

**Music education in junior secondary schools in Botswana:
the way forward**

Alfred Bakang Segomotso

October 2011

**Music education in junior secondary schools in Botswana:
the way forward**

by

Alfred Bakang Segomotso

A dissertation submitted in fulfilment of the requirements for the degree

MMUS (MUSIC EDUCATION)

in the Department of Music

Faculty of Humanities

University of Pretoria

Study leader: Prof John Hinch

Pretoria

October 2011

Abstract

The subject Music in junior secondary schools in Botswana exhibits areas of concern. While commendable efforts have been made in ensuring access to and equity in education, a corresponding commitment to the improvement and quality of education, by way of ensuring effective delivery in the classroom, has not been realised. The objectives of the Music syllabus are more inclined toward music literacy, at the expense of listening, movement, singing and instrumental playing. The syllabus design undermines the potential of music education to foster creativity, imaginative thinking and self-actualisation among the learners. Also, Western music receives more coverage than non-western musical genres.

The following research question guided the study:

- What are the problems regarding the teaching of Music in the junior secondary schools in Botswana, and what solutions can be recommended?

The following sub-questions received attention:

- To what extent are the teaching methodologies used effective (or ineffective)?
- To what extent does the teaching of Music take into account a learner's acquired skills, knowledge, attitudes and experiences?
- What is the amount and quality of professional support given to music teachers?
- To what extent are the assessment strategies used effective?
- To what extent are the available resources adequate (or inadequate)?

Thus, the aim of the study has been to determine the status quo, to make an analysis of the progress (or lack thereof) made in the development of music education, to identify the problems associated with teaching Music as a subject, and to come up with proposals for coping with and managing the situational constraints.

Information was gathered from an intensive scrutiny of the Music curriculum and a literature study. To this was added information gleaned from questionnaires sent to selected Music teachers and school pupils.

The study determined that: there are definite imbalances in the treatment of learning objectives and genre coverage, with an inclination towards music literacy, and unclear directions towards the development of creativity, imaginative thinking and self-actualisation; there is an over-emphasis on Western models and music; there is a prevailing feeling that the performance and listening aspects of Music are difficult to assess; the amount of

professional support provided to music teachers and to schools is minimal with a lack of proper mentorship for less experienced teachers; and, there is insufficient allocation of facilities and resources.

Thus the following recommendations have been suggested: more indigenous musical arts should be incorporated into the curriculum, with an increase in the Popular music content as a way of responding to the learners' interests; capacity-building workshops should be conducted; methods of appraising teachers should be reviewed to make them more subject specific; supervisors of music education programmes in schools should be further equipped with the necessary skills to appropriately carry out supervision; the Department of Curriculum Development and Evaluation should involve South African experts in their Arts and Culture curriculum in order to make assessment more relevant and accurate; the Teaching Service Management and the Teacher Training and Development departments should take appropriate steps towards an across-the-board improvement of music education through subject Music.

KEYWORDS

Botswana

Teaching methodology

Learning styles

Music curriculum

Music assessment

Music syllabus

Junior secondary schools

Secondary education

Teacher education

Vision 2016

CONTENTS

Abstract	ii
Keywords	iv
Contents	v
CHAPTER 1 RESEARCH OUTLINE	
1.1 Introduction	1
1.1.1 Botswana	1
1.1.2 Acronyms and abbreviations	2
1.1.3 Introduction to education in Botswana	3
1.2 Personal motivation	4
1.3 Background to the research	4
1.3.1 The ten-year basic education programme	5
1.3.2 Junior secondary education programme	5
1.3.3 Junior secondary curriculum	7
1.3.4 Music as a curriculum subject	7
1.4 Statement of the problem	8
1.5 Research question	9
1.6 Aims of the study	9
1.7 Significance of the study	10
1.8 Methodology	11
1.9 Outline of the chapters	12
CHAPTER 2 LITERATURE REVIEW	
2.1 Introduction	14
2.2 Botswana: educational developments and management	14
2.2.1 The status of music education programmes	14
2.2.2 Educational development and the economy	15
2.3 Music	16
2.3.1 The meaning of music	16
2.3.2 Roles of music	16
2.3.3 Types of music	17
2.3.3.1 African music	17
2.3.3.2 Western classical music	18
2.3.3.3 Jazz and Popular styles	18
2.3.3.4 Blending across musical genres	19
2.4 Music education	19
2.4.1 The meaning of music education	19
2.4.2 Musical arts education	20
2.4.3 Music education theories	20



2.5	Justifying music education	22
2.6	The music education curriculum	24
2.7	Teacher training and development	24
2.7.1	Pre-service training of teachers	24
2.7.2	The specialist music teacher	24
2.7.3	Music teaching conditions	25
2.8	Music teaching and learning processes	25
2.8.1	Effective music teaching	25
2.8.2	Planning for music education	25
2.8.3	Learning activities in a music classroom	26
2.8.4	Children's musical potential	27
2.9	Assessment in music education	28
2.9.1	The assessment process	28
2.9.2	Effective assessment	28
2.9.3	Problems with assessment in music	29
2.9.4	Types of assessment	29
2.10	Resources for music education	30
2.11	Summary of the review	30

CHAPTER 3 THE CURRENT STATE OF MUSIC EDUCATION IN BOTSWANA

3.1	Introduction	32
3.2	Overview of the current state of music education	32
3.2.1	Socio-cultural context	33
3.2.2	Current situation regarding music education	33
3.2.3	Key indicators of progress in music education in Botswana	35
3.2.4	Developments in arts and culture	36
3.3	Access to and equity in junior secondary music education	37
3.4	Aims of music education at junior secondary level	37
3.5	Reforms in education and the public service	38
3.6	Problems within the education ministry structures	40
3.6.1	Teaching Service Management (TSM)	40
3.6.2	Department of Secondary Education	41
3.6.3	Department of Curriculum Development and Evaluation (DCDE)	41
3.6.4	Botswana Examinations Council (BEC)	43
3.6.5	Tertiary Education Council (TEC)	43
3.6.6	The University of Botswana (UB)	43
3.7	Non-governmental organisations	44
3.7.1	The Botswana Teachers Union (BTU)	45
3.7.2	Botswana Association of Music Educators (BOAME)	45
3.8	Music education and the national <i>Vision 2016</i>	45
3.9	Summary	47

CHAPTER 4 DATA COLLECTION AND ANALYSIS

4.1	Introduction	49
4.2	Research design	49
4.2.1	Delimitation of the study	50
4.2.2	Sampling procedure	51
4.2.3	Population of the study	51
4.2.4	Data gathering	52
4.3	Data presentation: Teachers' questionnaire	52
4.4	Data presentation: Pupils questionnaire	69
4.5	Discussion of data emanating from the questionnaires	75
4.5.1	Music teachers in schools: the staffing situation	76
4.5.2	Resource allocation for music education	77
4.5.3	Music education activities	77
4.5.4	Professional support of music teachers	78
4.5.5	Syllabus design and implementation	79
4.6	Music lessons in schools: an evaluation	80
4.7	General remarks about the lessons	83
4.8	The three-year junior secondary music syllabus: an analysis	84
4.8.1	Preliminary information from the syllabus	84
4.8.1.1	Rationale for music	85
4.8.1.2	Key competencies	85
4.8.1.3	Recommended teaching methods	85
4.8.1.4	Assessment	86
4.8.2	Content analysis of the syllabus	86
4.8.2.1	Coverage of the musical genres	86
4.8.2.2	Learning objectives	89
4.8.2.3	Musical activities	89
4.8.3	Syllabi of other countries	90
4.8.3.1	South African Arts and Culture syllabus	91
4.8.3.2	Namibian Arts-in-Culture syllabus	92
4.8.3.3	Australia's Music syllabus	92
4.9	Summary of the chapter	94

CHAPTER 5 SUMMARY AND CONCLUSIONS

5.1	Introduction	95
5.2	Summary	95
5.2.1	The research problem	95
5.2.2	Theoretical framework	96
5.2.3	Current state of music education	96
5.2.4	Data collection and analysis	97
5.3	Research conclusions	97



5.3.1 To what extent are the teaching methodologies used effective (or ineffective) in imparting musical skills and knowledge?	98
5.3.2 To what extent does the teaching of music take into account a learner's acquired skills, knowledge, attitudes and experiences?	99
5.3.3 What is the amount and quality of professional support given to music teachers?	100
5.3.4 To what extent are the assessment strategies used effective in determining the learners' musical knowledge and skills?	100
5.3.5 To what extent are the available resources adequate (or inadequate) to meet the needs of teaching and learning music?	101
5.4 Summary	102

CHAPTER 6 THE WAY FORWARD AND RECOMMENDATIONS

6.1 Introduction	103
6.2 The key problem	103
6.3 The way forward	104
6.4 Recommended solutions	104
6.4.1 Designing a music curriculum	105
6.4.2 Using teaching approach appropriate to music	105
6.4.3 Employing relevant assessment approaches	106
6.4.4 Ensuring continuous professional development of music teachers	106
6.4.5 Ensuring equitable resource allocation for music teaching	106
6.5 Recommendations for further research	107
6.5.1 Teacher education	107
6.5.2 Music education in schools	107
6.5.3 Music education curriculum	108

BIBLIOGRAPHY	109
---------------------	-----

APPENDICES: Questionnaires	118
-----------------------------------	-----

CHAPTER 1

RESEARCH OUTLINE

1.1 Introduction

1.1.1 Botswana

At independence in 1966, the state of the nation was unsatisfactory, characterised by poor infrastructure and low literacy levels, amongst other problems. Botswana has managed to transform itself from one of the poorest countries in the world to one in the middle income ranks in the four decades after independence. Observers have attributed this high rate of economic development to the stable political environment, good governance and prudent fiscal management. Among challenges the country has had to face in the past few years is the high prevalence of the HIV/AIDS pandemic, the effects of which the government has managed to contain, by making drugs available for free to the citizens. Another challenge that has emerged is that of a high rate of unemployment. This is because the current economy, which is mainly driven by the public sector, can no longer produce enough jobs. There are constant calls made by the government, for the private sector to increase its participation so as to create more employment opportunities.

The Botswana Tourism Board's annual publications *Discover Botswana* of 2009 and 2010 delineate the following facts about Botswana, regarding government, geography, population and languages:

- **Government**

The Republic of Botswana is a multiparty democracy. The country has an Executive President. The National Assembly elects the President for a term of five years.

- **Geography**

Botswana is roughly the size of France or Texas, with a surface area of 581 730 sq km. It is an entirely landlocked country, bordered by its neighbours South Africa, Namibia, Zambia and Zimbabwe. Botswana is 84% covered by Kgalagadi Desert. Most of the population is settled in the east and southeast of the country. (See Appendix A.)

- **Population**

The total population estimated for 2006 was 1,85 million growing at a rate of 2.4% per annum. The population is heavily weighted towards younger age groups; about 43% of the population is younger than 15 years of age. Over 50% of the population is settled in urban areas. Gaborone, in the extreme south east, is the capital city with a population estimated to be 250, 000. Other main towns (estimated populations in brackets) are Francistown (105, 000), Lobatse (60, 000) and Selebi-Phikwe (50, 000). (Botswana Tourism Board 2010:8.)

- **Languages**

The Batswana are the most numerous ethnic group in the country, forming 78.2% of the population, and they speak the Setswana Language. ('Batswana' also refers to the citizens of Botswana). Other ethnic groups speak their own languages. The official language is English which is used in governmental circles and in business affairs.

1.1.2

Acronyms and abbreviations

BEC – Botswana Examinations Council

BGSCE – Botswana General School Certificate of Education

BIUST – Botswana International University of Science and Technology

BOAME – Botswana Association of Music Educators

BTU – Botswana Teachers Union

CAPA – Creative and Performing Arts

DAC – Department of Arts and Culture

DCDE – Department of Curriculum Development and Evaluation

DSE – Diploma in Secondary Education

ICT – Information and Communication Technology

JCE – Junior Certificate Examination

MCE – Molepolole College of Education

MoESD – Ministry of Education and Skills Development

PBRS – Performance Based Reward System

PMS – Performance Management System

PSLE – Primary School Leaving Examinations

RNPE – Revised National Policy on Education

SADC – Southern African Development Countries

TEC – Tertiary Education Council

TSM – Teaching Service Management

UB – University of Botswana

1.1.3 Introduction to education in Botswana

In 1992 a Presidential Commission on Education was appointed in Botswana, with the mandate to make a comprehensive review of the entire education system, and make recommendations to the government. In relation to secondary education this commission, the second on education since independence in 1966, was expected to advise on the organisation and diversification of the secondary school curriculum that will prepare adequately and effectively those that are unable to proceed to higher education (Botswana 1993: v). As a result of the commission's report presented in 1993, the current educational policy known as the Revised National Policy on Education (RNPE) was formulated. The RNPE advocates an educational programme with increased emphasis on practical and vocational components in the curriculum.

It is against this background that Music and other subjects with practical and vocational components such as Design and Technology, and Home Economics were introduced into the education system at junior secondary level. The rationale for the inclusion of Music in the curriculum has not been clear to those with interest in childrens' education – with some regarding music as just a hobby or for only a talented few, with no place in the classroom – making it a somewhat daunting task for the administrators and teachers charged with its implementation. This dilemma can be expected in a school curriculum that previously put more emphasis on the recall of concepts and less on the application aspects. This general lack of understanding of what music education entails not only impacts negatively on the effectiveness of the music education programme but also affects its overall development.

The problems of the junior secondary music programme are even more complex than they have been cited in the foregoing paragraph. The exact natures of the problems need to be understood through empirical research. It is for this reason that a research question focusing on the problems of music education in Botswana's junior secondary schools has been posed, forming the basis of this dissertation, with the aim of discerning and recommending appropriate intervention measures.

1.2 Personal motivation

I was first introduced to music education at Molepolole College of Education (MCE), where I was studying towards a Diploma in Secondary Education (DSE) from 1994 to 1996. A year after obtaining the diploma, I was offered a government sponsorship to pursue a BA (Music) degree at the University of Natal¹ in Durban. After completing my studies in 2001, I was posted to Donga Junior Secondary School, one of the schools selected to pilot the teaching of music in junior secondary schools. I was involved in the six-year pilot programme as a teacher, a marker and a moderator in the national examinations. In 2007 I was appointed a Staff Development Fellow, a college experience position, before embarking on my postgraduate studies.

I then proceeded to the University of Pretoria in 2008, where I graduated with a BMus (Hons) degree in 2009. I researched the current topic as part of fulfilling the requirements for the long essay module under the honours degree programme. My motivation in embarking on the current study was to perform a more in-depth, quality research at master's level in order to understand and learn more about the current status of music education in the junior secondary schools in Botswana. I feel that the experiences I have had in music education as a student, teacher and a teacher-educator have put me in a good position to embark on this research.

1.3 Background to the research

A number of developments have been initiated as part of the implementation process of the Revised National Policy on Education (RNPE). These have been aimed at the overall improvement of the education programmes in Botswana. An overview of the way the junior secondary level of education operates together with the developments that have taken place in recent years serves as important background information to this research. This will be dealt with through a discussion based on the following aspects:

- Junior secondary as part of the basic education programme;
- the junior secondary curriculum; and
- Music as part of the junior secondary curriculum.

¹ Now the University of Kwa-Zulu Natal.

1.3.1 The ten-year basic education programme

Botswana's basic education programme runs for ten years. The first seven of these are spent by the learners in primary schools, while the last three are completed in junior secondary schools. The programme has been organised to achieve fifteen aims (Botswana, 2005: ii). Among these, the two aims identified as being the most relevant to the current topic are that, on completion of the programme, the learners should have:

- acquired knowledge and understanding of society, appreciation of their culture including languages, traditions, songs, ceremonies, social norms and a sense of citizenship; and
- developed their own special interest, talents, and skills whether these be dexterity, physical strength, intellectual ability and/or artistic gifts.

Before the implementation of the current education policy the programme ran for nine years. An extra year resulted from a change in the junior secondary programme from the two-year duration to three years. The change followed concerns raised by educationists and members of the public that the two years was too short (Botswana, 1993:147).

1.3.2 Junior secondary education programme

The Department of Secondary Education under the Ministry of Education and Skills Development is mandated with the running of the secondary education programmes. It does this through a network of junior and secondary schools across the country. With its headquarters in Gaborone, the Department has regional offices to which all schools are attached. In recent years, there has been an increase in the decentralisation of some departmental functions from the headquarters to the regional offices, the main purpose being to improve service delivery by the Department.

The developments relating to staffing in schools, the facilities, and the learners targeted by the programme are dealt with below:

- **Staff supply and its retention**

An important challenge for the Teaching Service Management, as the employing authority for teachers, is to be able to attract and retain suitable and experienced staff in the teaching

profession. The following ways relate to the opening up of prospects for promotion and making the schools conducive for teaching and learning:

1) The school management capacity has been strengthened by creating positions of Head(s) of Department (HoDs) in addition to the school Head and the Deputy Head. The HoD posts are considered to be equivalent to that of the Deputy Head. The HoDs deal more with pastoral responsibilities and student affairs, whereas the Deputy Head assists the Head with the overall administration and is also responsible for the academic affairs in a school. All these members of the school's top management have been released from teaching duties.

2) In addition to these, the establishment registers have been revised to accommodate more posts at the middle management levels for academic improvement in the schools, and to deal with emerging issues such as staff development, HIV/AIDS awareness and Information and Communication Technology (ICT).

3) Support staff is supplied consisting of the Bursar, a secretary, a supplies officer, cleaners, kitchen-hands, messengers and security officers.

- **Facilities**

The facilities available depend mainly on the school size. The facilities common to most schools include the administration and classroom blocks, the school library, the school garden, a kitchen, sports grounds, a multi-purpose hall, and laboratories for Science, Home Economics, Design and Technology, Art, Business Studies and Computer Awareness.

- **The learners targeted by the programme**

The secondary educational programme targets learners who have completed their primary schooling and have sat their Primary School Leaving Examination (PSLE). All of the learners are admitted regardless of their PSLE pass levels. Most learners entering the junior secondary phase for Form 1 are 13 years of age. However, in line with making basic education accessible to a wide range of learners, those up to 17 years of age are eligible for admission.

In relation to music education, most of these students have no formal music education background due to inconsistencies and other problems associated with the implementation of the Creative and Performing Arts (CAPA) syllabus in the primary schools. The primary schools however have a strong culture of choral music, thus there is a strong likelihood that the learners would have participated in this genre of music.

1.3.3 Junior secondary curriculum

The junior secondary school curriculum comprises two main groups of subjects: the core subjects and the optional subjects.

- **Core subjects**

The core subjects are taken by all learners targeted in the three-year curriculum. The core subjects are seven in number: English, Setswana, Mathematics, Science, Social Studies, Moral Education and Agriculture.

- **Optional subjects**

Optional subjects are Design and Technology, Art, Music, Physical Education, Business Studies, Home Economics, French and Religious Education. Learners are expected to choose at least two subjects from the list, adhering to the requirements provided by the Department of Curriculum Development and Evaluation (DCDE).

There are also classes conducted for Computer Awareness, and Guidance and Counselling, though these are non-examinable subjects. In addition to these, schools offer a range of extra-curricular activities in the form of sporting activities, including ball sports and athletic activities, as well as performing arts, social and academic-oriented clubs.

1.3.4 Music as a curriculum subject

- **Rationale for music education**

According to the syllabus document, the purpose of having Music as part of the curriculum is to provide students with the opportunity to develop their innate musical abilities and to contribute to the preservation and transmission of the cultural heritage of Botswana. The purpose is further clearly explained as follows, (*Three-year Junior Secondary School Syllabus: Music*, 2010: iii):

The inclusion of music as a subject in the education programme provides students with the opportunity to develop their innate musical abilities. Music represents a unique combination of ideas, skills and knowledge, making new ways of communication and problem solving possible. Music contributes to the physical, cognitive (intellectual), affective (emotional, aesthetic, normative and spiritual) and social development of the learner.

The music programme has been organised to achieve six aims. In relation to the main problems to be addressed by this research, one of the aims is that on completion of the three-year programme, learners should have developed a creative approach to music-making so as to encourage motivation, self-actualisation and the attainment of well-balanced personal artistic qualities (*Three-year Junior Secondary School Syllabus: Music, 2010*).

- **Subject content**

The syllabus document provides the content information including topics and objectives that should to be covered in the three years of the junior secondary programme. The topics covered include music theory, notation, pitch, rhythm, dynamics, tempo, time signatures, texture, and harmony. The following are included as the instruments on which learners are expected to have been given basic instruction: voice, recorder, keyboard, guitar and various percussion instruments. There also topics relating to musical traditions covering the music of Botswana, African music and Western music.

- **Assessment**

The schools insist on regular assessment for each subject. Marks are normally expected for each month for every subject. In addition to this, end of term examinations administered under the same conditions as the final examinations are conducted in the first, second and third terms. The final examinations coordinated by the Botswana Examinations Council (BEC) take place at the end of the three-years of the junior secondary programme. There are papers for music appreciation and music theory, and a practical examination.

1.4 Statement of the problem

While commendable efforts have been made in ensuring access to and equity in education, a corresponding commitment to the improvement and quality of education, by way of ensuring effective delivery in the classroom, has not been realised. This is even more true for the teaching of Music in junior secondary schools. This may be attributed to inadequate teacher education and insufficient allocation of resources committed to the teaching of Music. The situation is further exacerbated by the non-availability of suitable in-service personnel with a music education background to offer administrative and professional support to the teachers.

Curriculum planning that merely promotes more of the same, while permitting imbalances in the treatment of learning objectives and topic areas does not serve the education system well. An examination of the different subject areas, including Music, has revealed orientation of the curriculum towards the cognitive over the physical, affective and social domains. The objectives of the Music syllabus are more inclined toward music literacy, at the expense of other equally important components of music education such as listening, movement, singing and instrumental playing. Furthermore, Western music has received more coverage in the syllabus than non-western musical genres. In a nutshell, it appears that the syllabus design undermines the potential of music education to foster creativity, imaginative thinking and self-actualisation among the learners.

1.5 Research question

The following research question guides the study

What are the problems regarding the teaching of Music in the junior secondary schools in Botswana, and what solutions can be recommended?

The following sub-questions are derived from the main question:

- To what extent are the teaching methodologies used effective (or ineffective) in imparting musical skills and knowledge?
- To what extent does the teaching of Music take into account a learner's acquired skills, knowledge, attitudes and experiences?
- What is the amount and quality of professional support given to music teachers?
- To what extent are the assessment strategies used effective in determining the learners' musical knowledge and skills?
- To what extent are the available resources adequate (or inadequate) to meet the needs of teaching and learning music?

