

**Spatial and social exclusion:  
Travel and transport needs of rural women in  
Limpopo, South Africa**

by

SABINA MAMMELANE MAHAPA

Submitted in fulfillment of the requirements for the degree of Doctor Philosophiae  
in the Department of Geography, Geoinformatics and Meteorology  
Faculty of Humanities, University of Pretoria

Promoters: Prof U.J. Fairhurst  
Dr M. de Waal

**October 2003**

## CONTENTS

---

LIST OF TABLES	vii
LIST OF FIGURES	viii
ACRONYMS AND ABBREVIATIONS	x
SUMMARY	xi
OPSOMMING	xiv
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS	xvii

### Chapter 1

<b>BACKGROUND</b>	<b>1</b>
1.1 Introduction	1
1.2 Statement of the problem	3
1.3 The rationale	3
1.3.1. <i>Macro-policy environment</i>	3
1.3.2. <i>Gender equality</i>	5
1.3.3. <i>Economic need and social efficiency</i>	7
1.3.4. <i>Welfare need</i>	7
1.3.5. <i>Demographic need</i>	8
1.3.6. <i>Efficiency and sustainability</i>	8
1.3.7. <i>Welfare need</i>	8
1.4 The research questions	9
1.5 Aim of the study	9
1.6 Overview of methodology	10
1.7 The study area	11
1.8 Transport needs	11
1.9 Structure of the thesis	13
1.10 Conclusion	14

### Chapter 2

<b>LITERATURE REVIEW: GENDER AND TRANSPORT</b>	<b>15</b>
2.1 Introduction	15

2.2	The rural infrastructure debate .....	15
2.3	Rural development.....	16
2.4	The need to grasp local realities.....	17
2.5	Transport for the low-income group (IMTs).....	18
2.6	Emerging issues from the debates .....	19
2.7	Gender and transport.....	20
2.8	The gender dimensions of social and spatial exclusion.....	24
	2.8.1. <i>Marginality and integration</i> .....	25
	2.8.2. <i>Dualism and social relation</i> .....	27
	2.8.3. <i>Actors, agency and subjectivity</i> .....	27
2.9	Gender-based exclusion .....	29
	2.9.1. <i>Division of labour</i> .....	30
	2.9.2. <i>Power relations</i> .....	30
	2.9.3. <i>Patriarchy</i> .....	31
2.10	Gendered access to resources.....	32
2.11	Conclusion .....	33

## Chapter 3

### GENDER AND RURAL TRANSPORT SITUATION

#### IN SOUTH AFRICA POST 1994..... 36

3.1	Introduction .....	36
3.2	Gender and transport.....	36
3.3	Rural transport policy review .....	40
	3.3.1. <i>National Transport Policy Forum (NTPF)</i> .....	40
	3.3.2. <i>Rural Development Programme (RDP)</i> .....	41
	3.3.3. <i>Rural Development Strategy (RDS)</i> .....	43
	3.3.4. <i>Growth, Employment and Redistribution (GEAR)</i> .....	43
	3.3.5. <i>Transport policy review</i> .....	45
	3.3.6. <i>Moving South Africa (SA) and Gender</i> .....	48
	3.3.7. <i>National Rural Transport Strategy</i> .....	50
3.4	Integrated Sustainable Rural Development Strategy (ISRDS) .....	51
3.5	The Gender Policy Framework .....	52
3.6	Evaluation of the new rural transport environment .....	52
3.7	Concluding remarks.....	53

## Chapter 4

<b>METHODOLOGY .....</b>	<b>54</b>
4.1 Introduction .....	54
4.2 Quantitative and qualitative methodologies .....	54
4.3 Feminist methodology.....	57
4.4 Research methods.....	59
4.4.1. <i>Focus group interviews</i>	60
4.4.2. <i>Observation methods</i>	64
4.4.3. <i>Documentary data</i>	66
4.4.5. <i>Photographs</i>	68
4.5 Data analysis .....	68
4.5.1. <i>Developing a system to organise data</i>	68
4.5.2. <i>Segmenting data</i>	69
4.5.3. <i>Making the necessary connections</i>	69
4.6 Verification .....	69
4.7 Validity and reliability .....	74
4.7.1. <i>Detailed description</i>	74
4.7.2. <i>Triangulation</i>	74
4.7.3. <i>Feedback</i>	74
4.7.4. <i>Member checking</i>	75
4.7.5. <i>Comparison</i>	75
4.8 Ethical issues.....	75
4.9 Summary .....	76

