



THE LIFE EXPERIENCES AND UNDERSTANDINGS
OF CHILDREN AS CITIZENS IN A DEMOCRATIC
SOUTH AFRICA

by

Ina Joubert (J C)

August 2007

S.A.
People



Faculty of Education

University of Pretoria

THE LIFE EXPERIENCES AND UNDERSTANDINGS OF CHILDREN AS CITIZENS IN A DEMOCRATIC SOUTH AFRICA

by

Ina Joubert (J C)

Submitted in partial fulfilment of the requirements for the degree

PHILOSOPHIAE DOCTOR

in

LEARNING SUPPORT, GUIDANCE AND COUNSELLING

Department of Educational Psychology

University of Pretoria

SOUTH AFRICA

Supervisor: Professor Liesel Ebersöhn

Co-supervisor: Professor Irma Eloff

2007



UNIVERSITEIT VAN PRETORIA
UNIVERSITY OF PRETORIA
YUNIBESITHI YA PRETORIA

DEDICATION

For my own children and for the children of South Africa.

Different faces

Many races

Different people

Many places

The past behind us

The future and freedom in front of us

For children of Africa

We stand together

In these troubled times

We stand together

We come from one land but we are so different

Yet, we stand together.

Stephen-John Martin (in Smuts, 2001:15)

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

This research was a challenging and demanding journey, but I did not travel it alone; I was supported along the way by God, people and support systems. I wish to express my sincere appreciation and gratitude to:

The nine-year-old learners who participated enthusiastically in sharing their experiences, and provided data that formed the basis and thrust of this research. The principal of the school and teachers of the Foundation Phase, especially the Head of Department – Foundation Phase, who gave their support and cooperation.

Liesel Ebersöhn and Irma Eloff who supervised this work by providing academic input, intellectual stimulus and technical guidance, each in their own unique way. Their scholarly leadership assisted me at times when I felt confused by the excess of information and data and did not recognize emerging insights.

Jonathan Jansen, Theo Möller and Marilise Lombard who acted as critical readers and gave thought-provoking criticism. Rinelle Evans who gave initial direction through stimulating questions.

Annalie Botha who acted as research assistant and took time to engage with my research endeavours and uncertainties and provided meaningful contributions. She also shared my excitement during the data collection phase when the participating children inspired with their passion for life. Retha van Wyk and Jaco Joubert assisted with the drama technique and gave a special dimension of youthful energy and unique approach to the research. Karin Scrooby assisted with information searches.

Elsabé Olivier who acted as information specialist and who offered her professional expertise.

The University of Pretoria for financial support in the form of a bursary.

Susan Fourie who assisted with the transcriptions, Hester van der Walt for her meticulous editing and Johan Slabbert for assistance in compiling the compact disc.

My husband Jaco who assisted by photographing data for the compact disc, my children Kristien and husband Rooies, Louise and husband Louis, Jaco (jr) and Barry for their encouragement, patience and support. My family, friends and colleagues for their prayers, motivation and interest.

Soli Deo Gloria!

TABLE OF CONTENTS

DEDICATION	iii
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS	iv
DECLARATION OF AUTHORSHIP AND COPYRIGHT WAIVER	ix
ABSTRACT	x
CHAPTER 1. Overview: Children, citizenship and citizenship education in the global and South African context	1
1.1 Introduction	1
1.2 Rationale	2
1.3 Contextualising this study	9
1.3.1 Historicity of citizenship education	9
1.3.2 South Africa and citizenship education	12
1.4 Explanation of core concepts	19
1.4.1 The life experiences and understandings of children.....	19
1.4.2 Children as citizens	19
1.4.3 Democratic South Africa	20
1.5 Unit of analysis	21
1.6 Research design and methodology	23
1.6.1 Data collection methods and instruments	26
1.6.2 Data analysis	28
1.7 Anticipated research constraints	29
1.8 Outline and organization of the inquiry	31
CHAPTER 2. Literature review: Young children, citizenship and citizenship education	33
2.1 Introduction	33
2.2 Young children, citizenship and citizenship education	34
2.2.1 Studies on citizenship in the global context.....	35
2.2.2 Studies on citizenship in the local context.....	41
2.3 The conceptual framework: A tool for explanation and justification	44
2.3.1 Citizenship	45
2.3.2 Citizenship and democracy	50
2.3.3 Citizenship education.....	51

2.3.4	Citizenship education and globalization	57
2.3.5	Theories promoted by Dewey and Waghid related to citizenship education.....	58
2.3.6	Theories related to the young child and citizenship education	65
2.4	Concluding remarks	67
CHAPTER 3. Research design and methodology: Participatory into data gathering		69
3.1	Introduction	69
3.2	Paradigmatic considerations	69
3.2.1	Qualitative paradigm.....	69
3.2.2	Interpretative paradigm	70
3.2.3	Participatory principles in methodology	71
3.3	Research design	73
3.4	Participants and research site	73
3.5	Research process	74
3.5.1	Informal data collection strategies	74
3.5.2	Formal data collection strategies.....	76
3.5.3	Personal role in research process	77
3.5.4	Data collection methods and instruments	79
3.5	Data analysis	92
3.6	Strategies for enhancing the validity of this study	93
3.7	Conclusion	97
CHAPTER 4. Data analysis: Voices of the participating children as citizens in democratic South Africa		98
4.1	Introduction	98
4.2	Explanation of data analysis process	100
4.3	Results of the theme analysis	102
4.3.1	Theme 1: Learners' identification of themselves as child citizens	103
4.3.2	Theme 2: Learners living as child citizens in the local community.....	116
4.3.3	Theme 3: Learners living as child citizens in the democratic dispensation of South Africa	127
4.3.4	Theme 4: Learners' desire for change in securing their future.....	141
4.4	Concluding remarks on main findings	148

