

DIRECTORS' DUTIES TO CREDITORS

by

SULETTE LOMBARD

submitted in partial fulfilment of the requirements for the degree

DOCTOR LEGUM

in the

**FACULTY OF LAW
UNIVERSITY OF PRETORIA**

PROMOTOR: PROF DR PA DELPORT

**Pretoria
AUGUST 2006**

VOORWOORD

Met opregte dank en waardering aan die volgende persone vir die bydrae wat hulle tot hierdie proefskrif gelewer het:

Prof Piet Delpont, my promotor, vir sy deurlopende bystand, waardevolle advies en bekwame leiding.

Prof Chris Nagel vir hulp met die redigering van die proefskrif.

My familie, vriende en kollegas vir hul deurlopende belangstelling, aanmoediging en ondersteuning.

'n Besondere woord van dank aan my ouers, Isak en Erika Roos, vir hul liefde, geloof in my vermoëns en getroue ondersteuning met hierdie proefskrif en al my ander studies.

Hierdie proefskrif word opgedra aan my man, Gerrit en ons kinders, Cara, Jeanne en Gerrit. 'n Spesiale woord van dank kom hulle toe vir volgehoue aanmoediging, ondersteuning, geduld, begrip en opoffering.

Die proefskrif sluit relevante regsontwikkelings tot en met 30 April 2006 in.

Sulette Lombard

Augustus 2006

TABLE OF CONTENTS

PART I: GENERAL ORIENTATION

Chapter 1: Introduction	3
1.1 BACKGROUND	3
1.2 PURPOSE OF STUDY.....	5
1.3 EXPOSITION	5
1.4 LIMITATION OF SCOPE	7
1.5 METHODOLOGY	8

PART II: JUSTIFICATION OF A DUTY TO CREDITORS

Chapter 2: Conceptual Justification	13
2.1 INTRODUCTION	13
2.2 THEORIES ON THE NATURE OF THE COMPANY.....	14
2.2.1 General.....	14
2.2.2 Contractual Theories.....	15
2.2.2.1 General.....	15
2.2.2.2 Legal Contractualism.....	16
2.2.2.3 Economic Contractualism.....	17
2.2.3 Communitarian Theories	17
2.2.4 Concessionary Theories.....	19
2.2.4.1 General.....	19
2.2.4.2 Dual Concession Theory.....	21
2.2.5 Associative Theories.....	22
2.2.6 Application to a Duty to Creditors.....	23
2.2.6.1 Contractual Theories.....	23
2.2.6.2 Communitarian Theories	24
2.2.6.3 Concessionary Theories.....	25

2.2.6.4 Associative Theories	25
2.3 CREDITORS' CONTRACTUAL RELATIONSHIP WITH THE COMPANY	27
2.3.1 General	27
2.3.2 Freedom to Negotiate.....	28
2.3.3 Adequacy of Contractual Protective Measures.....	28
2.3.3.1 Risk Compensation	28
2.3.3.2 Guarantees and Loan Covenants.....	30
2.3.4 Efficiency Concerns.....	30
2.3.5 Conclusion	31
2.4 SHAREHOLDERS V CREDITORS AS PRIMARY CORPORATE CONSTITUENTS.....	32
2.4.1 General.....	32
2.4.2 Owners of the Company	33
2.4.3 Relative Strength of Bargaining Power	34
2.4.4 Residual Risk-bearers	35
2.4.5 Efficient Monitors of Managerial Performance.....	38
2.4.6 Differences Between Equityholders and Debtholders	41
2.4.7 Conclusion	43
2.5 EFFECT OF A DUTY TO CREDITORS ON DIRECTORS' BEHAVIOUR.....	44
2.5.1 General.....	44
2.5.2 Fragmentation of Duties	44
2.5.3 Increased Risk Averseness.....	45
2.5.4 Reluctance to Serve on Company Boards.....	47
2.6 EFFECT OF A DUTY TO CREDITORS ON LIMITED LIABILITY	48
2.7 CONCLUSION.....	52
Chapter 3: Evaluation of Alternative Remedies	55
3.1 INTRODUCTION	55
3.2 STATUTORY MEASURES PROVIDING FOR DIRECTORS' PERSONAL LIABILITY.....	57

