UNIVERSITEIT VAN PRETORIA
UNIVERSITY OF PRETORIA
YUNIBESITHI YA PRETORIA

RESTRUCTURING SOUTH AFRICAN MUSIC EDUCATION CURRICULUM TO MEET THE POST-APARTHEID PARADIGM SHIFT IN EDUCATION

by

Ntshengedzeni Alfred Nevhutanda

Submitted in accordance with the requirements for the

degree

Doctor Musicae

in the

Department of Music

School of the Arts

Faculty of Humanities

University of Pretoria

Promoter: Prof. Caroline van Niekerk

Pretoria: March 2005

© University of Pretoria

I dedicate this work to those who have written me off. With God everything is possible.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

Acknowledgements go to the following people, whose support in various ways has been decisive for the successful completion of this thesis.

- My promoter, Prof. Caroline van Niekerk, for her dedication to call a spade a spade with regard to any unprofessional work. Thank you for your healthy criticism and encouragement.
- University of Pretoria's music library for being willing to aid in the search process.
- My darling wife Tshilidzi, the woman I share my life with, for unconditional support and encouragement to stay focused on this research project. It paid dividends.
- My children, Munei, Murendwa and Phindulo (Chief) for their support and prayers. I have climbed my mountain, yours?
- My mother and my late father for bringing me up.
- My spiritual leader Pastor G. Muhali, You know my background more than my family members. Thank you for your prayers.

UNIVERSITEIT VAN PRETORIA
UNIVERSITY OF PRETORIA
YUNIBESITHI YA PRETORIA

ABSTRACT

This thesis provides a fundamental conceptual framework for a new paradigm of Music Education in South Africa. The main argument presented is for a new perspective to supplement and complement the Outcomes-based approach currently used in education: the complexity theory in Music Education and Music Technology perspective. In this the research seeks to overcome identified shortcomings of the past era's curriculum philosophy of Music Education.

A democratic South Africa provides equal educational opportunity to all South Africans. Many of the values currently held in arts subjects in South Africa run contrary to this expectation. Music Education paradigms link directly with the following values of arts: drill and practice, performing, scientific management, and creative thinking models. The only curriculum that can exist in this environment depends on the two major factors that have always driven vocational education: task analysis based on outcomes and the material contexts primary to the course.

The curriculum in the emerging technology education paradigm bases its values on solid educational goals. Successful education focuses on problem solving, sensitive human relations, self-understanding, and the integration of one's total experience into an educational system that aims toward self renewal and lifelong learning. The word "technology" conjures images of change and the future. The emerging technology education paradigm seeks to advance beyond the philosophy of Music Education as content. With technology and the outcomes-based approach as the charge, content will change as paradigm and society change.

Using the total school curriculum as a resource base, the new technology education paradigm lends credence to its philosophical position within the Outcomes-based approach adopted in the South African education system. The role of Music Technology in the 21st century has many social implications. Change is the key. All educational curriculum springs from some image of the future. If the image of the future held by a society is grossly inaccurate, its Music Education curriculum will betray its learners.

The research is predominantly a qualitative study that uses literature survey, an overview of different paradigms in education and music with particular reference to South African Music Education.

Keywords: Music Education, Music Technology, Outcomes-based Education, music curriculum, complexity theory, modern paradigm, postmodern paradigm, integrated approach, constructivist approach, interdisciplinary teaching

