

#### - Mini dissertation -

## THE EFFECT OF MENTORING ON THE DEVELOPMENT OF LEADERS: A QUALITATIVE STUDY.

by

Miss. O.M. Swanepoel	26019508	0829605557 olgaswanepoel1@gmail.com
Home department:	Human Resource Management	
Supervisor:	Prof. H.E. Brand	
Supervisor's e-mail address:	hein.brand@up.ac.za	
Strategy of inquiry:	Phenomenological qualitative research	

Submitted in partial fulfilment of the requirements for the degree MCom in Industrial Psychology

in the

FACULTY OF ECONOMIC AND MANAGEMENT SCIENCES

at the

UNIVERSITY OF PRETORIA

Date of submission: 2012-08-24



#### **ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS**

- I want to thank my supervisor, Prof Hein Brand, for his knowledge, understanding, guidance, support and motivation throughout this whole process—I could not have done it without you.
- To all of the individuals who participated in the study—thank you all for sharing your knowledge, experiences and time with me and for making the data collection process so enjoyable.
- I want to thank Nikki Groenewald for the editing of the dissertation.
- To my wonderful family and friends who supported, advised, and motivated me, and who always believed in me—thank you from the bottom of my heart for all you have done for me.
- I am most thankful to God as I would not have gotten to this point without His unfailing love and for blessing me so greatly.



## **TABLE OF CONTENTS**

CHAPTER	1	1
INTRODUC	CTION	1
1.1 BA	ACKGROUND	1
1.2 PR	ROBLEM STATEMENT	2
1.3 PL	JRPOSE STATEMENT	3
1.4 RA	ATIONALE OF THE STUDY	3
CHAPTER :	2	5
LITERATUF	RE REVIEW	5
	RODUCTION	
	FINITIONS OF KEY TERMS	
	NTORING	
2.3.1	Introduction	
2.3.2	Definitions of mentoring	
2.3.3	Distinguishing between formal and informal mentoring	8
2.3.4	Types of mentoring	
2.3.5	South African perspectives on mentoring	9
2.3.6	International perspectives on mentoring	14
2.4 LE	ADER DEVELOPMENT	19
2.4.1	Introduction	19
2.4.2	Definitions related to leader development	20
2.4.3	South African perspectives on leader development	22
2.4.4	International perspectives on leader development	
2.5 TH		
DE	EVELOPMENT	30



	2.5	.1	Introduction	30
	2.5	.2	South African and International perspectives on the connection	
			between mentoring and leader development	31
	2.6	SUI	MMARY	32
Cŀ	HAPT	ER 3	3	33
RE	SEA	RCH	METHODOLOGY	33
	3.1	INT	RODUCTION	33
	3.2	RES	SEARCH STRATEGY	33
	3.2	.1	The aim of the study	33
	3.2	.2	Qualitative research	34
	3.2	.3	Phenomenological research approach	34
	3.3	RE	SEARCH GROUP	35
	3.3	.1	Participants	35
	3.3	.2	Selection of participants	36
	3.3	.3	Sample size	36
	3.4	DA	TA COLLECTION	36
	3.5	DA	TA ANALYSIS	37
	3.6	SUI	MMARY	39
Cŀ	HAPT	ER 4		40
RE	ESUL	TS A	ND DISCUSSION	40
	4.1	INT	RODUCTION	40
	4.2	RES	SULTS AND DISCUSSION	40
	4.2	.1	Personal involvement in mentoring and leader development	40
	4.2	.2	Mentoring	42
	4.2	.3	Leader development	53
	4.2	.4	The connection between mentoring and leader development	66
	43 9	SUMI	MARY	75



CHAPTE	₹ 5	77
CONCLU	SIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS	77
5.1 I	NTRODUCTION	77
5.2	CONCLUSIONS DRAWN FROM RESULTS	77
5.2.1	Mentoring	77
5.2.2	Leader development	78
5.2.3	The connection between mentoring and leader development	78
5.3 RE	ECOMMENDATIONS	79
5.4 SL	JMMARY AND CONCLUSION	81
LIST OF F	REFERENCES	82



### **APPENDICES**

APPENDIX A: Questionnaire	87
APPENDIX B: Informed consent form	92



## **LIST OF TABLES**

Table 1:	Key terms used in this document	5
Table 2:	A tabularised summary of personal involvement in mentoring and le	ader
	development	40
Table 3:	A tabularised summary of mentoring results	42
Table 4:	A tabularised summary of leader development results	53
Table 5:	A tabularised summary on the connection between mentoring and leader	
	development	66



#### **ABSTRACT**

Organisations depend on strong and competent leaders for their sustainability, profitability and competitiveness. Therefore organisations have an extremely strong focus on development, and especially on leader development. Mentoring has been recognised as a developmental tool (Truter, 2008, p.61) and is therefore employed by many organisations to foster such development.

The primary aim of this study is to determine whether and to what effect, mentoring can be used to foster leader development in a business context. The research is of a qualitative, phenomenological nature and enquires into the perceptions, personal experiences and knowledge of people who have been exposed to mentoring and leader development, in order to understand how mentoring has played a role in the development of their leadership.

In-depth interviews were conducted with a sample of six participants in order to collect the required data; and South African and international literature was consulted in order to interpret the interview data accurately in terms of the primary aim of the study.

The study revealed the following results amongst others:

- There is a connection between mentoring and leader development and mentoring can be used to develop leaders.
- Leader development is not possible in the absence of mentoring.
- Mentoring can contribute to leader development by focussing on a person's development and teaching that person to become a good or a better leader.
- Mentoring has the ability to positively impact or benefit leader development.
- Mentoring has the ability to develop a person's leadership capability and competence (i.e. his/her ability to be a leader).
- Mentoring can be used as a tool to develop effective leaders.



## THE EFFECT OF MENTORING ON THE DEVELOPMENT OF LEADERS: A QUALITATIVE STUDY.

# CHAPTER 1 INTRODUCTION

#### 1.1 BACKGROUND

Are leaders born or made? This is still a common question in the South African business context today, and there does not seem to be a concrete conclusion on the matter. Therefore organisations still continue to try and "grow" their leaders through the unlocking of their employees' potential. A possible way to accomplish this is by institutionalising mentorship programmes, whereby less experienced employees can grow personally and professionally with the guidance and support of an experienced, wiser person or mentor. "It was Socrates who mentored Plato, who mentored Aristotle, who mentored Alexander the Great. Socrates described himself as, "a mid-wife assisting the labour of the mind in bringing knowledge and wisdom to birth." (Truter, 2008, p.59)

This study thus aims to determine whether and to what effect mentoring can be used to foster leader development in a business context. Even though substantial research has been done on the concepts of mentoring and leader development respectively, and even though both concepts are applied in a variety of contexts, e.g. nursing, general medicine and psychiatry (Gibbs, Brigden, and Hellenberg, 2005), it is still necessary to further study the connection between the two concepts in a South African business context. Therefore in this study mentoring and leader development are not only studied in isolation, but are critically analysed to determine whether the one (mentoring) truly has an effect on the development of the other (leaders).

Both mentoring and leader development have become important and influential concepts in the business context of today—in South Africa and around the world—but the "knowledge gap" in past research, especially in South African research, to describe the specific outcomes of mentoring, specifically in terms of its leader development ability, calls the applicability of mentoring in the business context into question. The question that still



remains largely unanswered is: What is the perceived effect or impact of mentoring on the development of leaders? This is what this study aims to clarify further.

It is important to note that there are theoretical differences between the concepts of leader development, leadership development and leadership, however unclear and incomplete these differences may be. For this study, the concept of leader development will be focussed on as it links best with the concept of mentoring and its aim—to develop people with potential into future leaders. Therefore in this study the related concepts of leadership development and leadership may form part of the discussion of leader development, as they do relate to leader development, but will not be looked at *critically*. It is my opinion that the aim of this study would be best resolved if the focus is placed upon the connection between mentoring and leader development, as this is also what the participants of the study have most probably experienced firsthand—that mentoring has in some way contributed to their development and progression as leaders in their specific fields of work.

#### 1.2 PROBLEM STATEMENT

The research problem that this study aims to address is: What effect does mentoring have on the development of leaders in the South African business context?

As mentoring has become widely recognised for its impact in leveraging personal and organisational development, it can thus be a powerful tool—if understood properly—to encourage development on all levels in the South African business context (Gibbs, Brigden, & Hellenberg, 2005; Truter, 2008). Although there has been substantial research done on mentoring and leader development respectively, little research has been done on the connection between mentoring and leader development in particular—most literature only states that mentoring leads to "personal learning" (Van Dijk, 2008, p.8); "leadership development" (Van Dijk, 2008, p.8); "enhancing (of) potential" (Van Dijk, 2008, p.8), or states that "mentoring and coaching are powerful leadership development techniques" (Truter, 2008, p.61); and that "mentoring is a key element of leadership development" (Sondhi, 2009, p.41). However it does not describe what effect or impact mentoring truly has on the development of leaders. Past South African and international literature is thus too vague about the connection between mentoring and leader development specifically.



This study addresses this problem, by studying both mentoring and leader development in isolation, and by then drawing conclusions of the specific connections between the two. The findings of this study can be of academic importance as it can advance people's theoretical conceptualisations about mentoring and leader development by adding to the existing "knowledge gap" mentioned previously, and the findings can also enable organisations to develop better leaders through the application of mentoring.

The objectives of the study are the following:

- To determine what is meant by mentoring and the main components thereof through a review of available literature on the concept.
- To determine what is considered to be leader development and the main components thereof through a review of available literature on the concept.
- To determine the effect of mentoring on leader development as can be concluded from the literature.
- To determine the effect of mentoring in South African organisations through openended interviews with employees.
- To determine who are considered to be leaders in South African organisations through open-ended interviews with employees.
- To determine the effect of mentoring on leader development.

#### 1.3 PURPOSE STATEMENT

The main purpose of this study is to determine if the mentoring of employees in the South African business context has an effect on their leader development.

#### 1.4 RATIONALE OF THE STUDY

The first chapter states the background to the problem and the purpose of the study. In chapter two the literature on the main concepts of mentoring, leader development and the connection between mentoring and leader development are discussed according to South African and international perspectives. Chapter three describes the research methodology that guides the study and in chapter four the results gained from the interview data are



given and discussed in detail. In the final chapter, chapter five, conclusions are drawn and discussed and some final recommendations are made.



### CHAPTER 2 LITERATURE REVIEW

"Mentoring is essential in today's competitive business environment. It combines the thirst for connection with the power of learning. Leaders must be involved from the very beginning if mentoring is to be successful." -- Lois J. Zachary

#### 2.1 INTRODUCTION

The aim of the literature review is to provide a critical summary of the current state of knowledge in the fields of mentoring and leader development. This chapter provides the platform which will be built on inductively in the following chapters. The chapter will start with defining the key terms that are used throughout the study. Then the main concepts under study, namely mentoring, leader development and the connection between mentoring and leader development will be discussed according to South African and international perspectives. Lastly the chapter will be summarised.

