

**An ecological evaluation of the sustainability of bark harvesting of medicinal
plant species in the Venda region, Limpopo province, South Africa**

by

Milingoni Peter Tshisikhawe

Submitted in fulfillment of the requirements for the degree

Philosophiae Doctor

In the Faculty of Natural and Agricultural Sciences

Department of Plant Science

University of Pretoria

Pretoria

Supervisor: Prof. M.W. van Rooyen

August 2012

Dedication

This work is dedicated to my biological parents, Tshamano Sarah and the late Maanda Andries Tshisikhawe.

DECLARATION

I declare that the thesis, which I hereby submit for the degree of Philosophiae Doctor (Department of Plant Science) at the University of Pretoria, is my own work and has not previously been submitted by me for a degree at this or any other tertiary institution.

SIGNATURE:.....

DATE:.....

Table of contents

ABSTRACT xvi

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS.....xix

Chapter 1

INTRODUCTION

1.1 Thematic background 1

1.2 Problem statement and rationale for the study3

1.3 Study aim and objectives6

1.4 Structure of the dissertation 7

References9

Chapter 2

LITERATURE REVIEW

2.1 Historical development and current state of medicinal plant use 13

2.2 The concept of sustainable use 16

2.3 Size-class distribution 18

2.4 Matrix modeling 19

2.5 Plant conservation target areas 22

References 24

Chapter 3

STUDY AREA, MATERIAL AND METHODS

3.1 Study area	33
3.2 Description of the species investigated.....	40
3.2.1 <i>Elaeodendron transvaalense</i>	40
3.2.2 <i>Brackenridgea zanguebarica</i>	41
3.3 Methods	43
3.3.1 Population studies	43
3.3.2 Evaluating reserve adequacy of the <i>Brackenridgea zanguebarica</i> reserve ..	47
References	48

Chapter 4

AN EVALUATION OF THE EXTENT AND THREAT OF BARK HARVESTING IN THE VENDA REGION, LIMPOPO PROVINCE, SOUTH AFRICA

Abstract	52
4.1 Introduction	53
4.2 Study area	56
4.3 Materials and methods	56
4.3.1 Overall assessment of species with potential medicinal bark use in the Venda region	56

4.3.2 Evaluation of trade in plant bark in the Venda region	57
4.3.3 Vulnerability of 58 species traded most for their medicinal bark properties in the Venda region	58
4.4 Results and discussion	60
4.4.1 Overall assessment of species with potential medicinal bark use in the Venda region	60
4.4.2 Evaluation of trade	61
4.4.2.1 Plant parts and species most commonly traded	61
4.4.2.2 Collectors of medicinal plants	76
4.4.2.3 Exportation from the region	77
4.4.2.4 Conservation and sustainability methods	78
4.3.3 Vulnerability of 58 species traded most for their medicinal bark properties in the Venda region	81
4.5 Conclusions	85
4.6 Acknowledgements	86
References	87

CHAPTER 5

POPULATION BIOLOGY OF *ELAEODENDRON TRANSVAALENSE* JACQ. IN THE PRESENCE OF HARVESTING

Abstract	94
5.1 Introduction	95
5.2 Study area	97
5.3 Materials and methods	99



5.4 Results and discussion	103
5.4.1 Population structure	103
5.4.2 Harvesting	107
5.4.3 Crown health	111
5.4.4 Regeneration	113
5.4.5 Stem growth rate	116
5.4.6 Population growth rate	117
5.4.7 Species grain	118
5.5 Conclusions	120
5.6 Acknowledgements	121
References	122

Chapter 6

POPULATION BIOLOGY OF *BRACKENRIDGEA ZANGUEBARICA* OLIV. IN THE PRESENCE OF HARVESTING

Abstract	130
6.1 Introduction	131
6.2. Species and study area	132
6.3 Materials and methods	135
6.4 Results and discussion	137
6.4.1 Population structure	137
6.4.2 Crown health	142
6.4.3 Bark removal areas	144
6.4.4 Regeneration	148

6.5 Conclusions	151
6.6 Acknowledgements	152
References.....	153

Chapter 7

IS THE PRESENT BRACKENRIDGEA NATURE RESERVE LARGE ENOUGH TO ENSURE THE SURVIVAL OF *BRACKENRIDGEA ZANGUEBARICA* Oliv.?