UNIVERSITEIT VAN PRETORIA
UNIVERSITY OF PRETORIA
YUNIBESITHI YA PRETORIA

TABLE OF CONTENTS

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS		ii
ABSTRACT		iii
CHAPTER 1: INTRODUCTION, ORIENTATION AND PROBLEM IDENTIFICATION		
1.1	INTRODUCTION	1-1
1.2	MUSIC EDUCATION IN A CHANGING CONTEXT	1-3
1.3	HISTORICAL MOMENTS IN THE ESTABLISHMENT OF ARTS EDUCATION IN SOUTH AFRICA	1-5
1.4	FOCUS OF THE RESEARCH STUDY	1-8
1.5	FORMULATION OF THE RESEARCH QUESTION	1-9
1.6	METHOD OF STUDY	1-11
1.7	CLARIFICATION OF CONCEPTS AND TERMS	1-12
1.7.1	Restructuring	1-13
1.7.2	Arts Education	1-13
1.7.3	Culture	1-14
1.7.4	Music Education	1-14
1.7.5	Curriculum	1-15
1.7.6	Multiculturalism	1-16
1.7.7	Paradigm	1-17
1.7.8	Integrated Approach	1-18
1.7.9	Outcomes-based Education	1-18
1.7.10	Poststructuralism	1-19
1.7.11	The modern paradigm	1-19
1.7.12	The postmodern paradigm	1-19
1.7.13	Complexity theory	1-20

UNIVERSITEIT VAN PRETORIA
UNIVERSITY OF PRETORIA
YUNIBESITHI YA PRETORIA

1.7.14	Transformation	1-20
1.8	STRUCTURE OF THESIS	1-20
1.9	NOTES TO THE READER	1-21
CHAPTER 2:	THE STRUCTURE OF THE SOUTH AFRICAN EDUCATION SYSTEM	
2.1	INTRODUCTION	2-1
2.2	THE SOUTH AFRICAN QUALIFICATIONS AUTHORITY (SAQA)	2-1
2.3	THE NATIONAL QUALIFICATIONS FRAMEWORK (NQF)	2-3
2.4	PRINCIPLES OF THE NQF	2-5
2.5	LEVELS OF THE NQF	2-6
2.6	THE LEARNING AREAS OF THE NQF	2-8
2.7	QUALITY ASSURERS	2-10
2.7.1	National Standards Bodies (NSBs)	2-10
2.7.2	Standards Generating Bodies (SGBs)	2-11
2.7.3	Education and Training Quality Assurers (ETQAs)	2-12
2.8	UNIT STANDARDS	2-12
2.9	MEUSSA'S UNIT STANDARDS	2-13
2.10	IMPLICATIONS OF THE STRUCTURAL CHANGES FOR EDUCATION IN SOUTH AFRICA	2-14
2.10.1	An Outcomes–based approach	2-14
2.10.2	Critical and Developmental Outcomes	2-15
2.10.3	Exit level learning outcomes	2-17
2.10.4	Specific outcomes/Assessment Standards	2-17
2.11	PROGRAMMES AND QUALIFICATIONS	2-18
2.12	OUTCOMES-BASED EDUCATION DEFINED	2-19

UNIVERSITEIT VAN PRETORIA
UNIVERSITY OF PRETORIA
YUNIBESITHI YA PRETORIA

2.12.1	Traditional OBE	2-22
2.12.2	Transitional OBE	2-22
2.12.3	Transformational OBE	2-23
2.12.4	Critical remarks on OBE	2.23
2.12.4.1	OBE as an educational transformation strategy for the 'new' South African education system	2-24
2.12.4.2	What Outcomes-based education is all about	2-26
2.13	THE EMANCIPATORY RHETORIC OF OBE	2-30
2.14	OBE: EDUCATION WITH PRODUCTION?	2-32
2.15	OBE, GLOBALISATION AND THE CAPITALIST MARKET	2-32
2.16	THE EXCLUSION OF AFRICAN CULTURE IN OBE	2-33
2.17	THE DEMISE OF CURRICULUM 2005, THE SUGGESTED INTRODUCTION OF CURRICULUM 21 (C21) AND THE REINTRODUCTION OF C2005	2-36
2.18	COMPARATIVE PRINCIPLES AND PRACTICES OF OBE IN SOUTH AFRICA, AND OF PROGRESSIVE EDUCATION IN AMERICA	2-39
2.19	SUMMARY	2-42