#### 2.2 DEFINITIONS OF KEY TERMS

Definitions of the key terms related to this study are depicted in Table 1 below:

Table 1: Key terms used in this document

Key term	Meaning
Effect	People's perceptions about how one thing
	impacts or influences another.
Employees	Employees who get paid for their work.
Leader (refer to 2.4.2.1, p.20)	A person who channels and shapes his/her
	talents and energies to the rigorous
	demands of leading (Shenkman, 2008).
Leadership (refer to 2.4.2.2, p.20)	The ability to influence a group toward the
	achievement of a vision or set of goals
	(Robbins & Judge, 2007).
Leader development (refer to 2.4.2.3, p.21)	The progression of a person into a leader with the applicable leadership qualities (Day, 2001, p.584).



Key term	Meaning
Leadership development (refer to 2.4.2.4,	Expanding the collective capacity of
p.22)	organisational members to engage
	effectively in leadership roles and
	processes (Day, 2001, p.584).
Mentee (refer to 2.3.5.3, p.11)	The person that is being mentored by a mentor.
Mentor (refer to 2.3.5.1, p.7)	A wiser and more experienced person, who
	guides, supports and nurtures a less
	experienced person (mentee) (Truter, 2008,
	p.59).
Mentoring (refer to 2.3.2, p.7)	A tool for transferring essential job-related
	skills, attitudes and behaviours from a
	mentor to a mentee (Van Dijk, 2008).
Open-ended interviews	Interviews which are relatively informal and
	which make use of questions that can be
	elaborated upon.
Perception	A subjective insight or feeling.
Phenomenology (refer to 3.2.3, p.34)	A person's perception of the meaning of an
	event, as opposed to the event as it exists
	externally to the person (Leedy & Ormrod,
	2010, p.141).
Qualitative research (refer to 3.2.2, p.34)	A means for exploring and understanding
	the meaning individuals or groups ascribe to
	a social or human issue (Creswell, 2009).

#### 2.3 MENTORING

"Wise mentoring speeds up people's growth to maturity, increases their desire to learn and excel, and assists them to correctly recognise and develop their gifts and talents."

-- Charles Gordon

#### 2.3.1 Introduction

Mentoring involves the development of a junior, inexperienced person's career, the providing of psychosocial support to the junior, and role-modelling. Mentoring is also a key element of leadership development. Career development encompasses sponsorship, exposure to valuable projects, protection and coaching, whereas psychosocial support aids in the formation of the junior's self-concept through acceptance, role-modelling, confirmation and friendship (Pinho, Coetsee, and Schreuder, 2005; Sondhi, 2009).



Some of the different definitions of mentoring will be given, the differences between formal and informal mentoring will be explained, and the types of mentoring will also be discussed. Hereafter the literature review will focus on both South African and international perspectives regarding the qualities and characteristics of mentors and mentees, the roles and functions of mentors and mentees, the factors for successful mentoring, and the benefits of mentoring.

#### 2.3.2 <u>Definitions of mentoring</u>

Mentoring facilitates, guides, and encourages continuous innovation, learning and growth (Johnson, 2002, p.41).

"Mentoring is a process of transferring specific knowledge from the mentor to the protégé." (Janse van Rensburg, and Roodt, 2005, p.10)

"Mentoring provides psychological guidance and support to influence or inspire." (Blunt, and Conolly, 2006, p.199)

A tool for transferring essential job-related skills, attitudes and behaviours from a mentor to a mentee (Van Dijk, 2008).

Mentoring assists an organisation's top performers to utilise their abilities to their own and their organisation's advantage (Stone, 2002).

"Mentoring is a dyadic relationship in which an older, more experienced member of the organisation fosters the growth and development of a junior employee to a point where he or she becomes a competent professional. Mentoring is also viewed as a dynamic, developmental relationship between two individuals based on trust and reciprocity, leading toward the enhancement of the junior member's psychological growth and career advancement and toward achieving mutual benefits for the mentor, mentee and organisation." (Pinho et al., 2005, p.20)



"Mentoring is that distinctive human endeavour in which some take it upon themselves to closely attend to the growth and development of others, and take responsibility for seeing them succeed at a higher level of human accomplishment and maturity." (Shenkman, 2008, p.50)

#### 2.3.3 <u>Distinguishing between formal and informal mentoring</u>

Informal mentoring is a mentoring relationship where the mentor and mentee, agree that the mentee will place his/her confidence in the mentor to counsel or teach him/her. The interactions in informal mentorships are likely to move outside the typical boundaries of the office. As a product of work and non-work interactions, the mentor helps to influence and socialise the mentee. In addition, the mentor provides the mentee with support, guidance, and feedback as a result of his/her knowledge about how to get things done, what is what, and who is who. Therefore, mentees learn from their mentors—not only how to improve on their jobs, but also how to manage their organisational careers better, and how to balance and manage their lives better. These informal types of mentorships have been alleged to be a key developmental instrument in the upward movement of individuals in organisations (Friday, Friday, and Green, 2004).

Formal mentoring refers to a mentoring relationship where a third party (usually the organisation) authorises an agreement between a mentor and mentee, whereby the mentee should trust the mentor to counsel or teach him/her in order for the mentee to reach his/her full potential (Stone, 2002; Friday, Friday, & Green, 2004). Some features of formal mentoring programmes include top management support; corporate mentoring strategy; sensible mentor and mentee selection and matching processes; comprehensive mentor and mentee orientation; clearly stated expectations and responsibilities of the mentor and mentee; and established duration and contact frequency between the mentor and mentee (Friday, Friday & Green, 2004).



#### 2.3.4 Types of mentoring

Even though the literature mostly only makes a distinction between informal and formal mentoring, there are in fact five types of mentoring (Janse van Rensburg & Roodt, 2005), namely:

- Executive mentoring: An informal relationship is established with an executive or director (that may be retired or not). This can lead to the mentee becoming more visible in top management.
- Supervisory mentoring: The mentee's boss (supervisor/manager) becomes his/her mentor. This can lead to more career advancement opportunities for the mentee.
- Diversity mentoring: This includes cross-cultural mentoring where a mentor and mentee are of different races; and cross-gender mentoring where a mentor and mentee are of different sexes.
- Peer mentoring: The mentor and mentee are on the same level in the organisation (i.e. peers) and the relationship is relatively informal; and can lead to information sharing, emotional support and in some cases, to close relationships.
- Hierarchical mentoring: This includes mentoring from a higher grade which refers to
  the relationship between a junior and a senior in order to enhance the knowledge of
  the junior person; and mentoring from a lower grade which refers to a junior
  mentoring a senior person on a subject about whom the junior recently gained
  experience.

#### 2.3.5 South African perspectives on mentoring

#### 2.3.5.1 Qualities and characteristics of mentors

A mentor is someone of greater experience who guides, supports and nurtures a less experienced person/mentee (Truter, 2008, p.59).

It is important that a mentor should possess the following qualities and personal characteristics (Janse van Rensburg & Roodt, 2005; Truter, 2008; Meyer & Fourie, 2004):

- Be reliable
- Act with integrity



- Be honest
- Be committed
- Be trustworthy
- Have relatively high emotional intelligence, i.e. the mentor should be able to understand others
- Be a role-model for the mentee
- Have patience
- Be good at networking (i.e. the building of valuable social relationships)

It is important that a mentor should possess the following work-related characteristics (Janse van Rensburg & Roodt, 2005; Truter, 2008; Meyer & Fourie, 2004):

- Have relevant work experience, as well as work competence
- Have knowledge of the organisation so that the mentor can show the mentee how things are done in the organisation
- Have external experiences (experiences outside the organisation), where the mentor has gained specific contextual knowledge, which can be of value for the mentee
- Have an interest in developing people
- Be willing to share his/her experiences with those that are being mentored
- Ask good and valid questions
- Have credibility
- Possess good listening and analytical skills
- Be able to balance processes and their content
- Be able to help the mentee to manage the knowledge that he/she gains
- Be good at networking (i.e. the building of valuable social relationships)
- Be a role-model for the mentee
- Be reliable

#### 2.3.5.2 Roles and functions of mentors

The following roles and work-related functions have to be fulfilled by a mentor (Janse van Rensburg & Roodt, 2005; Meyer & Fourie, 2004):

- Shielding the mentee from risky issues within the organisation
- Giving demanding tasks to the mentee so that the mentee can gain experience



- Establishing and maintaining rapport
- Counselling and advising the mentee on issues that may stand in the way of good performance
- Coaching and teaching the mentee on other behavioural methods and skills that can be applied to the work setting
- Acting as a "sounding board" (Meyer & Fourie, 2004, p.41) for the mentee by providing helpful feedback on his/her ideas
- Befriending the mentee
- Promoting the mentee's career interests
- Introducing the mentee to key people in the organisation to make him/her more noticeable
- Accepting and respecting the mentee
- Acting as a role-model for the mentee

#### 2.3.5.3 Qualities and characteristics of mentees

A mentee is the person who is mentored by the mentor. It is someone who takes charge of his/her own development and sees the value of learning from others (Meyer & Fourie, 2004, p.4).

If mentees are to benefit optimally from the mentoring relationship, they will also need to possess certain qualities and characteristics, including (Clutterbuck, 2005, p.7-8):

- Good communication skills
- Be relatively agreeable
- Be relatively extroverted
- Be open to new experiences
- Be trusting of the mentor
- Maturity (i.e. be self-reliant, self-motivated, self-resourceful and self-confident)
- Not be oversensitive to criticism
- Show respect for themselves and their mentors
- Be willing to be actively involved in the mentoring process
- Be willing to engage in constructive dialogue with the mentor
- Be committed to learning



#### 2.3.5.4 Roles and functions of mentees

Mentees need to fulfil the following roles and work-related functions within the mentoring relationship (Meyer & Fourie, 2004):

- Be willing to learn from the mentor
- Reflect on and internalise the teachings of the mentor
- Do necessary research
- Be responsible for his/her self-development
- Communicate his/her needs clearly
- Listen actively to the mentor
- Build an effective relationship with the mentor
- Implement what has been learned

#### 2.3.5.5 Factors for successful mentoring

There are certain factors that are necessary if the mentoring relationship is to be successful:

- It is vital that there is the necessary commitment to the mentoring process if it is to be successful. This implies commitment from top management, commitment from the mentors, and commitment from the mentees. If such commitment is absent, then the benefits of the mentoring process will not be actualised and it will not have served its purpose (Meyer & Fourie, 2004).
- Set and clearly describe the goals, objectives and desired outcomes for the mentoring process (Blunt & Conolly, 2006).
- Comprehensively plan the mentoring activities so that the scope, content and process are clearly laid out (Meyer & Fourie, 2004).
- Determine the criteria for how mentors and mentees will be selected, thus ensuring
  that the correct mentor is paired with the appropriate mentee. There must be a high
  probability that the mentor and mentee will work well together and that their
  relationship will be effective and productive (Blunt & Conolly, 2006; Meyer & Fourie,
  2004).