3.2.1 South Africa	57
3.2.1.1 Applicants	58
3.2.1.1.1 Question as to Whether Claim Should be Quantified.....	58
3.2.1.1.2 Effect of Implementation of Compromise in terms of Section 311 on <i>Locus Standi</i> of Creditor	59
3.2.1.2 Winding-Up, Judicial Management or Otherwise	60
3.2.1.3 Recklessly	61
3.2.1.4 Fraudulently	63
3.2.1.5 Consequences of a Successful Application.....	64
3.2.1.5.1 Liability for Which Debts?	64
3.2.1.5.2 Creditors Who Are Benefited	65
3.2.1.5.3 Punitive Element.....	66
3.2.1.6 Evaluation	67
3.2.2 Comparative Study.....	71
3.2.2.1 Australia.....	71
3.2.2.2 New Zealand	75
3.2.2.3 England	76
3.2.2.4 Canada.....	81
3.3 TYPICAL INSOLVENCY REMEDIES	83
3.3.1 General	83
3.3.2 Statutory Voidable Dispositions	84
3.3.2.1 Dispositions Not for Value	84
3.3.2.2 Voidable Preferences	84
3.3.2.3 Undue Preferences	85
3.3.3 Common Law Remedy: <i>Actio Pauliana</i>	85
3.3.4 Evaluation	86
3.4 PIERCING THE CORPORATE VEIL	90
3.5 CONCLUSION.....	93

PART III: FRAMEWORK FOR A DUTY TO CREDITORS

Chapter 4: Judicial Framework	97
4.1 INTRODUCTION	97
4.2 TYPE OF DUTY	100
4.2.1 Introduction.....	100
4.2.2 Australia.....	101
4.2.3 New Zealand	102
4.2.4 England	103
4.2.5 Canada.....	104
4.2.6 United States of America	105
4.3 POINT IN TIME WHEN THE DUTY ARISES	106
4.3.1 Introduction.....	106
4.3.2 Australia.....	106
4.3.3 New Zealand	108
4.3.4 England	109
4.3.5 Canada.....	110
4.3.6 United States of America	111
4.4 BENEFICIARY OF THE DUTY	114
4.4.1 Introduction.....	114
4.4.2 Australia.....	116
4.4.3 New Zealand	116
4.4.4 England	118
4.4.5 Canada.....	119
4.4.6 United States of America	121
4.5 PROTECTED CREDITORS	121
4.5.1 Introduction.....	121
4.5.2 Australia.....	122
4.5.3 New Zealand	123
4.5.4 England	124

4.5.5	Canada.....	125
4.5.6	United States of America	125
4.6	POWER OF THE GENERAL MEETING TO RATIFY A BREACH OF THE DUTY .	125
4.6.1	Introduction.....	125
4.6.2	Australia.....	126
4.6.3	New Zealand	126
4.6.4	England	127
4.6.5	Canada.....	128
4.6.6	United States of America	128
4.7	CONCLUSION.....	128
Chapter 5: Protection Afforded by Fiduciary Duties		132
5.1	INTRODUCTION	132
5.2	SOURCES AND FORMULATION.....	135
5.2.1	South Africa	135
5.2.2	Australia.....	136
5.2.3	New Zealand	137
5.2.4	England	138
5.2.5	Canada.....	142
5.2.6	United States of America	142
5.3	RELEVANT ELEMENTS.....	143
5.3.1	Acting in Good Faith in the Best Interests of the Company	143
5.3.1.1	General.....	143
5.3.1.2	Requirement of Good Faith	144
5.3.1.3	Defining the Interests of the Company	145
5.3.2	Maintaining an Unfettered Discretion	150
5.3.2.1	General.....	150
5.3.2.2	Nominee Directors	150
5.3.3	Avoiding a Conflict of Interests.....	155
5.3.3.1	General.....	155