CHAPTER 3: CONCEPTUAL FRAMES THAT HAVE INFORMED MUSIC EDUCATION IN THE WEST

3.1	INTRODUCTION	3-1
3.2	BACKGROUND TO THE CONCEPT OF MUSIC EDUCATION	3-1
3.2.1	Education in Music	3-7
3.2.2	Education about Music	3-8
3.2.3	Education for Music	3-8
3.2.4	Education by means of Music	3-9
3.3	WHY MUSIC IN EDUCATION?	3-9

UNIVERSITEIT VAN PRETORIA
UNIVERSITY OF PRETORIA
YUNIBESITHI YA PRETORIA

3.4	CURRENT PHILOSOPHIES OF MUSIC EDUCATION	3-11
3.5	MUSIC CURRICULUM	3-15
3.6	CONCEPTS OF MUSIC EDUCATION	3-17
3.7	MUSIC EDUCATION FRAGMENTATION	3-18
3.8	PLANNING A MUSIC CURRICULUM	3-26
3.9	GENERAL PRINCIPLES FOR CURRICULUM PLANNING	3-27
3.10	TEACHING APPROACHES TO MUSIC EDUCATION	3-30
3.10.1	The conventional-liberal approach	3-32
3.10.1.1	Emile Jacques-Dalcroze (1865-1950) and his philosophy of Music Education	3-32
3.10.1.2	Zoltán Kodály (1882-1967) and his philosophy of Music Education	3-33
3.10.1.3	Carl Orff (1895-1982) and the Creativity Philosophy	3-35
3.10.2	The liberal avant-garde approach	3-36
3.10.2.1	John Paynter	3-37
3.10.2.2	Murray Schafer and Creative Music Education	3-38
3.10.2.3	George Self: New Notation	3-39
3.11	A PROPOSED CONSTRUCTIVIST APPROACH TO MUSIC EDUCATION CURRICULUM	3-39
3.12	THE IMPLICATIONS OF CURRICULUM 2005 FOR MUSIC EDUCATION	3-42
3.12.1	Music as part of the Arts and Culture Learning Area	3-42
3.12.1.1	Redressing imbalances	3-43
3.12.1.2	Developing literacy	3-43
3.12.1.3	Specific outcomes	3-43
3.12.1.4	Assessment in Arts with reference to Music	3-45

UNIVERSITEIT VAN PRETORIA
UNIVERSITY OF PRETORIA
YUNIBESITHI YA PRETORIA

3.13	MUSIC EDUCATION IN THE 21ST CENTURY	3-48
3.13.1	The declining relevance of Western art music and the rising relevance and classicalization of American vernacular music of the 20th century	3-48
3.13.2	The two-pronged effect of the use of technology for music performance and creativity: the unemployment of traditional, professional human performers and the rise of amateur creativity	3-49
3.13.3	The equalization and democratization of society in general, and the growing resurgence of avocational and amateur musicianship	3-49
3.13.4	The changing role of Music Education at institutions in South Africa	3-49
3.14	MULTICULTURAL MUSIC EDUCATION	3-50
3.15	SUMMARY	3-51
CHAPTER 4: PARADIGMS AND EDUCATION: A THEORETICAL FRAMEWORK		
4.1	INTRODUCTION	4-1
4.2	KUHN'S APPROACH TO UNDERSTANDING THEORETICAL CHANGE	4-2
4.3	CURRICULUM POLICY	4-3
4.4	PARADIGMS OF INQUIRY	4-4
4.4.1	Positivism	4-4
4.4.2	Post-Positivism	4-4
4.4.3	Critical Theory	4-5
4.4.4	Constructivism	4-5
4.5	POLICY FRAMEWORK FOR CURRICULUM DEVELOPMENT	4-5