- Define both mentor and mentee roles and responsibilities so that there is no uncertainty as to what both the mentor and mentee can expect from the process (Blunt & Conolly, 2006; Meyer & Fourie, 2004).
- Both mentor and mentee need training on the dynamics of the mentoring relationship and how to fulfil their roles and responsibilities. Training can increase the effectiveness of the mentoring process (Meyer & Fourie, 2004).
- It is important to monitor the mentoring process continuously and to evaluate whether
  it is reaching its objectives. This applies to the process as a whole, but also to the
  mentor and mentee. This implies evaluating whether all parties are fulfilling their roles
  and responsibilities and reaching their predetermined outcomes (Blunt & Conolly,
  2006; Meyer & Fourie, 2004).

#### 2.3.5.6 Benefits of mentoring in an organisational context

Mentoring can benefit an organisation in the following ways (Meyer & Fourie, 2004):

- It can be used to develop leaders
- It can assist with the career development of employees
- It promotes the transfer of skills
- It promotes sound working relationships
- It leads to more job satisfaction
- It can be used to advance employment equity in a South African context
- It can build employee competence and proficiency
- It promotes a strong learning culture within an organisation
- It can aid employees in reaching their full potential
- It can assist the organisation in reaching organisational goals

#### 2.3.5.7 Benefits of mentoring for the mentor

Mentoring not only benefits the organisation as a whole, but has specific benefits for the mentor as well, including (Meyer & Fourie, 2004):

- Mentors can develop leadership skills through mentoring
- Mentors can learn from mentees
- Mentors can use and transfer their experience and expertise



Mentors can build new relationships

#### 2.3.5.8 Benefits of mentoring for the mentee

Mentoring not only benefits the organisation as a whole as well as the mentor, but has specific benefits for the mentee as well, including (Meyer & Fourie, 2004):

- Mentees can learn from experienced people
- Mentees can improve their professional skills and development
- Mentees can develop valuable networks with other people

#### 2.3.6 International perspectives on mentoring

#### 2.3.6.1 Qualities and characteristics of mentors

It is important that a mentor should possess the following qualities and personal and work-related characteristics, including (Johnson and Ridley, 2004):

- Acting emotionally warm towards the mentees, i.e. having an attitude of friendliness, approachability, respect and openness.
- Listening actively, i.e. being attentive to what mentees are saying, communicating genuine interest and undivided attention, and reflecting the mentees' main concerns.
- Treating mentees with unconditional positive regard, i.e. being non-judgemental and understanding of mentees' feelings, thoughts and actions.
- Having a sense of humour, i.e. being able to mix work and laughter and being able to show humility.
- Having emotional intelligence, i.e. demonstrating emotional self-awareness and being aware of the emotional states of mentees.
- Displaying trustworthiness, i.e. being honest, ensuring congruence in word and action, and acting consistently with integrity.
- Respecting the values and differences of others.

#### 2.3.6.2 Roles and functions of mentors

A mentor needs to fulfil the following roles and functions in the mentoring role (Johnson & Ridley, 2004):

- Select the mentee carefully and ensure that there is a match between the personal characteristics, interests and desires of mentor and mentee.
- Know and understand the mentee and his/her talents, strengths and weaknesses.
- Drive excellence; set high expectations and communicate this clearly to the mentee,
   and model the same excellence that you expect from the mentee.
- Give recognition when it is due, thereby instilling confidence in the mentee and helping him/her to achieve his/her goals.
- Network on behalf of the mentee to gain appropriate and beneficial opportunities for him/her.
- Teach the mentee by sharing knowledge and experience.
- Provide the mentee with the needed support to reach his/her goals.
- Be a friend to the mentee when appropriate—have a relationship with the mentee.
- Be a role-model to the mentee by modelling humility, excellence and a work-life balance.
- Be dependable by being available, willing to listen and guiding the mentee, and by providing the mentee with honest and open feedback.

#### 2.3.6.3 Qualities and characteristics of mentees

A mentee should possess the following qualities and characteristics if he/she is to maximally benefit from the mentoring experience (Shenkman, 2008):

- A mentee must be open to change, meaning that he/she has to want to make a change in their professional careers.
- A mentee must have an attitude of determination, meaning that he/she will get back up after a failure or disappointment.
- A mentee must be open to work collaboratively—with mentoring a problem will be treated in a collaborative manner, and the mentee must be open to this.



A mentee must have a desire to be part of something "greater"—a desire to do more;
 a desire to become emotionally involved in something he/she cares about doing; a search for a higher purpose; etc.

#### 2.3.6.4 Factors for successful mentoring

There are numerous factors that are necessary for the mentoring process to be successful:

- An organisation's CEO must play a crucial part in a mentoring programme for it to reach its full benefit. If a mentoring programme is not supported and modelled by the CEO, it will not be adopted fully within the organisational culture (Johnson, 2002; Stone, 2002).
- It is important to pair the right mentor with the right mentee. These two people need to be compatible and should be able to understand each other for learning to take place. Often times a mentor/mentee pair just does not work well, which negatively impacts the goal of the mentoring. Therefore mentees should be paired with mentors who can and want to help their mentees reach their learning goals; and it would be best for the pairing to be voluntary on both the mentor's and mentee's side (Stone, 2002).
- It is important that the mentor and mentee have regular meetings (once a month should suffice) to discuss specific goals and areas for development for the mentee (Johnson, 2002; Stone, 2002).
- The mentee is responsible for preparing the agendas (with regard to areas that he/she would like to discuss) for the meetings (Johnson, 2002).
- The mentee's progress should be evaluated quarterly by both mentor and mentee in order to determine whether the mentee is reaching the set out (development and performance) goals and how he/she needs to improve further (Johnson, 2002; Stone, 2002).
- It is important that the mentor give constructive feedback on the mentee's performance. This means acknowledging and appreciating positive behavioural changes, while making the mentee aware of behavioural (not personal) shortcomings. Try to focus on the behaviour and not the person (Stone, 2002; Meyer & Fourie, 2004).



 A mentor must also act as a role-model to his/ her mentee, thereby modelling positive behaviours for the mentee to adopt (Stone, 2002).

#### 2.3.6.5 Evaluating the effect and outcomes of mentoring

There are many issues related to the evaluation of mentoring. This makes it difficult to establish criteria to measure the outcomes/effects of mentoring. First there is the issue of identifying what should and should not be termed "mentoring" (Gibb, 1994). Often any person that is in a slightly more senior position is labelled a mentor to his/her subordinates. Being more experienced or in a more senior position is only one aspect of being a mentor; there are many other aspects (or criteria) that need to be present for someone to be a mentor. This phenomenon of labelling people as mentors when they are not, will lead to problems with measuring the effects of mentoring, as something else will in actuality be measured.

Studies on mentoring tend to highlight the problems of making clear associations between mentoring and particular outcomes/effects. Mentoring has been proclaimed as one of the key career development and advancement tools in the organisational milieu (Friday, Friday, & Green, 2004). The broader initiatives of which mentoring is normally part, namely being either learning-centred or career-centred, can in actuality not be proven, as there is no clearly established relationship between mentoring and learning, or mentoring and career development (Gibb, 1994).

There are no "already made" models for evaluating mentoring. A survey found that the evaluation of mentoring typically consisted of asking mentors to evaluate the worth of the mentoring relationship. In many other studies, the focus is on asking the mentees to evaluate the worth of mentoring for themselves. While this will provide some useful information, it does not amount to an evaluation which identifies the overall value of mentoring (Gibb, 1994).

Another issue of evaluating the outcomes of mentoring that is problematic is the time of the evaluation. Evaluation will normally be conducted at the end of the formal mentoring experience, but the perceived benefits thereof at that point in time may not be totally



comprehensive. It may be that it is only later that the mentor or mentee reflects fully on the benefits that the mentoring relationship has brought him/her (Gibb, 1994).

Certain outcomes of mentoring are difficult to measure as they may not be readily accessible. The effects of mentoring on knowledge, skill or attitude cannot easily be tested (Gibb, 1994).

From this brief discussion on the issues related to the evaluation of mentoring it can thus be concluded that there is no clear cut way to evaluate the outcomes/effects of mentoring. It will always be a subjective process, but there are a few ways to ensure that the evaluation is an accurate portrayal of what mentors and mentees have experienced during the mentoring process:

- Interviews are the best way to collect information about individuals' mentoring experience (Gibb, 1994).
- The experiences of both the mentor and the mentee should be taken into account (Gibb, 1994).
- When questioning mentors and mentees about their personal experiences of mentoring, there should be factual questions (what has the mentoring relationship involved); process questions (how do the mentors and mentees describe their experiences of mentoring in terms of specific outcomes); and affective questions (what are the mentors' and mentees' feelings about the mentoring relationship) (Gibb, 1994).

#### 2.3.6.6 Benefits of mentoring in an organisational context

Mentoring can serve many positive organisational purposes, namely (Friday and Friday, 2002; Johnson, 2002; Stone, 2002):

- It can be used as a career development tool
- It can support organisational diversity initiatives
- It can communicate organisational values and appropriate behaviours
- It can enhance the recruitment and retention efforts of organisations
- It can improve the engagement levels of employees as mentoring can provide them with a feeling of belonging



- It can enable a more inclusive organisational environment
- It can assist high potential employees with building networks and becoming more visible in the organisation
- It can empower employees
- It can increase employees' levels of job satisfaction
- It can enhance decision-making skills
- It can improve the transfer of communication, knowledge, and skills
- It can develop intellectual capital as new knowledge is developed which can in turn be applied to the benefit of the organisation
- It can teach leaders how to be effective mentors and it can mobilise a powerful development process
- Mentoring can sustain continuous learning
- It supports the building of an organisation's performance capability and culture
- Mentoring brings forth role-models who model continuous learning
- Mentoring can help to advance the interests of special groups and populations, e.g.
   woman and racial groups
- It emphasises employee participation, empowerment and collaborative decision making

#### 2.4 LEADER DEVELOPMENT

""Great leading" means that people collaborate and share a determination to put a vision into the world that never existed before, for the benefit of more people, and to the end of enriching the lives of those whom the endeavour affects." (Shenkman, 2008, p.29)

#### 2.4.1 Introduction

A leader is someone who provides direction, who influences behaviour, and who inspires others to be greater than they are (Robbins & Judge, 2007; Smit, 2007). There is still an age-old debate regarding the question of whether leaders are born or made. Literature seems to indicate that there is a change in leadership in that leadership is now seen to be more transitional, meaning that it is visionary, transformational, empowering and that it consists of competencies which can be acquired, rather than being in-born (Smit, 2007).