5.3.3.2 Unwarranted Personal Benefit	156
5.3.3.3 Contracts with the Company	156
5.4 CONSEQUENCES OF BREACH OF DUTY	157
5.4.1 General	157
5.4.2 Setting Aside of Transaction	157
5.4.3 Civil Personal Liability	158
5.4.3.1 Extent of Personal Liability	158
5.4.3.2 Basis of Personal Liability	159
5.4.3.3 Defendant	161
5.4.3.3.1 Defining “Director”	161
5.4.3.3.2 <i>De Facto</i> Directors	163
5.4.3.3.3 Non-executive Directors	165
5.4.3.3.4 Puppet, Dummy or Stooze Directors and Shadow Directors	166
5.4.4 Pecuniary Penalty Orders	168
5.5 APPLICATION TO A DUTY TO CREDITORS	169
5.5.1 Sources	169
5.5.2 Formulation	171
5.5.3 Relevant Elements of Fiduciary Duties	174
5.5.3.1 Acting in Good Faith in the Best Interests of the Company	174
5.5.3.2 Maintaining an Unfettered Discretion	177
5.5.3.3 Avoiding a Conflict of Interests	181
5.5.4 Consequences of Breach	182
5.5.4.1 Remedy	182
5.5.4.1.1 Personal Liability	182
5.5.4.1.2 Pecuniary Penalty Order	183
5.5.4.2 Basis of Liability	183
5.5.4.3 Defendant	184
5.6 CONCLUSION	185

Chapter 6: Protection Afforded by the Duty of Care and Skill.....	189
6.1 INTRODUCTION	189
6.2 SOURCES AND FORMULATION.....	191
6.2.1 South Africa.....	191
6.2.2 Australia.....	194
6.2.3 New Zealand.....	195
6.2.4 England.....	196
6.2.5 Canada.....	199
6.2.6 United States of America.....	199
6.3 RELEVANT ASPECTS	200
6.3.1 Elements of “Care”, “Skill” and “Diligence”	200
6.3.1.1 Duty of Care.....	200
6.3.1.2 Duty of Skill.....	200
6.3.1.3 Duty of Diligence.....	202
6.3.2 Required Standard.....	203
6.3.2.1 South Africa.....	203
6.3.2.2 Australia.....	204
6.3.2.3 New Zealand.....	206
6.3.2.4 England.....	208
6.3.2.5 Canada.....	208
6.3.2.6 United States of America.....	209
6.3.3 Distinction Between Executive and Non-Executive Directors.....	211
6.3.3.1 South Africa.....	211
6.3.3.2 Australia.....	213
6.3.3.3 New Zealand.....	214
6.3.3.4 England.....	215
6.3.3.5 Canada.....	215
6.3.3.6 United States of America.....	216
6.3.4 Reliance on Others.....	216
6.3.4.1 South Africa.....	216

6.3.4.2	Australia.....	217
6.3.4.3	New Zealand	218
6.3.4.4	England	218
6.3.4.5	Canada.....	219
6.3.4.6	United States of America.....	219
6.4	CONSEQUENCES OF BREACH.....	220
6.4.1	South Africa	220
6.4.2	Australia.....	221
6.4.3	New Zealand	222
6.4.4	England	222
6.4.5	Canada.....	222
6.4.6	United States of America	223
6.5	APPLICATION TO A DUTY TO CREDITORS	225
6.5.1	Sources.....	225
6.5.2	Formulation.....	228
6.5.3	Relevant Aspects.....	229
6.5.3.1	Required Standard.....	229
6.5.3.1.1	Duty of Care.....	229
6.5.3.1.2	Duty of Skill.....	233
6.5.3.2	Distinction Between Executive and Non-executive Directors.....	234
6.5.3.3	Reliance on Others	234
6.5.4	Consequences of Breach.....	236
6.5.4.1	Basis of Liability	236
6.5.4.2	Suitability of Remedy	238
6.5.4.3	Inadequate Information.....	238
6.5.4.4	Judicial Reluctance	241
6.6	CONCLUSION.....	243

