom European Atomic Energy Community

FAL Final Act of Lagos

FRA EU Fundamental Rights Agency

ICJ International Court of Justice

IDPs Internally displaced persons

IGAD Intergovernmental Authority for Development

IGADD Intergovernmental Authority on Drought and

Development

ILC International Law Commission

IOC Indian Ocean Commission

LPA Lagos Plan of Action

MRU Manu River Union

NEPAD New Partnership for Africa's Development

NGOs Non Governmental Organisations



OAU Organisation of African Unity

OAU/AU-RECs Protocol OAU/AU Protocol on Relations Between the African

Economic Community and the Regional Economic

Community

PAP Protocol Protocol to the Treaty Establishing the African

Economic Community relating to the Pan-African

Parliament

PCIJ Permanent Court of International Justice

PJCC Police and Judicial Cooperation in Criminal Matters

PSC Peace and Security Council

PSC Protocol Protocol relating to the Establishment of the Peace and

Security Council of the African Union

REC Regional Economic Community

SACU Southern African Custom Union

SADC Southern Africa Development Community

SADC PDS Protocol SADC Protocol on Politics, Defence and Security

Cooperation

SADCC Southern African Development Coordination

Conference

SEC Subregional Economic Communities

SMC Standing Mediation Committee

TEU Treaty of the EU

UDAO Union Dounaniere de L'Afrique de l'Ouest

UDEAC Union Douanière et Économique de l'Afrique Centrale

UDHR Universal Declaration of Human Rights

UMA Union du Maghreb Arabe

UN United Nations

UNDP United Nations Development Programme

UNHCR United Nations High Commission for Refugees



VCLT Vienna Convention on the Law of Treaties

WAHO West African Health Organisation

ZaöRV Zeitschrift für ausländisches öffentliches Recht und

Völkerrecht



TABLE OF CONTENTS

Declaration Dedication Acknowledgments Summary of thesis Table of cases	ii iii iv v viii		
		Table of treaties and other instruments	X
		List of abbreviations	xii
		Table of contents	xvi
		Chapter one	
Introduction			
1.1 Background to the study	1		
1.2 Thesis statement and research questions	10		
1.3 Clarification of terminology	11		
1.4 Significance of the study	19		
1.5 Research methodology	21		
1.6 Breakdown of chapters	23		
1.7 Limitations and temporal delineation of the study	25		
Chapter two Human rights and international integration in Africa			
2.1 Introduction	29		
2.2 States, sovereignty and international organisations	30		
2.3 History of African integration	33		
2.4 Human rights in continental integration initiatives in Africa	35		
2.4.1 Explaining integration	36		
2.4.2 The Organisation of African Unity	38		
2.4.3 The Lagos Plan of Action and Final Act of Lagos	43		



2.4.4 The African Economic Community (The Abuja Treaty)	45
2.4.5 The African Union	48
2.5 Subregional institutions as foundational blocks for integration in Africa	52
2.5.1 Nature and motivation for subregional integration	53
2.5.2 The Main Regional Economic Communities in Africa	58
2.5.2.1 The Arab Maghreb Union	59
2.5.2.2 The Common Market for Eastern and Southern Africa	59
2.5.2.3 The Economic Community of Central African States	60
2.5.2.4 The Economic Community of West African States	61
2.5.2.5 The Intergovernmental Authority for Development	61
2.5.2.6 The Southern African Development Community	62
2.5.2.7 The Community of Sahel Sahara States	62
2.5.2.8 The East African Community	63
2.6 Conceptualising the link between political and economic integration in Africa	64
2.7 Human rights in the discourse of institutions for integration in Africa	73
2.7.1 Continental integration and human rights	73
2.7.2 Regional integration and human rights	79
2.8 The African human rights system: whither subregional mechanisms?	83
2.8.1 Norm creating instruments in the African human rights system	84
2.8.2 Mechanisms and institutions for human rights realisation	86
2.8.2.1 The African Commission	87
2.8.2.2 The African Children's Rights Committee	88
2.8.2.3 The African Court on Human and Peoples' Rights	89
2.9 Interim Conclusion	92
Chapter three	
ECOWAS: A new vehicle for human rights realisation in West Africa?	
3.1 Introduction	97



3.2 Towards integration in West African	98
3.3 The idea of human rights in ECOWAS	99
3.3.1 Traditional human rights	100
3.3.2 Democracy and good governance	100
3.3.3 Peace, security and humanitarian law	101
3.4 The sources of rights in the ECOWAS framework	102
3.4.1 The 1993 revised ECOWAS Treaty	104
3.4.2 Conventions and Protocols of the Community	107
3.4.3 Subsidiary legislations, declarations and other 'soft law instruments'	109
3.4.4 General principles of law	113
3.4.5 The African Charter on Human and Peoples' rights	115
3.4.6 Other relevant instruments of the OAU/AU	117
3.4.7 The United Nations Charter, the Universal Declaration on Human Rights	
and other relevant global human rights instruments	120
3.5 Human rights in the mandates of the main institutions and	
organs of ECOWAS	123
3.5.1 The Authority of Heads of State and Government	124
3.5.2 The Council of Ministers	125
3.5.3 The Community Parliament	126
3.5.4 The Economic and Social Council	127
3.5.5 The ECOWAS Community Court of Justice	128
3.5.6 The ECOWAS Commission	129
3.6 ECOWAS as a post-national human rights institution	131
3.7 A new pillar in an old building: Relation with existing human rights systems	139
3.7.1 Relation with national systems for human rights realisation	140
3.7.2 Relation with African (continental) human rights system	143
3.7.3 Relation with the global human rights system	148
3.8 Interim conclusion	149
Chapter four	
Current ECOWAS human rights practice: the conundrum of efficacy	and
symmetry	
4.1 Introduction	152
4.2 The Authority: Beyond the conferences	153