This is supported by Conger and Riggio (2007, p.1), two leading experts in the field of leadership, who state that leadership capability can proactively be influenced by both the characteristics of the individuals and the organisations for which they work. Thus they imply that leaders can in fact be made or developed. It is for these reasons that organisations today still continue to develop talented people into their future leaders who can help the organisation not only survive, but grow and achieve levels of excellence (Johnson, 2002).

It is important to note that the main concept of leader development differs theoretically from leadership development and leadership, yet also encompasses both of these concepts. In order to provide a broader, perhaps more realistic picture of leader development, this literature review will include leadership development and leadership as well.

Some of the definitions related to leader development will be given. South African perspectives regarding the qualities and characteristics of leaders, and the roles and functions of leaders will be discussed. Hereafter international perspectives regarding the qualities and characteristics of leaders, the roles and functions of leaders, the factors for successful leader development, how to evaluate the effects and outcomes of leader development, the benefits of leader development, and the methods to achieve leader development will be discussed.

#### 2.4.2 Definitions related to leader development

#### 2.4.2.1 Definition of leader

A leader is someone who channels and shapes his/her talents and energies to the rigorous demands of leading (Shenkman, 2008).

#### 2.4.2.2 Definition of leadership

Leadership implies the capability to influence a group toward the achievement of a vision or set of goals (Robbins & Judge, 2007).



"Leadership is about articulating visions, embodying values, and creating the environment within which things can be accomplished." (Yukl, 2010, p.21)

According to Stanley (cited in Taylor, 2009, p.1) "Leadership is seen in terms of unifying people around values and then constructing the social world for others around those values and helping people to get through change".

Leaders focus on the emotional and psychological resources of the organisation—i.e. the organisation's values, connections and dreams (Smit, 2007).

According to Weiss (cited in Smit, 2007) a leader is someone who tries to influence an individual or group's behaviour, for whatever reason this might be necessary.

According to Cairns (cited in Smit, 2007) leadership has the focus of change—leaders take initiative, challenge the status quo, and motivate their followers.

The foundation of leadership is character, and the leader's character is made up of a collection of dispositions, habits and attitudes (Barlow, Jordan, & Hendrix, 2003).

Leadership is the "ability to change others' behaviour, or to move them towards taking action in line with a goal or objective". (Smit, 2007, p.596)

"Leadership occurs when individuals anticipate and identify an opportunity to make something positive happen, and then take responsibility for the process and its results." (Johnson, 2002, p.123)

#### 2.4.2.3 Definition of leader development

Leader development is the purposeful investment in human capital in order to build a person's intrapersonal competence by helping the individual enhance his/her self-understanding and to construct an independent identity. In doing this, the individual can progress into a leader with the applicable leadership qualities (Day, 2001, p.584).



#### 2.4.2.4 Definition of leadership development

"Leadership development is defined as expanding the collective capacity of organisational members to engage effectively in leadership roles and processes." (Day, 2001, p.585)

#### 2.4.3 South African perspectives on leader development

#### 2.4.3.1 Qualities and characteristics of leaders

It is important that a leader should possess the following qualities and personal and work-related characteristics (Bergh & Theron, 2003):

- Leaders must be able to relate to people in a sensitive and compassionate way
- Leaders must seek out and embrace multiple perspectives from people
- Leaders should have a personal and active approach towards reaching their goals
- Leaders must be able to take the necessary risks if a good opportunity arises
- Leaders must provide direction according to their vision of the future
- Leaders must have the ability to communicate their vision to their followers in an understandable and clear way
- Leaders must encourage their followers to overcome challenges that they might face

#### 2.4.3.2 Roles and functions of leaders

The following roles and work-related functions have to be fulfilled by a leader (Bergh & Theron, 2003):

- Leaders must encourage and acknowledge multiple perspectives from people
- Leaders must be able to adapt to and manage changing situations
- Leaders must provide their followers with clear direction
- Leaders must clearly communicate with their followers
- Leaders must encourage and motivate their followers to reach the desired goals



#### 2.4.4 <u>International perspectives on leader development</u>

#### 2.4.4.1 Qualities and characteristics of leaders

It has been mentioned earlier that there is still a debate regarding whether leaders are born or made. From the literature, it seems clear that it can be both. Anyone can be a leader given the appropriate training and development (Smit, 2007; Barlow et al., 2003).

Leaders differ from their followers in terms of certain qualities and personal characteristics, including (Barlow et al., 2003):

- Being extroverted, i.e. being sociable and assertive
- Being emotionally stable, i.e. being calm
- Having a desire to lead
- Having a good character, i.e. being true to who they are
- Being self-aware
- Being curious, i.e. constantly searching for better ways of doing something
- Being honest, i.e. consistently being truthful
- Acting with high integrity, i.e. constantly choosing to do the right and moral thing
- Being sincere, i.e. being genuine
- Being self-confident
- Having a high cognitive ability, i.e. being intelligent and competent

Leaders differ from their followers in terms of certain work-related characteristics, including (Barlow et al., 2003):

- Being curious in terms of searching for better ways of doing something
- Being intelligent and competent
- Being conscientious, i.e. being persevering and thorough
- Having the desire to lead
- Being driven
- Being visionary
- Wanting to take initiative
- Being decisive, i.e. being able to make sound and logical decisions in a timely manner



Being open to learning from experience

#### 2.4.4.2 Roles and functions of leaders

The following roles and work-related functions have to be fulfilled by a leader (Barlow et al., 2003; Johnson, 2002; Cacioppe, 1997):

- Guide his/her followers according to a clear and powerful vision or purpose
- Apply the resources available to him/her (these resources include the skills, knowledge and material resources of his/her followers)
- Develop relationships with his/her followers
- Inspire and motivate his/her followers to improve their quality of work
- Exert influence so that his/her followers work towards achieving higher level values and goals
- Have the ability to clearly communicate with followers, as well as the ability to clarify difficult concepts, tasks and ideas for them
- Take risks when it becomes necessary

#### 2.4.4.3 Factors for successful leader development

A leader's primary role is to create followers and, according to Shenkman (2008), the leader's character is the essential element that followers focus on when determining whether or not to follow a specific leader. Character in this sense can be defined as the unchanging attributes of the leader by which he/she is known (Shenkman, 2008).

For leaders to be developed successfully they need to have acquired the ability to project specific aspects of their character onto their followers. These aspects include the following (Shenkman, 2008):

- Self-awareness: A successful leader needs to have self-awareness in order to correctly apply his/her personal values, beliefs, and past experiences to decisions.
- Practical insight: A successful leader needs to have the ability to perceive new possibilities amidst challenging situations.



- Drive: A leader's drive in terms of his/her energy or willpower can be the force that
  inspires others to follow him/her. This drive has to be present for a leader to be
  successful.
- People skills: A successful leader needs to have adequate people skills, as he/she
  has to be able to work collaboratively with others, whilst being empathetic, as well as
  being firm.
- Self-trust: A successful leader has to have the ability to trust in the creditability of his/her decisions. Self-trust is almost synonymous with the concept of charisma.

Apart from a leader's character, he/she needs to have the following abilities for him/her to be successful (Barlow et al., 2003; Johnson, 2002; Cacioppe, 1997):

- Have the ability to be objective; meaning that his/her personal values and views should not cloud his/her judgement about what the best course of action would be in a particular situation
- Have a clear and powerful vision or purpose that guides him/her
- Use the resources available to him/her to reach the desired goals (these resources include the skills, knowledge and material resources of his/her followers)
- Apply knowledge as needed to deal with a situation; this knowledge can be the leader's own or someone else's
- Have the ability to overcome adversity
- Be sensitive to his/her followers and be able to respond appropriately to the different followers
- Instil trust in his/her followers
- Develop relationships with his/her followers that enable them to reach desired goals
- Inspire and motivate his/her followers to improve their quality of work
- Exert influence so that his/her followers work towards achieving higher level values and goals
- Have relatively high emotional intelligence; meaning an ability to know and appropriately utilise his/her own feelings and those of others
- Have the ability to clearly communicate with followers, as well as the ability to clarify difficult concepts, tasks and ideas for them
- Be fully aware of the people around him/her
- Be extremely focussed on the task at hand



#### Take risks when the situation deems it to be necessary

Another factor that is important to the development of leaders within an organisational context is the dedication and participation of senior executives in the development of the programme (Cacioppe, 1998; Johnson, 2002; Shenkman, 2008). For such a programme to be successful, senior executives will have to be involved in the programme from start to finish. It is not enough for senior executives to only act as "organisational celebrities" (Cacioppe, 1998, p.194), they have to be mentors, role-models and coaches for those who are being developed. Senior executives usually have a lot of experience and expertise that can be passed down to the developing leaders to assist them in becoming self-actualised individuals and competent leaders. There has been evidence that supports the idea that involving senior executives in the development of organisational leaders is an effective strategy (Cacioppe, 1998). This is because senior executives can set a direction for everyone in the organisation to follow; they can provide a practical application value for what is being taught; and they can provide the developing leaders with frameworks to enable them to better implement organisational decisions and actions (Cacioppe, 1998).

The learning climate (Yukl, 2010) of the leader's workplace is another important factor to consider with the development of a leader. The learning climate refers to the prevailing attitudes and values that exist (in a specific work setting) about the importance of development—meaning whether development is seen as important or not. For leader development to take place, a high quality leader development programme, as well as a supportive learning climate is needed. A supportive learning climate encourages leaders to seek opportunities for personal growth and skills acquisition; it encourages leaders to apply what they have learnt in their everyday practices; and it rewards learning. Ways to create and maintain a supportive learning climate include (Yukl, 2010):

- Providing financial support for further learning
- Arranging development workshops
- Establishing career counselling programmes
- Introducing feedback systems, such as 360 degree feedback
- Recognising and rewarding development



#### 2.4.4.4 Evaluating the effect and outcomes of leader development

Criteria to evaluate the effectiveness of leader development in a work context can include any of the following (or a combination thereof) (Yukl, 2010):

- Leader development can be evaluated in terms of the outcomes of the leadership influence on a single individual, a group, or an organisation.
- It can be evaluated based on the extent to which the performance of an individual, group, or organisation has improved. Sales figures, net profits, and productivity rates are examples of what can be examined to determine whether performance has improved.
- The attitudes and perceptions that followers hold of a leader can be an indicator of the developed leader's effectiveness. Followers' attitudes and perceptions on their quality of work life, their self-confidence, and their career and psychological growth can be evaluated to determine whether an effective leader has been developed.
- Leader development can also be evaluated based on the leader's contribution to the
  quality of work processes, as perceived by followers and outsiders. Things to
  consider can include the extent of group cohesion, member commitment and cooperation.
- Lastly, it can be evaluated by determining the extent to which the developed leader
  has had a successful career as a leader. This can be based on whether the leader
  has been rapidly promoted into leadership positions, whether his/her contract is
  continuously renewed, etc.