## Chapter 5

<b>FINDINGS.....</b>	<b>77</b>
5.1 Introduction .....	79
5.2 Rural of women in rural development .....	79
5.2.1. <i>Productive roles</i>	77
5.2.2. <i>Reproductive roles</i>	77
5.2.3. <i>Community roles</i>	78
5.2.4. <i>Men's roles</i>	79
5.3 Transport needs.....	80
5.3.1. <i>Subsistence needs</i>	80
5.3.2. <i>Travel and transport for economic needs</i>	88
5.3.3. <i>Transport for social needs</i>	91
5.3.4. <i>Transport for the development of human capital</i>	91

5.4	Rural women's transport constraints.....	99
	5.4.1. <i>Self-employed and unemployed rural women</i>	96
	5.4.2. <i>Rural women transport entrepreneurs</i>	98
5.5	Other observations .....	98
5.6	Impact of transport on rural women .....	100
5.7	Summary .....	101
5.8	Conclusion .....	103

## Chapter 6

### THE DISEMPOWERMENT OF RURAL WOMEN:

### ODDS TOO GREAT TO OVERCOME..... 104

6.1	Introduction .....	104
6.2	The gap between policy and rural women's experiences .....	104
	6.2.1. <i>Rural women's roles</i>	106
	6.2.2. <i>Time schedule</i>	107
	6.2.3. <i>Division of labour</i>	108
	6.2.4. <i>Accessibility to resources and services</i>	108
6.3	Different impacts on rural women .....	116
	6.3.1. <i>Heavy work schedule</i>	112
	6.3.2. <i>Lack of transport</i>	113
6.4	The needs of rural women .....	114
6.5	Why a pro-active approach? .....	117
	6.5.1. <i>Cross-sectoral thinking</i>	118
	6.5.2. <i>Equal weight in infrastructure</i>	120
	6.5.3. <i>Appropriate modes of transport</i>	121
	6.5.4. <i>Spatial planning</i>	122
	6.5.5. <i>Mainstreaming gender and transport</i>	124
	6.5.6. <i>Mainstreaming livelihood issues</i>	125
6.6	Summary .....	125
6.7	Concluding remarks .....	127

## Chapter 7

### CONCLUSION AND RECOMMENDATIONS..... 128

7.1	Introduction .....	128
-----	--------------------	-----

7.2	Approach of the study .....	129
7.3	Literature and methodology .....	130
7.4	Emerging themes .....	131
7.5	Other emerging themes .....	136
	7.5.1. <i>Generalisation of needs</i>	136
	7.5.2. <i>Economic and social inefficiency</i>	136
	7.5.3. <i>Social sustainability</i>	136
7.6	Recommendations for rural transport policy and planning.....	137
	7.6.1. <i>Equity or efficiency</i>	137
	7.6.2. <i>Sector strategy</i>	138
	7.6.3. <i>Broadening of the rural transport problem</i>	138
	7.6.4. <i>Acknowledge appropriate rural transport interventions</i>	139
	7.6.5. <i>Challenges for planners and policy makers</i>	139
7.7	Recommendations for further research .....	141
	7.7.1. <i>Mainstreaming gender issues</i>	141
	7.7.2. <i>Gender monitoring and evaluation</i>	141
	7.7.3. <i>Setting targets</i>	142
	7.7.4. <i>Gender sensitive interventions</i>	142
	7.7.5. <i>Empowerment</i>	143
	7.7.6. <i>Implications for further research</i>	144
7.8	Concluding statements .....	145

## **REFERENCES ..... 147**

### **ANNEXURE 1**

1(a)	<b>BABANANA FOCUS GROUP .....</b>	<b>161</b>
1(b)	<b>MAMOLEKA FOCUS GROUP .....</b>	<b>171</b>
1(c)	<b>THE TSHITWI GROUP IN VENDA .....</b>	<b>179</b>