1.6 Aims of the study

This study was carried out in order to achieve the following aims:

- 1) to determine the status quo, with its improvements and problems, with regard to the teaching of Music in the junior secondary schools in Botswana;
- 2) to make an analysis of the progress (or lack thereof) made in the development of music education in the junior secondary schools in Botswana;
- 3) to identify the problems associated with teaching Music as a subject in the junior secondary schools; and
- 4) to come up with proposals for coping with and managing the situational constraints the teachers and schools experience with their music education programmes.

1.7 Significance of the study

This study is expected to provide a foundation on which future research in music education can be built and to provide a reference for stakeholders in education. The specific benefits that can be derived from this study are as follows:

- The research should inform the syllabus design decision processes on the considerations relating to the choice of Music topics, the formulation of learning objectives, the relative coverage of the various music topics, and the best approaches to ensure music education fosters imaginative thinking and self-actualisation among the learners.
- The research should offer the music teachers the opportunity to examine their approaches to music education including the range of classroom activities they plan, their musical relevance, the extent to which they incorporate the skills of the learners and the criteria they use to assess musical achievement.
- The research should identify the aspects of the curriculum where teachers feel incompetent, and suggest measures to address the problem. The research should further offer better ways of ensuring continuous and adequate support to the music teachers.
- The research should offer suggestions on the relevant strategies to ensure that resources are committed to the programme, leading to the better management of music-specific activities such as rehearsals and class performances.

1.8 Methodology

Qualitative research methods have been utilized in this study, because they are best suited to address the research question posed. Leedy and Ormrod (2001:147) state two things common to all qualitative research, “First, they focus on phenomena that occur in natural settings – that is, in the ‘real world’. And second, they involve studying those phenomena in all their complexity.”

The study utilised three main techniques to collect data: questionnaires, observations and document analysis:

- One questionnaire targeted the teachers to obtain their opinions and attitudes towards their work as music teachers.
- Another questionnaire, targeted at the learners who take Music as one of their optional subjects was used to determine how they perceive the music education programme.
- Lesson observations were undertaken to determine the following: the variety of musical activities included; whether (or not) the lesson objectives were clear, realistic and achievable within the given lesson time; and how the teachers handled assessment during the lessons.
- An analysis of the current three-year junior secondary music syllabus was carried out to determine how fairly the musical genres are covered, and also whether (or not) the objectives formulated are suitable for the Music subject area.

The following are features of the study that were considered to be critical in ensuring that suitable answers are solicited, in order to provide a basis for appropriate solutions:

- A theoretical framework was established through an extensive literature review, with a significant portion of the review devoted to the rationale for music education and the methodology for a music education programme.
- The current status of music education was evaluated against the socio-cultural context, the policies that guide education in Botswana, and the pillars of the *National Vision*.

- A research population was defined to include the learners and teachers as they constitute the *dramatis-personae* with routine experiences of the music education programme.
- An analysis of the current three-year junior secondary Music syllabus was undertaken by consulting the equivalent syllabi of three other countries for ideas that could be adopted to enrich the Botswana syllabus.

1.9 Outline of the chapters

This dissertation is in six chapters, each dealing with a specific aspect of the research.

Chapter 1 introduces the entire dissertation. The chapter provides the background to the research and a personal motivation. The problem statement is presented, and the research question guiding the study is posed together with the sub-questions that have emerged.

Chapter 2 interrogates the paradigms relevant to music education through a literature review. More specifically the chapter attempts to address the following questions: What is music and music education? Why should music be included in the children's education curriculum? How should music be taught and assessed?

Chapter 3 evaluates the state of music education programmes in Botswana and that of the junior secondary phase in particular. The issues, challenges and opportunities relating to music education are explored against current educational policies and practices. The contribution music education can make towards the realisation of the *National Vision* ideals is explored.

Chapter 4 features data collection, presentation and analysis. An introduction is made of the research design chosen for the study, as well as the details regarding sampling procedures, delimitation of the study and the tools for data collection. Data is presented using mainly qualitative methods.

Chapter 5 presents the summary of the dissertation and the research conclusions. The summary provides the most important facts that have emerged from different parts of the study. The conclusion provides answers to the main research question, and the sub-questions.

Chapter 6 presents the proposals, calling for the need for collaboration by the stakeholders with an interest in music education. Specific intervention measures are recommended to address the concerns raised by this study, and to point the way forward. The chapter closes with the topics recommended for further research.

At the beginning of each chapter, an introduction is made of the main ideas in that chapter. The perspectives of the major paradigms and step-by-step processes are then covered as they relate to the chapter's topic. Each chapter's topic is divided into subtopics, some of which have smaller divisions within them. A summary of the main points covered in each chapter is follows at the ends of chapters 2, 3, 4 and 5.

CHAPTER 2

LITERATURE REVIEW

2.1 Introduction

There has been an exponential growth in knowledge and communication over the last few decades, giving rise to numerous publications on education. These publications offer solutions to the problems experienced in education, and inform and influence education policy formulation. In addition, there is web-based information available, although its relevance and authority are often difficult to determine. The literature consulted and reviewed below provides an overview of paradigms that have dominated music education, and offers important information on the following broad areas:

- the meaning of music and music education;
- the place of music children's education curriculum;
- philosophical and didactic principles relevant to music education;
- incorporating learner's skills, attitudes and experiences in planning; and
- music curriculum design and implementation.

These literature studies regarding the status of music education were carried out as part of meeting the requirements for the awarding of the research-based degrees, but also in order to provide a broad, informed basis on which to base discussions and, eventually, to answer the research questions and propose the way forward.

2.2 Botswana: educational developments and management

2.2.1 The status of music education programmes

These studies focused on influencing policy decisions regarding music education in Botswana, reflecting a concern sounded by Mannathoko (1994:274) over the overabundance in sub-Saharan Africa of policy-oriented research as opposed to knowledge-building research: "Although these studies make important contribution to the region's educational information, another type of enquiry, knowledge-oriented research, should not be overlooked."

Bennet's study (2001) highlighted the lack of development of Music as a curriculum subject, and suggested a programme that could be used for teacher training institutions in Botswana. Schoeman (1993: 1-4) put at the centre of her research question "the need for a teacher training programme for Junior Primary Class Music tuition, as part of Arts Education, which is user-friendly to the musically untrained teacher, and adaptable for multicultural purposes."

Kanasi (2007) aimed through her study to identify the problems facing the training of music teachers in the colleges for primary school education. Kanasi presented a number of proposals – a significant one being a revised music syllabus – for a modified programme of teacher training. In his doctoral study, Phuthego (2007:17) expressed concern that the content for Creative and Performing Arts was mainly drawn from Western culture: "It is therefore a matter of concern to establish the extent to which local resources, in the form of indigenous arts, have been integrated into the syllabus."

2.2.2 Educational development and the economy

The studies referred to in section 2.2.1 above provide a negative picture regarding the music education programmes at the primary and secondary levels through to the teacher training level. Conversely, literature abounds with observations of satisfactory commitment by the government to the development of education, supported through a favourable share the education sector gets from the Botswana national budget. The 2006/07 *World Data on Education* has echoed the commitment of the government towards education, by indicating that the sector has enjoyed a favoured position in the allocation of budget since the implementation of the 1977 National Policy on Education.

The aforementioned literature study by Schoeman (1993) revealed that, following independence in 1966, the Botswana government has taken significant steps towards improving the quality of education. Schoeman indicated that the documents she used for the review empowered a comprehensive perspective of the education situation. In 1992 a Presidential Commission on Education was appointed, with the mandate to, amongst others, advise on an education system that is sensitive and responsive to the aspirations of the people and the manpower requirements of the country (Botswana 1993: v).

Apart from the positive observations regarding developments in education, Botswana has received recognition for prudent fiscal policies and good governance. There has been stable economic development over the years, which has resulted in sustained budget surpluses

and extensive foreign reserves (<http://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Economy-of-Botswana>). In addition, Botswana is recognised internationally as one of the countries with the least incidences of corruption in world. In 2009 the Transparency International rated Botswana as the least corrupt country in Africa for the 14th year in a row (<http://www.mmegi.bw/index>).

2.3 Music

What is music? What is the role of music? How is music classified? How one defines music and describes its role and the method selected for classifying music depends on the paradigm from which questions under analysis are viewed. This section of the review attempts to provide some answers to these questions.

2.3.1 The meaning of music

The Oxford Paperback Dictionary (Hawkins 1988:537) gives the following definitions of music:

1. The art of arranging the sounds of voice(s) or instrument(s) or both in a pleasing sequence or combination.
2. The sound(s) or composition(s) produced; a written or printed score for this.
3. Any pleasant sound or series of sounds, e. g bird sound.

Dorrell (2005:18) approaches the question from a biological perspective, explaining that every question about biology requires an answer within the framework of Darwin's theory of evolution by natural selection. Responding to a question, "What does music have to do with biology?" Dorell (2005:19) explains that, "Music is something that people create and something that people respond to. People are living organisms, and biology is the study of organisms."

2.3.2 Roles of music

Pound and Harrison (2003:11) summarise functions of music as, i) to support atmosphere or mood; ii) to support group identity; iii) to support memory; and iv) to communicate in situations where it may otherwise be difficult.

Kaemmer (1993:1) argues that music can be dangerous. To explain this danger, Kaemmer cites the concern parents have about the song lyrics of rock groups, fearing that listening to the ideas expressed in the music will have a negative effect upon the value system and behaviour of their children. He explains further that in the first half of the twentieth-century jazz music was subjected to similar controversy due to its nature being what may be regarded as intrinsically “decadent”. He further cites the Navajo people of the American Southwest who also consider music to be dangerous, “due to its supernatural power”. Nevertheless, an informed and enlightened choice of music used for educational purposes will obviate these ‘dangers’ and espouse Pound and Harrison’s listed (above) functions.

2.3.3 Types of music

This section focuses on the musical genres prominent in African societies. These are African music, western music, jazz and popular musical styles. African societies are comprised of diverse cultures, and writing in reference to a South African context, Blacking (1980:212) observes that “South African musical systems reflect ... the different societies in which they thrive...”

2.3.3.1 African music

Some features of African music, about which all authorities agree, are as follows:

- Unlike art music which is preserved through notation, African music is transmitted from one generation to another by oral tradition.
- The music is used to accompany a wide range of cultural rituals.
- The music is audience oriented. During the performance of music, the audience actively takes part such that there is often no clear distinction between the performer and the audience.

“The great proportion of African traditional music,” Mensah (1980:174) sums up, “is that occurring primarily in passage rites (birth, marriage, succession, and funeral ceremonies), worship, spirit possession divining and therapy.”

Kamien (1996:630-631) delineates the essential elements of African music. These are summarized as follows:

- **Call and response**

Phrases of a soloist are repeatedly answered by those of a chorus. Overlaps often occur when the leader resumes singing before the chorus has completed its response.

- **Rhythm and percussion**

Rhythm and percussive sounds are highly emphasized, reflecting the close link between music and dance in African culture. There is a wide use of percussion ensembles consisting mainly of drums, xylophones or rattles. The human body is sometimes used as a percussion instrument, with hand claps, foot stamps, and thigh or chest slaps common in African music.

- **Texture**

Some African societies have music that is homophonic in texture. The music features several voice parts singing the same melody at different pitch levels. Other African people however, perform polyphonic music, featuring melodic lines that are quite independent.

As will be seen, these elements are considered vitally important in music education, especially in the classroom, promoting participation and creativity via active music-making.

2.3.3.2 Western classical music

Western classical music is considered a written music tradition. Burkholder, Grout & Palisca (2010:33) explain that the first definitive references to notation date from about AD 850. References to the importance of music notation abound in the forthcoming chapters.

2.3.3.3 Jazz and Popular styles

Writing in reference to popular music in America, Politoske (1984:452) observes that it plays “an overwhelming part in the daily lives of most Americans.” Politoske goes further to explain that, “Its origins are deep in the human spirit, and its history reaches back to the earliest ages.” Along with a multitude of other writers on music, Frith (2007) associates popular music with the youth. In a volume of selected essays on *Taking Popular Music Seriously*, Frith (2007: 1) laments that, “Young people’s interest in music is taken for granted by everyone these days.” He cites excerpts from a number of research findings to support his convictions with regard to the importance youth attaches to popular music.

2.3.3.4 Blending across musical genres

Blacking (1980:197) attributes the development of music among black urban communities to the tendency to incorporate the European and American dance styles. Similar developments are typified in an observation made by Politoske (1984: 452) regarding popular music in America: “Over the years the millions of the immigrants who came to this country brought with them the music they knew and loved.”

Many art music composers are known to have drawn heavily on popular music, albeit usually in the form of folk and traditional music, for their compositions. Different sources cite composers such as George Gershwin, Charles Ives, Claude Debussy and Béla Bartók among those whose compositions made reference to popular music. Kamien (1996:301) explains that in line with the movement towards nationalism that dominated many compositions during the Romantic era, composers (such as Brahms, Dvorak and Liszt) wrote works which incorporated the folk tunes of their (and other) nations.

2.4 Music education

2.4.1 The meaning of music education

There is no correct or best way of defining music education. Colwell and Wing (2004) are careful with the way they define the concept. They cite the problem of a wide variety of contexts under which music is offered – required, elective, integrated, humanities and live music in class – as a limiting factor in any attempt to provide a definition that fits all music education situations. Colwell and Wing (2004:12) however offer the type of definition which can be used as a guide for defining music education programmes:

Our definition of a required music education program would be one that improves a student’s ability to discriminate, understand, and respond meaningfully to music worthy of human qualities. Even with this clear definition, the teacher’s responsibilities in deciding how this can best be accomplished for each student are enormous ... Decisions about these responsibilities must be based on a wide and deep knowledge of music, of children, and of teaching and learning strategies.

2.4.2 Musical arts education

Some scholars such as Nzewi (2003) show preference for the use of the concepts *musical arts* (instead of *music*) and *musical arts education* instead of (*music education*). The proponents are of the view that these concepts are more inclusive regarding the nature of music, especially in an African context, where there is tendency to incorporate other arts in the music. Kanasi (2007) conducted a study on *musical arts education* in the teacher training programmes in Botswana. Phuthego (2007) carried out his doctoral research into music education in Botswana with the concepts *musical arts* and *musical arts education* at the centre of his research question.

2.4.3 Music education theories

Hoffer (1993) provides detailed descriptions of four approaches to music education. The descriptions feature the life and work of the theorist behind each method, the context that influenced its development, as well as the characteristics of the approach. These approaches get their names from the theorists who developed them. The approaches, according to Hoffer (1993:115-133) are summarised below:

- **Dalcroze approach**

Three ideas – movement, solfege singing and improvisation – are basic to the Dalcroze approach. The purpose of movement is to create rhythmic sensitivity in the students by making them feel the music rhythm in their bodies. Solfege singing develops the students' ability to listen and remember tonal patterns. The inclusion of improvisation is aimed at ensuring that each student has the experience of expressing his or her musical ideas.

- **Orff Schulwerk**

In the Orff approach music instruction comes in stages. The early years of music instruction involve the use of speech rhythms. Emphasis is put on singing in the later years. It is only after several years of training in these two aspects that note reading is included. Movement, improvisation and instrumental playing are also important aspects of this approach.

- **Kodály approach**

Five distinctive features – musical literacy, emphasis on singing, early instruction, the use of folk music, and the use of music of high quality – define the Kodály approach.

- **Suzuki talent education**

There are three main ideas central to Suzuki talent education. The first one is that the approach strongly favours music instruction at an early age. The second idea is the emphasis on teaching music through rote learning; the music a student performs is memorised. The third one involves careful selection of the music, and the music chosen is performed by every student regardless of their ability. Suzuki's approach fosters cooperation, and not competition among the learners.

In a book devoted to the Kodály approach, Chosky (1981:6-8) provides a description similar to the one given by Hoffer:

- 1) True music literacy – the ability to read, write, and think music – is the right of every human being.
- 2) To be internalized, musical learning must begin with the child's own natural instrument – the voice.
- 3) The education of the musical ear can be completely successful only if it is begun early, in kindergarten and the primary grades, or even earlier, if possible.
- 4) As a child possesses a mother-tongue – the language spoken in his home – he also possess a musical mother tongue in the folk music of that language or culture. It is through his musical mother-tongue that the skills and concepts necessary to musical literacy should be taught.
- 5) Only music of unquestioned quality – both folk and composed – should be used in the education of the children.

Though there are differences in emphasis regarding these approaches to music education, there are a number of recurring themes that emerge from a study of these approaches. The importance of starting music instruction early, the careful selection of the music used in the instruction and the emphasis on the singing component are the most significant ideas.

For the teachers, parents and other people with an interest in children's music education, understanding the various approaches to music education is useful in two main ways. The first one is that this understanding provides options for choosing the approaches best suited to the local context in which music education occurs. The second is that a music education philosophy can be developed using carefully selected ideas provided by the approaches.

2.5 Justifying music education

Worldwide, the place of music in children's education curricula has not always been secure; and this is no less so in Botswana. This is despite the many compelling reasons for the value it has in children's development. It is for this reason that music teachers should have a clear rationale for the teaching of music in schools. Spruce (2002b:41) asserts that, "it is imperative that music departments are able to promote the place of music as a curriculum subject in schools." Thus, Botswanan music educators – at all levels – need to be aware of the positive roles that music education can play, in order to bring this to the attention of those in control of school programmes and curricula.

The following, gleaned from several sources, infer that children's music education is important in order to:

- develop self-expression and creativity;
- develop an aesthetic sense;
- facilitate motor and rhythmic development;
- promote cultural heritage;
- promote cognitive and abstract thinking;
- teach social and inter-personal skills; and
- promote vocal and language development.

Nevertheless, Spruce (2002b:41) sees a problem with justifications such as these: "they are not *specific* to music and therefore do not, in themselves, provide a rationale for the existence of music in the curriculum". In his view, the only sound justification for curriculum music is "in terms of the unique contribution it can make to the whole education of the child." Spruce further reasons that a justification other than this will inevitably leave curricular music prone to marginalisation, with its influence more and more restricted to the contribution it makes to the extracurricular life of a school.

Most curriculum areas exist to impart skills in the three domains: the cognitive, the affective and the psychomotor. Hoffer and Klotman (1994:113) point out that in addition to these, "music deals with the aesthetic values as well." Regarding this observation Spruce (2002b:43) warns:

In drawing parallels between music learning and learning in other subjects, we need to be careful not to overstate the case and consequently lose sight of the unique contribution music makes to the holistic education of the child, which is what justifies its place in the curriculum.

Kaagan and Chapman (1988:105) are of the view that advocacy strategies should further emphasize the value of arts to our audiences' welfare:

The trouble with most arguments for arts importance is not that they lack inherent validity – they have that – but they are seldom related to the concerns of the audience. Most arguments for the arts focus primarily and often exclusively on quality of life goals, neglecting totally the implications for our culture and students employment opportunities, which are concerns of major constituents.

Colwell and Wing (2004:16) are of the opinion that an advocacy strategy that employs “music more as a *humanity* than an art” in supporting the attainment of objectives in other subject areas would be welcome. They explain the philosophical advantages of this viewpoint as follows:

- music (and other arts) is an integral aspect of all history and culture;
- the use of music may make core subjects more interesting by allowing the teacher more teaching strategies; and
- the relationship of music to other subjects (and to life) is an important concept designed to integrate all educational experiences toward a common goal – the improvement of the quality of life.

Colwell and Wing (2004:8) also make an important observation: “The breadth and the potential of music education in the curriculum are such that no one can object to students’ learning music.” Further they assert that “This apple pie approach may mean that the general worth of music is accepted without serious thought as to what constitutes an exemplary program in music.” This is important in the context of this study, and vitally relevant to Botswana’s Music syllabus and the implementation thereof in the classroom.

The arguments presented in this section attest to the important role music plays in the curriculum. It must be noted that modern education systems experience an ‘overload’ of innovations, some of which are incompatible with or beyond the human and financial resources of the education system. For this reason the education policy-makers and administrators now view curricular areas with a more critical eye, insisting that their place be justified. The merits of each area are established, prior to their initiation and the results of implementation periodically evaluated. It is for this reason that the case for music education must be centred on the unique role that music plays in childrens’ development. The

Botswanan child will be holistically enriched through music education that is relevant, and is specifically shaped to encompass the global, the African and the Botswanan contexts.

2.6 The music education curriculum

Glover and Young (1999), Spruce (2002a), and Pound and Harrison (2003) are of the view that the music curriculum should have the following features:

- its foundation should be children's musical experiences;
- it should recognise children's cultural and social backgrounds;
- it should draw from a wide range of styles and cultures; and
- it should assume that children are musical.

Spruce (2002a:20) adds that, if these factors are considered, children will have been, almost by definition, involved in devising the music curriculum.

2.7 Teacher training and development

2.7.1 Pre-service training of teachers

As Colwell and Wing (2004:8) point out: "No teacher preparation program can offer courses in all of the essentials needed for a complete understanding of what is required of a competent music teacher." They further add that certain topics are omitted from teacher preparation, not because they are unimportant but because of lack of time.

2.7.2 The specialist music teacher

An observation of job descriptions of teachers will reveal an array of duties expected of them, some of which are not specific to their subject areas. Regarding this, Mills (2005) stresses that, "...a teacher who sees their business as primarily music has a sense of direction to their work, and the planning of their work, that a music teacher who sees their work as meeting lots of other professionals' extra-musical objectives inevitably lacks."

2.7.3 Music teaching conditions

Music teachers are often faced with the kind of problems which teachers in other subject areas do not experience. Inexperienced teachers in particular become demoralised by the lack of adequate time, resources and support staff a music education programme usually receives. Regarding this, Colwell and Wing (2004:8) cautions, "If you think in terms of music in a college setting, you fail to understand the situation of public school students, for whom education is the focus and music an important component of that focus."

2.8 Music teaching and learning processes

2.8.1 Effective music teaching

Spruce (2002a:15) suggests that the most effective music teaching occurs when:

- the music curriculum addresses the musical needs of all children;
- a teacher has a vision of the unique role music can play in the education of all children; and
- the teacher possesses the teaching, management and musical skills needed to realize the vision.

2.8.2 Planning for music education

According to Chosky, Abrahamson, Gillespie, Woods and York (2001:7), the educational process should be linked to the natural development of a child, and education should be sequenced and structured so that each stage can grow naturally out of the preceding and in to the succeeding stage. Glover and Young (1999:4) add that teachers should build up on what was covered in the earlier years and sustain it into secondary school.

Spruce (2002a:16-17) outlines three levels of planning as follows:

- **Schemes of work** - provide a road map for teacher's teaching and children's musical learning.
- **Units/modules of work** - tend to focus on one particular aspect or style of music, mapping out progression through the module by describing in broad terms the anticipated learning in each lesson.

- **Individual lessons** - take into account the learning aims of a module. Assessment of whether learning has actually taken place is incorporated in this level of planning. Allocation of resources and any anticipated classroom management issues are considered when planning for the lessons.