4.6	TRADITIONAL THEORY: SCIENTISTIC POSITIVISM AND TECHNICIST RATIONALISM	4-6
4.6.1	Scientism	4-6
4.6.2	Technicism	4-7
4.7	CHAOS / COMPLEXITY THEORY	4-8
4.7.1	The application of complexity theory to education	4-9
4.7.2	Complexity theory and value	4-10
4.8	CORE VALUES UNDERLYING MODERNIST EDUCATION	4-10
4.8.1	Reductionism	4-11
4.8.2	Rationalism	4-12
4.8.3	Objectivity	4-12
4.8.4	Optimism and progress	4-13
4.8.5	Mechanical causality	4-13
4.9	SOME VALUES SUGGESTED BY COMPLEXITY THEORY	4-14
4.9.1	The expansion of rationality	4-15
4.9.2	Subjectivity	4-15
4.9.3	Tempered optimism	4-15
4.9.4	Complex order	4-16
4.10	THE TRANSFORMATION OF EDUCATION	4-16
4.11	CURRICULUM DEVELOPMENT	4-17
4.11.1	Curriculum Development Process	4-17
4.11.2	Curriculum Development and Critical Outcomes	4-19
4.11.3	Curriculum Perspectives	4-22
4.12	COMPLEXITY THEORY AND OUTCOMES-BASED EDUCATION	4-24
4.13	HABERMASIAN CRITICAL EDUCATIONAL THEORY	4-27

UNIVERSITEIT VAN PRETORIA
UNIVERSITY OF PRETORIA
YUNIBESITHI YA PRETORIA

4.14	CONSTRUCTIVIST THEORY	4-30
4.15	CONSTRUCTIVISM AND ITS IMPACT ON THE PRACTICE OF TEACHING	4-31
4.16	SOCIAL CONSTRUCTIVISM, CRITICAL THEORY AND CRITICAL OUTCOMES	4-32
4.17	MAJOR MUSICAL PARADIGMS AND MUSIC EDUCATION	4-36
4.17.1	From Modern to Postmodern approaches to Music Education	4-36
4.17.2	Industrialization	4-38
4.17.3	Modernism	4-39
4.17.4	Musical changes and styles in Modernism	4-41
4.17.4.1	Claude Debussy (1862-1918)	4-43
4.17.4.2	Igor Stravinsky (1882-1971)	4-43
4.17.4.3	Arnold Schoenberg (1874-1951)	4-43
4.17.4.4	Béla Bartók (1881-1945)	4-43
4.17.4.5	Charles Ives (1874-1954)	4-44
4.17.4.6	Aaron Copland (1900-1990)	4-44
4.17.5	What is Postmodernism?	4-45
4.17.6	Implications of Modernism and Postmodernism in Music Education	4-49
4.17.6.1	Modernist views on meaning in music	4-49
4.17.6.2	Postmodern views on meaning in music	4-50
4.17.7	Transforming Music Education through arts partnership programmes	4-52
4.18	SUMMARY	4-55

UNIVERSITEIT VAN PRETORIA
UNIVERSITY OF PRETORIA
YUNIBESITHI YA PRETORIA

CHAPTER 5: WRITING OUTCOMES-BASED MATERIALS FOR MUSIC EDUCATION: COMPLEXITIES AND CONSIDERATIONS

5.1	INTRODUCTION	5-1
5.2	ARTS AND CULTURE	5-1
5.3	ARTS AND CULTURE AS A LEARNING AREA	5-1
5.4	CURRICULUM INTEGRATION	5-8
5.4.1	The Fragmented Model	5-8
5.4.2	The Connected Model	5-9
5.4.3	The Nested Model	5-9
5.4.4	The Sequenced Model	5-10
5.4.5	The Shared Model	5-10
5.4.6	The Webbed Model	5-10
5.4.7	The Threaded Model	5-11
5.4.8	The Integrated Model	5-11
5.4.9	The Immersed Model	5-12
5.4.10	The Networked Model	5-12
5.4.11	Using the Models	5-13
5.5	WRITING A MUSIC EDUCATION PROGRAMME THAT WILL LEAD STUDENTS TO GROWTH IN PERSONAL KNOWLEDGE	5-13
5.6	WRITING A MUSIC EDUCATION PROGRAMME SO THAT STUDENTS RECEIVE THE SKILLS OF THEORETICAL DISCOURSE	5-14
5.7	WRITING A MUSIC EDUCATION PROGRAMME SO THAT STUDENTS DO NOT SEE KNOWLEDGE AS PURELY INSTRUMENTAL	5-14
5.8	WRITING A MUSIC EDUCATION PROGRAMME SO THAT STUDENTS UNDERSTAND THAT KNOWLEDGE CONSISTS OF COHERENT AND RELATED BODIES OF INFORMATION	5-15