Chapter 7: Point in Time When the Duty Arises	248
7.1 INTRODUCTION	248
7.2 DEFINING THE TRIGGERS	250
7.2.1 Insolvency	250
7.2.1.1 General	250
7.2.1.2 Definition of Insolvency in Cases dealing with Directors’ Duties to Creditors.....	251
7.2.1.2.1 Australia.....	251
7.2.1.2.2 New Zealand	252
7.2.1.2.3 England	252
7.2.1.2.4 United States of America	253
7.2.1.3 Definition of Insolvency in Context of Application of Section 424(1)	254
7.2.1.3.1 Commercial or Factual Insolvency?	254
7.2.1.3.2 Debt Subordination	256
7.2.1.4 Definition of Insolvency in Other Statutory Measures Aimed at the Protection of Creditors.....	258
7.2.1.5 Suggested Definition of Insolvency.....	259
7.2.1.5.1 Balance Sheet and/or Commercial Insolvency?	259
7.2.1.5.2 Objective Test	261
7.2.1.5.3 Under-capitalized Companies and Debt Subordination.....	262
7.2.1.5.4 Insolvency in Fact	262
7.2.2 “Doubtful Solvency”	264
7.2.2.1 General.....	264
7.2.2.2 Definitions and Guidelines Provided by Commentators	264
7.2.2.3 Suggested Definition of “Doubtful Solvency”	267
7.2.3 “Actions Causing Insolvency”	267
7.2.3.1 General.....	267
7.2.3.2 Suggested Formulation of “Actions Causing Insolvency”	268
7.3 FACTORS INFLUENCING PREFERENCE FOR A TRIGGER.....	268
7.3.1 General.....	268

7.3.2	Need for Precision.....	269
7.3.3	Need for Risk-taking.....	270
7.3.4	Director Reaction.....	272
7.3.5	Increase in Cost.....	274
7.3.6	Role of the Judiciary.....	274
7.3.7	Reconciling Triggers with Conceptual Justification for a Duty to Creditors	276
7.3.7.1	General.....	276
7.3.7.2	Insolvency and “Doubtful Solvency”	276
7.3.7.3	“Actions Causing Insolvency”	278
7.4	PRACTICAL APPLICATION OF THE TRIGGERS.....	279
7.4.1	Insolvency and “Doubtful Solvency”	279
7.4.2	“Actions Causing Insolvency”	282
7.4.3	Summary.....	284
7.4.3.1	Insolvency or “Doubtful Solvency as Triggers”	284
7.4.3.2	“Actions Causing Insolvency” as Trigger.....	285
7.5	CONCLUSION.....	285
Chapter 8: Beneficiary of the Duty		291
8.1	INTRODUCTION	291
8.2	ORTHODOX VIEW.....	294
8.2.1	Interest of the Company.....	294
8.2.2	Enforcement of Directors’ Duties.....	296
8.2.3	Ratification of a Breach of Directors’ Duties	297
8.2.3.1	Distinction between Ratifiable and Unratifiable Wrongs.....	297
8.2.3.2	Ratification by Directors as Shareholders.....	300
8.2.3.3	Ratification by Unanimous Consent	303
8.3	JUDICIAL METHODS FOR EXTENDING DIRECTORS’ DUTIES TO CREDITORS	305
8.3.1	Indirect Duty Method.....	305
8.3.1.1	Beneficiary of Duty.....	305

8.3.1.2	Right of Action	306
8.3.1.3	Power of Ratification	307
8.3.2	Direct Duty Method	306
8.3.2.1	Beneficiary of Duty.....	308
8.3.2.2	Right of Action	308
8.3.2.3	Power of Ratification	309
8.4	EVALUATION OF JUDICIAL METHODS	309
8.4.1	Indirect Duty Method.....	309
8.4.1.1	Perceived Advantages	309
8.4.1.2	Perceived Problems.....	311
8.4.2	Direct Duty Method	313
8.4.2.1	Perceived Advantages	313
8.4.2.2	Perceived Problems.....	314
8.4.3	Summary	316
8.5	SUGGESTED METHOD	318
8.5.1	Beneficiary of Duty.....	318
8.5.2	Classes of Creditors	319
8.5.3	Right of Action	321
8.5.3.1	Creditors’ Derivative Action.....	322
8.5.3.2	Flexible Definition of “Membership”	324
8.5.3.3	Summary	326
8.5.4	Power of Ratification	327
8.6	CONCLUSION.....	329
Chapter 9: Relief from Liability		332
9.1	INTRODUCTION	332
9.2	RELIEF BY THE COURT	335
9.2.1	Introduction.....	335
9.2.2	Statutory Provisions Empowering Courts to Grant Relief.....	336
9.2.2.1	South Africa.....	336