#### 2.4.4.5 Benefits of leader development in an organisational context

There are numerous benefits for organisations that develop leaders, including (Cummings & Worley, 2009):

- Increased focus on strategy and goal setting
- More effective teams
- Members feeling more empowered in their work
- Increased organisational productivity
- Increased sales
- Decreased turnover



- Socialising leadership in a set of values believed to be important to the organisation's success
- To ease the execution of strategic change agendas
- To retain valuable talent
- Building the knowledge and skills of the organisation

#### 2.4.4.6 Benefits of leader development for the leader developing others

According to Alan Mumford (cited in Cacioppe, 1998, p.197) there are many reasons why it is beneficial for leaders to assist in the development of others into leaders. Some of these reasons are as follows:

- Assisting in the growth of other individuals can be intrinsically satisfying for the leader
- Sharing expertise and experience with others can improve the leader's own skills, knowledge and insight
- Developing others can result in the resolving of organisational and personal problems
- Developing others means more time for the leader to pursue larger leadership opportunities, mainly because the developing leaders' task performance is enhanced which will enable them to perform a larger variety of work-related tasks
- Leaders developing leaders can build leadership within and across all management groups

#### 2.4.4.7 Benefits of leader development for the leader being developed

Benefits that a person being developed as a leader may experience include (Cummings & Worley, 2009):

- Adding to the skills and knowledge of those being developed
- It can make individuals more effective and capable personally and professionally
- It can lead to greater self-awareness in the leader
- It can enable better goal-setting and achievement for the leader
- Professionally, developing a person to be a leader can lead to that person being able to work across boundaries
- It can be empowering



## 2.4.4.8 Methods to achieve leadership development

Leaders can be developed by using a variety of methods (which include mentoring). These methods are categorised under formal training, developmental activities, and self-help activities, which will be discussed in short (Yukl, 2010).

## Formal training:

The main objective of formal training programmes is to increase general skills and behaviours (Yukl, 2010).

Specific methods for training leaders include (Yukl, 2010):

- Behaviour role-modelling—developing leaders are shown how to handle a particular type of interpersonal problem by practicing the (correct) behaviour in a role play.
- Case discussions—case studies are used to practice analytical and decision-making skills.
- Games—these games are more focussed on the business environment and teach analytical and decision-making skills.
- Simulations—simulations are used to analyse complex problems that the developing leader is likely to come across, and to teach the developing leader how to make decisions regarding the problem; the (real-life) consequences of the developing leader's decision are also pointed out.

#### Developmental activities:

Developmental activities are usually fixed within operational job assignments. Activities may include coaching to address evident gaps in skills, behaviours, and/or confidence; mentoring to become more aware of how others respond to the individual; and special assignments that challenge the individual's knowledge and skills (Yukl, 2010).

The following activities can be used to facilitate leader development (Yukl, 2010):

- 360 Degree feedback—receiving feedback from multiple sources.
- Developmental assessment centres—assesses the developing leader's strengths, weaknesses, and development needs.



- Special assignments—providing the developing leader with challenging assignments that are out of his/her regular field of work.
- Job rotation—moving the developing leader between different jobs in order to gain experience.
- Action learning—field projects are conducted on complex problems in order to develop solutions that can be implemented.
- Mentoring—an experienced person provides guidance, advice and support to a less experienced person for developmental reasons.
- Coaching—a more experienced person facilitates the learning of a less experienced person; similar to mentoring.
- Personal growth programmes—includes a set of psychological activities aimed at improving self-awareness and resolving inner conflicts.

## Self-help activities:

As the name implies, self-help activities are carried out by individuals on their own. It may include activities such as reading books; watching videos; listening to audiotapes; and using computer programmes to build skills (Yukl, 2010).

## 2.5 THE CONNECTION BETWEEN MENTORING AND LEADER DEVELOPMENT

#### 2.5.1 Introduction

For this study it was important to determine the connection (if such a connection exists) between mentoring and leader development. For this reason, it was important to also do a literature review on this main concept specifically. This was, nevertheless, a rather futile excursion, as very little literature could be found on the actual connection (or non-connection) between mentoring and leader development. This notion was confirmed by Michael Shenkman, PhD (2008), who states in his book, *Leader Mentoring*, that: "There have been many studies about leader effectiveness and what techniques work best, but none that I have found about the effect of mentors on leaders." (Shenkman, 2008, p.13)

To this same notion was Cohen and Tichy's (1998, cited in Cacioppe, 1998, p.194) statement that the work that has been done on leader development has not proven to be



adequate, as it has been too "backward-looking and too theoretical". It also has rarely been tied to an organisation's direct needs, and it has not really prepared leaders for the challenges of the future. Although this was said in 1998, it seems that it still holds true to a certain extent today, as confirmed by Hopen in 2010 who stated that there was still no common consensus on the best way to develop leaders and leadership.

## 2.5.2 <u>South African and International perspectives on the connection between</u> mentoring and leader development

What was indeed found in the South African and international literature on the connection between mentoring and leader development was the following:

- Mentoring itself is a dynamic and multifaceted mix of coaching, modelling, and feedback. Irrespective of the formality of the mentoring relationship (whether it is formal or informal), effective developmental relationships arise from a mix of opportunity and intent. Mentoring is seen as an especially effective component of development in context. The opportunity to observe and work with members of senior management is an especially critical part of mentoring, as it helps to develop a more sophisticated and strategic perspective on the organisation which therefore develops a type of intrapersonal competence. It is this intrapersonal competence that is the aim of leader development. Therefore mentoring is particularly suited to develop leaders (Day, 2001).
- "Mentoring can be used to develop leadership." (Meyer & Fourie, 2004, p.11)
- "Research has pointed to the worth of mentoring relationships in leadership development." (Stone, 2002, p.15)
- "Remember: no mentors, no leaders. Period." (Shenkman, 2008, p.181)

From doing this literature review it seemed that effective leaders are not necessarily naturally born that way—they have to be developed and armed with the necessary leadership tools if they are to become great leaders. Through exploring leader development, it can be concluded that leader development is a complicated concept; that mentoring is a possible way to develop leaders; that in order to develop leaders a lot of support and commitment is required; and that the advantages that effective leaders can bring to their organisations will far outweigh the drawbacks of developing them. For



development initiatives to successfully create effective leaders it will have to focus on what leadership qualities to develop; which methods to use to develop those qualities; and how to sustain leaders' effectiveness across time and contexts, but a lot more research is still required.

#### 2.6 SUMMARY

In this chapter South African and international literature on mentoring, leader development and the connection between mentoring and leader development was reviewed and discussed. The following chapter will describe the methodology for the study in detail.



# CHAPTER 3 RESEARCH METHODOLOGY

#### 3.1 INTRODUCTION

In the previous chapter literature on the main concepts of the study—mentoring, leader development, and its connection—was critically examined and discussed. It was found that there is a lack of knowledge on the connection between mentoring and leader development and that this "knowledge gap" needs to be addressed by the findings of this particular study and by additional research. In this chapter the methodology for the study will be explained in terms of its qualitative, phenomenological nature; the research group will be discussed; and the methods for data collection and analysis will be discussed.

#### 3.2 RESEARCH STRATEGY

## 3.2.1 The aim of the study

The aim of this study is to determine if the mentoring of employees within the private, business sector of South Africa has an effect on their leader development. Thus the study aims to seek new insights into the phenomena of mentoring and leader development, by asking questions and by assessing the phenomena in a new light (Lewis, Saunders, and Thornhill, 2009).

The phenomena of mentoring and leader development were examined from a different angle in order to determine what the effect of mentoring is on the development of leaders—as this has not yet been accurately determined in a South African business context. To determine the effect of mentoring on leader development, it was necessary to determine firstly a connection between mentoring and leader development, and secondly to determine what the perceived effect of mentoring itself is on the development of leaders, according to the participants in the study. Conclusions drawn are thus based on these individuals' perceptions.



#### 3.2.2 Qualitative research

"Qualitative research starts from and returns to words, talk, and texts as meaningful representations of concepts" -- R. Gephardt (cited in Pratt, 2009, p.856)

The research approach that was used to conduct this study was qualitative research. Qualitative research is a means for exploring and understanding the meaning individuals or groups ascribe to a social or human issue. The process of research involves emerging questions and procedures, data typically collected in the participant's setting, data analysis inductively building from participants to general themes, and the researcher making interpretations of the meaning of the data. As qualitative research has no standardised language and template for writing up findings, the final written report has a flexible structure. Those who engage in qualitative research support a way of looking at research that honours an inductive style, focused on individual meaning, and the importance of rendering the complexity of a situation (Creswell, 2009; Pratt, 2009).

## 3.2.3 Phenomenological research approach

"Through phenomenology a significant methodology is developed for investigating human experience and for deriving knowledge... One learns to see naively and freshly again."

-- Clark Moustakas (cited in Heimbrock, 2005, p.282)

Specifically, the qualitative research approach of phenomenology was used to conduct the study. "Phenomenology refers to a person's perception of the meaning of an event, as opposed to the event as it exists externally to the person." (Leedy & Ormrod, 2010, p.141) With a phenomenological study the core of human experiences about a phenomenon, as described by the participants, is identified. Thus phenomenology aims to understand people's perceptions and personal experiences of a certain phenomenon. In order to do this a small number of participants are studied (Creswell, 2009; Leedy & Ormrod, 2010). Within phenomenology people's experiences of a phenomenon are reduced to a universal description by establishing patterns and relationships of meaning (Creswell, 2009) and by making generalisations of what a specific phenomenon is like from an insider's point of view. Phenomenological methods are scientific by virtue of being methodical, logical, critical, general and potentially inter-subjective (Werts, 2005).



For this study phenomenology was used to find out what people who have been exposed to mentoring and leader development think of how mentoring played a role in the development of their leadership. A deeper insight into the phenomena of mentoring and leader development was gained through the exploration of the participants in the study's perceptions, individual meanings, personal experiences and knowledge of the phenomena. Phenomenology truly takes into account the human element in research as it is not cold or distant, but rather personally involved and empathic. It allows for diverse views and settings by interviewing participants free from judgement, and comprehensively, on their real-life experiences.