### **ANNEXURE 2 THEMES AND CATEGORIES**

2(a)	<b>RURAL WOMEN'S ROLES .....</b>	<b>187</b>
2(b)	<b>RURAL WOMEN'S USE OF TRANSPORT .....</b>	<b>188</b>
2(c)	<b>TRANSPORT CONSTRAINTS AND THE IMPACT .....</b>	<b>189</b>
2(d)	<b>OPPORTUNITIES DENIED .....</b>	<b>191</b>
2(e)	<b>RURAL WOMEN'S TRAVEL AND TRANSPORT NEEDS .....</b>	<b>192</b>
2(f)	<b>AN INTEGRATED APPROACH .....</b>	<b>193</b>

### **ANNEXURE 3 LETTER OF CONSENT**

3(a)	<b>BALOI TRIBAL AUTHORITY.....</b>	<b>194</b>
3(b)	<b>PARTICIPANTS.....</b>	<b>195</b>

## LIST OF TABLES

---

TABLE 4.1	Preliminary definitions of categories	72
TABLE 5.1	Rural women's practical needs	95
TABLE 5.2	Strategic needs of rural women	95
TABLE 5.3	Rural women's travel constraints	96

## LIST OF FIGURES

---

FIG. 1.1	Orientation of Tshitwi, Babanana and Mamoleka in Limpopo, South Africa	12
FIG. 5.1	(a) Women and children waiting at the water tap	81
	(b) A girl at Babana pushing a wheelbarrow to fetch water	81
	(c) A girl transporting water using a wheelbarrow at Babanana	81
	(d) Children pushing wheelbarrows to fetch water at Babanana	81
FIG. 5.2	(a) Women and girl children washing clothes near the water tap in Babanana	82
	(b) Women and children washing clothes at a stream in Mamoleka	82
	(c) Women and children washing clothes and fetching water in Babanana	82
FIG. 5.3	Children at Mamoleka collecting water at a temporary pond	84
FIG. 5.4	(a) Girls carrying wood at Mamoleka	86
	(b) A woman transporting wood at Mamoleka	86
	(c) Women transporting wood at Mamoleka	86
	(d) Heaps of wood at Babanana	87
	(e) Heaps of wood at Mamoleka	87
FIG. 5.5	(a) Women at Babina-Chuene Project watering the plants	89
	(b) Women at Babina-Chuene Project picking some vegetables	89
	(c) A woman picking vegetables at Babina-Chuene Project	89
	(d) Rural woman using a donkey-cart as means of transport in Mamoleka	89
FIG. 5.6	(a) Rural woman selling at the local market in Babanana	90
	(b) Rural women at the local market in Tshitwi	90



FIG. 5.7	Men doing elementary technical work in the Road Upgrading Project in Tshitwi	97
FIG. 5.8	Transport needs framework	102
FIG. 6.1	The sustainable rural livelihood framework (adapted from Carney, 1998:6)	110
FIG. 6.2	Heavy work schedule cycle	112
FIG. 6.3	Transport disadvantage cycle	113
FIG. 6.4	Stages for improving livelihoods of the rural unemployed	115
FIG. 6.5	An Integrated Approach in Transport Planning	119
FIG. 7.1	Themes explored	132

## ACRONYMS AND ABBREVIATIONS

---

SANRAL	South African National Roads Agency Limited
NDOT	National Department of Transport
PWCB	Public Works Community Base Organisation
IDP	Integrated Development Plans
CSIR	Council for Scientific and Industrial Research
NGO	Non-government Organization
PRSP	Poverty Reduction Strategy Paper
RSA	Republic of South Africa
TOR	Terms of Reference
CBO	Community Based Organisation
ILO	International Labour Organization
IFRTD	International Forum for Rural Transport and Development
IMTs	Intermediate Means of Transport
WB	World Bank
HIV/AIDS	Human Immunodeficiency Virus/Acquired Immune Deficiency Syndrome
RDP	Reconstruction and Development Programme
SRLA	Sustainable Rural Livelihood Approach
SLA	Sustainable Livelihood Approach
NMTs	Non-motorized Transport
IRTT	International Rural Travel and Transport
ANC	African National Congress
UNDP	United Nations Development Programme
NTPF	National Transport Policy Forum
SANCO	South African National Civic Organization
COSATU	Congress of South African Trade Unions
PAC	Pan-Africanist Congress
SABTA	South African Black Taxi Association
MSA	Moving South Africa
DOT	Department of Transport
CEDPA	Centre for Development and Population Activities
NRTS	National Rural Transport Strategy
NGPF	National Gender Policy Framework
IILS	International Institute of Labour Studies
SSATP	Sub-Saharan Africa Transport Policy Programme
NEPAD	New Partnership for Africa's Development
AU	African Union
DBSA	Development Bank Southern Africa
DFID	Department for International Development
IT	Intermediate Technology
ISRDS	Integrated Sustainable Rural Development Strategy
UNICEF	United Nations Children's Fund
RTTP	Rural Travel and Transport Programme
ITDG	International Technology Development Group
GMS	Gender Management System
GRTT	Gender and Rural Transport Initiative
SADC	Southern African Development Community