While planning for teaching sets forth the intended actions, there should be room to accommodate situations which may arise during the teaching. “In many schools considered difficult to teach in,” Spruce (2002b:270) notes, “it is departments such as music that are most effective in that they have the flexibility and resources to tailor their curriculum to meet the specific needs and interests of their pupils...” Although a teacher should not adhere slavishly to the teaching plan, the general thrust and directions should be clearly maintained.

2.8.3 Learning activities in a music classroom

Educationists advocate for a shift from teacher centred approaches to the more learner-centred ones. The rationale for this perspective arose from constructivist theory developed by Dewey, Piaget, Vygotsky, De Vries and Kohlberg among others. The constructivist theory states that learning happens best if learners are actively involved and allowed to interact with the environment (Flohr, 2005). On the other hand, music educators such as Swanwick (1994) promote the idea of teaching music musically.

The implication for these views is that the following musical activities should be incorporated in the teaching of music: singing, listening, music reading and writing, instrumental play, movement and dance, and creativity. These activities are briefly dealt with below:

- **Singing**

A human voice is a naturally available instrument. Chosky (1981: 17) asserts that “the voice is the instrument a child is born with,” and goes further to state that it is “as natural an activity as speaking.”

- **Listening**

Listening is regarded as one of the most important communication skills. Incorporating listening skills in the music education, therefore, helps to develop childrens’ musical abilities as well as their general skills in listening. According to O’ Brien (1995:1), “the study of music in a formal setting will enable you to become a better listener and to develop solid skills of

appreciation.” The author further asserts that it is only by understanding how to listen attentively, that one can be able to explore and understand musical detail.

- **Music notation**

Exposure to literacy in music enables people to communicate their musical ideas through the reading and the writing of music. Developed musical literacy skills lead to the betterment of one’s musical abilities. In support of exposing learners to musical composition, Mills (2005:40) asserts that, “Children are capable of a great deal as composers, if enough is expected of them, and if the tasks that they are set are not so narrow as to constrain them.”

- **Instrumental play**

Instruments are alternative mediums to the voice for making music. Glover and Young (1999:104) explain the importance of instrumental playing in two ways. One relates to affording some learners an opportunity to develop their musical identity, and the other concerns instrumental playing as a source of motivation to prepare and perform for others.

- **Movement and dance**

In many cultures, especially most African cultures, music and dance are related arts. There are also related concepts for these two art forms. As Glover and Young (1999:126) describe it, “... both music and dance are rooted in the sensations of timing and rhythm, intensity and dynamics which we feel”. The authors further state that music can be transformed into movements which we both see and feel.

- **Creativity**

Creativity is the ability to come up with innovative solutions to musical problems being experienced. Miché (2002 :194) does not only acknowledge the importance of music training in enhancing creativity, but goes further to cite research-supported evidence regarding the relationship between music and the development of various forms of creativity. Music education should therefore offer learners extensive opportunities that challenge them to think creatively.

2.8.4 Children’s musical potential

With their earlier, somewhat intuitive learning in tow, children are easily capable of developing musical literacy and conceptual understanding of music as one among many disciplines in the school curriculum (Campbell, 2002: 66). “Systematic observation of young

children's musical behaviour," Welch (2002:125) agrees, "reveals a rich and diverse pattern of musical competencies."

Mills (2005:2) does not support the categorization of people as 'musical' and 'unmusical'. She rather asserts: "We all have potential as musicians, and even the most famous musicians among us have potential which remains untapped". This view is shared by Pound and Harrison (2003:65) who contend that an approach to teaching and learning music should assume that every child is musical.

2.9 Assessment in music education

2.9.1 The assessment process

Glover and Young (1999:214) assert that "[t]he assessment process must be rooted in all teaching, and children must be fully involved in it themselves." This view is shared by Spruce (2001: 118) when he asserts that "what we teach and how we teach it impact upon *what* and *how* we assess." Far too often, assessment is viewed in terms of the record of marks or grades, and having a system in place for recording the marks. While this is part of the assessment process, it should be clear that there is far more to it than this. Bray (2002:81) cautions that, "Designing an elaborate system which records our marks and grades may not lead to effective assessment." He further stresses that (his italics), "*It is the process, which leads to the record, which is most important.*"

2.9.2 Effective assessment

According to Glover and Young (1999), for assessment to be effective, the teacher and pupils should understand each other fully, and both engage in the process from the same understood basis. "If this is in place," Glover and Young (1999:215) reason, "children will be able to make their own self-assessments." The authors see an added advantage of this approach as developing learners cognitive understanding of the subject, keeping them motivated, and increasing a sense of 'owning' their learning.

Spruce (2002b:18) makes an important observation regarding musical progression: "It is tempting to consider musical progression in terms of increased technical facility...". He further highlights the shortcomings of assessment viewed in this narrow way as follows:

- A whole range of ways in which musical achievement might be demonstrated is ignored.
- It fails to provide for the needs of all children.
- It fails to provide for aspects of creativity, breadth of repertoire, listening skills, critical and appraising achievements.
- It fails to provide for increased understanding of the nature of music.

2.9.3 Problems with assessment in music

Bray (2002:79) notes that "...the prevailing feeling [is] that music is one of those subjects difficult to assess." This is in comparison to 'difficult' subjects, such as Mathematics for example, where things are basically perceived as being either right or wrong. With reference to listening, Glover and Young (1999:214) also make a point regarding the difficulties of assessment: "The idea of listening to individual children's work and assessing it against a framework of learning expectations in music is unfamiliar to many teachers".

Bray (2002) and Glover and Young (1999) are of the view that the difficulty often arises from a lack of clarity over terms and concepts. Bray further laments that an enormous amount of time and effort is put into a system which records a great deal of information, but does not help students to learn. He believes in devising a system that is clear, easy to use, has a beneficial effect on learning, and does not take up enormous amount of time.

2.9.4 Types of assessment

Adams (2001a) and Bray (2002) make a distinction between two models of assessment – formative and summative. Formative assessment has the following features:

- it seeks to gain insights in the way pupils respond to and interpret the given material;
- it involves teachers and pupils in further development and learning;
- it promotes a review of teaching styles and approaches; and
- it promotes informed feedback to the pupils about their own learning and work.

Summative assessment however, provides information regarding the standard a particular student has reached at a specified time. The overall achievement of a student is recorded in relation to a required standard as set out in defined criteria.

Adams (2001b:173) further describes another model of assessment known as ipsative assessment. Adams explains that this type of assessment informs pupils how they have performed in relation to their previous efforts.

2.10 Resources for music education

Music departments in schools often have to deal with an array of resource allocation problems such as lack of enough teaching and storage space, non-availability of purpose-built facilities to support music education, and instruments not being enough for the learners.

With limited finance, Spruce (2002b:26) appeals to school music departments to consider the following questions regarding resource acquisition and management:

- How much do the resources cost and will the pupils get value for money in terms of quality, content and fitness of purpose?
- How is the department developing its resources, availability and use to promote the quality of learning?
- How does the department evaluate the effectiveness of resources?
- How does the department review and develop the use of accommodation?

2.11 Summary of the review

The literature consulted highlighted major ideas in relation to the delivery of effective music programmes.

The chapter provided an overview of the research studies consulted regarding the status of music education programmes in Botswana. These studies were concerned with the way the curriculum for the teacher training is designed, and also the associated problems of the general underdevelopment of music education programmes. The studies proposed changes to solve the problems identified, and most offered revised programmes for use in the teacher training institutions. In contrast to prevailing concerns over music education, literature citing the commitment towards improvements in education by the Botswana government is also available. This is evident through the reviews undertaken, and the substantial allocations the education sector enjoys from the national budget.

The chapter then interrogated the paradigms relating to the philosophical and didactic principles relevant to music education. The general thrusts of the arguments are centred on the following areas:

- the rationale for music education;
- music curriculum design and implementation; and
- the assessment procedures relevant to music education.

A short summary of each of these arguments is given below:

Music departments and teachers need to have a clear rationale for music education. The rationale should be based on the unique role music plays in the holistic development of children. If teachers and schools are not prepared to promote music education, then music will be subjected to marginalisation in the school curriculum. In his article *Justifying Music in General Education: Belief in Search for Reason*, Jorgenson (1996) points out that if the arts are to survive and flourish in general education, they will need to be justified in a variety of ways. Jorgenson's advice (1996:6) that where arts are seen to be vulnerable, "belief in search of reason becomes a more urgent enterprise" should be heeded.

Curriculum design and implementation should be based on the skills, attitudes and experiences children bring along with them. The design and implementation should further recognise the social and cultural backgrounds of the children, for whom the music education is intended. The curriculum should be also devised on the assumption that children are musical.

Assessment in music education is a difficult exercise. The difficulty may arise from lack of clarity and common understanding of the meanings of different musical terms and concepts. The difficulty is further compounded by the limited perceptions of what musical progression constitutes. In addition to these, teachers are often not competent enough to assess learning, especially where listening to children's musical presentations is involved.

CHAPTER 3

THE CURRENT STATE OF MUSIC EDUCATION IN BOTSWANA

3.1 Introduction

A comprehensive and insightful evaluation of educational planning, policy and practice is necessary in order to advise on adjustments that may be required. For music education, this involves reflecting on the progress (or lack thereof) made in effectively teaching the subject since its inception in Botswana's junior secondary curriculum in January 1999. This evaluation will feature accounts of what has been achieved so far, and assess the extent to which different players effectively carry out the roles mandated to them. All this will be measured against a backdrop of the philosophical principles guiding music education. The evaluation serves as a foundation to planning geared towards the provision of sustainable and equitable music education to the junior secondary learners.

The current state of music education will be dealt with under the following broad headings:

- The socio-cultural context impacting on music education in Botswana
- Music education within the entire education system
- Music education as part of the Botswana's national development agenda, with specific reference to the National Vision.

3.2 Overview of the current state of music education

The current state of music education needs to be viewed and understood from within various contexts: societal challenges and demands; global trends and pressures; and educational goals and relevance to the economy. While these factors are external to music education, they cannot be ignored. This section seeks to highlight the factors impacting on music education so as to provide an overview of the current state of music education in Botswana. The overview sets forth the context for the latter parts of this chapter in which the challenges and the initiatives relating to the teaching of music in the junior secondary schools are discussed.

3.2.1 Socio-cultural context

Botswana, like many of African countries, exists simultaneously in two worlds. The first world arising from a history of colonisation, urbanisation and globalisation, is the one influenced by Western ways of thinking, and which puts a strong emphasis on intellectual endeavours. Nzewi (2007:vi) warns of the dangers of absorbing Western values simply because they seem more immediately inventive, pointing out that all too often the results thereof can be seen as "... human and environmental tragedies".

The other world is informed by indigenous knowledge systems featuring an inclination towards oral traditions. As Nzewi relates (2007:iii, vii) "The indigenous African conceptualization is holistic" and incorporates a "philosophy of cautious advancement to consolidate humanness". While there is often cultural tension between these two worlds, opportunities abound for the harmonious resolution of conflicts that do arise. Thus, with respect to music education *per se*, the weak linkage of class music (too often Western-oriented) to pupils' own, everyday musical and social experiences is a cause for concern. Music educators can fulfil an important role here. They need to be aware of the gap between school learning (through 'intellectual endeavours') and the learners' everyday existence. And the contents of class music need to be re-engineered in order to make music education both educational and socially relevant.

3.2.2 Current situation regarding music education

- **Pre-primary level**

The concepts of "pre-primary education" and "early childhood learning" are relatively new to Botswana's education policy. The renaming of the former Primary Education Department to Pre-Primary Education Department reflects the attention these concepts are now receiving. According to Botswana (2006:2), "...the Education Act would need to be amended to include Pre-Primary Education."

For these reasons there is little information about the situation of music at this level. It can be assumed, however, that little or no progress has been made with regard to this crucial stage of a child's development. This assumption stems from the fact that curricular changes usually take time to make any meaningful impact.

- **Primary level**

At this level of education music is taught under the banner of Creative and Performing Arts (CAPA). CAPA draws its content from Art and Craft, Design and Technology, Home Economics, Business Studies, Drama, Dance, Music and Home Economics. Although the syllabus stipulates clear objectives for each of these subject areas, they have to be integrated when taught as they are closely linked by common objectives. In a recent study on situation of music education within the CAPA programme. Phuthego (2007:i) laments the teachers' shortcomings, in terms of appropriate teaching approaches and their vague understanding of "integration", a concept they are required to master.

- **Secondary level**

Secondary education runs for five years. The first three of these are in the junior secondary schools leading to the Junior Certificate Examination (JCE), and last two years are in the senior secondary schools, leading to the Botswana General Certificate of Secondary Education (BGCSE) examination. Music in the junior secondary schools is the focus of this current study. There are problems in music education at this level regarding the quality of teaching and the effectiveness of syllabus design. Music at senior secondary schools is currently undergoing a pilot stage with 13 of the 28 schools participating, and therefore little information is available regarding the progress at this stage.

- **Tertiary level**

Apart from the Botswana International University of Science and Technology (BIUST) which is currently undergoing construction and has yet to start operating, the University of Botswana (UB) is the only public university in the country. Course offerings such as performance, composition, musicology and music technology – typical of what is offered in other university-level institutions – are not there among the programmes presented at the UB. Rather, music is limited to music education modules offered by the Primary Education Department. The colleges of education also include music within their diploma programmes, although the coverage is limited.

3.2.3 Key indicators of progress in music education in Botswana

While the main purpose of this study is to highlight the problems of music education at the junior secondary level of education in Botswana, it is equally important to highlight areas of success as well. Acknowledgement of these would serve as an affirmation that there is a potential desire for improvement, and set the tone for further improvement. The key indicators of progress relate to 1) opportunities for further training, 2) the number of schools offering Music at junior secondary level, 3) improvements of facilities, and 4) meeting the manpower requirements relating to music education.

- **Opportunities for further training in music**

There has been an increase in the number of in-service music teachers sent for further training, mostly in South African tertiary institutions. More teachers with a music education background have been recruited to Staff Development Fellow (SDF) positions at the Colleges of Education.

- **Schools offering music**

Music has been rolled out to 30 more junior secondary schools, in addition to the initial 15 which participated in the pilot programme. Piloting of the music education programme has started in selected senior secondary schools in the country.

- **Purpose-built facilities for music**

A purpose-built music education facility has been built and is now functioning at the Molepolole College of Education (MCE), and construction of a similar facility for the creative and performing arts disciplines is on-going at the Serowe College of Education (SCE). Construction of a college dedicated to applied arts at Oodi is complete, and will soon be opened to receive its first students.

- **Meeting the manpower needs**

There have been recruitment drives, targeting persons with a music education background, to fill positions of education officers in the Ministry of Education and Skills Development (MoESD). These officers will be expected to help with the formulation of policies guiding the

development of music education. The recruitment of academics for the University of Botswana (UB) with primary, secondary and college level teaching experiences and with doctoral qualifications will also help provide much-needed skills relating to music policy-making and knowledge through research, and provide much-needed professional leadership in the area of music education.

3.2.4 Developments in arts and culture

- **Recording of indigenous and popular music**

The past few years have seen an unprecedented growth in ‘musical products’, including CDs and DVDs of well-known folk songs, and new compositions bearing characteristics of both folk and popular music styles. These are mostly aimed at and produced by the youthful sections of society. This growth can be attributed to the improvements in today’s world of communication, electronics and computer technology. Chosky, Abramson, Gillespie, Woods and York (2001:24) observe that technological advances have always influenced new developments in music, “Musicians are no strangers to advances in technology”. In Botswana, as throughout the world, technology has made it possible for a variety of types of music to be more accessible. As the authors succinctly summarise it, “Technology has long been a musician’s friend.”

- **Opportunities for performance**

The advent of the national television service just over a decade ago made it increasingly possible for Botswana musicians to reach out to wider audiences. In addition, local artists have increasingly become important actors in many political parties’ rallies.

- **Department of Arts and Culture (DAC)**

In response to the rapidly changing arts and culture landscape, the government established a new Department of Arts and Culture under the Ministry of Youth, Sports and Culture. The department now carries out the functions of the former Culture and Youth Department. The new department has four divisions – Culture, Performing Arts, Visual Arts and Graphic Design. According to the department’s newsletter *Marang a Ngwao*, the new department was formed, “to adequately serve the youth, art and culture sectors as well as the clientele.”

- **Opportunities within music education**

There have been significant internal changes with the most obvious being an increase in the number of junior secondary schools offering Music as a subject and an increase in the number of teachers sponsored by the government for further training in the field of music education.

3.3 Access to and equity in junior secondary music education

Out of 207 junior secondary schools in Botswana, only 45 offer Music. This represents 22% of the junior secondary schools in the country. In the 2009 Junior Certificate Examination (JCE), 1267 out of a total of 40196 candidates sat for Music examinations (see Appendix). This was one of the lowest figures (Bookkeeping and Office Procedures had 187 and 295 candidates respectively). French, a newer subject, had 1659, whereas Physical Education which was introduced about the same time as Music had 14936. All these subjects are offered as optional subjects in the junior secondary schools. These figures show how underrepresented music education is at this level of education. If the situation does not improve, the problem of an ineffective music education programme will persist up to the tertiary level.

3.4 Aims of music education at junior secondary level

Informed by the spirit of the Revised National Policy on Education (RNPE), the school curriculum is now highly diversified to meet the country's challenges in the 21st century. According to the Ministry of Education (2006:21-22), "There is emphasis on prevocational preparation and in this regard practical subjects such as Design and Technology [and] new subjects like Business Studies, Physical Education, Music, Moral Education and Computer Awareness are available."

The aims of the three-year junior secondary music programme are drawn from the aims of a ten-year music education programme which are embedded in the aims of ten-year basic education programme. These three sets of aims are clearly stated in the three-year junior secondary music syllabus document. Designed to build on the foundations laid by the CAPA at the primary level of education, the syllabus expects the learners to have attained the

following at the end of the three-year programme (*Three-year Junior Secondary School Syllabus: Music. 2010:iii*):

1. Musical skills and competencies that will enable them to perform their own compositions and the compositions of others, in a variety of styles, through singing and playing instruments;
2. Musical skills and competencies that will enable them to create their own compositions, devise arrangements of existing compositions and to improvise;
3. An ability to respond to the concepts of music, from a variety of styles and music traditions, through listening and appreciating, and to evaluate musical performances and compositions;
4. Knowledge and understanding of the history and development of music in Botswana and the characteristics of African music;
5. An interest in different styles of music and related arts to show their interaction and relationship;
6. A creative approach to music-making so as to encourage motivation, self-actualisation and the attainment of well-balanced personal and artistic qualities.

These aims are stated in clear language; they are both measurable and achievable. As is evident from other sections of this chapter, the prevailing conditions in which music is taught are unfavourable for their achievement. The major difficulties in achieving the aims relate to resource constraints, including appropriately trained music teachers. Resource allocations require drastic re-evaluation – in consultation with school principals and music educators across the board.

3.5 Reforms in education and the public service

The government has in the past few years been inundated with complaints from the public over poor service delivery and low productivity levels in the public service. The government responded to these concerns by with sending benchmarking missions, comprising senior officers in government, to a wide variety of countries across the world with the intention of investigating how countries with successful service delivery achieve this, then coming up with performance improvement initiatives. As a result, government ministries, departments, units and institutions were directed to devise vision and mission statements as well as

customer service standards, and finally commit themselves to the implementation of high standards of performance.

Furthermore, two major systems, the Performance Management System (PMS) – aimed at monitoring performance levels in the public service – and the Performance Based Reward System (PBRS) – thereby rewarding good performers – are now in place. Also, each public service officer is expected each year to come up with a Performance Development Plan (PDP) and then execute that plan. Performance reviews are undertaken quarterly to ensure that the officers are on track regarding the performance objectives they have stated in their PDPs. It is worth noting that in order to implement these reforms the government has committed considerable resources to attempting to train public service workers in these performance reforms. In the process delivery has been affected as most officers had to attend performance management workshops for many days, or even weeks. For teachers, contact time with the learners was severely reduced, leading one to wonder whether the reforms have not been doing a disservice to education in general and to music education in particular.

An important question to address is whether or not the reforms have added meaningful value to the delivery of the curriculum and to the teaching of music. The main problem is that the reforms come as directives to be implemented with little or no input from stakeholders, especially the teachers. An observation echoed by Brand (2009:87) regarding music teachers' work is that "In this modern age of information technology, globalization, and economic competition, music teachers' work and lives are affected by the maddening wheel of change characterized by development of everything touted as new...". Brand further makes a valid argument that "... far too often, music teachers are made to feel left out of the very change they are expected to guide and implement", a situation relevant to educationists in Botswana. Apart from the general problem of a lack of thorough consultation, certain observations can be made regarding the implementation of the systems. Firstly, it is not clear whether or not there has been improvement in the actual delivery of the curriculum in the classroom, although there has been some improvement in the administrative functions within the education sector, and in customer service. Secondly, while the reforms aimed at managing performance and rewarding good performance, it seems as if the reward aspect is being neglected as only the measuring of performance gets all the attention.

While the majority of the reforms seem to be appropriate for some sectors in the public service, they do not appear to be as applicable within the education sector as it is too complex an area to measure using the currently available instruments. Further investigation

regarding the implementation of reforms within the education sector would seem to be both necessary and urgent.

3.6 Problems within the education ministry structures

The Ministry of Education and Development (MoESD) operates with a number of departments, divisions and units. For the purpose of autonomy, some functions mandated to the ministry are carried out by parastatals. This section will focus on the departments with the most direct influence on music education in junior secondary schools. These have been identified as the Teaching Service Management (TSM), the Secondary Department, and the Department of Curriculum Development and Evaluation (DCDE). Parastatal organisations included in this section are the Botswana Examinations Council (BEC), the Tertiary Education Council (TEC) and the University of Botswana (UB).

3.6.1 Teaching Service Management (TSM)

The Teaching Service Management (TSM) is the employing authority for teachers in Botswana, across all public schools: primary, secondary and colleges of education. With regard to the employment of music educators, the selection procedures followed do not reflect art-oriented selection procedures such as auditioning to determine the suitability of the applicants. In cases where direct contact is made with the interviewing panels, music education is not accorded the benefit of representation of panel members with a music education background to select the suitable candidates.

With regard to the quality of teachers, Hoffer (1993:44) argues that, “Good music teachers must also be good musicians.” Hoffer further argues that while they may not play their instruments and sing as well as someone who concentrated on that aspect of music, “a person can’t teach what he or she does not know.”

In view of the changing arts and culture climate, opportunities in the form of new positions have been created in the public service to manage the development. Thus music education loses qualified and experienced teachers to these positions which offer better salaries, prospects of improvement, and challenging responsibilities at middle management.