9.2.2.2	Australia.....	337
9.2.2.3	England	338
9.2.2.4	Evaluation	338
9.2.2.4.1	Applicability of Relieving Provisions in Case of Statutory Liability ...	338
9.2.2.4.2	Uncertainty Regarding Proceedings to which Relieving Provisions Will Apply	341
9.2.2.4.3	Anomaly in that Person who Acted <i>Negligently</i> Is Entitled to Relief if He Acted <i>Reasonably</i>	342
9.2.2.4.4	Extent of the Court’s Discretion	344
9.2.3	The Business Judgment Rule	345
9.2.3.1	United States of America.....	345
9.2.3.2	Australia.....	349
9.2.3.3	Evaluation	352
9.2.3.3.1	Arguments in Favour of a Statutory Business Judgment Rule	352
9.2.3.3.1.1	Judiciary’s Stance on Pronouncing on Business Decisions.....	352
9.2.3.3.1.2	Encouragement of Risk-Taking	352
9.2.3.3.1.3	Need for Protection at the Moment When Directors Take Business Judgments	353
9.2.3.3.1.4	Arguments from Fairness and Expediency	353
9.2.3.3.2	Arguments against a Statutory Business Judgment Rule.....	354
9.2.3.3.2.1	Superfluity of a Statutory Business Judgment Rule	354
9.2.3.3.2.2	Limited Application of and Protection Afforded by the Rule	355
9.2.3.3.2.3	Creation of Formalism	356
9.2.3.3.2.4	Realism About Shareholder Litigation Risk	356
9.2.3.3.2.5	Effect of a Statutory Rule On the Content of a Duty of Care	356
9.2.3.3.2.6	Doctrinal Conflicts.....	358
9.2.3.3.2.7	Uncertainty Regarding Parameters of the Business Judgment Rule.....	358
9.2.4	Application to a Duty to Creditors.....	359
9.3	INDEMNIFICATION.....	362

9.3.1 Introduction.....	362
9.3.2 Statutory Regulation	362
9.3.2.1 South Africa.....	363
9.3.2.2 Australia.....	364
9.3.2.3 New Zealand	366
9.3.2.4 England	368
9.3.2.5 Canada.....	369
9.3.2.6 United States of America.....	369
9.3.3 Application to a Duty to Creditors.....	374
9.3.3.1 General Indemnity and Exemption	374
9.3.3.1.1 General.....	374
9.3.3.1.2 Section 247(1) and Modifying or Releasing Provisions in Articles of Association.....	376
9.3.3.1.3 Application of Section 247(1) in a Group Context.....	379
9.3.3.2 Indemnity against Liability for Legal Expenses	381
9.4 DIRECTOR LIABILITY INSURANCE.....	382
9.4.1 Introduction.....	382
9.4.2 Statutory Regulation	383
9.4.2.1 South Africa.....	383
9.4.2.2 Australia.....	384
9.4.2.3 New Zealand	385
9.4.2.4 England	386
9.4.2.5 Canada.....	387
9.4.2.6 United States of America.....	387
9.4.3 Application to a Duty to Creditors.....	388
9.4.3.1 General.....	388
9.4.3.2 Statutory Regulated Access	389
9.4.3.3 Consequences of Non-compliance with Statutory Requirements.....	391
9.5 CONCLUSION.....	392

PART IV: CONCLUSION

Chapter 10: Conclusion	396
10.1 BACKGROUND	396
10.2 JUSTIFICATION OF A DUTY TO CREDITORS.....	397
10.2.1 Conceptual Justification of a Duty to Creditors.....	397
10.2.2 Need for a Duty to Creditors.....	398
10.2.2.1 Statutory Personal Liability	398
10.2.2.2 Typical Insolvency Remedies	400
10.2.2.3 Piercing the Veil	400
10.3 FRAMEWORK FOR A DUTY TO CREDITORS	401
10.4 DEVELOPMENT OF A DUTY TO CREDITORS	406
10.5 CONCLUDING REMARKS.....	407

APPENDICES

Summary	411
Opsomming.....	413
Bibliography: Books and Theses	417
Bibliography: Law Journals.....	423
Bibliography: Bills and Reports.....	441
Table of Cases.....	445
Table of Statutes	457