#### 3.3 RESEARCH GROUP

## 3.3.1 Participants

The participants for this study were individual employees within the private, business sector of South Africa who:

- had been exposed to a mentorship programme (meaning that they had a mentor who
  provided guidance and supervision, or that they were themselves acting as mentors
  in their business environments); and/or
- were engaged in a mentorship programme at the time of the study (meaning that they
  were under the guidance and supervision of a mentor at the time of the study, or that
  they were themselves acting as mentors in their business environments at the time of
  the study); and
- had been exposed to leader development programmes; and/or
- were engaged in leader development programmes at the time of the study; and/or
- experienced leadership in their current business environments (by acting as leaders, or by working underneath a leader).

The aim was to draw conclusions based on these individuals' perceptions. It was thus crucially important that the participants have knowledge, understanding, experiences and perceptions of both phenomena—mentoring and leader development—in order to gain a more accurate understanding of the phenomena and their connection.



#### 3.3.2 Selection of participants

Non-probability sampling was used for this study in the selection of participants. This type of sampling provided the researcher with the freedom to select participants based on her subjective judgement (Lewis et al., 2009). More specifically, purposeful, self-selection sampling was used to select participants. This means that any individual who fit the criteria (refer to 3.3.1, p.35) and who was interested in participating in the study, was selected.

#### 3.3.3 Sample size

A small sample of six participants was used for this study as such a small number made it easier to conduct thorough, in-depth interviews and to also interpret the interview data with more care. A large sample size was not needed for this type of study as a high confidence rate in the data was not necessary; as a relatively higher margin of error could be tolerated; as generalisability was not a big priority; and as use would not be made of complicated statistical analyses (Lewis et al., 2009).

#### 3.4 DATA COLLECTION

The following issues pertain to the collection of data for the study:

- Specific forms of data: Primary data was collected (Lewis et al., 2009). This includes textual and verbal data.
- Approach/technique used to collect data: The mono method of data collection (Lewis
  et al., 2009) was used in the study, meaning that a single technique and
  corresponding analysis procedure was used. The approach/technique that was used
  to collect the data was phenomenology.
- Instrument used to collect data: The in-depth/semi-structured interview was used to collect data from participants. Face-to-face interviews were conducted. The questions that were asked were related to mentoring; leader development; and the possible connection between the two, and the questions were open-ended so that participants could speak their minds freely. The questions that were asked in the interviews were the study's main research questions/objectives, and some additional predetermined questions to clarify uncertainties stemming from the main research questions (refer to



Appendix A on p.87 for the questionnaire that was used for the interviews of the study). The interviews were audio-recorded by means of a tape recorder in order to facilitate better data capturing and analysis. Informal notes were also taken during the interviews to maintain concentration and focus (Lewis et al., 2009).

Specific attributes of the units of analysis that were investigated: Personal attributes
that were noted during data collection included gender, age group, current job title,
etc.

#### 3.5 DATA ANALYSIS

As qualitative data is extremely diverse in nature, it is very difficult to follow a standardised approach of analysis (Lewis et al., 2009). For this study, text analysis (Leedy & Ormrod, 2010) formed the structure within which the data was analysed. The central task during the analysis was to identify underlying and common themes in the participants' descriptions of the phenomena (Leedy & Ormrod, 2010). It is important to note that the steps or tasks of text analysis that are described below could not always be followed to the letter—at times it had to be adjusted, in order to make the analysis and understanding of the data simpler.

The first task in the analysis was to transcribe the information obtained from the in-depth interviews and researcher notes (Leedy & Ormrod, 2010).

Secondly, the relevant information was separated from the irrelevant information, meaning that only the information that relates to the phenomena was used (Leedy & Ormrod, 2010).

The data was then summarised, meaning that key points were formulated from what the participants had said. Thus long statements were taken and compressed into shorter statements that contained only the essence of what had been said. These key points in effect became the main themes that were further explored in the study (Lewis et al., 2009).

After the data had been summarised, it was categorised (Lewis et al., 2009). The key points were grouped into categories that reflected the various facets, meanings, perceptions, and experiences of the phenomena. Each category received an appropriate label or code that reflected the theme or, if possible, the study's research



questions/objectives. The categories were also defined to ensure the appropriate allocation of themes (Lewis et al., 2009). The categories were not set, so that they could still be adjusted to better define the themes they contain, categories could be divided into smaller categories if they were deemed to be too broad, or categories could be eliminated in order to refine the themes further (Lewis et al., 2009). The categories derived had to provide a coherent, well structured, analytical framework that was used further in the analysis (Lewis et al., 2009).

Looking critically at the information contained in the various categories, divergent perspectives were then sought out. The various ways in which different participants experienced the phenomena were considered and arranged into "meaning units" that reflected various aspects of the experiences of the phenomena (Leedy & Ormrod, 2010).

A compound meaning of the phenomena was developed based on the integration of the various meanings (meaning units) that were identified in order to develop an overall description of the phenomena as participants *typically* experience it (Leedy & Ormrod, 2010).

Finally, after composite descriptions were developed of how participants experienced the phenomena, the meaning of these lived experiences was interpreted in order to draw conclusions and to answer the research problem successfully (Creswell, Hanson, Clark, Plano, and Morales, 2007).

The end result was a broad description of the phenomena as seen by people who had experienced it personally. The focus was on common themes in the experiences of the people who were studied, despite the diversity in the individuals and the settings. This tied in with the overall purpose of a qualitative, inductive study which aimed to better understand the meanings that people attach to events. In the end, the researcher was able to say: "I understand better what it is like for someone to experience that". (Leedy & Ormrod, 2010, p.142)



#### 3.6 SUMMARY

In this chapter the method for conducting this study was explained in detail. Within this predetermined methodology the data was collected and analysed—which will be the discussion in the following chapter. In the next chapter the results of the data analysis will be given and discussed critically.



# CHAPTER 4 RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

#### 4.1 INTRODUCTION

In this chapter the results gained from the data analysis will be provided and discussed critically, so as to be able to draw relevant conclusions on the main concepts under study in the following chapter. The results that best reflect the research objectives and the main research problem will be focussed on in the discussion.

#### 4.2 RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

## 4.2.1 Personal involvement in mentoring and leader development

The participants' biographical information was combined with the results from questions 17 to 22 and 36 to 39 pertaining to each participant's personal involvement in mentoring and leader development. This information is depicted in Table 2:

Table 2: A tabularised summary of personal involvement in mentoring and leader development

Partici- pant	Gender	Age	Company	Job title	Personal involvement in mentoring relationship and leadership			Functions in mentoring relationship and leadership role	
					Mentor	<u>Mentee</u>	<u>Leader</u>	<u>Mentoring</u>	<u>Leadership</u>
1	Male	40+	First National Bank (FNB): Smart Product House	CEO of Smart Product House of FNB	Yes	No	Yes	Mentor type of functions	Run business unit
2	Male	40+	Price Waterhouse Coopers (PWC)	Human Resources partner of PWC	Yes	No	Yes	Train; Supervise; Monitor	Manage company; add to company's profits; train; keeping track of competing companies



Partici- pant	Gender	Age	Company	Job title	Job title Personal involvement in mentoring relationship and leadership			Functions in mentoring relationship and leadership role	
					Mentor	<u>Mentee</u>	<u>Leader</u>	Mentoring	Leadership
3	Male	40+	Webber Wentzel	Partner	Yes	No	Yes	Transfer knowledge; listen; advise	Provide leadership; share experience; keep team goal- focussed
4	Male	40+	FNB	Organisa- tional Psycholo- gist at FNB	Yes	Yes	Yes	Be present; listen; reflect; create awareness	Functional HR work; focus on people issues; train
5	Male	40+	FNB	Head of Operations and Support of FNB	Yes	Yes	Yes	Guide; Support; listen; advise	Perform operational function
6	Male	40+	Mutual and Federal (M&F) Insurance Company	Group Manager of the Specialist Investiga- tion Unit of M&F	Yes	Yes	Yes	Teaching skills	Manage team; prevent fraud and crime

#### 4.2.1.1 Discussion of Table 2

As depicted in Table 2 above, the participants used in this study were all male and seasoned in age (40 years and above). These individuals all worked in the private business sector of South Africa, in the following industries and companies: banking (FNB), audit (PWC), legal (Webber Wentzel) and insurance (M&F). The participants' job titles that they held at the time of acting as mentor, mentee or leader were all of high stature in their specific industries, and included: Industrial and Organisational Psychologist, Group Manager, Section Head, Equity Partner, and Chief Executive Officer.

All six participants fulfilled the roles of mentors at their specific places of work, and three of the participants were also mentees at one or other stage in their careers. Their functions as mentors included: Performing mentoring type of functions; providing training in mentoring; ensuring that mentors fulfil their roles; monitoring the application of mentoring in the company; transferring knowledge; listening; providing advice; being present and



involved; listening; reflecting; creating awareness; providing guidance and support; providing advice; and teaching specific skills.

All six participants acted as leaders in their specific workplaces and their leadership functions included: Running the business unit; managing the company; contributing to the company's profitability; keeping track of competing companies; training employees; providing leadership; sharing experience; keeping the team goal-focussed; doing functional human resources work; focussing on people issues; performing an operational function; managing the team; and preventing fraud and other crime.