3.6.2 Department of Secondary Education

Although Ministry of Education and Skills Development officials have long appreciated the importance of developing sound educational policies that ensure good quality teaching and learning in the classrooms, the MoESD has, for the most part, lacked the capacity to ensure adherence to the highest teaching standards. The Department of Secondary Education is responsible for the supervision of schools, and does this throughout the educational regions across the country (see map – Appendix A).

In most cases, music education is not represented at the regional office level. Thus, music education issues are assigned to officers with little understanding of the prevailing issues in music, whose role is therefore limited to administrative and not professional leadership.

At the school level, the school Head is the focal person as he/she is responsible for facilitating the implementation of the curriculum and monitoring its ability to meet the broad educational goals as set out by the RNPE. Teachers depend on the school Head to enhance their teaching and meet objectives specific to their programmes. The fundamental role of support at the school head level is typified in an emphasis made by Abril & Gault (2006: 6): “This assistance is especially crucial in music education programs where the [school Head] can help establish school-wide support for the music education curriculum.”

Punke (1972) cited by Abril and Gault (2006:7) compared the views of school administrators (including school Heads and other subsidiary administrators or department heads) on the role of music in the public school curriculum, and found that they “... believed that winning athletic teams were more effective at fostering improved school community relations than outstanding musical performing groups...”. While this study was carried out in a totally different setting in terms of location and period, the findings are also true for schools in Botswana. For instance, sports administration enjoys funding and commitment of human resources, with sporting activities being well provided for in the school calendar.

3.6.3 Department of Curriculum Development and Evaluation (DCDE)

According to Botswana (2010:i) the Department of Curriculum Development and Evaluation organises the prescription list of secondary school textbooks as follows:

- Core text: this category covers textbooks to be used by all students doing the subject. It is expected that all students should have a copy of the book chosen as a core text.
- Class sets: schools are allowed to buy 40 copies for 3 classes or less and 80 copies for four classes or more.
- Supplementary texts: this category provides for materials to supplement the core text. It is recommended that a limited number should be bought for students doing the subject. Additional copies of supplementary texts should be accumulated over the years.
- Teacher's Reference texts: These texts should be shared by the teachers teaching the subject in the schools.

The books prescribed for music education have many limitations, the main one being that they do not address music from the local context. While they do cover music theory, this is presented in a form difficult for the beginners to grasp. Other limitations relate to inadequate coverage of the syllabus and lack of relevance to the Junior Certificate Examinations (JCE).

One would expect a core music text book to have some of the following features:

- Clear on tasks to be carried out as the learner listens to the music, such as identification of pitches, inserting bar lines at appropriate places, and identification of instruments.
- Offer the opportunity to apply music concepts which have been taught theoretically.
- Have an integrated approach to music education. For example, work based on the lyrics of the music may be used to enhance listening and language skills.
- A variety of signs, symbols and pictorial representations to stimulate learner's interest.
- Engages the learners to physically respond to music by using conducting patterns, or by dancing to the beat patterns of the music.
- Make use of music-teaching tools of such as listening maps, guides and questionnaires.
- Make use of material drawn from a wide range of musical cultures and styles.
- Expose learners to tasks requiring them to imagine, compare, and suggest the moods of the pieces they are listening to. In addition, learners are given probing questions to relate the music to real life experiences.

As will be discussed in the following chapters, the textbooks currently prescribed for Music in Botswana's junior secondary schools do not satisfy these criteria and therefore render the learning of music more difficult than necessary for most Botswana learners. The above-mentioned features are addressed in several readily-available books, including those by Amanto *et al* (2009), Bestwick *et al* (2005), Johnson *et al* (2006), Mbenje & Pambano (2010) and Phibion & Moeng (2009).

The second and most important function of the Department of Curriculum Development and Evaluation relates to syllabus development. Curriculum development and design is the main concern of this study, and an analysis of the music syllabus will be undertaken in the latter chapters of this study.

3.6.4 Botswana Examinations Council (BEC)

The Botswana Examinations Council (BEC) is responsible for examinations at the end of each school programme. It is through BEC initiated assessments that the quality of education in schools is determined and the progression of learners to levels above basic education monitored. Currently, the BEC relies on summative assessment, but there is a need to reduce the reliance on this type of assessment (see Chapters 2.9.2 – 2.9.4). This is especially important in a subject such as Music where not only the outcomes, but the *process* of learning should be taken into account. The 21st century needs curriculum and assessment strategies placing more emphasis on *context* and less on *content*, affording the recipients skills needed to participate in a world that is increasingly becoming more complex.

3.6.5 Tertiary Education Council (TEC)

The Tertiary Education Council (TEC) has a more or less similar mandate to the South African Council on Higher Education. TEC's mandate includes quality assurance in tertiary educational institutions. Music education at the colleges and the University (UB) should adhere to the standards imposed by the TEC.

3.6.6 University of Botswana (UB)

A university has a role to play by way of generating knowledge through research into music education. In many universities, initiatives such as outreach programmes are in place, both to offer support to the community and to learn from such initiatives. These programmes are

performed in collaboration with music teachers and other people working locally in music and in related arts. Currently there is little or no effort in this direction at the UB.

An important role of the University of Botswana is the provision of professional and academic guidance to the colleges of education. This leadership is in the form of approving the syllabi and ensuring appropriate assessments by participating in the setting of examinations and being in charge of the moderation of the results. Music education, as one of the college offerings, is subject to these processes. There has been concern over their failure to properly carry out this mandate given to them by the Ministry of Education and Skills Development. This failure concerns the lack of adequate response – through adaptation of their own syllabi – to curricular changes taking place at the school levels.

3.7 Non-governmental organisations

Democracies the world over thrive because of the meaningful participation of civil society. This participation comes in many forms such as workers associations, professional associations, and cultural and social organisations; these are all stakeholders for which education of each successive generation holds obvious advantages in terms of raising the effectiveness of the workforce and improving social consciousness. Matters of education are too important to be left to the government alone. Meaningful participation in music education through non-governmental set-ups and stakeholders would encourage the following:

- Advocacy of music education in all schools
- Organising of music fairs and exhibitions
- Furthering research on music
- The building of networks with other music associations globally
- Organising workshops for music teachers
- The presentation of seminars.

With specific regard to music education, the contribution of two organisations, the Botswana Teachers Union (BTU) and the Botswana Association of Music Educators (BOAME), will be discussed.

3.7.1 Botswana Teachers Union (BTU)

The Botswana Teachers Union (BTU) exists primarily as a staff welfare union concerned with a wide range of issues affecting the teachers. However, the influence of the BTU in music across the educational spectrum cannot be ignored. This organisation has a long tradition of running choral music competitions countrywide. Organised at branch levels, regional through to the national, these annual competitions attract choirs from all levels of the education spectrum – from primary through to tertiary institutions. Community choirs are also included. Surprisingly, and disappointingly, it has been ascertained from BTU officials that the participation rate by junior secondary school choirs is continually lower it should be.

3.7.2 Botswana Association of Music Educators (BOAME)

The BOAME as a professional organisation that should be carrying out some of the functions alluded to above, but its influence has not been evident in music education circles.

3.8 Music education and the national *Vision 2016*

In a development geared towards advancing education and ensuring socio-economic progress, a task force was appointed in 1997 to come up with a national vision. This task force produced a report entitled *Vision 2016: Towards Prosperity for All*, whose pillars are listed as follows (Long Term Vision for Botswana 1997:5-13):

- An open, democratic and accountable nation
- A prosperous, productive and innovative nation
- An educated, informed nation
- A moral and tolerant nation
- A united and proud nation
- A compassionate, just and caring nation
- A safe and secure nation.

Vision 2016 currently permeates the thinking across all sectors of development in Botswana. Policy documents guiding education in Botswana are directed towards the attainment of these ideals. Budget speeches, state of the nation addresses and fiscal policies all make reference to the national vision. The themes of National Development Plan 9 and National

Development Plan 10, which started in 2009, are centred on the attainment of the national vision.

While these documents express the government's confidence in attaining the ideals expressed by *Vision 2016*, critics in some quarters of society dismiss it as too ambitious and unattainable within current levels of development. The critics cite high unemployment rates and related problems such as crime and poverty as the major stumbling blocks towards attainment of this vision. Whatever the views people have, optimistic or pessimistic, the point is that the aims of *Vision 2016* should be achievable if appropriate strategies are put in place. Previous sections of this chapter focused the status of music education within the existing policies and practices. With so much interest centred on *Vision 2016* in Botswana, perspectives informed by music education principles need to be sought, by addressing the following questions: What opportunities exist in music education for the attainment of the national vision? How can music teachers use the *Vision 2016* ideals to ensure effective music education? How can music teachers create ownership of the vision among the junior secondary learners? This section presents music education as one of the vehicles that can be used towards the attainment of the *Vision 2016* ideals. The ways, provided for in music education concern:

- Awareness

Awareness of the pillars of *Vision 2016* (see Chapter 3.9) is the first critical step towards its achievement. A wide range of activities from melody writing to performances in a concert, for example, can be carried out in music classes, with the national vision as the central theme.

- Interpersonal skills

Vision 2016 encompasses concepts such as democracy, co-operation, openness, morality and tolerance. In music education, there is wide range of activities such as ensemble and choral work, individual and group performances which, if applied to other areas, will help towards the attainment of the vision.

- Education and information

Educating *through* music is a current education strategy. If fully adopted in teaching-learning situations, this approach would help accelerate the attainment of educational objectives, and the objectives of *Vision 2016*.

- Empowerment

Music education offers a wide range of self-actualisation opportunities such as performance and composition. In the process of exposing learners to these, the ideal of having a prosperous, productive and innovative nation is supported.

3.9 Summary

This chapter examined the current state of music education against the myriad of policies and practices governing Botswana's education system. The chapter identified some factors that mitigate against an effective music education programme at the junior secondary schools, and which constitute a serious impediment to providing effective, sustainable and equitable music education to learners. These factors concern the following:

- The weak linkage of class music to pupils' own, everyday musical experiences.
- Ineffective assessment procedures in place for music at junior secondary level.
- Lack of proper coordinated efforts toward improving the quality of music teaching and learning.
- Ineffective involvement of all stakeholders in music education.
- Insufficient resource allocation committed to the teaching of music.

This chapter also highlighted the opportunities that could, if exploited, offer a more effective music programme. These opportunities relate to the advent of globalisation, developments in Information Communication Technology and Botswana's national *Vision 2016*. The chapter also poses questions such as: Why do the departments under the Ministry of Education, and the schools alike, fail to take sufficient advantage of modern technology or use skills of relevant professionals to improve the quality of music education? What are the factors that influence curriculum development and policy decisions, and what role do music teachers play in that process? How can the music teaching capacities of junior secondary schools in Botswana be strengthened? It looks at the roles of various organisations in Botswana (ranging from social institutions and professional associations to the government ministries) in helping promote music education in the junior secondary schools.

The following issues of concern with regard to the current junior secondary school Music syllabus can be extrapolated from the above discussions, especially from Chapter 3.6.3:

- There is an imbalance in the treatment of learning objectives, with the syllabus skewed towards the cognitive domain.
- The syllabus is more inclined towards music literacy, with little or no attention given to other musical activities such as listening, movement, singing and instrumental playing.
- The stylistic coverage of the musical genres is not broad enough to accommodate non-western musical genres.
- The syllabus undermines the potential of music to foster creativity, imaginative thinking, and self-actualisation among the target learners.

An evaluation of education such as this, can never be an exhaustive catalogue of all that needs to be done. The purpose, however, is to ensure that a wide-ranging and all-inclusive set of observations are solicited, providing a basis for proposals and recommended actions in the latter parts of this study. If the issues raised in this chapter are not responded to through appropriate intervention measures, the ideal of creating a well-rounded and effective music product, as implied by the three-year junior secondary Music syllabus document, will remain a theoretical abstraction.

CHAPTER 4

DATA COLLECTION AND ANALYSIS

4.1 Introduction

This chapter opens with an introduction to the research design chosen for this study. Then, a presentation of data from answers to the questionnaires is made. Reports on the lesson observations undertaken then follow. Thereafter, an analysis of the three-year junior secondary school music syllabus is made. The chapter closes with a discussion of the findings with a view to making recommendations for the improvement of music education in Botswana's junior secondary schools.

4.2 Research design

Leedy and Ormrod (2001:91) describe research design as “the complete strategy of attack on the central problem.” They further explain that the design provides the overall structure for:

- Procedures the researcher follows
- The data the researcher collects
- The data analysis the researcher conducts.

The purpose of this study has been to document problems regarding the teaching of music in junior secondary schools in Botswana. Perceptions of music teachers and learners were solicited regarding their experiences in music education. This study also sought to establish the appropriateness of the design of the current three-year junior secondary Music syllabus to meet the stated broad educational goals. According to Mouton's categories (2001:148-180), the present study combines elements of the following categories:

1. Ethnographical research – participant observation study;
4. Survey – provides an overview of a representative sample of the selected population;
8. Evaluation research – to ascertain if a programme has been properly implemented; and
13. Content analysis – evaluating the content of a curriculum.

A research design employing qualitative research methods was found to be best suitable for eliciting answers to the questions posed at the beginning and in achieving the study objectives. Descriptions of the delimitation of the study, sampling procedures, the study population as well as details regarding tools for data collection follow.

4.2.1 Delimitation of the study

The eight schools identified for inclusion in the research are found in three of the country's five regional areas under the control of the Secondary Department.



The distribution of these schools is as follows:

- South region: 3 schools, 1 urban (Gaborone) and 2 rural
- Central region: 3 schools, 2 semi-urban (Serowe/Palapye area) and 1 rural
- North region: 2 schools, 1 urban (Francistown) and 1 rural.

The study involved schools in the Gaborone, Serowe/Palapye and Francistown areas of Botswana.

4.2.2 Sampling procedure

Schools were chosen on the basis of having participated in the six-year pilot programme for music education in junior secondary schools in Botswana. It was assumed that the schools therefore have enough experience in the teaching of Music, and that they have passed the stage of problems associated with introducing a new subject into the school curriculum. Thus only 15 of the 45 schools offering Music were eligible to participate in this study.

Permission to do the research in the junior secondary schools was granted by the ministry education authorities. As stipulated in the letter from the Ministry of Education and Skills Development granting permission, and in adherence to research ethics, the consent of the regional and school authorities, parents and research participants was also sought. The Music coordinator in each school helped with identifying at least one teacher to answer the questionnaire, another one to have his/her lesson observed, and the distribution of questionnaires to the learners. For the learner participants, the Music coordinator in each school was asked to distribute the questionnaires to ten students in Form 2, and another ten in Form 3. That means that from each of the participating schools 20 learners participated. The total number of learners included in the study was thus 160 from the eight participating schools.

4.2.3 Population of the study

The population of this study is defined as including music teachers and learners in the junior secondary schools. Music teachers were considered appropriate participants for this study as they are the implementers of the music education programme. Learners, as recipients of the music education programme, are valuable sources of information to determine the effectiveness (or lack thereof) of the music education programme.

Learner participants were selected on the basis of having experienced music education for at least one year in junior secondary school. That means that the participation was restricted to learners in their second and third years of junior secondary schooling, i.e. they had to be in either Form 2 or Form 3.

4.2.4 Data gathering

- **Questionnaires**

The study utilised a questionnaire to obtain the opinions and attitudes of teachers in the eight schools towards their work as music teachers. Another questionnaire, targeted the learners who experience music lessons at their school, was used to determine how they perceive the music education programme. (See Appendices.)

- **Observations**

Lesson observations were undertaken to determine the quality of learning and the actual content of the teaching of music *in situ*.

- **Analyses**

An analysis of the Botswana music syllabus has been carried out in order to get further insight into the quality of the music education programme. The equivalent current South African Arts and Culture syllabus has also been consulted, both for comparative purposes and for enriching ideas for possible future incorporation into the Botswana syllabus. To this end the syllabi of Namibia and Australia have also been scrutinised.

4.3 Data presentation: Teachers' questionnaire

The teachers' questionnaire comprised four parts. Part I (4 items) was meant to establish the background information, both with regard to previous training and the music teaching experience of the participants. Part II (6 items) aimed at establishing, through use of both quantitative and qualitative items, the form music education takes,. The quantitative aspect comprised statistical data concerning the numbers of music teachers and pupils, and music teaching loads. The qualitative data related to the evaluation of facilities for teaching music, and the approaches teachers use to teach music.

Part III (7 items) established the quality of professional support the teachers receive at school level, as well as from the relevant department of the Ministry of Education and Skills Development. Part IV (4 items) discerned the opinion teachers have of the music syllabus,

including suggestions of ways to improve the current syllabus. The questionnaire consisted of close-ended questions, but with some open-ended questions used as follow-up. The following are the findings gleaned from the answers to the questionnaire as completed by the eight teachers.

PART I: PERSONAL INFORMATION

1. What are your qualifications?

Out of the eight respondents involved in this study, only one has a BA (Music) degree, the rest hold a Diploma in Secondary Education (DSE).

2. Where and when did you obtain the qualification?

The BA (Music) degree holder obtained the qualification at the Nelson Mandela Metropolitan University (Port Elizabeth) in 2004, while the rest obtained their diplomas at Molepolole College of Education (MCE). Only two of the diploma holders stated the years in which they obtained their qualification – one in 2000, the other in 2008.

3. Which form(s) do you teach?

All respondents indicated that they teach classes across the junior secondary school spectrum – Forms 1, 2 and 3.

4. How long have you been teaching music

(a) in this school?

(b) in any previous school(s)?

This item aimed at ascertaining the teaching experience the respondents had, both in terms of the number of years teaching music and the different school settings. One respondent had 7 years in their present school. The number of years spent teaching music for the remaining seven teachers can be summarised using the following ranges:

- 0 to 1 year – three teachers
- 1 to 2 years – three teachers

- 2 to 3 years – none of the teachers
- 3 to 4 years – only one teacher.

The actual years of experiences as music teacher listed in ascending order: 8 months (one teacher), 1 year (two teachers), 1½ years (one teacher), 2 years (two teachers), and 4 years (one teacher).

Three respondents had not taught in any other school before. Two others only mentioned a previous school, not the number of years as required in question 4b. The longest serving teacher, i.e. the one with 7 years in the current school, had an additional 3 years teaching experience in a previous school(s).

PART II: MUSIC EDUCATION IN THE SCHOOL

1. Give the numbers of the following:

- (a) Music teachers in this school**
- (b) Music teaching periods per week**
- (c) Pupils taking music**
- (d) Pupils per class (average)**

Five of eight schools involved in this study had two music teachers each. The remaining three schools had one, three and four teachers respectively.

Four teachers mentioned teaching loads ranging from 18 to 30 periods per week, that being 18, 22, 28 and 30 periods respectively; one reported 9 periods, while three others reported only 4 periods per week.

One participant did not respond to the question 1 (c) on the number of pupils taking music. The school with the lowest has 90 pupils, while the next has 94. A higher numbers of pupils were indicated in the three other schools, namely 135, 140, and 180. The remaining two schools had 204 and 210 learners respectively, making them schools with the highest number of pupils taking music among the participating schools.

In last part of this question participants were asked to state the average number of pupils per class. The figures given by the eight participants were: 10, 10, 15, 17, 18, 20, 24 and 30.

1.1 How do the above numbers affect the quality of the music education programme in this school?

All respondents lamented the high ratio of pupils to the available resources. The concerns regard the concomitant inability to manage classes properly, especially instrumental work. Inefficient remedial and enrichment activities were also cited. One of the respondents succinctly described the situation in the schools as follows: “Pupils gather around one instrument. Performance assessment takes too long and it is not productive. There is totally no individualised instruction.”

2. Is the teaching and storage space suitable for the teaching of music?

None of the participants indicated having suitable space for either teaching or storage.

a. If not, explain how you manage to deal with the problem.

One of the participating teachers did not respond to this question. The rest gave the following responses, indicating a range of negative experiences regarding teaching and storage space:

- We only compromise by taking instruments in and out. The classroom is used as a base room; therefore we do not have access to the room. The room is surrounded by other rooms and it is not soundproofed.
- We have piled all the equipment in the small storeroom and have to take them out during the music lessons.
- We occupy a small storeroom, where there is no electricity, and therefore use adaptors to pull electricity from the nearest room.
- We only store materials that are used more often than others.
- No base room for music, therefore we move up and down searching for empty spaces, sometimes outdoor teaching areas.
- It is a compromise; the lab is very small both for students and materials.
- It is a difficult one because there is a shortage of classrooms in the school. We normally check the class timetables so as to use an available classroom if the users have gone for other practical subjects.

3.1 Which instruments are available in the school?

Responses to this question cover the following list of instruments: guitars, keyboards, recorders, and drum kits which all the schools have. Additional instruments mentioned in the responses include: *djembe* drums, marimba, xylophone, bongos, maracas, *segaba*, *setinkane* (see below) and tambourines. One respondent mentioned a trumpet included among the available instruments.

A *segaba* (Photo by Mothusi Phuthego)



A *setinkane* (Photo by Tshepo Setswammung)



3.2 Describe the activities you do with your pupils, using instruments

Responses to this were as follows:

- Playing scales, melodies and chords.
- Illustrating the playing techniques of instruments, how sound is produced, and when dealing with the classification of instruments.

- Doing practical work to meet the requirements of the syllabus and assessment.
- Performing during important school activities such as the school prize-giving and other ceremonies.

4 How often do you assess the following areas of music education: (a) listening, (b) music theory and history, and (c) performance?

This item sought to establish the frequency at which listening, music theory and performance were assessed. The results are given in the table below:

Area	Very often	Sometimes
Listening	3	5
Music theory and history	8	0
Performance	3	5

The participants indicated that they assess all areas, though with varying frequencies:

- Music theory and history is the most often assessed area with all teachers indicating that they assess it very often.
- Listening and performance are both only assessed sometimes.

4.1 For you, which area is the most difficult to assess?

Three respondents indicated that performance is the most difficult to assess, while the remaining five indicated listening. None of the participants mentioned music theory and history.

4.2 Explain the difficulty that you experience

For some teachers the concerns that were raised centred on feelings of being incompetent as music teachers, while others put the blame on the calibre of the pupils they teach in the schools:

The difficulties cited for the assessment of listening were as follows:

- It is very difficult to come up with items for the listening paper.
- Sometimes pupils and teacher tend to differ in some areas in listening such as instrument classification in relation to sound production.

- I find some musical concepts difficult to identify and explain through listening.
- It's difficult to set the paper as there are no resources and sometimes I have to use personal resources.
- Learners have big problems with listening, and require more training.
- At times I feel that I am too harsh on the students, while at other times I feel too lenient with them.

As for performance assessment, the responses included the following:

- Most students usually do not play well during assessments.
- My own weakness in improvisation affects the way I assess performance.

5. What strategies do you employ for the different abilities in your class?

5.1 High achievers

All respondents reported that they give them challenging tasks to keep them busy. One also mentioned putting them in a group to encourage competition.