Abstract	158
7.1 Introduction	159
7.2 Study area	162
7.3 Materials and Methods	164
7.4 Results and discussion	171
7.4.1 <i>Brackenridgea zanguebarica</i> population parameters.....	171
7.4.2 Establishment of minimum core conservation area	174
7.4.3 Factors threatening the survival of <i>Brackenridgea zanguebarica</i> population	193
7.4.3.1 Unsustainable harvesting practices.....	193
7.4.3.2 Settlement areas	195
7.4.3.3 Development ventures	195
7.5 Conclusions.....	196
7.6 Acknowledgements	197
References	199

Chapter 8

SYNTHESIS AND MANAGEMENT RECOMMENDATIONS

Abstract	205
8.1 Introduction	206
8.2 Discussion	207
8.2.1 Sustainable harvesting and conservation	207
8.2.2 Indigenous conservation techniques	212
8.2.3 Conventional conservation techniques.....	216
8.2.4 The integrated management of <i>Elaeodendron transvaalense</i> and <i>Brackenridgea zanguebarica</i>	218
8.3 Conclusions and recommendations	221
References	227

Chapter 9

REFERENCES.....	236
APPENDIX A	268
APPENDIX B	279

List of tables

Table 4.1: List of ecological factors used to score the vulnerability of the 58 species harvested most commonly for their bark in the Venda region.....	59
Table 4.2: Indigenous plant species most commonly traded around Venda for medicinal bark properties	64
Table 4.3: Comparison in terms of availability and collection locality of medicinal plant species commonly traded in the three shops in Thohoyandou (adapted from Tshisikhawe 2002)	72
Table 4.4: Comparison of species price and frequency of use of the most commonly traded species around Thohoyandou and Sibasa (Adapted from Tshisikhawe 2002) .	74
Table 4.5: Vulnerability score for 58 plant species harvested for their bark in the Venda region.....	83
Table 5.1: Extent of harvesting on <i>Elaeodendron transvaalense</i> individual trees in the Tshirolowe population sampled in 2004.....	108
Table 6.1: Extent of harvesting on <i>Brackenridgea zanguebarica</i> individual trees through stem removal in data collected in 2004 at Thengwe study area.....	147
Table 7.1: Density of young and adult categories of <i>Brackenridgea zanguebarica</i> individuals sampled in the Brackenridgea Nature Reserve	172
Table 7.2: Determination of the ecological factor score and adjustment percentage of <i>Brackenridgea zanguebarica</i> in the Brackenridgea Nature Reserve area	176

Table 7.3: *Brackenridgea zanguebarica* minimum conservation area size calculations using the Burgman *et al.* (2001) method 180

Table 7.3(a): The impact on area of minimum required habitat after removing grazing 184

Table 7.3 (b): The impact on area of minimum required habitat after reducing the four identified anthropogenic factors by half..... 186

Table 7.3 (c): The impact on area of minimum required habitat when the four identified anthropogenic factors are removed 188