rural transport, but also would have constituted a disservice to efforts to generate an informed basis for rural women's emancipation.

Just as feminist research often draws on multiple disciplines, this study too draws on several: human geography, sociology and feminist methodology, in particular. Moreover, the use of multiple methods in this project, rather than a single method, was chosen not only because of its feminist concerns but also because of a commitment to thoroughness and the need to be responsive to the rural women studied. To this end, multiple research methods, such as participant observation, focus group discussions, document and photograph analysis, and photographs were used.

These methods made it possible to provide some insights into the roles of rural women and to their related travel and transport needs in the three villages studied in Limpopo: Mamoleka, Tshitwi and Babanana. The question of whether transport empowers or is disempowering rural women was addressed.

Three main themes emerged in this study. These themes suggest that rural women use the transport system in order to satisfy their multiple roles. Transport practitioners, however, provide transport facilities and services that are often characterised by constraints that create problems for these women and hence impact on their opportunities. Consequently, unresolved problems lead to opportunities denied. Therefore, policy makers should generate new strategies to address African rural women's transport needs.

One thing immediately apparent in reviewing the findings of this research is that gender biases in rural transport stem from the multiple roles that rural women perform in society and at home. Because the total workload of a rural household is rarely shared equally among its members, the burden of transport falls on women. Inadequate and inappropriate transport increases the amount of time necessary to perform their multiple roles, leaving rural women perform with little or no spare time to develop themselves by participating in socio-economic and political activities.

The burden of transport not only deprives rural women of participation in development activities, it also makes them lose out on opportunities to earn higher incomes and to improve their financial resources. Finally, because they already have limited financial resources and opportunities, they are unable to invest in personal means of transport, through which they might reduce their transport burden and improve their incomes.

A close linking of gender perspective and rural transport policy is proposed in order to improve rural transport systems and initiatives and to make them more gender-responsive and sustainable. Making rural transport policy more responsive to the needs of rural women requires developing a structural approach to understand their needs, identifying instruments to address those needs, and establishing an appropriate policy framework. To this end, this thesis identifies some approaches that would help in developing a gender-responsive rural transport policy through paying attention to rural women's travel and transport needs. These approaches include recognition of the need for an integrated rural transport policy, in which both transport and non-transport interventions applicable to addressing rural transport problems for self-employed and unemployed rural women, as found in Limpopo, are promoted. Furthermore, the need for awareness of rural women's multiple roles is outlined. What remains is the need for development of a comprehensive, gender-sensitive strategy in all fields of rural transport research, policy and projects to help explore ways of correcting existing biases in rural travel and transport for rural women.

**Key Terms:** *rural transport, practical needs, strategic needs, reproductive role, productive role, social role, social exclusion, spatial exclusion, patriarchy, gender mainstreaming.*

## OPSOMMING

---

**Titel van Tesis:** Ruimtelike en sosiale uitsluiting: Reis en vervoerbehoefte van plattelandse vroue in Limpopo, Suid-Afrika.

deur

**Sabina Mammelane Mahapa**

**Studieleiers:** Prof U.J. Fairhurst  
Dr M. de Waal

**Departement:** Geografie, Geoinformatika en Meteorologie

**Graad:** DPhil

Vele navorsingsbydraes is reeds gelewer rakende die vervoeraktiwiteite van plattelandse huishoudings. Pogings om die reis en vervoerbehoefte van plattelandse vroue aan te spreek, was egter minder suksesvol. Die persepsie dat plattelandse vroue die mindere sosio-ekonomiese lede van die gemeenskap verteenwoordig, impliseer dat hulle rol as produktiewe bydraers nie noodwendig gereflekteer word in sektorale strategieë nie. Indien in aanmerking geneem word hoe vervoerbehoefte tans die behoeftes van plattelandse vroue aanspreek, is dit 'n belangrike faktor in die beplanning van 'n sosiale en ekonomiese vatbare plattelandse vervoerbehoefte.