4.2.1 General policy directions	154
4.2.2 Creation, modification and control of Community institutions	157
4.2.3 Responsibility to implement and enforce Community obligations of	
member states	159
4.2.4 Human rights responsibilities in Community protocols	161
4.3 A mandate without a method? The Community parliament	163
4.3.1 Recommendations and other advisory inputs to decision making	164
4.3.2 Petitions to Parliament	167
4.3.3 Fact finding and other missions	168
4.4 A licence to protect: The Community Court of Justice	169
4.4.1 From interpretation to protection: the human rights jurisdiction of the ECCJ	171
4.4.2 The ECCJ as a human rights Court	173
4.4.2.1 Material jurisdiction of the Court	173
4.4.2.2 Temporal jurisdiction	180
4.4.2.3 Territorial jurisdiction	181
4.4.2.4 Personal jurisdiction	182
4.4.2.5 Procedure before the ECCJ	185
4.4.4.6 Human rights judgments of the ECCJ: Can the protector protect?	187
4.5 The Commission: more than a secretariat	188
4.5.1 Facilitator of human rights meetings and conferences	190
4.5.2 Human Rights training programmes	193
4.5.3 Hosting of special units and execution of community human rights projects	194
4.5.4 Formulation and initiation of human rights policies	197
4.6 The Council of Ministers	198
4.7 Other institutions in the system	198
4.8 Interim conclusion	201
Chapter five	
Insights from beyond the continent: Human rights in the European Union	
5.1 Introduction	205
5.2 The European Union in context	206
5.3 The evolution of human rights in the EU Constitutional framework: activism	
or illegality?	209



5.3.1 Judicial origins for Community human rights competence	213
5.3.1.1 Legal consequences of ECJ action in the field of human rights	218
5.3.2 Treaty foundations for Community human rights competence	222
5.4 Current human rights practice: addressing issues of overlap and	
organisational conflicts	227
5.4.1 Community standard-setting in the field of human rights	229
5.4.1.1 The ECHR	230
5.4.1.2 The Workers' Charter	232
5.4.1.3 The EU Charter of Fundamental Rights	233
5.4.2 Judicial protection of rights	237
5.4.2.1 Individual access to the ECJ	237
5.4.2.2 Applicable sources of human rights standards	240
5.4.2.3 Use of ECtHR Case law	242
5.4.2.4 Nature of human rights protection before the ECJ	243
5.4.2.5 The scope of the ECJ human rights protection	245
5.4.3 Non-judicial protection: observation and monitoring	248
5.4.3.1 The human rights work of the European Parliament	249
5.4.3.2 The human rights work of the European Commission	251
5.4.3.3 The Fundamental Rights Agency	252
5.5 Mechanisms for maintaining intra- and inter-organisational balance in	
human rights practice	254
5.5.1 The principle of limited competence	257
5.5.2 The principle of subsidiarity	260
5.5.3 Cooperation and coordination	265
5.6 Similarities, dissimilarities and insights	269
5.7 Interim conclusion	273
Chapter six	
Comparative perspectives in Africa: Human rights in the EAC and SADC	
6.1 Introduction	275
6.2 Human rights in the East Africa Community	277
6.2.1 The East African Community	278
6.2.2 Human rights in the EAC Treaty framework	280
6.2.3 Current human rights practice	282

6.2.3.1 Standard-setting and sources of rights	283
6.2.3.2 Judicial protection of rights	287
6.2.3.3 Non-judicial protection of rights	293
6.2.4 Fertile grounds for improved subregional protection of rights	296
6.3 Human rights in the Southern Africa Development Community	297
6.3.1 The Southern Africa Development Community	298
6.3.2 Human rights in the SADC Treaty framework	299
6.3.3 Current human rights practice	301
6.3.3.1 Standard-setting and sources of rights	302
6.3.3.2 Judicial protection of rights	308
6.3.3.3 Non-judicial protection of rights	312
6.3.4 Sustaining processes for human rights protection	315
6.4 Towards non-disruptive subregional systems	316
6.5 Interim conclusion	319
Chapter seven	
Conclusion and recommendations	
7.1 Introduction	321
7.2 Synopsis of findings	322
7.3 Conclusions	330
7.4 An ideal model for subregional human rights regimes in Africa	335
7.5 Recommendations	338
Bibliography	341