5.2 Average achievers

Two participants did not respond to the question. Others responded as follows:

- We limit their work by giving them work suitable for their level.
- Give them more work. Mix them with high achievers and encourage competition. Put them in their own group as well and encourage competition.
- Assign them to do group and individual work.
- Give them regular exercises.
- Give them some challenging activities so that they can explore more.

5.3 Low achievers

The common responses given were as follows:

- We give them easy tasks so that they progress step by step to catch up with the others.
- Lots of revision and more practice.
- As much as possible they get individual attention through remedial teaching during afternoon studies.

- Put them in their own group and practice at their pace; encourage competition; and give them their own work.
- Pair them with average and high performers so that they can be helped.

6. How often do you incorporate the following musical activities in your teaching: (a) singing, (b) listening, (c) music notation, (d) instrumental teaching, (e) movement, (f) improvisation?

This item sought to establish the frequency with which the musical activities listed above were incorporated in the teaching of music. The results are given in the table below:

Activity	Always	Sometimes
Singing	5	3
Listening	1	7
Music notation	6	2
Instrumental playing	3	5
Movement	3	5
Improvisation	3	5

PART III PROFESSIONAL SUPPORT

1. Describe the quality of support you get from:

(a) Colleagues in the school

Some positive responses were given. Two of the respondents simply described it as good. Others elaborated on the nature of support:

- During music moderation where most of the lessons are affected, they are willing to sacrifice their lesson time.
- Most of the time they are supportive.
- Through team-teaching, especially practical (referring to other music teachers in the school).
- Sometimes praise for work well done.

There were also two unfavourable responses given, as follows:

- Too little, they view music as a waste of time.
- No support at all.

(b) Your senior teacher

The responses given mainly relate to administrative issues and they were as follows:

- Taking up any matters relating to music with the school administration.
- Assessing lessons and organising music activities.
- A bit supportive though not understanding or knowledgeable.
- Sometimes supportive, sometimes not.
- Supportive, makes sure everything is done, e.g. orders reach school on time.
- It is very minimal.
- Not so convincing (as we do not have a music room).

(c) The school Head

Most of the respondents acknowledged the support they got from the school head though the extent varies. Three respondents simply used the words 'excellent', 'supportive', and 'good' to describe the nature of support. The rest elaborated a little further:

- Supports us in music school programmes (both internal and external).
- Makes finances available for activities.
- Supportive, though resources govern her.
- A little supportive.
- Supportive, makes sure the department gets what is needed on time.

2. Is there a music cluster in the area?

Seven respondents indicated that there is a cluster in their area, and only one indicated otherwise. (The respondents were all ofay with this concept; but a definition would be: "A music cluster is a grouping of music teachers from a number of junior secondary schools in an area with the purpose of attending to common issues regarding Music as a subject; for example, a Francistown music cluster would have teachers from the city of Francistown and the surrounding areas.")

2.1 If YES, describe the activities that the cluster is currently involved in.

Cluster activities were generally common for most participating schools, and these were given as follows:

- Setting examinations and organising work schemes.
- Organising music cluster competitions within the region and team teaching across the schools in the cluster.
- Conducting skills-sharing workshops.

3. Have you been engaged by Botswana Examinations Council (BEC)

(a) As an examiner?

(b) As a moderator?

(c) As a marker?

Four respondents indicated having been engaged as examiners by the BEC, three others had not, while one participant did not respond to the question. Only two have been moderators of music examinations, while the rest have not. Five have been engaged in the marking of examinations, while the other three have not been engaged in this exercise.

3.1 If you have answered YES to any of the above, how has this helped in improving your teaching of music?

Those who answered YES to the question(s) gave the following responses:

- It has broadened my mind on how to mark some musical concepts.
- Helped me in setting questions, to know what is needed when moderating.
- This helped us on expectancy of the response of the students.
- I learnt a lot of material through the assessments.
- Know how best to target with some questions and how to prepare a marking key.

3.2 If NO, how do you think that it could help in the teaching of music?

Those who answered NO to the questions gave the following responses:

- It will be vital when it comes to setting and marking tests, since I will know standards required by the BEC.

- It would widen teachers knowledge.
- I think I would be able to know what is needed in music examination and therefore help students accordingly.

4. Have you attended any workshop organised for music teachers?

Seven affirmed having attended workshops organised for music teachers, while only one had not.

4.1 If YES, what was covered in the workshop?

The content of the workshops was described as follows:

- Item writing in music, syllabus implementation, training on JCE marking and video shooting methods for continuous assessment.
- Syllabus review, setting high order questions.
- We have learnt how to play different instruments and how to teach certain topics that were difficult to us.
- Skills sharing or even topic discussions.
- How to assess continuous assessment and video shooting.

4.2 How has the workshop helped in enhancing your approach to the teaching of music?

The indicated gains from attending the workshops were as follows:

- From some of those workshops, I could handle topics that were difficult since we managed to share our experiences.
- It helped me to set questions that are of high standard and quality.
- We are now confident to teach certain topics and play the keyboard.
- It helped me on how to tackle tasks and how to choose materials for each of the tasks.
- Appropriate methods and approaches to the teaching of music.
- It is very helpful, strategies were revealed and learnt.

5. Has the Department of Curriculum Development and Evaluation involved you in any of the following activities:

(a) Review of the music syllabus?

(b) Review of the textbooks and audio material for teaching music?

Five respondents indicated having been involved in the syllabus review, three others indicated otherwise. As for the review of textbooks only two indicated having been involved, the rest had not been involved.

5.1 If YES, how has this helped in improving your teaching of music?

Those participants who had been in the review of the music syllabus and/or the textbooks and audio material responded as follows:

- Increased mastery of the subject content.
- It gave us an overview of what to set during the examinations.

5.2 If NO, how do you think that it could help in enhancing your teaching of music?

Four participants did not respond to this follow-up question, while the other four gave the following responses regarding the review of textbooks and audio material:

- It could give us the opportunity to suggest books to use for music teaching, as well as the topics to include in music.
- It will help in knowing the content that best fit learners' capabilities.
- It would help teachers come up with essential materials that are relevant to the syllabus.
- It could open up my mind and introduce me to books and materials appropriate for the requirements of the music syllabus.

6. What are you currently doing to ensure your own professional development in music education?

One respondent did not answer this question; the others provided the following responses:

- I do more practice, especially on playing of instruments.
- Taking extra lessons on playing of instruments during the holidays.
- I get tutorial lessons on some aspects of difficulty from other teachers, and I'm busy trying to get a bursary to go for further education.
- I benchmark with other music teachers in Gaborone to share knowledge and skills.

- Collaborating with some musicians and studio operators to acquire some knowledge, especially with studio operation.
- I read more music books and practise playing different instruments. I also engage other stakeholders like the Prisons Band to help students and myself.

7. Give your own opinion of how the following personnel can contribute to an improvement in the state of music education: (a) subject officers within the Ministry of Education, (b) the school Head, (c) the senior teacher, and (d) the Deputy Head.

7.1 Subject officers within the Ministry of Education

A range of interconnected responses were given:

- They should have been in the classroom before so that they can be able to contribute effectively to issues affecting music education.
- Avail funds for schools and oversee if music teachers are given enough support in their schools.
- Needs to be a music-oriented person, and therefore will understand the needs of the department.
- Provide all necessary materials for teaching music.
- Need skilled officers in music.
- Before the subject is started in a school, there should have been more research especially on infrastructure so as to curb the situation of lack of storerooms, hence creating a better learning space for music in schools.

7.2 The school Head

Two participants did not respond, the other six responded as follows:

- By finding a place for us (classroom).
- Making resources available for the subject.
- Should liaise with the officer who will be a musician, for him to better understand the needs of the subject.
- Work hand in hand with other music stakeholders to ensure that everything is on the right track.
- Need to be knowledgeable on content so that they can easily help or understand when teachers ask for something.

- The Head should motivate music teachers and learn more about music, hence provide guidance.

7.3 The senior teacher in charge of music education

Two participants did not respond, the other six responded as follows:

- By visiting classes regularly to check if we need assistance.
- Be supportive during organising events and trips.
- Needs to be a music oriented person, and therefore will understand the needs of the department.
- Oversee the department to make sure all is running according to plan.
- Have an idea of what is expected in music.
- Senior teachers should act as quick as possible to the issues reported to them hence a better music learning environment being created.

7.4 The Deputy Head (as head of academics)

Six participants responded to the question, as follows:

- Helping with the logistics for holiday teaching, particularly if there is need to help the learners with their music practical.
- Oversee on the smooth running of the subject.
- Will liaise with the music teacher and subject officer to know what the subject needs/wants.
- Make sure that all music exam material is available.
- He needs skills so that they will support music teachers when they need help.
- Make sure that music has the necessary equipment and housing so that pupils may learn easily.

PART IV: TEACHER'S OPINION OF THE MUSIC SYLLABUS

1. Does the music syllabus offer the following opportunities:

- (a) To engage learners in movement and dance?**
- (b) To sing and/or play the available musical instruments?**
- (c) For pupils to showcase their musical talent?**
- (d) Musical activities promoting creativity and imaginative thinking?**

One teacher indicated that the syllabus offered the opportunity to the learners to engage in movement and dance; the other five disagreed, while two did not respond to the question. As for singing and instrumental playing, seven respondents indicated that music affords learners this opportunity, and one did not respond.

Five indicated that the syllabus offers opportunity for showcasing musical talent, two others thought otherwise, and one did not respond. Lastly, six respondents thought the syllabus offers activities promoting creative and imaginative thinking, whereas one did not think so, and the other one did not respond to this question.

1.1 Which of the opportunities do you feel requires *most* coverage in the music syllabus?

Respondents were asked to indicate by circling the letter of the opportunity they thought deserved *most* coverage in the music syllabus. The six responses received included the following:

- To engage learners in movement and dance – not selected by any of the respondents.
- To sing and/or play the available musical instruments – selected by one respondent.
- For pupils to showcase their musical talent – selected by two respondents.
- Musical activities promoting creativity and imaginative thinking – selected by three respondents.

1.2 Explain your choice

The six teachers who responded to question 1.1 responded as follows to this follow-up question:

- I think students need to be very creative so that they continue after finishing the course.
- Most students take music to explore their talent.
- At the completion of junior secondary education, learners should be aware of the talents they possess.
- For learners to be able to explore and develop their abilities.
- Learners need to know what they are good at so that they can compose or play for bands around if they don't go for further education.

- Students should be able to create because we are living in a technological era. Therefore if they are creative they will be able to cope with the changing times.

2 Teaching of any curriculum subject should aim at addressing the following aspects of human development: cognitive, psycho-motor, affective, and social development.

2.1 Which of the above four aspects of development do you think music education should target most?

Six respondents answered. One listed both affective and social development. Two mentioned psycho-motor development and two mention social development. One respondent mentioned cognitive, psycho-motor and social development.

2.2 Which of these aspects have been covered

(i) *most* by the current syllabus?

Three did not respond to this follow-up question, the remaining five all chose cognitive development as the one most covered by the current syllabus.

(ii) *least* by the current syllabus?

Four did not respond to this follow-up question. Three respondents chose social development and one chose affective development as the one least covered by the current syllabus.

2.3 Suggest changes that could be made to the music syllabus to address developmental aspects

Four participants responded as follows:

- More practical work needs be included.
- Should cover a wide range of developmental aspects.
- Should cater for performance/practical activities.
- The syllabus can be made in a way that it caters for creativity in pupils at this younger stage.

3. To what extent does the current syllabus cover the following musical genres?

(a) Western music

Seven responded, reporting detailed coverage of Western music by the syllabus. Some went on further to mention the stylistic period covered by the syllabus: Renaissance, Baroque and Classical. The coverage includes monumental works, vocal and instrumental music as well as the characteristics thereof. One respondent described it as “Too much and confusing”.

(b) African music

Seven responded, stating that it is limited to the indigenous music of Botswana artists and groups, indigenous instruments of Botswana, and describing the general characteristics of African music. Two of these felt that the coverage of African music was too little.

(c) Popular music

Six responded, mentioning that the syllabus covers popular music of Botswana, and went on further to state the styles falling under the musical genre, according to the syllabus descriptions. These are gospel, jazz, choral, kwasa-kwasa, traditional pop, house, rap rhythm and blues, and hip-hop. Two respondents gave the following comments: “Too little and brief” and “Not well covered, very shallow”.

(d) Jazz

Seven responded, explaining that it is only included under popular music, but not as a topic on its own. Others further explained that it is just mentioned under popular music of Botswana, and not given any detailed treatment in the syllabus. One of the respondents explained that jazz as a genre has been least covered by the syllabus, and another supported this by stating that it was “too little and too brief”.

3.1 Suggest the changes that could be done regarding the coverage of these musical genres in the syllabus

Six teachers responded, including the following suggestions:

- Increase the coverage of popular music because it is the one students understand most.

- Each musical genre should be covered as a topic/subtopic on its own, to give the learners adequate exposure to each one of them.
- African music needs a more in-depth coverage by the syllabus, whereas Western music needs less.
- All these genres should be covered on an equal manner.
- Increase the coverage of jazz, instead of just mentioning it.

4. Please provide any further comments on the current syllabus, with a view to possible improvements

Four of the teachers responded to this item, while the rest did not. Their responses were as follows;

- There ought to be increased aural exposure to African and popular music, so that students understand music better.
- The current syllabus is not addressing all aspects of music.
- Some topics need to be looked into as they are not necessary for students at the junior secondary level.
- More practical work needs to be incorporated in the syllabus.

4.4 Data presentation: Pupil's questionnaire

The second questionnaire was targeted at the pupils who experienced music lessons at their school. The pupils' questionnaire comprised two parts. Part I (7 items) was meant to establish the extent of exposure to a wide variety of musical activities. This part of the questionnaire also sought to determine how learners perceived the music education programme with regard to issues such as the amount of time allocated to music, the number of music learners, and the quality of textbooks available to them.

Part II (4 items) aimed at establishing the opinions pupils had of Music as a subject. Items prompted them to agree (or disagree) with the idea of offering Music as a core subject, and to indicate whether (or not) their music education afforded them opportunities for self-expression. Lastly, the questionnaire afforded the learners an opportunity to come up with suggestions regarding things that could be done to improve the quality of music in their schools. The questionnaire consisted of close-ended questions with some open-ended

questions used as follow-up. The following are the findings from the questionnaires completed by 142 learners.

PART I

1. Did you choose to do Music as one of your optional subjects?

A significant number of the 142 respondents, 85 % (n=121), indicated that they chose Music as one of their optional subjects while the other 15% (n=21) did not.

1.1 If NO, explain how it came to be that you are in the Music class.

Out of the 21 respondents who reported not to have chosen music, 17 cited having been forced to and not having another option available to them as the reasons for being in the music class. The remaining four stated that Music had been their second choice.

2. Do you feel that music is given enough time in the school time-table?

60% (n=84) of the respondents (n=139) felt that Music was given enough time, while the other 39% (n=55) thought otherwise. The remaining three respondents did not respond to the question.

3. Would you describe the number of learners in your Music class manageable to your teacher?

There were significant differences in views regarding manageability of the class to the teacher, with 80% (n=113) of the respondents describing the number as manageable (n=113), while the other 16% (n=23) of the respondents disagreed. Six respondents did not answer this question.

4. Are textbooks used in the music class?

70% (n=98) of the 139 who responded to this question reported that textbooks were used in their music classes, while 29% (n=41) reported otherwise. The remaining three did not respond.

4.1 If YES, do the textbooks used help you learn music concepts better?

83 of the respondents, who affirmed to question 4 above (n=98), felt that the textbooks helped them learn music better, while seven indicated otherwise. Eight did not respond to the question.

5. Are you actively involved in any music-making group within or outside the school?

Only 30% (n=43) of the respondents indicated active involvement in music-making activities, while rest, 70% (n=99) of the respondents, indicated non-involvement.

5.1 If YES, give details of your involvement

Areas of involvement cited by the respondents were through choirs, church, hip hop band, traditional dance, and the playing of drums. The frequencies with which these responses appeared were as follows: choir 26, music in the church 4, member of a hip-hop band once, member of a traditional dance group once, and the playing of drums also only once.

6. Does music education in the school offer the following opportunities

- (a) To practise in small groups?**
- (b) To play the available musical instruments?**
- (c) To share my musical talent with other students?**
- (d) Access to individual attention if the need arises?**

This 'Yes/No' item required the respondents to place a tick on a corresponding box. The results are given in the table below:

Opportunity	Yes	No
To practise in small groups	103	39
To play the available instruments	110	32
To share musical talent	107	35
Access to individual attention	107	35

6.1 Which of the opportunities (a, b, c or d) described above, do you feel needs *most* attention in your music education?

The number of times each opportunity was chosen as requiring *most* attention is given below.

- (a) To practise in small groups – 30.
- (b) To play the available musical instruments – 60.
- (c) To share my musical talent with other students – 25.
- (d) Access to individual attention if the need arises – 15.

Twelve respondents did not answer this question.

6.2 Explain your choice

Some of the reasons cited as explanations were as follows (these have been codified into succinct statements):

- (a) To practise in small groups
 - To help us develop skills for ensemble related activities (n=20).
- (b) To play the available musical instruments.
 - To gain instrumental skills (n=35).
 - To prepare for the instrumental part of the practical examination (n=5).
- (c) To share my musical talent with other students
 - To prepare for future careers in music (n=2).
 - To develop confidence (n=2).
- (d) Access to individual attention if the need arises
 - To get more help from the teachers (n=11).

Eight participants did not respond to this question.

7. How often are the following musical activities included in the lessons: singing, listening, music notation, instrumental playing, movement, improvisation?

This item sought to establish the frequency with which the musical activities listed above were incorporated in the music lessons. The results are given in the table below:

Activity	Always	Sometimes	Never
Singing	27	107	8
Listening	42	91	9
Music notation	66	67	9
Instrumental playing	16	109	17
Movement	16	58	68
Improvisation	22	59	61

7.1 In your opinion, which one of the activities should be included *more* often in the music lessons?

Instrumental playing had the highest frequency with 73, followed by listening and singing with 25 and 21 respectively. Music notation had 13, while movement and improvisation were the least with 4 and 2 respectively. Four participants did not respond to this item.

7.2 Give the reason for your answer

The reasons most frequently cited for including activities *more* often were as follows:

For singing

- it is interesting to sing
- to develop singing talent
- to build a foundation for a future career in singing

For instrumental playing

- to develop better playing skills
- to solve problems currently experienced with instrumental activities
- it is interesting to play musical instruments
- to prepare well for the practical examinations

For listening

- to develop listening skills
- to prepare for examinations
- to learn music better
- to develop appreciation of music

For music notation

- it is the most important part of music
- it is difficult and needs more time
- most students do not understand it
- to enable us to read music

For movement

- Involvement in dance and movement makes music more interesting.
- most students do not understand it.

7.3 In your opinion, which one of the activities should be included *less* often in the music lessons?

Movement and singing had the highest frequencies, 32 each, followed by music notation and listening with 26 and 17 respectively. Improvisation had 8, while instrumental playing and practising in the small groups were the least chosen, with 6 each. Twelve participants did not respond to this item.

7.4 Give the reason for your answer

Reasons most cited for *less* frequent inclusion of the activities were as follows:

Singing

- Everyone can sing therefore it is not important.
- It is not in the examinations.

Instrumental playing

- It takes a long time to learn instruments.

Listening

- It takes more time.
- It is difficult to concentrate.

Music notation

- It is not important.

Movement

- It is not covered in the Music examinations.
- It is not important.

PART II

This section consisted of statements, and respondents had to place a tick in the appropriate box regarding whether they agreed (or not) with the given statement:

Statement	Strongly agree	Agree	Disagree	Strongly disagree
1. Music education offers me opportunities to express myself	60	71	3	8
2. Music should be taught as a core subject	29	52	23	38
3. I would recommend to a friend entering the school to opt for Music as subject choice	54	66	10	12

Suggest things that could be done to improve the quality of learning music in the school.

A wide range of suggestions were raised. A significant number of suggestions had an improved music education programme as the central theme. A suggestion to buy more musical instruments appeared most frequently, 60 times. Related to this was the call for making instrumental playing the main focus of music education, which was mentioned 54 times. The need to have more music lessons and to provide more music books were raised 14 and 13 times respectively. Other suggestions raised less frequently included:

- Building a music laboratory.
- Increased effort on the part of teachers in helping the students.
- Having educational trips to studios and other relevant places.
- Making opportunities for performing music in the community.

4.5 Discussion of data emanating from the questionnaires

A number of interconnected themes emerged from an analysis of the data collected from both the teachers and the pupils questionnaires. These themes, five in number, are presented in form of headings, under which the interpretation of factual data as well as the participants' perspectives is presented. These themes concern:

- The music teachers in schools: the staffing situation
- Resource allocation for music education
- Music education activities
- Professional support of music teachers
- Syllabus design and implementation.

The themes, though presented as distinct headings, are so intertwined that the themes influence each other. The reason for presenting them as discrete entities is to ensure clarity and ease of reference, particularly in view of the recommended solutions to be made in the latter parts of this study.

4.5.1 Music teachers in schools: the staffing situation

There are two key issues regarding the supply of music teachers in schools. These are issues of quality and quantity.

Quality has to do with the calibre of music teachers and their competencies to teach music using appropriate didactic principles. Most of the teachers completed their teaching diploma at the Molepolole College of Education (MCE). At MCE music is currently taught as a minor subject due to the current shortage of suitably qualified lecturers. According to the colleges' management systems currently in place, a minor subject is given limited resources – in equipment, time and contact with the lecturers. Against this background, the problem area relating to the current teaching of Music is centred on: 1) the insufficient training teachers are exposed to at MCE; 2) the little experience the teachers have in music education; and 3) the situation they find themselves in, that of teaching music without a mentor with experience of music in general, or music education in particular. Any mentor should have taken music as a major subject, or have a music degree.

Informal discussions with music teachers in the schools backed this up by revealing that most experienced music teachers had been transferred to the selected senior secondary schools to pilot music education there. These teachers were mostly degree holders who had been in the junior secondary schools for a number of years, and who had previously participated in the pilot programme at this level. There is thus a void in the junior secondary schools.

The issue of quantity deals with the teacher-learner ratio as well as the teachers' workloads. In comparison with core subject teachers in the schools, music and other teacher of optional subjects have relatively smaller classes to teach. Teachers of core subjects such as Mathematics, Social Studies and Languages can have classes as large as 45 pupils. Information from the teacher's questionnaire data revealed that the number of pupils per music class could be as low as 10, while the highest number of pupils per class was 24. Also schools have at least two music teachers. An unexpected high number of four teachers were reported in one of the schools. It means therefore, that, despite of the not-so-impressive remarks concerning the quality of music teachers in schools; their numbers seems to be satisfactory to handle music education in the schools. Thus, problems are quality related, not quantity related.

