UNIVERSITEIT VAN PRETORIA
UNIVERSITY OF PRETORIA
YUNIBESITHI YA PRETORIA

The marginalized stories of people who live in poverty: a pastoral narrative approach to community transformational development.

By

Semape Jacob Manyaka

Submitted in fulfillment for the degree

of

PHILOSOPHIAE DOCTOR

With specialization in the field

of

PASTORAL FAMILY THERAPY

In the

FACULTY OF THEOLOGY

DEPARTMENT OF PRACTICAL THEOLOGY

Of the

UNIVERSITY OF PRETORIA

UNDER SUPERVISION

Of

PROF. J C MULLER

August 2010

© University of Pretoria

Acknowledgements

I wish to thank the following people who have journeyed with me in the journey of completing this research project:

Prof. Muller whose patience and wisdom, gave me such great advice

My wife Catherine without her support, this journey would not be possible. Most of the time, I spent sleepless nights.

My Children, Tshegofatso, Tebogo, and Phenyo, you were the source of my inspiration.

Willow Manor Christian Center, the church where I work, thanks for allowing me to continue with this research process.

Sandra Duncan who helped me with the proofreading of my work

Amanda Richter who journeyed with me and she assisted me in a big way.

Above all, I would like to thank the almighty who gave me the strength to start and complete this assignment.

Dedication

I dedicate this PhD to my beautiful wife Catherine who was patient with me when I was spending sleepless nights during my study, also to my children, Tshegofatso. Tebogo, and Phenyo whom sometimes I did not spend enough quality time.

Declaration

I Semape Jacob Manyaka, declare that **The marginalized stories of people who live in poverty: a pastoral narrative approach to community transformational development** is my work. Every reference used has been properly acknowledged accordingly. The work has never been submitted for attainment of a degree in any faculty of the university.

Abstract

In this research process, my objectives were as follows; firstly, to explore the relationship between identity formation and poverty and secondly to explore the role of the church in combating the effects of poverty in the lives of those who live in poverty stricken communities. A Narrative approach was used to gather data from the community. I listened to the stories of those people who live in poverty. Seven movements were used as the methodology for this research (Muller 2005:81-86).

As a practical theologian, I positioned myself within postfoundationalist theology. In this position I avoided foundation epistemology which seeks the absolute truth as well as anti or nonfoundational epistemology which promotes relativism. As I mentioned earlier postfoundationalist practical theology is always thinking in a specific context and can also go beyond that specific context into interdisciplinary thinking.

Starting from a specific context into an interdisciplinary context, we found that the concept of poverty has been described as a discourse meaning that it went from poverty as a lack of resources into linguistic, poverty as lack of capabilities or poverty being political. By taking multidimension method to eradicate poverty one needs to apply a multidimensions approach. The stories from Nellmapius affirmed that poverty influences identity formation. The following effects were identified: low self-esteem, stress, depression, lack of self-acceptance and hopelessness.

The church has the capacity as the biggest membership and with the most awareness organization in most communities that has the attention of many people. The church is able to preach hope for people in what seems to be hopelessness and encourage the poor to rise out of their poverty. It can facilitate the poor and the government to work together to change their lives.

Key concepts

Postmodernism

Social constructionism

Postfoundationalism

Narrative approach

Poverty

Identity formation

Development

Transformation

Church

Co-researchers

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Chapter 1: Positioning **1**