Die hoofrede vooropgestel deur hierdie navorsing, is die verwagtinge wat geskep is deur die demokratiese verkiesing wat gedurende 1994 in Suid-Afrika plaasgevind het. Na die verkiesing het vele persone, spesifiek inwoners in plattelandse gebiede, hoër verwagtinge in dienslewering gekoester. Desnieteenstaande, tien jaar later, het plattelandse Swart vroue nog steeds te kampe met onoorkomlike uitdagings ten opsigte van toeganklikheid tot basiese dienste. Die hoof argument vooropgestel deur hierdie navorsing, is dat plattelandse vervoerbehoefte en beplanning in Suid Afrika, soos ook elders, gefaal het om spesifieke geslagsverwante uitdagings aan te spreek.

Aangesien studies van hierdie aard kompleks is en onderliggende probleme nie noodwendig vanuit 'n eksterne hoek geïnterpreteer kan word nie, is dit belangrik dat die studie vanuit 'n interne gesigspunt benader word. Die navorsing opsigself is dus nie benader as 'n blote abstrakte kennis-soekende proses nie, maar daarop gerig om 'n omvattende begrip van die

vervoerprobleme van plattelandse vroue te verkry. Voortspruitend hieruit, is 'n kwalitatiewe vroulik-gebaseerde benadering aanvaar, onderlê deur 'n geslagsgerigte perspektief ten opsigte van vervoerprobleme van plattelandse vroue. Deur 'n nie-geslags perspektief van patrone en prosesse gerig op plattelandse toestande na te volg, sal nie alleenlik 'n onvolledige begrip van plattelandse vervoer daarstel nie, maar ook 'n ondiens impliseer in 'n poging om 'n ingeligte basis ten opsigte van die emansipasie van plattelandse vroue te genereer.

Net soos vroulik-gebaseerde navorsing dikwels berus op 'n veelheid van dissiplines, word hierdie studie ook multi-dissiplinêr onderlê: spesifiek menslike geografie, sosiologie en vroulik-gebaseerde metodologieë. Inteendeel, deur gebruik te maak van 'n gekose multi-dissiplinêre navorsingsbenadering, as eerder 'n enkelvoudige fokusgerigte benadering, rig die studie spesifiek op vroulik-gebaseerde belange, 'n verbintenis tot deurdagtheid en 'n ontvanklikheid ten opsigte van die studie van plattelandse vroue. Vir sodanige doelbereiking, is van 'n veelheid van navorsingstegnieke gebruik gemaak, onder andere: deelnemende waarnemingstegnieke, fokusgroep besprekings, dokumentontleding en fotografiese analiese.

Genoemde navorsingstegnieke het dit moontlik gemaak om 'n studie-insig te verkry in die rol van plattelandse vroue en hul verbandhoudende reis en vervoerbehoefte binne drie plattelandse gemeenskappe in Limpopo, naamlik Mamoleka, Tshitwi and Babanana. Die vraag of vervoer plattelandse vroue bemagtig of nie, is dienoreenkomstig aangespreek.

Voortspruitend uit die studie, is drie hoof temas geïdentifiseer. Die temas suggereer dat plattelandse vroue gebruik maak van 'n vervoerstelsel om sodoende hulle multi-dimensionele sosiale rolle te volvoer. Vervoerorganisasies daarteen, voorsien vervoerfasiliteite en dienste wat gekenmerk word deur beperkinge wat dikwels aktiwiteits- en geslagsgevoelig is en noodwendig impak op geleenthede wat plattelandse vroue gebied word. Gevolglik lei onoorkomlike vervoerprobleme tot geleenthede ontnem. Derhalwe, beleidsmakers moet nuwe strategieë daarstel om soedoende voorsiening te maak vir die vervoerprobleme van Swart plattelandse vroue.