4.5.2 Resource allocation for music education

Music in junior secondary schools is under-resourced. The following subjects offered in the junior secondary schools generally have special rooms to cater for their specific needs: Science, Home Economics, Design and Technology, Art, Business Studies and Computer Awareness. Music has not yet benefitted from the same kind of recognition. While one needs to appreciate that the school-level management may not have the capacity to provide separate facilities suitable for the demands of teaching Music, something could be done to help the situation. Some schools have helped alleviate the problem by turning an ordinary classroom into a base room for Music.

In the worst of situations, teachers indicated that they were normally forced to run around the school in search for available teaching space. In the process, a lot of time gets wasted. Another related problem is that of storage space for the safe-keeping of instruments and other valuables for music education. Most music departments reported having to share storerooms with other subjects. This situation forces them to carry instruments to and from the available teaching area. This does not only waste time, but also leads to damage caused by the possible mishandling due to the frequent movement.

4.5.3 Music education activities

This study has shown that there is a lack of sufficient variety in the activities undertaken in music lessons. Of particular concern is the orientation of music education towards the theoretical aspect at the expense of the listening and performance components of music. The questionnaires aimed to establish the frequencies of incorporation of different musical

activities in the lessons, namely: singing, listening, music notation, instrumental playing, movement and improvisation. It emerged from the responses that music notation is the most often included followed by singing. Instrumental playing, movement and improvisation then followed with equal frequencies. The listening activities are the least incorporated in music lessons.

The theoretical orientation of music education is also reflected in assessment procedures. Among the three areas of components of music education – listening, music theory and history, and performance – it has turned out that music theory and history is the most often assessed. The reasons cited for the low frequencies of assessment of other components were mainly that other areas were too difficult to assess. This not only defeats the purpose of making the education curriculum more vocational and less academic in order to cater in for the needs of the increasingly complex workplace, but could demoralise the learners as their interest in the music itself – both through aural perception and through music making – is not satisfied.

Data from the pupils' questionnaire revealed that a significant majority of pupils taking music purposely chose to do the subject. This indicates the importance music learners attach to Music as one of the subject offerings. Related to this is the strong agreement among the pupil respondents of these two ideas:

- Music education offers them opportunities to express themselves
- They would recommend Music to the new Form 1s in the process of choosing optional subjects as part of their curriculum subjects.

The suggestion that “Music should be taught as a core subject” also relatively strongly supported. This further reinforces the need for teachers to maintain the high level of interest the learners apparently have in Music. Should this interest be sustained, the chances of producing skilled musicians, from this level through to their adulthood, is high; this, in turn, may well provide a strong base for the music educators of the future. A surprising majority of learners, however, reported non-involvement in musical activities in the classroom, creating a challenge to make the music curriculum more intensive in the area of music-making.

4.5.4 Professional support of music teachers

The study sought to examine the quality of professional support the music teachers receive in order to enable them to effectively carry out their teaching duties. The school-level support, from non-music colleagues through to the supervisors has been described as

satisfactory. But some participants cited the non-allocation to them of a base room for the Music subject as an indicator of the lack of support from the school managements. Most participants viewed a lack of awareness of the 'inner' workings of music education as a limiting factor, with another one being the non-availability of education officers to direct the school managements on ways to deal with the current situation of Music in schools.

Most teachers have not been exposed to activities that would enhance their professional development, such as marking of music at the examination level and reviewing of the syllabus and the textbooks. The in-service workshops have also not been frequent enough, nor have they covered all the areas found to be most difficult. Workshops are also important in orientating new teachers.

It is encouraging that most teachers reported some involvement in functioning clusters. The system of clusters is important in avoiding any feelings of isolation the music teachers would otherwise have. These clusters also help, if used effectively in sharing problems teachers face, and in suggesting possible solutions. Another advantage of the cluster arrangement is that they tap into the expertise of the experienced music teachers from other levels of the system. Nevertheless, currently the activities undertaken are not broad enough as they seem to be limited to the drawing-up of common work schemes and the setting of end-of-term examinations.

4.5.5 Syllabus design and implementation

The concerns raised at the beginning, and which prompted this study centred were centred on: 1) the way the objectives were formulated; 2) the developmental aspects – cognitive, social and spiritual – and 3) genre coverage of the current music syllabus. The questionnaires asked for factual information from the teacher respondents, concerning the extent of coverage of these aspects by the syllabus. Most of the teachers did not respond to the items, leading to an assumption that they were undecided on the responses to give. For those who responded, there was no consensus about the syllabus content. One can deduce from this that they do not know their syllabus well, particularly as most music teachers have less than two years experience. As for questions asking about preferred changes to the syllabus, it can be further assumed that the changes suggested were not informed choices.

Despite the less-than-reliable data regarding syllabus design, there is some consensus on the genre coverage, namely that: 1) Western music receives in-depth coverage; 2) there is

little coverage of African music, except for some focus given to the music of Botswana; 3) Jazz as a genre has not been covered, instead it has been simply mentioned as one of the popular music styles of Botswana; and 4) Popular music also has not received enough coverage, although it is the genre most learners would be interested in.

In relation to syllabus design and implementation, the pupils have expressed preference for learning a variety of instruments, and for increased instrumental instruction and performance opportunities. The expectation that they would be playing 'more sophisticated' instruments may have been the motivation behind opting for the subject Music in the first place.

4.6 Music lessons in schools: an evaluation

In addition to the use of questionnaires to obtain data relevant to this study, lesson observations were undertaken in the eight participating junior secondary schools. The literature on research methodology categorises lesson observations under participant-observation. According to Yarbrough (2008:86) participant-observation as a research method is based on two main assumptions:

- that the most important behaviour of individuals in groups is a dynamic process of complex interactions and consists of more than facts, statistics, or even discrete events, and
- that human behaviour is influenced by the setting in which it occurs.

The purpose of the lesson observation exercise was to establish the validity of data relating to various aspects of the questionnaires. The observations were guided by the following:

- The syllabus – the degree to which it was followed.
- Musical activities – the extent to which they were varied. Particular attention was given to the incorporation (or non-incorporation) of singing, listening, music notation, instrumental playing, movement, and improvisation.
- Assessment – the extent to which sound assessment principles were used to assess Music. The focus was mainly on the handling of assessment during the course of the lesson.
- Outcomes – the extent to which the lesson objectives were clear, realistic and achievable within the given lesson time.

From the eight participating schools, a total of 11 lessons were observed: 2 lessons each in three of the schools, and a single lesson in each of the remaining five schools. Each lesson was evaluated by writing qualitative remarks and assigning scores to rate its effectiveness in terms of the criteria set out above. Based on these criteria, the score allocation was as follows: syllabus coverage, 20 points; variety of musical activities, 36 points; inclusion of assessment, 24 points; and formulation of objectives, 20 points. These add up to a total possible score of 100. The scores were allocated according to what I perceive to be – through personal experience and through comments made by Music teachers in general – the relative weighting of the challenges each aspect can have on the teachers presenting the lessons: both syllabus coverage and the formulation of objectives were each allocated 20 points as they were considered to be relatively the easiest for most teachers: the next most challenging aspect was the incorporation of assessment with 24 points; the use of variety of musical activities is important in ensuring that learners experience Music through a wide range musical activities rather than learning of the concepts theoretically hence the weighting of 36 points.

The scores obtained for the 11 lessons observed, in decreasing order are as follows: 72, 70, 69, 67, 66, 65, 60, 58, 55, 51 and 43. The table below covers the proceedings of a representative sample covering three of the lessons. The sample was determined by identifying the lessons ranked as the best lesson, an average lesson, and the least well presented among the lessons observed. The ranks of these lessons according to the list of scores given above are 1st, 6th, and 11th and their scores are 72, 65 and 43 respectively.

For the purpose of this table, the best, average and least well presented lessons have been assigned lesson numbers 1, 2 and 3 in the table below:

Lesson	Score	Remarks on the lessons
1	72	<p>Working in permanently established groups, learners took turns to practice on the recorders, keyboards and to practice some songs. Learners had the opportunity to help one another with the pieces, to play alone and with the rest of the group. Also, opportunities for listening and commenting on each other's presentations were created.</p> <p>The teacher played the role of a facilitator of the activities, identifying mistakes common to all the learners, helping to correct them, and highlighting the work well done. The positive aspects included the variety of musical activities undertaken – singing, playing, listening as well as musical notation. Also some form of informal assessment took place in the lesson.</p>
2	65	<p>The lesson was presented focusing on the pattern of tones and semitones in a major scale. The C major scale was used to introduce the ideas discussed. Activities included construction of the scale, both ascending and descending. Learners were also given the opportunity to sing scales using tonic sol-fa names.</p> <p>The lesson was presented with the use of appropriate teaching strategies and defined activities. However, the high achievers could easily get bored as there were not enough tasks to challenge them. These could have been in the form of getting them to work out and play the scales with one or more sharps and flats.</p> <p>There was no apparent assessment.</p>
3	43	<p>The lesson was presented with what seemed to be the initial exposure of the learners to staff notation. The learners struggled with identifying the lines and spaces. Only three of the 15 learners in the class took turns to carry out tasks on the board. The teacher also seemed to lack the necessary skills to arouse the learners' interest as they were too quiet and showed a lack of motivation to learn. The "chalk and talk" approach to teaching was used, as no activities and teaching aids were used.</p> <p>There was no apparent assessment</p>

4.7 General remarks about the lessons

- **Lesson planning and presentation**

It was beyond the scope of the study to ask for lesson plans and the work schemes. However, the lesson observation exercise sought to establish whether or not lessons had a planned direction such that one could determine the specific objectives the teacher wanted to achieve. This was evident in some lessons, but not so in the others as the lessons lacked clear direction. In some lessons, for instance, the whole lesson time of about 80 minutes was spent on practising some pieces on the keyboards, with no specific lesson outcomes for the practise exercise. It was ascertained that all the lessons presented addressed more than one syllabus topic.

- **Lesson activities and teaching techniques**

The lessons observation revealed evidence of the little effort the music teachers make to incorporate learner's musical experiences in their teaching. Except for situations where the learners were left to practise the keyboards, most of the activities were teacher-centred. The few learner-centred activities simply comprised doing the exercises on notation. The dominant teacher-centred methods in use do not help in making music learning a meaningful experience for the learners.

- **Overall impression**

Despite the not-so-positive remarks about the approaches used in the teaching of music, the teachers possessed some of the skills required to be a good teacher. These have been identified as logical presentation, ability to arouse learners' interest, good voice projection as well as positive interaction with the learners. These showed the strength of training they received contributing to make them confident teachers. The main problem has to do with teaching musically in an art-oriented context, such that learners would feel a real difference between, say, a Mathematics and a Music lesson. Most lessons emphasised music theory over listening and performance exercises, the exception being the highest-rated (72 score) lesson.

4.8 The three-year junior secondary music syllabus: an analysis

This study was conceived with the aim of documenting the problems regarding the teaching of Music in Botswana junior secondary schools, with a view of recommending appropriate solutions. Central to the problem recognised at the planning stage is the approach to curriculum planning. The problems concern the inadequate coverage of some topic areas and the learning domains – affective, cognitive and psychomotor – which are not fairly represented in the learning objectives. The overall design of the syllabus leads to an over-emphasis on activities which do not necessarily support the potential of music education to develop creativity, imaginative thinking, and self-actualisation among the learners. For these reasons, the three-year junior secondary Music syllabus serves as the relevant document to analyse, in addition the data collection devices used for the current study, with a view to coming up with solutions to address the problems.

The Music syllabus document features two main parts, as described below:

- The first part covers the preliminary information dealing with the general approaches to the music education programme as well as issues, challenges and opportunities expected during its implementation.
- The second part provides specific subject content that should be covered in Forms 1, 2 and 3, making up the three year junior secondary education programme.

Analyses regarding these two parts are covered under sections 4.6.1 and 4.6.2 respectively.

4.8.1 Preliminary information from the syllabus

The preliminary information in the three-year music syllabus document has been provided under nine headings. Four of these relate to: rationale of the syllabus; key competencies; recommended teaching methods; and assessment. These four have been chosen for analysis on the basis that they are the most relevant to the current study, and that to focus on them can best help to clarify the problems highlighted in section 4.6 above. The following points are all extracted from *Three-year Junior Secondary School Syllabus: Music*. (2010: ii-iv):

4.8.1.1 Rationale for music

The syllabus document provides justification for Music being in the curriculum, and further puts an emphasis on the following:

- the principle of adjusting the content and methods to the knowledge and interest of the learners
- teaching music in real life context, rather than just making learners memorize the concepts
- the use of CDs, DVDs, videotapes, and attendance of musical activities and organizing musical concerts.

4.8.1.2 Key competencies

The document emphasises that learners should be able to:

- use their basic knowledge of musical concepts and skills through creative activities
- appreciate different styles of music and musical forms of expression
- explore and discriminate between musical styles, genres, and traditions
- express their own ideas and feelings in developing a style exploiting instrumental and /or vocal possibilities
- produce compositions that demonstrate a coherent development of musical ideas, consistency of style and degree of individuality.

4.8.1.3 Recommended teaching methods

The following real life orientation of music education is emphasised:

- the principle of adjusting the content and methods to the knowledge and interest of students
- teaching music in real life context, rather than just making learners memorize the concepts
- using CDs, DVDs, videotapes, and attendance of musical activities and organizing musical concerts
- ensuring maximum learning, making use of several short sessions of practice rather than one long session.

4.8.1.4 Assessment

With regard to assessment the document mentions the following:

- Assessment is an integral part of the teaching and learning process
- Formative assessment should be done as a diagnostic process and should be done regularly
- Summative assessment is used to measure the learners' assessment at the end of the programme, and it is coordinated by the Botswana Examinations Council (BEC).

4.8.2 Content analysis of the syllabus

The section of the syllabus dealing with actual subject matter has been organised into units which are subdivided into topics, with subtopics as further subdivisions. Each of the subtopics has a general objective, from which the specific objectives have been derived. An illustration of the arrangement from *Unit 1: Introduction to music* is given below.

Unit: Introduction to music

Topic: Meaning of music

Sub-topic: Role of music

General objective: explore the meaning of music in society

Specific objective: discuss the meaning of music

The Music syllabus designed for Forms 1, 2 and 3 of the Botswana junior secondary school programme is organised in spiral form. This means that a topic covered in Form 1 may reappear in Forms 2 and 3, though with increased level of difficulty.

The next part of this section will focus on the musical genres covered by the syllabus, the learning objectives and the musical activities.

4.8.2.1 Coverage of the musical genres

The following table provides an outline specifically dealing the musical genres covered by the syllabus across all three Forms.

Form	Topic	Sub-topic
1	African Music	Characteristics of African Music
	Botswana Music	Indigenous Music of Botswana
2	African Music	Indigenous Music of Botswana: Artists and Groups Indigenous Music of Botswana: Instruments Choral Music of Botswana
	Western Traditions	Renaissance Baroque Classical
3	Music of Botswana	Popular Music of Botswana

Though there appear to be many topics relating to indigenous and popular music, there are many weaknesses regarding the actual content to be covered under the topics. The following are examples that are subject to multiple interpretations, and do not take into account the fact that books dealing with African music are generally scarce, even non-existent:

Objective 4.1.1.4 identify prominent African musical groups

Objective 4.1.1.5 discuss influential musical styles and artists in Southern Africa

Objective 3.1.1.1 name pioneers of Botswana music

Objectives 3.1.1.3 discuss famous compositions of indigenous artists and groups.

The syllabus, however, deals with Western music in a manner which shows consistency, i.e. each of the sub-topics (Renaissance, Baroque and Classical) covers the musical characteristics, the main composers, the monumental works, the instrumentation (including the use of the orchestra) and the main musical forms.

The topics cited in the table fall under the unit entitled "Music Traditions". Other main units in the syllabus are: Notation, Appreciation and Performance. These units, as explained below are more inclined towards promoting the understanding of Western music and contribute considerably less to the Popular music and African music areas.

- **Notation**

As explained in section 2.3.3.2, Western music is considered a written music tradition. Notation covers a substantial part of the syllabus, covering topics such as: the staff, intervals, note values, time signatures, key signatures, scales and harmony.

- **Appreciation**

Topics covered include the types of voices and their combinations; instruments and dynamics. A number of objectives indicating strong association of these topic areas with Western music are:

Objective 2.1.1.1 describe subdivisions of female voice ranges as mezzo, lyrical, coloratura, contralto, dramatic.

Objective 3.1.1.5 describe the SSA, SAT, SATB choir combinations.

Objective 3.1.3.2 state the meaning of *p*, *pp*, *mp*, *mf*, *f*, *ff*, *cresc* and *decres*, providing Italian names and English equivalents.

Objective 3.1.2.1 describe types of instrument families – woodwinds, brass, strings and percussion.

- **Performance**

This unit deals with the singing and playing techniques using the voice, recorder and the keyboards. The emphasis here is to put into practice the concepts learnt under Notation such as the scales and harmony. In addition to these, simple melodies are played. The focus is on learning music through reading and not by rote, as it is mostly done in non-western cultures. Therefore the approach to performance promotes a Western way of learning music.

Thus, on deeper analysis of specified objectives it emerges clearly that African music and Popular music have many somewhat vague objectives, and generally lack a defined scope. The following are examples from the sub-topic on Popular music which do not have a clear relevance to the sub-topic:

Objective 2.1.1.9 discuss artists, drug abuse, fashion and HIV/AIDS.

Objective 2.1.1.11 discuss sound/noise pollution.

Objective 2.1.1.12 discuss the role of women in the music industry.

4.8.2.2 Learning objectives

This part of the section seeks to highlight and shed light on the general syllabus objectives in terms of the action verbs and the learning domains used.

- **Action verbs used in the music syllabus**

All authorities agree on the use of action verbs as key to the formulation of learning objectives. The objectives of the music syllabus meet this criterion, however, only a few use verbs applicable to music, such as compose, notate, harmonise, conduct, improvise and perform.

- **The domains emphasised**

The syllabus is more oriented to the cognitive learning domain, and less to the psycho-motor and the affective domains of learning. The cognitive learning domain puts emphasis on intellectual activities ranging from recall to more complex activities such as analysis. Psycho-motor emphasises manipulation skills, whereas affective has to do with the feelings.

4.8.2.3 Musical activities

The issue of musical activities has been a concern in all data gathering used in this study. With the questionnaires, the perspectives of both teachers and learners were solicited regarding the activities in their music programme. The previous section (Chapter 4.6), on lesson observation offered the respondents the opportunity to give their own impressions of what musical activities were presented and to evaluate their effectiveness.

This part of the study seeks to ascertain how well represented the listening and performance areas are in the syllabus. This analysis is in view of the recognition that the syllabus objectives determine the kind of activities the teachers and learners engage in during the music lessons.

The following are examples of objectives oriented towards performance:

Objective 2.1.4.8 sing intervals using solfege;

Objective 2.2.1.6 perform various rhythmic patterns in tonic sol-fa and staff notation;

Objective 4.2.1.6 perform various styles of indigenous music.

The following are examples of objectives oriented towards listening:

Objective 2.1.2.1 aurally identify dynamic markings;

Objective 2.2.3.1 aurally identify tempo markings;

Objective 2.2.4.4 aurally and by sight, identify different types of form such as binary, strophic, rondo and ternary.

To illustrate the extent of coverage by the syllabus of the objectives targeting the performance and listening aspects, an analysis of the Form 2 section of the syllabus has revealed the following (*Three-year Junior Secondary School Syllabus: Music. 2010: 7-12*):

:

- The total number of the objectives in this section of the syllabus is 131.
- Performance objectives are 22 in number, and this accounts for only 17% of the total.
- Listening objectives number only 4, accounting for a meagre 3% of objectives in this section of the syllabus.

This indicates that the objectives targeting performance and listening areas (only 20% in total) are grossly underrepresented in the current Music syllabus. This underrepresentation of the objectives with listening and performance orientation impacts on music learning and education in general in three main ways:

- 1) It undermines many of the benefits of having Music in the school curriculum.
- 2) It contributes little to Botswana's educational goals of making the curriculum more vocational in response to the dictates of the economy.
- 3) It also contributes little to creating a prosperous, productive and innovative nation, one of the ideals of the *National Vision*.

4.8.3 Syllabi of other countries

Part of this study involved consulting the equivalent syllabi of other countries for ideas which could be adopted to enrich Botswana's music syllabus. This section aims to present features of three syllabi consulted from South Africa, Namibia and Australia. This presentation is preceded by justification for selecting these three.

- 1) For choosing South Africa and Namibia, the reasons relate to the geographic position of Botswana and these countries i.e. they are all in Africa south of Sahara, and in the same economic bloc within the continent, i.e. the SADC region. Even more importantly, the

countries share borders with one another, and therefore some of their peoples share language, culture and ways of artistic expression.

2) For South Africa in particular, another reason relates to socio-cultural aspects of the country. The history and the multicultural nature of South African society is also an important factor, together with developmental policies with an orientation towards redressing the imbalances of the past.

3) Another reason applicable to South Africa concerns the economic position of South Africa. South Africa, being in an elevated economic position within the continent, has the benefit of the input of university-level local experts in curriculum design and implementation, as well as the ability to import expertise in the arts and music from abroad if the need arises.

4) Australia was chosen in the interest of globalisation and the need to adhere to an international standard in designing the curriculum. Another reason is that Australia is in the southern hemisphere and the country has an indigenous population with its own musical culture.

4.8.3.1 South African Arts and Culture syllabus

A distinct feature of the South African Arts and Culture syllabus – which is current equivalent of Botswana's CAPA – is that it is presented together in one document, covering content for all the grades from Grade R up to Grade 9. The advantages of this arrangement, together with other key features are outlined below:

- The Arts and Culture syllabus is for grades R to 9 and appears in one document, making it easy to track what the learners should have done in the lower Grades, as well as what they would be expected to do as they proceed higher along the education ladder.
- A detailed introduction to the learning area is included, explaining issues that would otherwise be difficult to understand if one did not have an arts and culture background, as is usually encountered with administrative officials.
- The syllabus does not only recognise assessment as an integral part of the learning and teaching processes, but goes further and provides specifics of key indicators of

expected achievements and of lesson outcomes. This is presented in such a manner that progress is measurable, and teaching and learning can be result-oriented.

- A detailed glossary giving definitions of terms used in the Arts and Cultures learning area has been given under the following headings: general, dance, drama, music and visual arts. This helps in creating a common understanding of the terms in the educational context. This is particularly important in music where one concept can have several meanings.
- Integration of the learning area with other learning areas: Particular recognition has been given to the fact that most African art forms and cultural practices are integrated into the society and its customs.