#### 4.2.2 Mentoring

The responses on questions 1 and 8 to 24 were analysed and the summarised result of the responses relating to the main concept of mentoring and its related questions is depicted in Table 3:

Table 3: A tabularised summary of mentoring results

Main themes	Subthemes	Recurring responses/	Participant	Examples of
Main themes  1. Perceptions	Subthemes  1.1 Mentoring (question 1)	perceptions  Mentoring is a process to help a less experienced person develop personally and professionally  Mentor shares his/ her experiences and skills with mentee  The aim is to add value to mentee  Encompasses coaching, counselling and training  Mentoring is long term  Mentee's issues are addressed, suggestions for improvement are	Participant responses  5  3  6  4	Examples of responses*  "To play an active role in the development of the skills of an individual on a specific subject to make him become an expert in a specific field."  "iemand wat sy lewenservaring deel met die persoon (mentee) en daardeur leiding gee."
		made, results are measured and discussed  Mentoring is about a relationship	3	



Main themes	Subthemes	Recurring responses/	Participant	Examples of
1 Doroontings	1 O Mantar		responses	
1. Perceptions	1.2 Mentor (question 1 and 8)	Experienced and knowledgeable person     Person with ability to teach, guide and challenge mentee     Role of mentor is to provide knowledge and guidance to mentee; share his/her experience and skills with mentee     Acts as role-model     Plays active role in mentoring     Is available for	responses  4  4  5 1 2	responses*  "In Persoon wat meer lewenservaring en ervaring in 'n sekere gebied het en wat dan die vermoë het om vir 'n mentee daardie lewenslesse oor te dra asook daardie ervaring wat hy reeds gehad het"  "Someone who has the necessary skills and knowledge of a subject and who is prepared to bring that
		mentee	2	knowledge across to someone else."
	1.3 Mentee (question 1 and 9)	<ul> <li>Person with limited experience</li> <li>Junior person in organisation</li> <li>Person with development potential</li> <li>Person with a desire for learning and personal and</li> </ul>	3 1 2	"A person who is hungry, who wants to learn."  "'n Persoon wat soos 'n spons water trek."
2. Mentor	2.1 Personal characteristics (question 10)	professional growth	6 3 3 3 4 3 1	"Knowledge of the subject, willingness to share the information and then an open mind and being unbiased."  "They (mentors) have to be approachable, they have to be availablethey have to have values"
	2.2 Work- related characteristics (question 11)	<ul> <li>Trustworthy</li> <li>Sharing</li> <li>Approachable</li> <li>Experienced</li> <li>Mature</li> <li>Strong communication skills</li> <li>Visible</li> <li>Commitment</li> </ul>	3 2 3 2 3 2 1 2	"Commitment, integrity, and reliability."  "Iemand watal redelik gespesialiseerd is en klomp werkservaring het in daardie gespesialiseerde veld"



Main themes	Subthemes	Recurring responses/	Participant	Examples of
2. Mentor	2.3 Work- related functions (question 12)	perceptions  Defining mentoring roles Consulting with mentee Assisting mentee Monitoring mentee Listening Sharing Acting authoritative Creating sound work environment Being there for mentee	responses  2  2  4  3  5  1	responses*  "The function is really just to be there for you (the mentee)."  "To create a sound working environment, to make available the necessary tools (for the mentee), and then displaying enough interest in the progress of the mentee."
3. Success factors for mentoring	3.1 Mentoring relationship success (question 13 and 14)	<ul> <li>Mutual effort</li> <li>Mutual trust</li> <li>Mutual dedication</li> <li>Mutual commitment</li> <li>Mutual respect</li> <li>Mutual honesty</li> <li>Measuring results</li> <li>Mutual willingness to share and learn</li> <li>Good pairing of mentor and mentee</li> <li>Mentor/mentee taking roles seriously</li> <li>Mentee must drive process</li> <li>Mentor must act as role-model</li> </ul>	6 3 2 2 1 1 1 1 1	"mentorship is a two-way street."  "Commitment, trust and knowledge, (and) leading by example."  "Mutual trust, mutual dedication, and measurables."
4. Evaluating the effect of mentoring	4.1 Evaluating the effect in terms of the mentee (question 15)	Improved performance of mentee     Possible promotions of mentee     Improved skill level of mentee     Cannot be evaluated organisationally     Personal growth and development of mentee	2 1 1 3 4	"(mentoring has been successful if it has) added value to you (the mentee) as a person."  "Your measure of the effect of mentoring is on the individual (mentee), not on the organisation."  "(dit gaan oor) die ontwikkeling van die persoon (mentee) self."



Main themes	Subthemes	Recurring responses/ perceptions	Participant responses	Examples of responses*
5. Benefits of mentoring	5.1 Benefits for organisation (question 16)	<ul><li>Sustainability</li><li>Competitiveness</li><li>Profitability</li></ul>	1 1 1	"Dit (mentorskap) gee jou (organisasie) 'n voordeel bo die kompetisie."  "(Mentoring) makes the company sustainable."
	5.2 Benefits for mentor (question 16)	Growth     Mentors can leave a legacy	1	"As dit (mentorskap) reg gedoen word is dit 'n wen-wen verhouding (vir die mentor en mentee)."  "Growth of the mentor"
	5.3 Benefits for mentee (question 16)	<ul><li> Growth</li><li> Support</li><li> Can become well rounded</li></ul>	6 1 3	"Daar is baie groot voordele."  "the growth of the
6. Personal experiences with mentoring	6.1 Personal experiences with mentoring (question 23)	<ul> <li>Mentoring is a must in an organisation</li> <li>Mentoring is a good process</li> <li>Mentoring develops competent people</li> <li>Mentoring builds success</li> <li>Mentor is a facilitator, not a counsellor</li> <li>Mentoring is enriching</li> </ul>	2 2 3 2 1	mentee."  "Mentoring has made me a better person—in all aspects."  "(it is a positive experience) to see people succeed."  "mens kan nie sonder dit (mentorskap) in 'n organisasie nie"

<sup>\*</sup>The examples of responses are provided in the language that the participants gave it—in either English or Afrikaans.

## 4.2.2.1 Discussion of Table 3 per main theme

## 1. Perception

The first main theme that was identified from the interview data was that of perception. Participants' perceptions of mentoring, mentor, and mentee were identified and the following were found in respect of the subthemes:



#### 1.1 Mentoring

The concept of *mentoring* was perceived by five of the six participants as a process aimed at helping a less experienced person develop personally and professionally. All of the participants felt that the main aim of mentoring is to add value to this less experienced person or mentee by developing him/her. Three of the participants mentioned the importance for the mentor to share his/her experience and skills with the mentee. This perception of what mentoring entails is broadly supported by the literature that also states that mentoring is about benefitting a junior employee in terms of building his/her psychological growth and advancing his/her career through the transferral of knowledge, job-related skills, attitudes and behaviours (Janse van Rensburg & Roodt, 2005; Van Dijk, 2008; Pinho et al., 2005).

Half of the participants were of the opinion that mentoring involves coaching, counselling and training; and that it is a process that addresses the mentee's issues, suggests improvements and measures results. These two perceptions are not specifically supported by the literature in this study, although half of the participants of the study perceive this to be true. What can be confirmed is the notion that coaching differs from mentoring and that it is only an element of mentoring (Stone, 2002). It would be suggested that further research be done on whether mentoring does in fact involve coaching, counselling and training; and whether mentoring does in fact address the mentee's issues while suggesting improvements and measuring results. Four of the participants perceived mentoring to be a long term process. This perception is also not supported by the literature in this study, but it is significant that the majority of the participants mentioned it. According to Meyer and Fourie (2004) mentoring is about the building of a relationship, which was confirmed by three of the participants who felt that mentoring is not only a process, but a relationship.

To sum up the majority perception of what mentoring is: Mentoring is perceived as a process which encompasses coaching, counselling and training and that is aimed at helping a less experienced person develop personally and professionally, thereby adding value to this person.



#### 1.2 Mentor

The concept of *mentor* was described by four of the participants as an experienced and knowledgeable person who has the ability to teach, guide and challenge the mentee. Five of the participants perceived a mentor's role as that of providing knowledge and guidance to the mentee and of sharing his/her experience and skills with the mentee. These two perceptions are supported by Truter (2008, p.59); Janse van Rensburg and Roodt (2005); and Meyer and Fourie (2004) who state that a mentor is a person with great experience who guides, supports and nurtures a less experienced person. One participant mentioned the importance for a mentor to be a role-model, which is affirmed numerous times in the South African and international literature (Janse van Rensburg & Roodt, 2005; Meyer & Fourie, 2004; Johnson & Ridley, 2004). Two of the participants felt that it is important for a mentor to be actively involved in the mentoring process by being available for the mentee, which is specifically mentioned by Johnson and Ridley (2004) as one of the roles and functions of a mentor.

Based on the majority perception of what a mentor is, it can be concluded that it is an experienced and knowledgeable person who has the ability to teach, guide and challenge a mentee by providing him/her with knowledge, guidance, shared experiences and skills.

#### 1.3 Mentee

The concept of *mentee* was perceived by all participants to be a person who has the desire to learn and to grow personally and professionally. In this regard, Meyer and Fourie (2004, p.4) supports this perception by describing a mentee as someone who takes charge of his/her development and has a desire to learn more. Three of the participants described a mentee as a person with limited experience, and one participant called a mentee a junior person in an organisation. Pinho et al. (2005) and Sondhi (2009) confirm the notion that a mentee is a junior, inexperienced person. Two of the participants perceived a mentee to have potential for development, which is debatable as it is not confirmed by the literature in this study.

The majority perception of a mentee is someone with a desire for learning and for personal and professional growth.



#### 2. Mentor

The second main theme that was identified from the interview data was that of mentor. Participants were asked to identify the personal and work-related characteristics of a mentor, as well as the work-related functions of a mentor, and the following were found in terms of the subthemes:

#### 2.1 Personal characteristics

The *personal characteristics* of a mentor were described by half of the participants to include the characteristics of approachability, trustworthiness, maturity, sharing, and strong communication skills. Four participants mentioned the importance of being knowledgeable; one participant mentioned the importance of a strong personality; and one of the participants felt that a mentor must have the quality of patience. All of the characteristics mentioned by the participants are confirmed in the literature, by Johnson and Ridley (2004); Janse van Rensburg and Roodt (2005); Truter (2008); and Meyer and Fourie (2004), with the exception of the characteristics of having a strong personality and being mature. These two characteristics require further attention and research.

The majority of the participants felt that being knowledgeable is the most important personal characteristic of a mentor, while approachability, trustworthiness, maturity, sharing, and strong communication skills are also important characteristics.

#### 2.2 Work-related characteristics

The work-related characteristics that a mentor requires were described by three of the participants as that of trustworthiness and approachability, which is confirmed by Johnson and Ridley (2004). Three participants perceived the characteristic of maturity to be important for a mentor to have. Two of the participants mentioned the characteristics of sharing, experience, strong communication skills, and commitment as being important, which are in accord with both South African and international literature (Janse van Rensburg & Roodt, 2005; Truter, 2008; Meyer & Fourie, 2004; Johnson and Ridley, 2004). One of the participants also felt that a mentor requires the characteristic of visibility. The work-related characteristics of maturity and visibility are not specifically mentioned in the literature of this study and therefore require additional attention.



In summary, according to the majority perception of the participants, a mentor should have the following work-related characteristics: Trustworthiness, approachability, and maturity.

#### 2.3 Work-related functions

Under the subtheme of *work-related functions* two of the six participants identified defining of mentoring roles and consulting with the mentee as important for a mentor. Four participants mentioned the importance for a mentor to assist a mentee, which corresponds with Johnson and Ridley (2004) who state that a mentor needs to provide the necessary support for a mentee. Half of the participants felt that a mentor had to be able to monitor the mentee. Five out of six participants regarded good listening skills, the ability to share knowledge, and being available for the mentee as important work-related functions, which is affirmed by Janse van Rensburg and Roodt (2005); Truter (2008); and Meyer and Fourie (2004). One participant felt that a mentor had to be able to act authoritatively, and one participant felt that a mentor needed to be able to create a sound working environment for the mentee. Although most of the participants' perceptions discussed here are not specifically mentioned in the literature of this study as being work-related functions that a mentor should perform, these perceptions add much value to our understanding of what it entails to function as a mentor in the South African business environment.