'n Aspek wat onmiddellik na vore tree in 'n oorsig van die navorsingsbevinding, is dat geslags-onewewigtigheid in plattelandse vervoer voortspruit uit die veelvuldige rolle wat vroue volvoer binne die gemeenskap en tuis. Aangesien die totale werkslading binne plattelandse huishoudings oneweredig verdeel is tussen gesinslede, val die las van vervoer op vroue. Onvoldoende en onvanpaste vervoer verhoog ook tydsbesteding nodig om veeldoelige take af te handel. Derhalwe, word plattelandse vroue feitlik geen tyd gelaat vir self-ontwikkeling en deelneming aan sosio-ekonomiese en politieke aktiwiteite.

Die vervoerlas wat op plattelandse vroue geplaas word, ontnem hulle nie alleenlik van deelneming aan ontwikkelingsaktiwiteite nie, maar hulle word ook die geleentheid ontnem om 'n hoër inkomste te verdien en sodoende hulle finansiële omstandighede te verbeter. Aangesien plattelandse vroue reeds beperkte finansiële bronne en geleenthede tot hulle beskikking het, is dit ook nie moontlik om in 'n eie wyse van vervoer te investeer deur middle waarvan hulle moontlik die vervoerlas kan verlig en 'n hoër inkomste kan genereer.

'n Nouer verband tussen geslagsgerigte perspektiewe en plattelandse vervoerbeleid word voorgestel om plattelandse inisiatiewe rakende vervoerstelsels te verbeter en dit sodoende meer geslagsgevoelig end onderhoudbaar te maak. Om plattelandse vervoerbeleid meer toeganklik vir plattelandse vroue te maak, impliseer 'n veranderde struktuur benadering vir beter begrip van hulle behoeftes, die identifisering van instrumente om dit aan te spreek en die daarstelling van 'n toepaslike beleidsraamwerk. Vir bereiking van sodanige doel, word enkele moontlikhede deur die tesis geïdentifiseer wat moontlik as basis kan dien in die ontwikkeling van 'n geslagsgevoelige benadering tot 'n plattelandse vervoerbeleid, wat spesifiek fokus op plattelandse vroue se reis en vervoerbehoefte. Genoemde benaderings bevestig die noodsaaklikheid van 'n geïntegreerde plattelandse vervoerbeleid, waar beide vervoer en nie-vervoer verwante aspekte, gerig op eie-indiensnemende en werklose plattelandse vroue soos bevind in Limpopo, bevorder word. Derhalwe, moet spesifiek kennis geneem word van die meerdoelige gemeenskapsrol van plattelandse vroue soos omskryf. Ten slotte word voorgestel dat 'n omvattende geslag-sensitiewe strategie, wat die volle spektrum van plattelandse vervoernavorsing insluit, beleid en projekte daargestel word om sodoende die bestaande wanbalans ten opsigte van plattelandse reis en vervoerbehoefte van plattelandse vroue, reg te stel.

**Sleuteltermes:** *plattelandse vervoer, praktiese behoeftes, strategiese behoeftes, reprodktiewe rol, produktiewe rol, sosiale rol, sosiale uitsluiting, ruimtelike uitsluiting, patriargale, geslagshoofstroming.*



## ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

---

I would like to express my sincere gratitude and appreciation to the creator for his guidance and the ability and perseverance granted to me to completing my studies

- My supervisors, Prof Joan Fairhurst and Dr Maretha de Waal, for their guidance, patience and encouragement throughout the study and for the invaluable research experience during the past few years
- Gerda Ehlers for her never-ending patience and help with the literature material from the library
- SANPAD for giving me the opportunity to participate in their research workshops, making me the person that I am today in terms of research experience
- Colleagues at UNIN, Dr G.H. Tengbeh, Sandy Burger, and L.T. Mabasa
- My friend Mrs M. J.J. Thupana and Dr Donna Wyckoff-Wheeler for editing this thesis
- Ingrid Booysen, for the final technical and graphical editing of the thesis
- My husband and children, Kwete and Mosima, and my late beloved son, Petlo, for understanding and bearing with me for so long, especially during the difficult times experienced in the compilation of this thesis.

Thank you  
Sabina

October 2003