1.1 Introduction 1

1.2 Motivation 2

1.3 Research gap 3

1.4 Research problem 5

1.4.1 What is identity? 5

1.4.2 Formation of identity 6

1.4.2.1 Marcia's identity status 7

1.4.2.2 Grotevant's process of Model of identity 8

1.4.2.3 Berzonky's identity styles 8

1.4.2.4 Identity formation as social construction 10

1.5 Biblical perspectives on identity formation 14

1.5.1 God's image and likeness in man 14

1.5.2 The fall of man 17

1.5.3 The nature of sin 18

1.5.4 The result of sin 19

1.5.5 Righteousness 19

1.6 Research objectives 21

1.7 Paradigmatic approach 22

1.7.1 Introduction 22

1.7.2 Paradigms shifting: moving between two worlds 22

1.7.2 Modernist's epistemology 22

1.7.2 Postmodernist's epistemology 23

1.7.3 Language 27

1.7.4 Discourse definition 28

1.7.5 Deconstruction 29

1.7.6 Transversal rationality 31

1.8. Social constructionism 33

1.9 Theological positioning 35

1.9.1 Theology 35

1.9.2 Post-modern theology 37

1.9.3 Postfoundationism: Beyond conflict and consonance 38

1.9.4 Practical theology 42

1.9.5 Exploring practical wisdom understanding 45

1.9.6 Postfoundationalist practical theology 45

1.10 Narrative theory, Recoeur and hermaneutics 46

1.10.1 Narrative research 48

1.11 Social constructionism and postfoundationalism 52

1.12 Ethical positioning 52

1.13 Research design 53

1.13.1 Specific context is defined 54

1.13.2 In-context experiences are listened and described 54

1.13.3 Interpretations of experiences are made, described, and developed in collaboration with co-researchers 54

1.13.4 A description of experiences as continually informed by traditions of interpretations 54

1.13.5 A reflection on religion and spirituality aspect, especially as it is understood and experienced in a specific situation 55