UNIVERSITEIT VAN PRETORIA
UNIVERSITY OF PRETORIA
YUNIBESITHI YA PRETORIA

5.9	WRITING A MUSIC EDUCATION PROGRAMME TO CONTRIBUTE TO MASTERY OF KNOWLEDGE	5-15
5.10	WRITING A MUSIC EDUCATION PROGRAMME TO ENSURE THAT EDUCATION IS SEEN AS A PROCESS AND NOT A PRODUCT	5-16
5.11	WRITING A MUSIC EDUCATION PROGRAMME TO ENSURE THAT STUDENTS UNDERSTAND HOW CRITIQUE OPERATES	5-17
5.12	WRITING A MUSIC EDUCATION PROGRAMME TO ENSURE THAT STUDENTS ACQUIRE BOTH BREADTH AND DEPTH OF KNOWLEDGE	5-17
5.13	HOW DOES ONE DESIGN MUSIC LESSONS AND DO ASSESSMENT ACCORDING TO THE METHODS OF OBE?	5-18
5.14	AFRICAN, INDIAN, COLOURED AND WESTERN MUSIC	5-20
5.15	IMPLICATIONS OF SOUTH AFRICAN MUSICAL CULTURES FOR MUSIC EDUCATION	5-22
5.16	THE CONTEXT OF MUSIC EDUCATION IN SOUTH AFRICA	5-24
5.17	OBE AND MUSIC EDUCATION	5-26
5.17.1	Outcomes-based?	5-27
5.17.2	Interdisciplinary teaching and Music Education	5-28
5.17.3	Interdisciplinary teaching, Multicultural Music Education and Curriculum 2005	5-29
5.17.4	An example: "Care for the Environment"	5-29
5.18	A BALANCED MUSIC CURRICULUM	5-30
5.19	OMIBIYI'S MODEL OF AN AFRICAN MUSIC CURRICULUM	5-32
5.20	PERFORMING MUSIC IN THE AFRICAN CULTURE	5-34
5.20.1	Music/dance emphasises communal performance	5-39
5.20.2	Music/dance provides holistic connections	5-39
5.20.3	Music/dance emphasises oral-kinaesthetic ways of teaching and learning	5-40

UNIVERSITEIT VAN PRETORIA
UNIVERSITY OF PRETORIA
YUNIBESITHI YA PRETORIA

5.21	PERFORMING MUSIC IN INDIAN CULTURE	5-40
5.22	PERFORMING MUSIC IN COLOURED CULTURE	5-42
5.23	PERFORMING MUSIC IN WESTERN CULTURE	5-43
5.24	SOME OPPORTUNITIES AND PROBLEMS	5-44
5.25	SUMMARY	5-45