4.8.3.2 Namibian Arts-in-Culture syllabus

Important features identified from the Namibian Arts-in-Culture syllabus are as follows:

- It is offered as a compulsory, non-examinable subject.
- It is an interdisciplinary subject combining culture with visual and performing arts and crafts.
- It supports the two optional subjects: Visual Art and Integrated Performing Arts. The syllabus is designed more as a guideline, allowing for content flexibility depending on cultural heritage, learners' level of development in the arts and the available resources.
- It puts the emphasis on sustaining learners' interest, allowing them to express themselves through the arts.
- It includes a detailed glossary giving definitions of terms used in the Arts-in-Culture syllabus, helping to create a common understanding of the meanings.

4.8.3.3 Australia's Music syllabus

Important features identified from the syllabus are as follows:

- The syllabus has a wide scope, with set parameters within which teachers and learners may choose a considerable amount of material which best suits their particular needs.
- The syllabus is divided into three main components which represent the three components of musical activities: composing, performance and listening.
- It demands from the learners a broad range of performance activities, covering performing individually, in an ensemble, in a choir, in an orchestra or in a military band.
- It uses set pieces in preparation for examination of the listening skills.
- It provides for the application of conventional music notation to the music of different cultures.
- It ensures the maintenance of specific standards through an outline of requirements for improvisation, the formulation of conditions for the participation in choirs, orchestras and military bands, and for traditional instruments as well as western instruments.

A study of these three syllabi has provided ideas which can serve as a basis for a review of Botswana's junior secondary school Music syllabus. The following have been identified as common features among the syllabi, though with varying emphasis:

- The integration of music with other arts, and other subject areas within the school curriculum.
- The incorporation of local cultural contexts, by relating the music learners are exposed to in class to the musical heritage of their communities.
- The detailed assessment procedures to help guide arts areas which are generally perceived to be difficult to assess.
- A wide range of musical activities are expected from the learners.
- The standard terms used in the programmes, which helps to eliminate problems associated with multiple meanings of musical concepts.

4.9 Summary of the chapter

This chapter focused on the research data for this study; both the research design approaches employed for collecting the data, and the analysis of the data collected. Qualitative research methods were used, utilising questionnaires, lesson observations and document analysis to obtain the data relevant to this study. The data collected through questionnaires, targeted two groups of participants, the teachers and the learners, and resulted in a number of interconnected themes regarding the music education programme in junior secondary schools. The themes identified range from problems associated with syllabus design to the competency levels of the teachers expected to implement the syllabus.

Findings of the lesson observations undertaken were presented, revealing varying degrees of the following:

- unclear lesson objectives,
- lack of variety in the musical activities,
- little evidence of assessment during the course of teaching, and
- the teacher-centred approaches dominating the lessons.

An evaluation of the current junior secondary school Music syllabus was undertaken to highlight problems relating to musical genre coverage, the objectives addressed and the learning activities. The equivalent syllabi of other countries – two from the SADC region and one from abroad – were consulted. Ideas that could be incorporated were highlighted. The ideas solicited relate to:

- an integrated approach to the music education programme
- taking into account the local cultural context by relating the music learnt in class to the music experienced in the communities
- having in place comprehensive assessment procedures
- promoting self-expression through the arts
- creating a common understanding of musical concepts.

CHAPTER 5

SUMMARY AND CONCLUSIONS

5.1 Introduction

This study aimed at identifying and documenting problems regarding the teaching of Music in Botswana's junior secondary schools. Qualitative research methods were employed, as they were found to be best suited to achieving the study aims, and in eliciting answers to the research questions. This chapter features a summary of the entire study, providing a recapitulation of the most important facts from different components of this study. The conclusion follows, presenting answers drawn from the study under each of the sub-questions that were derived from the main research question.

5.2 Summary

This section is presented in four parts. The first provides a recapitulation of the problems that led to this study. The second part outlines the major issues that arose from the literature review. Third part provides a summary of the major ideas that emerged from the study of the current state of music education in junior secondary schools Botswana, and the fourth outlines the measures relating to reliability and validity of this study.

5.2.1 The research problem

One of the initial stages of a research process is clearly defining a study problem. The following concerns, highlighted through the problem statement, led to the initiation of this study into Botswana's junior secondary Music programme:

- the imbalances in the treatment of learning objectives and in the coverage of musical genres;
- an inclination of the syllabus towards music literacy, with little attention being given to other musical activities such as listening, movement, singing and instrumental playing; and

- lesson presentations that tend to undermine the potential of music to foster creativity, imaginative thinking and self-actualisation among the learners.

5.2.2 Theoretical framework

As a result of the concerns outlined in 5.2.1 above the following topic presented itself:

Music education in junior secondary schools in Botswana: the way forward.

The theoretical framework of the research topic then was established through a literature review. Sources of the literature review included books, internet sources, government documents and research reports such as journals, dissertations and theses. The literature consulted provided important information covering:

- The nature of music and music education
- The role music plays in children's development
- Appropriate strategies for teaching music
- Active involvement of the learners in the music class
- Designing and implementing a music curriculum.

5.2.3 Current state of music education

This research study assessed the current status of music education, through a chapter devoted to this. The chapter outlined the developments in the area of arts and culture, as well as the government initiatives targeted at creating an environment conducive to growth. The key indicators of progress in the area of music education were highlighted. These include availing opportunities for further training to teachers, starting up a music pilot programme in the senior secondary schools and building facilities to benefit music at the tertiary level of education.

The problems within the structures of the Ministry of Education and Skills Development (MoESD) were investigated. This revealed weak links between its various departments, as well as the lack of effective collaboration between the MoESD and the professional and social organisations with an interest in music education. Where there is some collaboration, it is on *ad hoc* basis without strong coordination. This study has identified this as a major impediment to the provision of a music education programme. In view of this important

factor, the solutions recommended at the end of this report are centred on the need for improved collaboration to benefit the music education programme.

5.2.4 Data collection and analysis

There are always limitations in soliciting answers necessary for an evaluation such as this. However, an attempt was made to ensure a wide coverage of a range of possible situations with regard to the junior secondary Music programme. The purpose was to ensure that the recommended solutions are justified through a clear understanding of the nature of the problems regarding music education in Botswana. Against this background, the validity of research data and therefore the reliability of the solutions proposed were ensured.

The three-year junior secondary music syllabus was used as the principal document of analysis, and equivalent syllabi from within the SADC region and from abroad were consulted for ideas that could be adopted to enrich Botswana's syllabus.. The participating schools were drawn from different regions across the country, representing all areas – urban, semi-urban and rural. Learners and teachers as participants who directly experience the music education programme were utilized, with a series of lesson observations undertaken providing exposure to real teaching and learning situations. The number of visits to schools gave opportunities for informal discussions which provided an increased understanding of the issues and challenges affecting the music education programme. Then there was a high return rate of both teachers' and pupils' questionnaires; all eight teachers targeted responded, while 89% of the 160 targeted learners responded.

The foregoing discussion constitutes an overview of the major component of this study. The next and last section of this chapter will provide answers to the research question posed at the beginning. Thereafter the final chapter follows, devoted to the solutions recommended towards an improved junior secondary music education programme. This research report closes with recommendations for further research.

5.3 Research conclusions

In an attempt to get an in-depth understanding of the challenges of the junior secondary music education programme, with a view to providing solutions that can serve as appropriate intervention measures, the following main research question presented itself, and guided this study:

What are the problems regarding the teaching of Music in the junior secondary schools in Botswana, and what solutions can be recommended?

An analysis of this question led to the emergence of five sub-questions. These sub-questions sought to address the following areas: the music teaching methods; the level of involvement of the learners; the music assessment procedures; the resources for teaching music; and the professional support for the programme. In order to solicit answers to these questions, questionnaires were administered and music lessons were observed. Furthermore an analysis of the three-year junior secondary school music syllabus was also undertaken. It can be concluded that these strategies have been effective in providing answers to the problems regarding the teaching of music in Botswana. The following are the answers to the sub-questions, which form the basis for the recommended solutions in the next chapter.

5.3.1 To what extent are the teaching methodologies used effective (or ineffective) in imparting musical skills and knowledge?

Research abounds with findings advocating the making of learning in the classroom a more interactive experience. Kyriacou (1997:5) notes that until the 1960s research on effective teaching was linked to attributes of teachers, such as personality traits, sex, age, knowledge and training, which might have a bearing on their effectiveness. Since 1960, Kyriacou further explains, “research on effective teaching has focused fairly and squarely on activities in the classroom, and in particular the interaction between the teacher and the pupils.”

Moyles *et al* (2003:xiv) carried out a study to examine the practical and theoretical aspects that are key to understanding and to undertaking interactive teaching in primary classrooms. The authors report that the teachers involved in the five-year study were initially apprehensive about using interactive teaching and about coming face to face with permanent pictorial records of their own practice. They further report that over time the teachers overcame these fears and grew in confidence, resulting in their increased awareness when analysing classroom events.

Smialek & Boburka (2000:57) carried out a study on the effectiveness of cooperative listening exercises in developing critical music listening skills in non-music majors. A control group attended classes taught exclusively through lecture format. Two experimental groups participated in four 50-minute group-listening exercises. Subjects in one of the experimental

groups engaged in five additional group analysis exercises, comparing known and unfamiliar musical styles. The experimental groups were reported to have scored significantly better than other group on final examinations. This indicates that achievement was linked to how well the students interacted with the material they were later examined on.

These findings further advocate classroom situations where the teacher acts more as a facilitator of learning. The teacher-training programmes offered by the University of Botswana and the colleges of education also emphasise the learner-centred approaches in its teaching methods modules. A teacher's performance in the Botswana's education system is evaluated mainly in terms of their ability to prepare for and teach learner-centred classes.

A series of lesson observations were carried out during the course of this study. Among the lessons observed, in only some did the music teachers make clear efforts to get the learners actively involved in the learning processes. This was through incorporating practical music-making and listening in the learning of music theory topics such as notation. In most schools, however, the lessons were purely centred around music theory and were dominated by the teacher, without a range of activities to support the pupils' learning. This approach not only contributes little to the development of their musicianship skills, but deprives the learners of the creative experience.

It can be concluded therefore, that generally the methods in use in most of the schools are ineffective in promoting musical development. The findings reinforce the need to include more learner-centred approaches, which are also compatible with the learning of music. The current methods do not only promote rote learning, but also undermine the potential of music education to foster among the learners the stated requirements of creativity, imaginative thinking and self-actualisation.

5.3.2 To what extent does the teaching of music take into account a learner's acquired skills, knowledge, attitudes and experiences?

For teachers to plan for learner-centred music classes, they first need to recognise that learners bring along with them a range of skills, knowledge, attitudes and experiences. They need to tap these skills and make them the basis of their teaching. In this study, some pupils mentioned that their only active involvement in music was through the church and being a member of a musical group out of school. Most of these further reported non-availability of opportunities to share the talents they had with other learners.

Besides this, learners get exposure to music through the different media, cultural events and the cultural activities they engage in. Topics such as those dealing with dance styles could be better dealt with through the active participation of learners. This study has uncovered very little evidence of the incorporation in the classroom of the musical skills that learners already possess.

5.3.3 What is the amount and quality of professional support given to music teachers?

Participation in workshops and involvement in professional assignments such as the marking and moderation of examinations, and reviews of the teaching and learning materials are important in the on-going development of the teachers. This study established through the questionnaire survey the extent to which the teachers became involved in these, as well as the quality of the support they got at school level.

The quality of support varies from school to school. In some schools the support was hailed as excellent while in others it was described as unsatisfactory. The current situation whereby music is taught by teachers with little music education experience reinforces the need for strong support at school level. A lack of understanding by the school authorities and education officers of what music education entails constitutes a distinct limiting factor to the quality of support. Most of these authorities do not have a music education background, and have not themselves ever worked in programmes with music education in the curriculum.

On the basis of the above, it can be concluded that the amount and quality of professional support that the teachers have access to is inadequate. The pre-service training they get does not equip them with skills to deal with a wide range of issues and challenges related to the teaching of Music. This points to the need to have in place a strong support system if music education is to be a meaningful experience for the learners at junior secondary level.

5.3.4 To what extent are the assessment strategies used effective in determining the learners' musical knowledge and skills?

The literature sources consulted in this study have described assessment of music as being a difficult task. The difficulty is particularly evident if it is viewed against subjects such as Mathematics where the answer to a problem is either right or wrong. Responses given by the teacher-participants supported this view. The teachers cited the lack of confidence they felt with assessing learners, in particular with regard to the listening and performance areas

of music. This has resulted in their tendency to focus more on music theory assessment, neglecting these equally important aspects.

The Ministry of Education and Skills Development has entrusted the assessment of its education programmes to the Botswana Examinations Council (BEC). The BEC-coordinated assessments take place at the end of a schooling programme. While this arrangement is important in ensuring professionalism and quality assurance associated with examinations, it does not serve music education well. The music syllabus document is also brief on the aspect of assessment. This is in contrast with the equivalent syllabi of other countries consulted, which provide detailed information on the form assessment should take.

The conclusion that has been drawn from this study is that the current assessment strategies used are not effective in measuring the learners' musical knowledge and skills. These strategies are in many ways incompatible with music education. Ultimately, pass levels are determined through a system which is inappropriate for measuring musical knowledge. The current approach to assessment leaves important questions unanswered such as: How can musical achievement be measured through a few hours of mainly written examinations? What roles do the learners play in their own assessment? Are the standards understood by those involved, the teachers and the learners included? What is in place to ensure objectivity, particularly in light of the subjective nature of most components of art-related subjects?

5.3.5 To what extent are the available resources adequate (or inadequate) to meet the needs of teaching and learning music?

The fact that Music is some schools is taught in rooms with no electricity, in school halls and/or in outdoor teaching area makes it the most under-resourced subject in the majority of junior secondary schools. This is particularly evident if viewed against other subjects offering special skills and with a curriculum oriented towards practical skills. These kinds of subjects include the following: Science, Home Economics, Design and Technology, Art, Business Studies and Computer Awareness, which have rooms to help cater for their special needs.

In some of the schools the managements have helped provide a solution to the situation by identifying one of the classrooms as a base room for Music. Some positive experiences were identified from such schools, for example in one school there are displays of charts of musical composers and instruments which help the learners get a feel of the music environment. In another, the instruments such as drum kits and keyboards were

permanently set up, making them ready for use at all times. Overall, the general management of subject activities such as practising, remediation and enrichment is improving.

On the basis of the above, the fact that most schools do not have appropriate teaching and storage space puts music education in an unfavourable situation. Among the many issues raised in this study, this issue regarding the suitability of teaching and learning space stands out as one of the most important areas in addressing the problem of the junior secondary music programme in Botswana.

5.4 Summary of the chapter

The thesis presented in this study calls for change in the approaches to Botswana's music education programme to make it a more beneficial experience to the learners. The benefits of the music education programme involve opportunities to develop innovative thinking skills, increased artistic experiences and self-actualisation. This chapter outlined the steps employed to gain understanding of the exact nature of the problem. These included consulting relevant literature sources, giving an detailed account of the state of music education in Botswana, employing qualitative research methods, through the use of questionnaires, participant-observation and document analysis, and presenting and interpreting data collected using mainly qualitative approaches.

The chapter then aimed at providing the specific answers to the main research question that guided this study. The answers given in this section call for the need to come up with strategies that are aimed at adopting the methods appropriate for effective teaching music, planning the teaching of music (taking into account the skills, knowledge, attitudes and experiences the learners have), improving the amount and quality of professional support given to music teachers, making use of the assessment strategies appropriate and relevant to music education, and improving the current situation with regards to the resources allocated to music education in junior secondary schools.

The final chapter will provide the recommended intervention measures to the problems identified.

CHAPTER 6

THE WAY FORWARD AND RECOMMENDATIONS

6.1 Introduction

This chapter begins with a recapitulation of the problems regarding the teaching of music in junior secondary schools in Botswana. It sets forth the context for the next section which outlines the strategies deemed to be appropriate for countering the problems identified and for pointing the way forward. The last part of the chapter suggests topics for further research.

6.2 The key problem

This study was undertaken into the state of the subject Music in junior secondary schools in Botswana's education system, as reflected in the research question. The research question that has guided this study was formulated as follows:

What are the problems regarding the teaching of music in the junior secondary schools in Botswana, and what solutions can be recommended?

The question divides into two main parts: the first dealing with identification of the problems, and the other concerned with proposing solutions. The first component aimed at ascertaining, highlighting and documenting the perceived problems, and constituted the major component of this study. The second part consists of solutions recommended, based on the problems identified. The latter is the most important component of this study as it enumerates actions that ought to be taken towards the provision of a more effective Music syllabus and hence music education programme.

Although the focus of this study has been the problems associated with the Music syllabus and with music teaching at the junior secondary school level, it has been established that the gravest problems are rooted in the way the entire education system is managed, together with the existing policies and practices. Another important factor contributing to the problems is the lack of coordinated efforts among the departments within the Ministry of

Education and Skills Development (MoESD) to benefit music education in general and the subject Music in particular. There has also been evidence of weak links between the MoESD on the one hand and the social and professional organisations with an interest in the arts in general and music on the other. This lack of strong coordination of stakeholders has been identified as a major impediment to the proper development of the junior secondary school music education programme.

6.3 The way forward

Against the background provided in section 6.2 above, the basis for the recommended solutions hinges on the need for improved collaboration as a basis for the realisation of sustainable and effective music education. It is therefore proposed, as a major recommendation, that the MoESD should recognise and regularly engage the following bodies in formulating policies tackling issues, challenges and opportunities for music education:

- Teaching Service Management
- Secondary Department
- Department of Curriculum Development and Evaluation
- Botswana Examinations Council
- Tertiary Education Council
- Botswana Association of Music Educators
- The University of Botswana
- Colleges of Education
- Department of Arts and Culture
- Botswana Music Union.

6.4 Recommended solutions

Due to the problems identified, the following section focuses on the strategic directions and recommended actions. The recommended solutions have been organised under five themes: the design of a music curriculum; the music teaching approaches; music assessment, professional development of music teachers, and the allocation of resources for music teaching. An attempt has been made to make them specific, measurable,

achievable and result-oriented within the short to medium term. The frequency of discussions, workshops and training programmes referred to below should be ascertained through consultations with as many stakeholders as possible. In the interests of creating ownership, reference has been made to specific departments under the MoESD, with a mandate relevant to the proposed strategies.

6.4.1 Designing a music curriculum

In the light of the imbalances in the treatment of learning objectives and genre coverage, the inclination towards music literacy, and unclear directions towards development of creativity, imaginative thinking and self-actualisation, it is recommended that the music syllabus be reviewed, in order to make it more relevant to the local situations, by incorporating more indigenous musical arts in the music curriculum, and to increase the Popular music content as a way of responding to the learners' interests, and making music education more learner-friendly.

6.4.2 Reviewing teaching and training methods

In view of the dominantly teacher-centred presentation of music lessons, established through the participant-observation, it is recommended that the Departments of Secondary Education and Teacher Training and Development, through its in-service unit, should conduct capacity-building workshops by taking advantage of the system of the cluster arrangement to improve the methods and quality of music teaching. They should review methods of appraising teachers to make them more subject specific; this would help in judging music teachers' performance in terms of how interactive their lessons are. Importantly, they should incorporate training of supervisors of music education programmes in schools (senior teachers, Deputy Heads, and school Heads) especially on the aims of a music education programme, in order to equip them with the necessary skills to appropriately carry out the supervision.

With regard to the capacity-building workshops, for new teachers induction workshops should be conducted to expose them to the syllabus contents and assessment procedures. For both experienced and beginning teachers emphasis should be on using teaching approaches relevant to music education. At least two workshops should be held during each school term, to attend to specific areas needing attention and for skills sharing.

6.4.3 Employing relevant assessment approaches

In order to reduce the prevailing feeling among music teachers that the performance and listening aspects of Music are difficult to assess, it is recommended that the Department of Curriculum Development and Evaluation should involve South African experts in their Arts and Culture curriculum in order to create a set of working definitions of musical terms and concepts applicable to the junior secondary school music education in Botswana, and provide training on these. Importantly, there should be an increase in the use of formative assessment, using it to determine the success levels of music teaching styles and approaches; thus there will be a reduction in the use of summative assessment in determining musical achievement, as its use tends to minimize, or even ignore the contexts in which assessment takes place.

6.4.4 Ensuring continuous professional development of music teachers

Due to the teachers' complaints regarding the amount of support provided, and an indication of a lack of proper mentorship for the less experienced music teachers, it is recommended that the Teaching Service Management and Teacher Training and Development should modify the curriculum for training music teachers to make it compliant with modern didactic principles. Further, arts-appropriate recruitment procedures, such as auditioning, when appointing teachers to music teaching posts must be introduced. For new teachers, workshops to induct them into the music education programme should be conducted. Experts from the University of Pretoria and other South African universities should be consulted in order to help with an across-the-board improvement of music education throughout the entire education system.

Given the cost implications of practical music-making in the classroom, and to supplement indigenous instruments, the education authorities should seriously investigate the training of both new and incumbent teachers in recorder and/or guitar playing (where these are not already in place).

6.4.5 Ensuring equitable resource allocation for music teaching

Given that the music teachers and the learners have justifiably complained about the insufficient allocation of facilities and resources, it is recommended that the Department of Secondary Education, in consultation with the school Heads should ensure that one of the classrooms used for core subjects is turned into a base room for music, for the proper

management of music activities – including rehearsals, secure storage and use of the musical instruments, and class performances. Then, they need to stipulate a minimum set of musical instruments for the schools to serve as a guideline to the officers responsible for procurement in the schools and the supporting departments.

6.5 Recommendations for further research

The problems of the music education programme in Botswana are not peculiar to junior secondary school level. The same kinds of problems are there in other levels of the education system. These are influenced by a wide range of factors, ranging from the attitudes of teachers, learners and parents, through the existing education policies, to more complex issues related to national development and policies. During the course of this study a number of issues, challenges and opportunities emerged which could be tackled through research. For the purpose of clarity and defined focus, eight of these topics are presented below. They have been organised under three sub-headings: teacher education; music education in schools; and the music education curriculum.

6.5.1 Teacher education

The effectiveness of in-service programmes in Botswana in enhancing good quality music teaching needs to be closely examined, together with an investigation into the relevance of music education in Botswana tertiary institutions to the demands of the Junior Certificate (JC) Music syllabus. There also needs to be an investigation into the perspectives of music teachers regarding the quality of school music programmes in Botswana.

6.5.2 Music education in schools

The effectiveness of the music education programmes in the education system of Botswana should be surveyed, then aligned with a comparison of the state of music education in Botswana schools with that in other SADC countries. An examination of the school Heads' attitudes towards music education in Botswana secondary schools should supplement this survey.