1.13.6 A description of experience, thickened through interdisciplinary investigation 55

1.13.7 The development of alternative interpretations that points beyond the local community 56

1.14 Profiles of my co-researchers 56

1.14.1 Miss JM 56

1.14.2 Mr. S. and Mrs. Z 56

1.14.3 Mr. T and Mrs. T 57

1.14.4 Mr. P 57

1.14.5 Mr. TN 57

1.14.6 Mr. JR 57

1.14.7 Mrs. J 57

1.15. Journey of my life story 58

1.15.1 Why share my life story? 58

1.16 The context of Nellmapius 59

1.16.1 Population 61

1.16.2 Economic aspect 61

1.16.3 Educational aspect 61

1.16.4 Health aspect 62

1.16.5 Early childhood development centers 62

1.16.6 Taverns 62

1.17 Outlines of Chapters 62

Chapter 2: Description of the problem 64

2.1 Introduction 64

2.2 Definition of poverty 66

2.2.1 Poor people's definition of poverty 66

2.2.2 Definition of poverty by non poor people 71

2.2.3 Poverty as a discourse 73

2.3 Global poverty 74

2.4 Poverty trap or structural poverty 75

2.5 Africa 78

2.6 South Africa 79

2.6.1 Apartheid 80

2.6.2 Legacy of apartheid 82

2.6.2.1 Exclusion of the poor from the riches of the land 83

2.6.3 The history of inequality in South Africa 84

2.6.4 Meta-theoretical perspective 85

2.6.5 Whiteness 87

2.7 African mind 89

2.7.1 Reflection on prelogicality and mysticality 90

2.8 Measurement of poverty 91

2.9 Describing poverty, biblical perspective 93

2.9.1 God cares for the poor 93

1.9.2 Early church 94

2.9.3 Causes of poverty-biblical perspective 94

2.9.4 Spiritual poverty 95

2.9.5 Psychological perspective 96

2.10 Globalization 97

2.11 Impact of poverty 98

2.11.1 Poverty and identity formation process 99

2.11.2 Poverty and limitations to opportunity structures 100

2.11.3 Poverty and stress 101

2.11.4 Stigma and poverty 103

2.11.5 How poverty affects identity process 104

2.12 Conclusion 106

Chapter 3: Community transformation **107**

3.1 Introduction 107

3.2 Transformation as an action 108

3.2.1 Defining the concept of transformation 108

3.2.2 Transformation on an individual level 110

3.2.3 Social transformation 112

3.2.4 Transformation as a story of action in the bible 114

3.3 Development 115

3.3.1 Defining the concept of development 115

3.3.2 Economic development 119

3.3.3 Post-development theory 120

3.3.4 What is the post-development? 120

3.4 Developing and empowering the community 121

3.4.1 Defining the concept empowerment 122

3.4.2 Four elements of empowerment 124

3.4.3 Empowerment through education 126

3.4.4 Researcher's reflection on empowerment 127

3.4.4.1 Increasing the capacity 127

3.4.4.2 Dignified decent life 128

3.4.4.3 Freedom of choice 128

3.4.4.4 Participation in the process of empowerment 128

3.4.4.5 Expansion of assets 129

3.4.4.6 Entrepreneurship spirit: mpofutsho wa phatla 129

3.4.4.7 Empowerment-the power of participation 130

3.5 Transformational development 132

3.5.1 Convergent stories 132

3.5.1.1 Biblical stories 132

3.5.1.2 Creation 133

3.5.1.3 The story of the fall 134

3.5.1.4 Exodus-liberation story 135

3.5.1.5 Story of Jesus 136

3.5.1.6 The mission of Jesus 137

3.5.1.7 Death of Jesus on the cross 137

3.5.1.8 The faith-based organization and social transformation 138

3.5.1.9 The Holy Spirit 140

3.5.1.10 Three important theological ideas 141

3.6 Community story 143

3.7 The story of development agent 144

3.8 The role of the spirituality in social transformation in South Africa 145

3.8.1 Spirituality-the spirit's way in social transformation 147

3.9 My own reflection 147

Chapter 4: Experiences are listened to and described 148

4.1. Introduction 148

4.2. How did I choose them? 148

4.3. How did I collect the data 148

4.3.1 The questions have asked the co-researchers are as follows 150

4. 4 Language used 151

4.1.1 Mr. P's story 151

4.1.2 Mr. P's understanding of poverty 151

4.1.3 Mr. P's identified causes of poverty in an African context 152

4.1.3.1 Bantu education as a cause of poverty 152

4.1.3.2 Mindset has impact on our lives 153

4.1.3.3 Laziness as a cause of poverty 153

4.1.3.4 Environment has impact on the lives of people 153

4.1.3.5 Researcher's thoughts on Mr. P's narratives 154

4.2 Mrs J's narratives 155

4.2.1 Mrs. J's view on causes of poverty 155

4.2.1.1 Environment as a cause of poverty 155

4.2.1.2 Poverty is a chain 156

4.2.1.3 Grants 156

4.2.1.4 HIV/AIDS 156

4.2.1.5 Education and the mother tongue 157

4.2.1.6 Impact of poverty 157

4.2.1.7 The church and the community transformation 157

4.2.1.8 God 158

4.2.1.9 Researcher's thoughts on Mrs. J's narrative 158

4.2.2.1 Church as a business 159

4.2.2.2 Grants 159

4.3 Miss JM's story 160

4.3.1 Miss JM's view on the causes of poverty 160

4.3.1.1 Unemployment grants will kill economy 160

4.3.1.2 Barents's role 161

4.3.1.3 Responsibility 161

4.3.1.4 Positive thinking 161

4.3.1.5 Environment 157

4.3.1.6 Researcher's thoughts on Miss JM's narrative 162

4.4 Mrs T's story as a co-researchers 162

4.4.1 Mrs T's view on causes of poverty 162

4.4.1.1 Reasons why people live in poverty 162

4.4.1.2 Poverty is not only materials 163

4.4.1.3 Over populated 163

4.4.1.4 Poor family 163

4.4.1.5 Education 164

4.4.1.6 Grants to 14yrs causes poverty 164

4.4.1.7 Drugs addiction are results of poverty 164

4.4.1.8 Crime is caused by being in poverty 165

4.4.1.9 Teenage pregnancy caused by being living in poverty 165

4.4.1.10 Things are very expensive 165

4.4.1.11 Poverty has level 165

4.4.1.12 It kills the family of a person 165

4.4.1.13 Poverty makes people to feel hopeless 166

4.4.1.14 Change is always possible 166

4.4.1.15 Spirituality and God's presence 166

4.4.1.16 Researcher's thoughts on Mrs. T 's narrative 167