CHAPTER 5. Significance and implications of the inquiry: Enhanced understandings of the voices of the participating children	150
5.1 Introduction	150
5.2 Implications of the findings for the inquiry	151
5.2.1 Democratic identity	152
5.2.2 Understandings of citizenship	157
5.2.3 The future citizen of South Africa	164
5.2.4 Extending generally held current conceptions of citizenship education	166
5.3 Conclusion	168
CHAPTER 6. Synthesis of the inquiry: Children's voices enlightening further understandings of citizenship and citizenship education	170
6.1 Introduction	170
6.2 Synoptic overview of the inquiry	170
6.3 Contribution of the inquiry	175
6.4 Recommendations for further research	179
6.5 Epilogue	181
REFERENCES	186

LIST OF TABLES

Table 1.1: Citizenship education through time	11
Table 1.2: Comparison of recent issues of citizenship education in selected democracies	17
Table 1.3: Summary of methodological choices and strategies	25
Table 3.1: Summary of data collection and data capturing methods	81
Table 3.2: Instruments, limitations and enrichment of validity	96
Table 4.1: Summary of themes and related categories	99
Table 4.2: The relationship between data from each research instrument and the themes	100

LIST OF FIGURES

Figure 2.1: Interrelatedness of concepts regarding democratic identity	50
Figure 2.2: Conceptual framework	67

ADDENDA (See Compact Disc)

- 1: Democratic values
- 2: Characteristics of the modern nation-state
- 3: National Curriculum
- 4: Official documentation
- 5: Mediation of research activities
- 6: Implementation of National Curriculum
- 7: Pilot studies
- 8: Examples of data
- 9: Verification
- 10: Phases of data analysis
- 11: Citizenship Context Diagram

DECLARATION OF AUTHORSHIP AND COPYRIGHT WAIVER

I declare that this work is my own and that it has been written in my own words. All citations from literature have been acknowledged in-text and referenced in full.

I understand that all rights with regard to intellectual property in the work vest in the University of Pretoria who has the right to produce, distribute and/or publish the work in any manner considered fit.

My supervisors and I agree that, subject to the authorization of the University as owner of all intellectual property rights in this work, the approved version may be placed in the UpeTD archive with the following status:

Release the entire work immediately for worldwide access.

Signature

Date

ABSTRACT

This inquiry is the exploration and understanding of a case study: the nine-year-old learners of an inner-city school in South Africa and their experiences of democratic South Africa as citizens. Their expressions informed me on how they perceived their democratic identities and their understandings of their citizenship. From the acquired understandings and identities I sought to extend the current conceptions of citizenship education. This study was informed by the interpretivist paradigm and guided by a conceptual framework.

The literature on citizenship and citizenship education concerning the young child highlighted associated concepts and theories. I employed Dewey's theory on building a learning community and Waghid's expansion of compassion and imaginative action. Theories used concerning young children and their construction of citizenship were the postcolonial and transforming society theory, informing that children as young as nine years can engage in notions such as citizenship and democracy. From the literature, I identified the knowledge, skills and values needed for a child to participate as an active and accountable citizen; content also offered by the South African national curriculum. This curriculum envisages the future citizen as the responsible citizen who will embrace democratic values in their everyday lives and contribute to nation-building. The data collection methods and data collection instruments were designed in a child-centred way to facilitate self-expression. The constructivist grounded theory analysis assisted in generating significant insights.

The nine-year-old learners expressed their identification with the South African democracy and its values such as social justice, which aligned with the South African ideal of social cohesion and nation-building. However, they expressed little knowledge about and no active participation in democratic processes. They expressed concern about their unsafe neighbourhood and the social injustices they encountered in their community. The young learners expressed the desire for change to transform South Africa into a 'better nation' to secure their and other citizens' future.

Key findings confirmed statements made by scholars in this field: citizenship education has to acknowledge the life experiences of children in order to be meaningful (thus contextualize citizenship) and to assist young children to contribute to democracy. However, the democracy can

only be sustained and strengthened if the learners are knowledgeable about democratic processes and possible threats to these processes. In addition, young children need to be participants in the democracy and not only observers. The nine-year-old learners expressed the passion to do what is expected of them but seemingly lacked the participatory skills and opportunities they needed.

KEYWORDS: Young South African children's citizenship experiences, democratic identity, citizenship education, democratic values, Dewey's building a learning community, Waghid's compassion and imaginative action, postcolonial theory, transforming society theory, high social awareness, lack of participation, lack of democratic knowledge