6.5.3 Music education curriculum

The extent to which music components in the CAPA syllabus equip learners with the necessary attitudes, knowledge and skills required to successfully enter into Music at Junior Certificate (JC) level should be thoroughly examined. On top of this, ways in which indigenous music and popular music can be used to enhance the quality and relevance of music education in Botswana schools should be explored.

Bibliography

Abeles, H. F., Hoffer, C. F. & Klotman, R. H. 1994. *Foundations of Music Education*. New York: Macmillan.

Abril, C. R. & Gault, B. M. 2006. The State of Music in Elementary School: The Principal's Perspective. *Journal of Research in Music Education*. Volume 54 (1), pp. 6-20.

Adams, P. 2001a. Assessment in the Music Classroom, in *Learning to Teach Music in the Secondary School: A Companion to School Experience*. Edited by C. Philpott. New York: Routledge Falmer.

Adams, P. 2001b. Planning to Teach Music Musically, in *Learning to Teach Music in the Secondary School: A Companion to School Experience*. Edited by C. Philpott. New York: Routledge Falmer.

Amanto, H., Carklin, M., Mtimkulu, N. & van der Mescht, S. 2009. *Arts and Culture: Grade 8*. Capetown: Maskew Miller Longman.

Anderson, J. & Poole, M. 2009. *Assignment & Thesis Writing*. Cape Town: Juta.

Barrett, J. R. 2001. Interdisciplinary Work and Musical Integrity. *Music Educators Journal*. Volume 86 (5), pp. 27-31.

Bennet, A. 2001. *Unit Standards in Music: Guidelines for Non-specialist Teachers in Training in Botswana and the SADC region*. Unpublished DMus thesis, University of Pretoria, Pretoria.

Bestwick, A., Radus, C. & Ranson, J. 2005. *Investigating Arts & Culture*. Cape Town: Juta.

Blacking, J. 1980. Trends in the Black Music of South Africa in *Music of World Cultures: An Introduction*. Edited by E. May. London: University of California Press.

Botswana. 1993. *Report of the National Commission on Education*. Gaborone: Government Printer.

Botswana. 2002. *Lower Primary Syllabus (CAPA): Standard One to Four*. Gaborone: Department of Curriculum Development and Evaluation.

Botswana. 2005. *Upper Primary Syllabus (CAPA): Standard Five to Seven*. Gaborone: Department of Curriculum Development and Evaluation.

Botswana. 2006. *Report on the Organisational Structuring of the Ministry of Education: Final Report*. Gaborone: Government Printing and Publishing Services.

Botswana. 2007. *Three-Year Junior Secondary Draft Syllabus: Music*. Gaborone: Department of Curriculum Development and Evaluation.

Botswana. 2010. *Schools Prescription List*. Gaborone: Department of Curriculum Development and Evaluation.

Botswana Tourism Board. 2009. *Discover Botswana*. Gaborone: Imprint Botswana.

Botswana Tourism Board. 2010. *Discover Botswana*. Gaborone: Imprint Botswana.

Brand, M. 2009. Exhausted from Educational Reform. *Bulletin of the Council for Research in Music Education*. Issue:180.

Bray, D. 2000. *Teaching Music in the Secondary School*. Oxford: Heinemann.

Bray, D. 2002. Assessment in Music Education, in *Aspects of Teaching Secondary Music: Perspectives on Practice*. Edited by G. Spruce. London: Routledge.

Brinson, B. A. 1996. *Choral Music Methods and Materials: Developing Successful Choral Programs*. London: Prentice Hall.

Burkholder, J. P., Grout, D. J. & Palisca, C. V. 2010. *A History of Western Music*. 8th Edition. New York: W. W. Norton.

Burrack, F. & McKenzie, T. 2005. Enhanced Student Learning Through Cross-Disciplinary Projects. *Music Educators Journal*. Volume 91 (5), pp. 45-50.

Burton, L. H. 2001. Interdisciplinary Curriculum: Retrospect and Prospect. *Music Educators Journal*. Vol. 87 (5), pp. 17-21, 66.

Campbell, P. S. 2002. The Musical Cultures of the Children, in *The Arts in Children's Lives: Context, Culture and Curriculum*. Edited by L. Brestlerand & C. M. Thompson. The Netherlands: Klower Academic Publishers.

Cavner, D. & Gould, E. 2003. Whole Language in the Music Classroom: Part 1 of 2. *Music Educators Journal*, Volume 89 (4), pp. 39-43.

Chanukha, R. A. 2005. *Music Education in Malawi: The Crisis and the Way Forward*. Unpublished DMus thesis, University of Pretoria, Pretoria.

Chosky, L. 1981. *The Kodaly Context: Creating an Environment for Musical Learning*. New Jersey: Prentice Hall.

Chosky, L., Abrahamson, R. M., Gillespie, A. E., Woods, D. & York, F. 2001. *Teaching Music in the Twenty-first Century*. New Jersey: Prentice Hall.

Cohen, L., Manion, L. & Morrison, K. 2000. *Research in Education*. 5th Edition. London: Routledge Falmer.

Colwell, R. J. & Wing, L. B. 2004. *An Orientation to Music Education: Structural Knowledge for Music Teaching*. New Jersey: Pearson Prentice Hall.

Cutiotta, R. A. & Thompson, L. K. 2000. Voices of Experience Speak on Music Teaching, *Music Educators Journal*, Vol. 87(3), pp. 40-43.

Department of Arts and Culture. 2009. *Marang a Ngwao*. Gaborone: Design UNIT @DAC.

Dorell, 2005. *What is Music? Solving a Scientific Mystery*.

<http://www.whatismusic.info>. [Accessed 2010/03/17]

Dorn, C. and Lonna, J. 1988. Promoting Partnerships For Arts Education: Teachers, Artists, and Scholars, in *Towards an era in Arts Education*. Edited by J. T. McLaughlin. New York: American Council for the Arts.

Economy of Botswana.

http://www.wikipedia.org/wiki/economy_of_botswana.bw/[Accessed 2010/05/17]

Farr, R. & Tone, B. 1994. *Portfolio Performance Assessment*. Fort Worth: Hartcourt College Publishers.

Feay-Shaw, S. 2002. The Music of Mexican-Americans: A Historical Perspective of a Forgotten Culture in American Music Education. *Journal of Historical Research in Music Education*, Volume 54, XXIV:1.

Flohr, J. W. 2005. *The Musical Lives of Young Children*. Upper Saddle River: Prentice Hall.

Fraser, J. D. C. 2006. Mediation of Learning, in *The Educator as a Mediator of Learning*. Edited by M. M. Niemann & R. B. Monyai. Pretoria: Van Schaik.

Fraser, W. J. & Maree, J. G. 2004. *Outcome Based Assessment*. Sandown: Heinemann.

Frith, S. 2007. *Taking Popular Music Seriously: Selected Essays*. Cornwall: Ashgate.

Garretson, R. L. 1993. *Conducting Choral Music*. 7th Edition. New Jersey: Prentice Hall.

Gerrity, K. W. 2009. No child left: Determining the Impact of Policy on Music Education in Ohio. *Bulletin of the Council for Research in Music Education*. Issue:179.

Glover, J. & Young, S. 1999. *Primary Music: Later Years*. London: Falmer Press.

Government Paper No. 2 of 1994. 1994. *The Revised National Policy on Education*. Gaborone: Government Printer.

Hawkins, J. (ed.) 1988. *The Oxford Paperback Dictionary*. 3rd Edition. Oxford: Oxford University Press.

Hein, G. E. 1991. *Constructivist Learning Theory*.

<http://www.exploratorium.edu/IFI/resources/constructivistlearning.html> [Accessed 2009/03/17]

Herbst, A., de Wet, J. & Rijdsdijk, S. 2005. A Survey of Music Education in Primary Schools of South Africa's Cape Peninsula. *Journal of Research in Music Education*. Volume 53 (3), pp.260-283.

Hoffer, C. R. 1993. *Introduction to Music Education*. Belmont: Wadsworth.

Hopkins, A. G. 2001. Towards Quality and Institutional Enhancement Through Agreed Standards, in *Translating Vision 2016 in to Reality Through Curriculum Change*. Edited by D. Letsholo, T. Mogotsi & D. Molelo. Gaborone: Government Printer.

Johnson, S., Maxwell, E., Tagg, T., Breda, L. & Guzana, T. 2006. *Arts and Culture Learners's Book: Grade 6*. Cape Town: Oxford University Press.

Jorgensen, E. R. 1996. *Justifying Music in General Education: Belief in Search for Reason*. <http://www.edu.uiuc.edu/eps/PES-Yearbook/96docs/jorgensen.html> [Accessed 2010/06/17]

Jorgensen, E. R. 2003. *Transforming Music Education*. Indiana: Indiana University Press.

June, H. 1999. Speaking up or being heard? In *Teaching Music*, Vol. 6, no.6, pp. 2-6.

Kaagan, S. and Chapman S. 1988. Adopting Strategies for Advocacy and Action in Arts Education, in *Towards a New Era in Arts Education: Interlochen Symposium*. Edited by J. T. McLaughlin. New York: American Council for the Arts.

Kaemmer, J. E. 1993. *Music in Human Life: Anthropological Perspective on Music*. Austin: University of Texas Press.

Kamien, R. 1996. *Music: An Appreciation*. New York: McGraw Hill.

Kanasi, T. P. 2007. *Teacher Training for Primary School Musical Arts in Botswana: Problems and Proposals*. Unpublished MMus Dissertation, University of Pretoria, Pretoria.

Kigozi, B. S. 2008. *An Evaluation of Music Education in Elementary Schools in Buganda: A Way Forward*. Unpublished DMus thesis, University of Pretoria, Pretoria.

Klenowski, V. 2002. *Developing Portfolios for Learning and Assessment: Processes and Principles*. London: Routledge.

Klopper, C. 2005. *Variables Impacting on the Delivery of Music in the Learning Area Arts and Culture in South Africa*. Unpublished Doctoral Thesis. Pretoria: University of Pretoria.

Kyriacou, C. 1997. *Effective Teaching in Schools*. London: Nelson Thornes.

Leedy, P. D. & Ormrod, J. E. 2001. *Practical Research Planning and Design*. 7th Edition. Upper Saddle River: Merrill Prentice Hall.

Long Term Vision for Botswana: Towards Prosperity for All. 1997. Gaborone: Government Printer.

Mannathoko, C. 1994. The Contribution of Educational Research Networks to Research Capacity Building: The Case of BERA and ERNESA, in *Research for Educational Policy and Planning in Botswana*. Edited by S. Burchfield. Gaborone: Macmillan Botswana.

Mbenje, T. & Pambano, N. 2010. *Music for the Day (Junior Secondary Schools): Form 1*. Gaborone: Botsalo Press.

Mensah, A. A. 1980. Music South of Sahara in *Music of World Cultures: An Introduction*. Edited by E. May. London: University of California Press.

Miché, M. 2002. *Weaving Music into Young Minds*. Albany: Delmar.

Mills, J. 2005. *Music in the School*. New York: Oxford University Press.

Mmegi online. 2009. *Botswana is least corrupt country in Africa*.

<http://www.mmegi.bw/index>. [Accessed 2009/11/19]

Molyes, J., Hargreaves, L., Merry, R., Paterson, F. & Escarte-Sarries, V. 2003. *Interactive Teaching in the Primary School: Digging deeper into meanings*. Berkshire: Open University Press.

Mouton, J. 2001. *How to Succeed in your Master's and Doctoral Studies: A South African Guide and Resource Book*. Pretoria: Van Schaik.

Myers, L. K. 1961. *Teaching Children Music in the Elementary Schools*. Englewood: Prentice Hall.

Nzewi, M. 2003. Acquiring Knowledge of the Musical Arts in Traditional Society, in *Musical Arts in Africa: Theory, Practice and Education*. Edited by A. Herbst, M. Nzewi & K. Agawu. Pretoria: Unisa.

Nzewi, M. 2007. *A contemporary study of musical arts*. Volume four. Pretoria: CIIMDA.

O' Brien, J. P. 1995. *The Listening Experience: Elements, Forms and Styles in Music*. 2nd Edition. New York: Prentice Hall International.

Onyiuke, Y. S. 2005. *Childhood Music Education in Nigeria: A Case Study*. Unpublished DMus thesis, University of Pretoria, Pretoria.

Oslo, C. A. 2008. Staying in Step: Veteran Teacher Closes the Musical Gap in New Generation. *Teaching Music*, Volume 15, pp. 42-44.

Phibion, O. S. & Moeng, L. 2009. *Music: Form 1*. Gaborone: Collegium.

Phuthego, M. 2007. *An Evaluation of the Integration of Indigenous Musical Arts in the Creative and Performing Arts Syllabus and Implementation thereof in the Primary School Curriculum in Botswana*. Unpublished DMus thesis, University of Pretoria, Pretoria.

Politoske, D. T. 1984. *Music*. 3rd edition. London: Prentice Hall International.

Pound, L. & Harrison, C. 2003. *Supporting Musical Development in the Early Years*. Philadelphia: Open University Press.

Reimer, B. 2003. *A Philosophy of Music Education*. 3rd edition. New Jersey: Prentice Hall.

Republic of Namibia. 2006. *Junior Secondary Phase Arts-in-Culture Syllabus: Grades 8-10*. Okahandja: National Institute for Educational Development (NIED).

Revised National Curriculum Statement Grades R-9 (Schools): Arts and Culture. 2002. Pretoria: Department of Education.

Schoeman, L. 1993. *Teacher Training Programme for Junior Primary Music Education, adaptable for Botswana and South Africa – A Multicultural Approach*. Unpublished DMus thesis, University of Pretoria, Pretoria.

Smialek, T. & Boburka, R. R. 2006. The Effect of Cooperative Listening Exercises on the Critical Listening Skills of the College Music Appreciation Students. *Journal of Research in Music Education*, Volume 54 (1), pp.57-72.

Snyder, S. 2001. Connection, Correlation, and Integration. *Music Educators Journal*, Volume 87 (5), pp. 32-38, 70.

Spruce, G. 2001. Music Assessment and the Hegemony of Musical Heritage, in *Issues in Music Teaching*. Edited by C. Philpott & C. Plummeridge. London: Routledge.

Spruce, G. 2002a. Planning for Teaching and Learning, in *Aspects of Teaching Secondary Music: Perspectives on Practice*. Edited by G. Spruce. London: Routledge.

Spruce, G. 2002b. The Music Department, in *Aspects of Teaching Secondary Music: Perspectives on Practice*. Edited by G. Spruce. London: Routledge.

Swanwick, K. 1994. *Musical Knowledge: Intuition, Analysis and Music Education*. London: Routledge.

Swanwick, K. 1999. *Teaching Music Musically*. London: Routledge.

Three-year Junior Secondary School Syllabus: Music. 2010. Gaborone: Department of Curriculum Development and Evaluation.

Top 5 Qualities of Good Teachers.

<http://myfla.ws/blog/2008/05/24/top-5-qualities-of-good-teachers/> [Accessed 2009/ 04/ 15]

University of Botswana. 2006. *Diploma in Primary Education External Examiners' Report-2006*. Gaborone: University of Botswana.

Welch, G. F. 2002. Early Childhood Musical Development, in *The Arts in Children's Lives: Context, Culture and Curriculum*. Edited by L. Brestler & C. M. Thompson. The Netherlands: Kluwer Academic Publishers.

Winkler, A. C. & McCuen, R. 1989. *Writing the Research Paper: A Handbook*. 3rd edition. San Diego: Harcourt Brace Jovanovich.

Yarbrough, C. 2008. *An Introduction to Scholarship in Music*. San Diego: University Reader Company.

Young, S. & Glover, J. 1998. *Primary Music: Early Years*. London: Falmer Press.



APPENDIX A



Map of Botswana



APPENDIX B

QUESTIONNAIRE FOR TEACHERS

PART I: PERSONAL INFORMATION

1. What are your qualifications? _____

2. Where and when did you obtain the qualification? _____

3. Which form(s) do you teach? _____

4. How long have you been teaching music;

(a) In this school? _____

(b) Any previous school(s)? _____

PART II: MUSIC EDUCATION IN THE SCHOOL

1. Give the numbers of the following:

(a) Music teachers in this school

(b) Music teaching periods per week

(c) Pupils taking music

(d) Pupils per class (average)

1.1 How do the above numbers affect the quality of music education programmes in this school?

2. Is the teaching and storage space suitable for the teaching of music?

YES		NO	
-----	--	----	--

2.1 If not, explain how you manage to deal with the problem.

3. Which instruments are available in the school?

3.1 Describe the activities you do with your pupils, using instruments.

4. How often do you assess the following areas of music education? (Tick the appropriate block.)

Area	Very often	Sometimes	Never
Listening			
Music theory and history			
Performance			

4.1 For you, which area is the most difficult to assess?

4.2 Explain the difficulty that you experience.

5. What strategies do you employ for the different abilities in your class?

5.1 High achievers



5.2 Average achievers

5.3 Low achievers

6. Place a tick in the column that best describes how often you incorporate the following musical activities in your teaching:

Activity	Always	Sometimes	Never
Singing			
Listening			
Music notation			
Instrumental playing			
Movement			
Improvisation			

PART III PROFESSIONAL SUPPORT

1. Describe the quality of support you get from

(a) Colleagues in the school

(b) Your senior teacher

(c) The school head

2. Is there a music cluster in the area?

YES		NO	
-----	--	----	--

If YES, describe the activities that the cluster is currently involved in.

3. Have you been engaged by Botswana Examinations Council

(a) As an examiner?

YES		NO	
-----	--	----	--

(b) As a moderator?

YES		NO	
-----	--	----	--

(c) As a marker?

YES		NO	
-----	--	----	--

3.1 If you have answered YES to any of the above, how has this helped in improving your teaching of music?

3.2 If NO, how do you think that it could help in the teaching of music?

4. Have you attended any workshop organised for music teachers?

YES		NO	
-----	--	----	--

4.1 If YES, what was covered in the workshop?

4.2 How has the workshop helped in enhancing your approach to the teaching of music?

5. Has the Department of Curriculum Development and Evaluation involved you in any of the following activities:

(a) Review of the music syllabus?

YES		NO	
-----	--	----	--

(b) Review of the text books and audio material for teaching music?

YES		NO	
-----	--	----	--

5.1 If YES, how has this helped in improving your teaching of music?

5.2 If NO, how do you think that it could help in enhancing your teaching of music?

6. What are you currently doing to ensure your own professional development in music education?

7. Give your own opinion on how the following personnel can contribute to an improvement in the state of music education:

7.1 Subject officers within the Ministry of Education

7.2 The school head

7.3 The Senior teacher in charge of music education

7.4 The Deputy (as head of academics)

PART IV: TEACHER'S OPINION OF THE MUSIC SYLLABUS

1. Does the music syllabus offer the following opportunities:

(a) To engage learners in movement and dance?

YES		NO	
-----	--	----	--

(b) To sing and/or play the available musical instruments?

YES		NO	
-----	--	----	--

(c) For pupils to showcase their musical talent?

YES		NO	
-----	--	----	--

(d) Musical activities promoting creativity and imaginative thinking?

YES		NO	
-----	--	----	--

1.1 Circle the letter of the opportunity (a, b, c or d) described above, which you feel requires *most* coverage by the music syllabus.

1.2 Explain your choice

2 Teaching of any curriculum subject should aim at addressing the following aspects of human development: cognitive, psycho-motor, affective and social development.

2.1 Which of the above four aspects of development do you think music education should target most?

2.2 Which of these aspects have been covered

(a) *most* by the current syllabus_____

(b) *least* by the current syllabus_____

2.3 Suggest changes that could be made to the music syllabus to address developmental aspects._____

3. To what extent does the current syllabus cover the following musical genres:

(a) Western music

(b) African music

(c) Popular music

(d) Jazz

3.1 Suggest the changes that could be done regarding the coverage of these musical genres in the syllabus.

3.2 Please provide any further comments on the current syllabus, with a view to possible improvements.

QUESTIONNAIRE FOR PUPILS

To the respondent

Please complete this questionnaire. It is part of a study on the topic *Music education in junior secondary schools in Botswana: the way forward*. The questionnaire is aimed at investigating how you as a music learner perceive the music education programme in your school. It will take about 15 minutes of your time to complete.

PART I Place a tick in the box which better answers the question asked:

1. Did you choose to do music as one of your optional subjects?

YES		NO	
-----	--	----	--

If NO, explain how it came to be that you are in the music class.

2. Do you feel that music is given enough time in the school time-table?

YES		NO	
-----	--	----	--

3. Would you describe the number of learners in your music class manageable to your teacher?

YES		NO	
-----	--	----	--

4. Are text books used in the music class?

YES		NO	
-----	--	----	--

If YES: Do the text books used help you learn music concepts better?

YES		NO	
-----	--	----	--

5. Are you actively involved in any music-making group within or outside the school?

YES		NO	
-----	--	----	--

If YES, give details of your involvement _____

6. Does music education in the school offer the following opportunities?

(a) To practise in small groups.

YES		NO	
-----	--	----	--

(b) To play the available musical instruments.

YES		NO	
-----	--	----	--

(c) To share my musical talent with other students.

YES		NO	
-----	--	----	--

(d) Access to individual attention if the need arises.

YES		NO	
-----	--	----	--

6.1 Circle the letter of the opportunity (a, b, c or d) described above, which you feel needs *most* attention in your music education.

6.2 Explain your choice

7. Place a tick in the column that best describes how often the musical activities are included in the lessons:

Activity	Always	Sometimes	Never
Singing			
Listening			
Music notation			
Instrumental playing			
Movement			
Improvisation			

7.1 In your opinion, which one of the activities should be included *more* often in the music lessons?

Give the reason for your answer

7.2 In your opinion, which one of the activities should be included *less* often in the music lessons?

Give the reason for your answer

PART II Place a tick in appropriate box regarding the following statements:

1. Music education offers me opportunities to express myself.

Strongly Agree	<input type="checkbox"/>	Agree	<input type="checkbox"/>	Disagree	<input type="checkbox"/>	Strongly Disagree	<input type="checkbox"/>
----------------	--------------------------	-------	--------------------------	----------	--------------------------	-------------------	--------------------------

2. Music should be taught as a core subject.

Strongly Agree	<input type="checkbox"/>	Agree	<input type="checkbox"/>	Disagree	<input type="checkbox"/>	Strongly Disagree	<input type="checkbox"/>
----------------	--------------------------	-------	--------------------------	----------	--------------------------	-------------------	--------------------------

3. I would recommend to a friend entering the school in Form 1 to opt for music as a subject choice.

Strongly Agree	<input type="checkbox"/>	Agree	<input type="checkbox"/>	Disagree	<input type="checkbox"/>	Strongly Disagree	<input type="checkbox"/>
----------------	--------------------------	-------	--------------------------	----------	--------------------------	-------------------	--------------------------

4. Suggest things that could be done to improve the quality of learning music in the school.

Thank you very much for your time.