4.5 Mr. JR's view on poverty 167

4.5.1 Describing poverty 167

4.5.2 Mr. JR's view on causes of poverty 167

4.5.3 Some of the impacts of poverty 169

4.5.4 How to eradicate poverty 169

4.5.5 Mr. JR's experience of God presence 170

4.5.6 Researcher's thoughts on Mr. JR's narratives 171

4.6 Mr. T's story 172

4.6.1 Unemployment causes poverty 172

4.6.2 Poverty causes stress and depression 172

4.6.3 Budgeting system 172

4.6.4 Peer group pressure forced to live wrongly 173

4.6.5 People who live in poverty need a lot of motivation 173

4.6.6 Effective education must be given in mother tongue 173

4.6.7 People feel that prayer is useless 173

4.6.8 Poverty comes from God 173

4.7 Mr. TN's story 173

4.7.1 Mr. TN's view on poverty 174

4.7.1.1 Parents's divorce affects children negatively 174

4.7.1.2 Lack of willingness 175

4.7.1.3 Curse upon Africans 175

4.7.1.4 To continue in poverty is a choice 175

4.7.1.5 Willingness to go to school 175

4.7.1.6 Making right decisions 176

4.7.1.7 Most Africans (blacks) lack initiatives 176

4.7.1.8 Stop blaming apartheid 176

4.7.1.9 Researcher's thoughts on Mr. TN's narrative 176

4.8 Mr. S's story 177

4.8.1 Describing poverty 177

4.8.1.1 Spiritual needs 177

4.8.1.2 Physical needs 177

4.8.1.3 Emotional needs 177

4.8.1.4 Social needs 177

4.8.2 Causes of poverty 178

4.8.3 Impact of poverty 179

4.8.4 Spiritual 180

4.8.5 Eradication of poverty 181

4.8.6 Researcher's thoughts on Mr. S' narratives 182

4.9 Mrs. Z's story 182

4.9.1 Mrs. Z's view on causes of poverty 182

4.9.1.1 Mindset can cause and also can make us succeed 183

4.9.1.2 Laziness as a cause of poverty 183

4.9.1.3 The root of poverty is spiritual 178

4.10 Researcher's view on poverty 178

4.10.1 In Childhood 183

4.10.2 As a man, husband, and father 184

4.10.3 As a Christian and pastor 184

4.11 The themes identifies in the context and conversing with literature and other disciplines 185

4.11.1 Bantu Education Act as a cause of poverty 185

4.11.1.1 Personal responsibility 186

4.11 2 Poverty is not only materials 187

4.11.3 New perspective on social grants for the needy 188

4.11.4 Environment as a cause of poverty 189

4.11.5 The church as a vehicle for community transformation 190

4.12 Conclusion 190

Chapter 5: Description of experiences, thicken through interdisciplinary Investigation 192

5.1 Introduction 192

5.2 Postfoundationalist or interdisciplinary 193

5.3 Interdisciplinary conversation 194

5.4 Mr. Lekola's view (Education) 195

5.4.1 When reading the stories of co-researchers what do you think their concerns be ? 195

5.4.2 Mr. Lekola: How would you for formulates your discipline's unique perspective on these concerns and why is it important that this perspective be heard at the interdisciplinary table? 196

5.4.3 Mr. Lekola: Why do you think your perspective will be understood and appreciated by researchers from other disciplines? 196

5.5. Pastor A. Spaumer's view (Church) 197

5.5.1 Pastor A. Spaumer: When reading the story of co-researchers what do you think would be their concerns be? 197

5.5.2 Pastor A. Spaumer: How would you formulate your unique discipline's perspective on these concerns and why is it important that this perspective be heard at the interdisciplinary table? 198

5.5.3 Pastor A. Spaumer: Why do you think your perspective will be understood and appreciated by researchers from other disciplines? 199

5.6 Ms Freeman's view (Social work) 199

5.6.1 Ms Freeman: When reading the story of co-researchers, what do you think would their concerns be? 199

5.6.2 Ms Freeman: How would you formulate your discipline's unique perspective on these concerns and why is it important that this perspective be heard at the interdisciplinary table? 200

5.6.3 Ms Freeman: Why do you think your perspective will be understood and appreciated by researchers from other disciplines? 201

5.7 Ms Magakwe's view(Nursing)

5.7.1 Ms Magakwe: When reading the story of co-researchers, what do you think would their concerns be? 201

5.7.2 Ms Magakwe: How would you formulate your unique's discipline perspective on these concerns and why is it important that this perspective be heard at the interdisciplinary table? 202

5.7.3 Ms Magakwe: Why do you think your perspective will be understood and appreciated by researchers from other discipline? 203

5. 8 Researcher's reflection on interdisciplinary 203

5. 9 Reflection on God's presence 204

Chapter 6: Alternative interpretation pointing beyond the local context 206

6.1 Introduction 206

6.2 Postfoundationalism or interdisciplinary 207

6.3 Voices involve in creating the new story 208

6.4 An alternative story 208

6.4.1 Poverty 209

6.5. Suggested outcomes for community transformation that can be taken beyond specific 210

6.5.1 Development 210

6.5.2 Empowerment 211

6.5.2.1 Empowering the individuals 212

6.5.3 Transformation 213

6.5.4 Poverty and stress 214

6.5.5 Stigma and poverty 214

2.5.6 Sustainable community transformation 214

2.6.6.1 Ownership of the poverty alleviation projects 215

6.5.7 Self help 216

6.5.8 The church and the community transformation 216

6.5 Community transformation strategy 218

6.8 Equipping the poor people with skills for community transformation 220

6.9 Poverty has a negative impact on identity formation 221

1.10 Future research 222

Chapter 7: Reflection 223

7.1 Introduction 223

7.2 How did feel before research project 223

7.3 How did I feel during the research project 223

7.4 How did I feel after the research project 224

7.5 Positioning 224

7.6 Narrative approach 225

7.7 Excitement of the new story 226

7.8 Identity formation and poverty 226

7.9 Empowerment 227

7.10 Conclusion 227

Bibliography 229