List of figures

Figure 3.1 (a): Climate diagram, following Walter and Lieth’s (1960-1967) convention, for the Tshirolwe study area as represented by the Siloam Weather Station (data obtained from Weather Bureau 1998)	34
Figure 3.1 (b): Climate diagram, following Walter and Lieth’s (1960-1967) convention, for the Thengwe study area as represented by the Tshandama Weather Station (data obtained from Weather Bureau 1998)	35
Figure 3.2: A map of the Venda region showing the Tshirolwe and Thengwe study areas that were sampled during the 2004 and 2005 data collection of <i>Elaeodendron transvaalense</i> and <i>Brackenridgea zanguebarica</i> populations	36
Figure 3.3: A location map showing the Tshirolwe study area	38
Figure 3.4: A location map showing the Thengwe study area.....	39
Figure 3.5: An <i>Elaeodendron transvaalense</i> tree showing bark removal from the stem in the Tshirolwe study area.....	41
Figure 3.6: <i>Brackenridgea zanguebarica</i> showing leathery-coated seeds exposed from ruptured fruits in the Thengwe study area.....	42
Figure 3.7: A layout of a transect with a hundred meter rope and a tape measure measuring out the 2.5 meters width on the both sides of the 100 m rope in a <i>Brackenridgea zanguebarica</i> sampling area.....	44
Figure 4.1: Contribution of plant parts to medicinal trade in Venda (adapted from Tshisikhawe 2002)	63

Figure 5.1: A location map showing the Tshirolwe study area where data on *Elaeodendron transvaalense* were collected in the 2004 and 2005 surveys98

Figure 5.2: A research assistant measuring the debarked area on an *Elaeodendron transvaalense* stem in the Tshirolwe study area in the Venda region..... 101

Figure 5.3: Size-class distribution of harvested and unharvested individuals in a population of *Elaeodendron transvaalense* sampled in 2004 at Tshirolwe, in the Venda region, Limpopo 104

Figure 5.4: The regression of $\ln(D + 1)$ against stem circumference in a population of *Elaeodendron transvaalense* sampled in 2004 at Tshirolwe, in the Venda region, Limpopo..... 106

Figure 5.5: Positive linear relationship between stem circumference and plant height in a population of *Elaeodendron transvaalense* sampled in 2004 at Tshirolwe, in the Venda region, Limpopo 107

Figure 5.6: Relationship between the stem circumference classes and mean harvested area in a population of *Elaeodendron transvaalense* sampled in 2004 at Tshirolwe, in the Venda region, Limpopo 109

Figure 5.7: Stem size classes against ratio of the area: stem circumference in a population of *Elaeodendron transvaalense* sampled in 2004 at Tshirolwe, in the Venda region, Limpopo 110

Figure 5.8: Crown health status of *Elaeodendron transvaalense* population in the Tshirolwe study area, Venda region, Limpopo, as determined by a survey in 2004. Crown health was assessed on a scale of 0–5 with 0 indicating 100% crown mortality and 5 indicating a healthy crown 112

Figure 5.9: Stem circumference versus crown health status in a population of *Elaeodendron transvaalense* sampled in 2004 at Tshirolwe, in the Venda region, Limpopo 113

Figure 5.10: Stem circumference versus seed count as per individual 114

Figure 5.11: An *Elaeodendron transvaalense* seedling resprout showing a well-developed lignotuber in the 2003 survey at the Tshirolwe, Limpopo study area 115

Figure 5.12: *Elaeodendron transvaalense* annual stem circumference increment as measured at Tshirolwe, Venda region between 2004 and 2005 117

Figure 5.13: Species grain of the *Elaeodendron transvaalense* population of Tshirolwe from data collected in 2004 119

Figure 6.1: A location map showing the Thengwe study area where data on *Brackenridgea zanguebarica* was collected in 2004 134

Figure 6.2: Size-class distribution of *Brackenridgea zanguebarica* from the Thengwe study area, Limpopo from data collected in 2004..... 138

Figure 6.3: The regression of $\ln(D + 1)$ against stem diameter class midpoints for a *Brackenridgea zanguebarica* population from the Thengwe study area, Limpopo in 2004..... 139

Figure 6.4: The regression of $\ln(D + 1)$ against stem diameter class midpoints for a *Brackenridgea zanguebarica* population from the Thengwe study area, Limpopo in 2004 compared to the regressions of data by Todd *et al.* (2004) in 1990 and 1997.. 140

Figure 6.5: *Brackenridgea zanguebarica* annual stem circumference increment as measured at Thengwe, Venda region on data collected in 2004 and 2005..... 141