CHAPTER 6: TECHNOLOGICAL ADVANCES AND EXPERIMENTALISM IN MUSIC EDUCATION IN SOUTH AFRICA

6.1	INTRODUCTION	6-1
6.2	THE NEW TECHNOLOGY AND CURRICULUM DESIGN	6-1
6.3	THE AVANT GARDE	6-2
6.4	TECHNOLOGY AND SYNTHETICISM	6-4
6.5	DEVELOPMENT OF ELECTRONIC INSTRUMENTS, DEVICES AND TECHNIQUES	6-7
6.5.1	Early developments	6-7
6.5.2	Electronic Music following World War II until the 1960s	6-8
6.5.3	Equipment in Early Electronic Music Studios	6-9
6.6	COMPONENTS OF MUSIC TECHNOLOGY	6-10
6.6.1	Electronic Musical Instruments (EMI)	6-10
6.6.2	MIDI Sequencing (MS)	6-10
6.6.3	Multimedia and Digitized Media (MDM)	6-11
6.6.4	Internet and Telecommunications (IT)	6-11
6.6.5	Computer Music (CM)	6-11
6.6.6	Music Notation (MN)	6-12
6.6.7	Computer-based Education/Instruction/Training (CBE/I/T)	6-12
6.6.8	Computers, Information Systems and Lab Management (CISLM)	6-12

UNIVERSITEIT VAN PRETORIA
UNIVERSITY OF PRETORIA
YUNIBESITHI YA PRETORIA

6.6.9	Audio Technology (AT)	6-12
6.6.10	Research in Music Technology (R)	6-13
6.7	MEDIA PROGRAMMING	6-13
6.8	INFORMATION TECHNOLOGY AND MUSIC EDUCATION	6-15
6.9	THE VALUES OF TECHNOLOGY-BASED MUSIC EDUCATION	6-17
6.10	CURRICULUM PLANNING FOR MUSIC EDUCATION TECHNOLOGY	6-19
6.10.1	Learning outcomes: intended	6-20
6.10.2	Assessment	6-21
6.11	INTERACTIVE TECHNOLOGY-BASED MUSIC INSTRUCTION	6-21
6.11.1	Audio cassettes	6-22
6.11.2	Video cassettes	6-23
6.11.3	Computer-assisted learning	6-24
6.11.3.1	Computer-managed instruction	6-25
6.11.3.2	Computer-assisted instruction	6-25
6.11.3.3	Computer-based instruction	6-26
6.12	THE EDUCATIONAL IMPACT OF THE WORLD WIDE WEB (WWW) ON MUSIC EDUCATION	6-27
6.13	DESIGNING WEB-BASED INSTRUCTION	6-30
6.14	INDIVIDUALIZED TECHNOLOGY-BASED MUSIC INSTRUCTION	6-31
6.15	CURRICULUM PLANNING OF TECHNOLOGY-BASED MUSIC EDUCATION	6-31
6.16	OUTCOMES FOR STUDENTS AND TEACHERS RELATED TO TECHNOLOGY APPLICATIONS	6-32
6.17	TECHNOLOGY DEVELOPMENT AND APPLICATIONS TO SUPPORT TEACHING AND LEARNING	6-33

UNIVERSITEIT VAN PRETORIA
UNIVERSITY OF PRETORIA
YUNIBESITHI YA PRETORIA

6.18	PRINCIPLES OF MUSIC TECHNOLOGY	6-34
6.18.1	Integration	6-34
6.18.2	Specialization	6-35
6.18.3	Quality	6-35
6.18.4	Reward	6-35
6.19	SUMMARY	6-36

CHAPTER 7: EVALUATION, CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

7.1	INTRODUCTION	7-1
7.2	ANSWERING THE RESEARCH QUESTIONS	7-1
7.3	FINDINGS	7-3
7.3.1	Music Education in South Africa	7-3
7.3.2	Outcomes-based education	7-5
7.3.3	Technology-based Music Education	7-6
7.3.4	Integrated approach to Music Education	7-8
7.3.5	Theoretical framework	7-9
7.3.6	Curriculum for musical praxis	7-10
7.4	CONCLUSIONS	7-12
7.5	RECOMMENDATIONS	7-14
7.6	STRATEGIES FOR THE IMPLEMENTATION OF MUSIC EDUCATION	7-15
	SOURCES	S-1