Figure 6.6: Crown health status of *Brackenridgea zanguebarica* populations in the Venda region, Limpopo, as determined by a survey in 2004. Crown health was assessed on a scale of 0-5 with 0 indicating 100% crown mortality and 5 indicating a healthy crown..... 143

Figure 6.7: Correlation of crown health status and stem circumference of all individuals of *Brackenridgea zanguebarica* sampled in the Venda region, Limpopo, as determined by a survey in 2004..... 144

Figure 6.8: Bark removal estimates percentages on *B. zanguebarica* individuals from data collected in 2004 on a sliding scale of 0-5 with 0 indicating no removal and 5 indicating 100% removal of bark around the stem 146

Figure 6.9: Stem of *Brackenridgea zanguebarica* showing bark regeneration on harvesting scar caused by thieves as pointed out by the researcher in the Brackenridgea Nature Reserve, Thengwe. (Photo: K Magwede, Samsung Digimax 130)..... 149

Figure 6.10: Species grain of the *Brackenridgea zanguebarica* population of Thengwe from data collected in 2004..... 150

Figure 7.1: Grid map of the Thengwe region where the Brackenridgea Nature Reserve (boundary indicated by the black dotted line) is located 163

Figure 7.2: Changes in the size class distribution of *Brackenridgea zanguebarica* in the Brackenridgea Nature Reserve from 1990 to 2007..... 173

Figure 7.3: *Brackenridgea zanguebarica* annual stem circumference increment of 20 individuals as measured on the Thengwe population outside the Brackenridgea Nature Reserve, Venda region between 2004 and 2005 174

Figure 7.4: A researcher showing illegal harvesting of bark for medicinal purposes taking place inside the Brackenridgea Nature Reserve during the 2007 population density survey 194

Figure 8.1: A traditional healer (Dr TZ Ramaliba) being assisted by a dedicated person who is responsible for the digging of medicinal material of *Brackenridgea zanguebarica*..... 215

ABSTRACT

An ecological evaluation of the sustainability of bark harvesting of medicinal plant species in the Venda region, Limpopo province, South Africa

by

Milingoni Peter Tshisikhawe

Supervisor: Prof. M.W. van Rooyen

Department: Plant Science

Degree: Philosophiae Doctor

The study evaluated the extent and threat of bark harvesting of plant species for medicinal purposes in the Venda region and investigated possibilities of the sustainability of these practices. Approximately 30% of the woody plant species in Venda were found to have medicinal properties in their bark, but only about 12% of these species are commonly traded in muthi shops in the region. Fifty-eight medicinal plant species are commonly harvested for medicinal properties in their bark and found in muthi shops in the region. These 58 species were scored for the possible threat of bark harvesting to the species' survival using 20 ecologically relevant plant population traits. The most vulnerable species were *Adansonia digitata*, *Adenia spinosa*, *Albizia adianthifolia*, *Albizia versicolor*, *Brackenridgea zanguebarica*, *Croton megalobotrys*, and *Warburgia salutaris*. Of these species *Brackenridgea*

zanguebarica and *Warburgia salutaris* are amongst the ten most traded medicinal plant species in Venda region.

Elaeodendron transvaalense and *Brackenridgea zanguebarica*, the two species investigated in detail in this study, were amongst the most commonly traded medicinal plant species in Venda region. Analysis of size class distributions showed that both species had growing and healthy populations, exhibiting J-shaped population curves, centroids left-skewed from the midpoint of the size class distribution, and a fine-grained status. However, size-class distributions in both species revealed certain classes that needed monitoring since they were negatively affected by bark harvesting. Adult individuals of *B. zanguebarica* showed a high degree of bark regeneration as a response to bark removal from medicine men. The crown health status of *E. transvaalense* was generally good although some individuals, contributing 9% of the sample, had dead crowns. A linear relationship was noticed between areas harvested and stem circumference, which is understandable considering the large surface area of harvestable bark on bigger individuals. Matrix modeling of *E. transvaalense* revealed that the vegetative stage should be targeted for management action.

An assessment of the adequacy of the Brackenridgea Nature Reserve, an initiative aimed at protecting *Brackenridgea zanguebarica*, revealed that the reserve size is not enough for conservation of a viable population. The method flagged out potential growth habitat for *B. zanguebarica* around the current reserve, which could be incorporated to enlarge the conservation area, which could be incorporated to enlarge the conservation area. Four different scenarios were analysed on how best to conserve the species. Assuming a 50% reduction in human-related activities, such as

cultivation, harvesting and livestock grazing, it is recommended that the reserve be enlarged from its current 110 ha to 366 ha to maintain a viable population into the future.

Finally, the study recommended the adoption of an integrated approach to achieve sustainability of bark harvesting in the Venda region. Only by selecting best practices from both indigenous and conventional conservation techniques will the conservation of natural resources that are of important to local communities, be successful. An action plan that will involve the formation of an association by all stakeholders interested in the sustainable utilization of natural resources must be developed. The association must be governed by a constitution with a clear mission statement and the harvesting of natural resources should be done in line with a collection policy.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

I would sincerely like to thank every person and institutions that have helped me in realizing the compilation of this work. Some of the institutions and people deserve to be mentioned by names and are encouraged to continue to do good to all at all time.

My promoter Prof. MW van Rooyen is thanked so much for believing in the project of this nature. Your support from the onset when I shared with you my passion for looking at the impact of harvesting on medicinal plants was so encouraging. Dr Jerome Gaugris from the Centre for Wildlife Management, University of Pretoria is acknowledged for his immense support in sharing his expertise while I was analyzing some of the data.

The University of Pretoria (UP) is acknowledged through the Head of the Plant Science department, Prof. JMM Meyer, for allowing me to register for the degree with them. Administration at the university was very supportive whenever I needed their assistance.

I would also like to thank the University of Bergen in Norway through Dr Vigdis Vandvik for inviting me to attend a course on Plant Population Modeling. My trip to Norway was made possible through funding from the National Research Foundation (NRF) who also deserve special acknowledgement. NRF is appreciated for funding most part of my studies. Their research funds made collection of data to run smoothly.

I would also like to thank the three traditional healers Mrs Nyamukamadi Munyai, Mr Lucas Netshia and the late Mr Wilson Tuwani who made me understand the importance of following correct collection procedures in indigenous medicinal practice. They have really showed me that there can still be hope in terms of achieving the notion of sustainable harvesting of indigenous medicinal plants amongst traditional healers.

The University of Venda is acknowledged for giving me the opportunity to further my studies on a part time basis with the University of Pretoria. The encouraging support of colleagues within the Department of Botany is also appreciated. The Dean of the School of Mathematical Sciences Prof. Crafford is thanked for having faith in me through his unwavering support which enabled me to an NRF funded sabbatical leave in 2011. Support from the DVC Academic Prof. Xikombiso Mbenyane and the VC Prof. Peter Mbathi was indeed good and encouraging. The Management's support for research at the University of Venda is already bearing fruits.

To the Tshisikhawe family I say thank you for supporting me throughout my academic journey. To my wife Tshililo and daughter Livhuwani, sons Maanda and Dakalo I know that this level of my studies have been the most enduring of them all since I had to spend most of the weekends without you. The most difficult part was leaving you behind when attending conferences and training as part of my studies in Europe.

To my congregation, the Zion City Apostolic Church of South Africa, Mauluma branch I say thank you for your prayers. You have shown a lot of support under your

leadership of Archbishop Mauvhelwana even though I sometimes spent a number of Sundays without attending church services with you as a result of my academic engagements. To the church I say your prayers will always be appreciated.

Last but not the least I would like to thank the powers from above and below for giving me good health throughout my studies. Let Revelation 22:2 keeps us strong in our belief that our lives are interwoven with our nature and that it is upon us all to utilize it sustainably. Thank you! *Gracias!*