Based on the majority of perceptions of the participants, listening, knowledge sharing, being there for the mentee, and assisting the mentee are seen as the most important work-related functions of a mentor.

#### 3. Success factors for mentoring

The third main theme that was identified from the interview data was success factors for mentoring. Participants were asked to identify factors that contribute to a successful mentoring relationship and the following were found in respect of the subtheme:

#### 3.1 Mentoring relationship success

All of the participants were of the opinion that, for the mentoring relationship to be successful, it had to be a mutual effort between the mentor and mentee. This factor is not supported *per se* in the literature of this study, but it is evident from critically reading



through the characteristics and functions of both mentor and mentee, as described by Janse van Rensburg and Roodt (2005); Meyer and Fourie (2004); Truter (2008); Clutterbuck (2005); and Johnson and Ridley (2004), that the factor of mentoring being a mutual effort is in fact supported by the literature. Half of the participants mentioned the importance of mutual trust as a factor for success which is in accord with Clutterbuck (2005); and Johnson and Ridley (2004). A third of the participants mentioned mutual dedication and mutual commitment as success factors, and both of these factors are confirmed by Meyer and Fourie (2004).

The rest of the factors mentioned were only of individual importance, meaning that only one of the six participants would mention the specific factor. These factors were: Mutual respect (which is supported by Clutterbuck (2005); and Johnson and Ridley (2004)); mutual honesty (which is also confirmed by Meyer and Fourie (2004); and Johnson and Ridley (2004)); measurement of results (which is confirmed by Blunt and Conolly (2006); and Meyer and Fourie (2004)); mutual willingness to share and learn (which is in accord with Meyer and Fourie (2004); and Johnson and Ridley (2004)); good pairing of mentor and mentee (which is confirmed by Blunt and Conolly (2006); Meyer and Fourie (2004); and Stone (2002)); mentor/mentee taking their roles seriously (which is supported by both Johnson (2002); and Stone (2002) who discuss the necessity of having regular meetings); mentee driving the process (as supported by Johnson (2002)); and mentor acting as a role-model for the mentee (which is affirmed by Stone (2002)).

The most important factor for a successful mentoring relationship according to all of the participants was that of mutual effort. This effort implied the active involvement of both the mentor and mentee in the mentoring relationship and process.

## 4. Evaluating the effect of mentoring

The fourth main theme that was identified from the interview data was evaluating the effect of mentoring. Participants were asked to describe how the effect of mentoring (in the organisation) could be evaluated in their opinions. The following were found in respect of this subtheme:



## 4.1 Evaluating the effect of mentoring in terms of the mentee

Two participants were of the opinion that the effect of mentoring could be evaluated organisationally in terms of the improved performance of the mentee; one participant mentioned that any promotions of the mentee could be an indicator of the effect of mentoring; and one participant felt that this effect could be evaluated in terms of the improvement of the mentee's skill level. Four participants suggested that the effect of mentoring had to be evaluated in terms of the personal growth and development of the mentee. Half of the participants did not feel that the effect of mentoring could be evaluated organisationally.

Finding literature support for the abovementioned perceptions has proven to be difficult. It is recommended that further research be done on how the effect of mentoring can be evaluated organisationally and in terms of the mentee.

Regardless of the lack of support for the participants' perceptions, the participants' majority perception on this subtheme was that the effect of mentoring has to be evaluated in terms of the effect it has on the mentee's growth and development.

#### 5. Benefits of mentoring

The fifth main theme that was identified from the interview data was that of mentoring benefits. Participants were asked to identify the benefits of mentoring for the organisation, mentor, and mentee, and the following were found in terms of the subthemes:

#### 5.1 Benefits of mentoring for the organisation

The following organisational benefits were identified: Sustainability; competitiveness; and profitability. These benefits are supported by the literature of this study (Friday & Friday, 2002; Johnson, 2002; Stone, 2002).

#### 5.2 Benefits of mentoring for the mentor

Two participants mentioned the benefit of growth for a mentor and one participant mentioned the benefit of leaving a legacy by passing his/her knowledge and experience forward. Both of these benefits are confirmed by Meyer and Fourie (2004) who mention



the benefits of developing new skills, learning new things, and applying and transferring their experience and expertise to someone else.

## 5.3 Benefits of mentoring for the mentee

All of the participants mentioned growth as a benefit of mentoring for the mentee; while one participant mentioned the benefit of having support; and three of the participants mentioned the benefit of the mentee getting the opportunity to become well-rounded. These benefits are supported by the research of Meyer and Fourie (2004); Friday and Friday (2002); Johnson (2002); and Stone (2002) who mention the benefits of career development, feelings of belonging, empowerment, and continuous learning.

## 6. Personal experiences with mentoring

The participants were asked to describe their personal experiences with mentoring—to describe what it has meant to them or taught them over the years. As these are personal experiences that the participants have gained over the years, it will not be interpreted with reference to the literature. The following personal experiences with mentoring were mentioned by the participants:

#### 6.1 Personal experiences with mentoring

Two participants experienced that mentoring is crucial in the work environment and that it should be stressed within organisations. Two participants described mentoring as a good process overall. Three participants mentioned that mentoring has developed many competent people through the teachings and shared experiences of a mentor. Two participants experienced mentoring to build success in terms of the mentor, the mentee and the organisation. One participant suggested that a mentor's role is to be a facilitator (who guides the process of mentoring), and not a counsellor. Four of the participants experienced mentoring to be very enriching (from a mentor's perspective) as they could pass success on to a mentee while improving themselves at the same time.



## 4.2.3 <u>Leader development</u>

The responses on questions 2, 25 to 40 and 47 were analysed and the summarised result of the responses relating to the main concept of leader development and its related questions is depicted in Table 4:

Table 4: A tabularised summary of leader development results

Main themes	Subthemes	Recurring responses/	Participant	Examples of
		perceptions	responses	responses*
1. Perceptions	1.1 Leader development (question 2)  1.2 Leadership (question 25)  1.3 Leader (question 26)	<ul> <li>Identifying a person with leadership potential and intellectual ability to lead</li> <li>Developing the person to become a better leader</li> <li>Taking a person to high level of excellence</li> <li>Mentoring is needed for leader development</li> <li>The ability to take a group progressively from one level to the next</li> <li>Leadership is about inspiring people</li> <li>Being visionary</li> <li>Leading strategically</li> <li>Engaging actively with others</li> <li>Contributing specialist skills</li> <li>Person with leadership qualities</li> <li>Person with expert skills and knowledge</li> <li>Good communicator/listener</li> <li>Person of high integrity</li> <li>Being visionary</li> <li>Person who is actively involved and visible</li> <li>Calculated risk-taker</li> <li>Leadership</li> </ul>	1 3 3 2 3 1 2 3 3 4 3 4 3 4 1 5 5	"To take those people who have got the intellectual ability to lead and to put them on a journey in terms of their development."  "Die vermoë om die sterkpunte in 'n persoon raak te sien en seker te maak jy kan daarop bou."  "Leadership is an ability to take a group of people from one level to the next level progressively."  "Leadership is about inspiring people to do their tasks."  "He (the leader) can talk the language, he sets a good example, and he is visible in whatever he does."  "Someone who possesses all the qualities of a leader."



Main themes	Subthemes	Recurring responses/	Participant responses	Examples of responses*
1. Perceptions	1.4 Leader vs. manager (question 27)	Difference between leader and manager     Leader leads and inspires people to do tasks     Manager manages tasks and daily functions	6 5 5	"A leader leads and a manager manages."  "'n Leier is iemand wat visie het en iemand inspireer en 'n bestuurder is iemand wat die strukture daarstel om dit (die visie) te kan doen (uitvoer) en seker te maak dit
2. Leader	2.1 Personal characteristics (question 28)	<ul> <li>Integrity</li> <li>Competent</li> <li>Fair</li> <li>Respectful</li> <li>Determined</li> <li>Strong communication skills</li> <li>Ability to make decisions</li> <li>Ability to influence</li> <li>Ability to guide</li> </ul>	4 2 1 1 1 2 1 2 2	word gedoen."  "skill, this goes with competence, credibility"  "Trustworthy, honesty, integrity, insight into the business, able to influence people (and) to guide people, to be a good guy"
	2.2 Work-related characteristics (question 29)	<ul> <li>Self-insight</li> <li>Balance</li> <li>Altruistic</li> <li>Dedication</li> <li>Competent/ expert</li> <li>Integrity</li> <li>Strong communication skills</li> <li>Ability to make decisions</li> <li>Ability to influence</li> <li>Ability to guide</li> </ul>	1 1 2 3 4 2 3 2 2	"Hy moet die werksomgewing baie goed verstaanhy moet 'n visie hê, hy moet die vermoë hê om mense te kan inspireer om daardie strategie of visie wat hy het te kan uitvoer"  "To have an in-depth knowledge of the business."



Main themes	Subthemes	Recurring responses/ perceptions	Participant responses	Examples of responses*
2. Leader	2.3 Work- related functions (question 30)	<ul> <li>Ensuring growth</li> <li>Inspiring</li> <li>Acting as role-model</li> <li>Training</li> <li>Strategising</li> <li>Leading group</li> <li>Monitoring group</li> <li>Being approachable</li> </ul>	3 3 2 1 1 1 1	"Om seker te maak dat die besigheid groei en dat die mense groei in die besigheid"  "He must play a supervisory role, he must lead by example, he must have a democratic leadership style—in other words an open-door approach, he must be easily approachable."
3. Success factors for leader development	3.1 Factors for successful leader development (question 31)	<ul> <li>Leader characteristics</li> <li>Organisational environment</li> <li>Leader identification</li> <li>Planning and policies</li> </ul>	3 2 1	"the environment, to acknowledge or have some sort of mechanism to try and identify the leaders"  "In die eerste plek moet daar ruimte wees in die besigheid om te groei—vir 'n persoon om 'n leier te kan weesmens moet die persone identifiseer wat leierskap- eienskappe het"
	3.2 Factors for leader success (question 32 and 33)	<ul> <li>Leader characteristics</li> <li>Having followers</li> <li>Leader credibility</li> <li>Organisation's success</li> <li>Organisational environment</li> </ul>	6 4 1 2 1	"The ability to capture the hearts of the people."  "The way that he (the leader) treats his people, then his commitment, and his support to the people and the project."

Main themes	Subthemes	Recurring responses/	Participant	Examples of
4. Evaluating leader effectiveness	4.1 Criteria to evaluate leader effectiveness (question 34)	perceptions  Competence Ability to work with people Type of actions Track record Curiosity Ability to communicate Fellow opinions Number of followers	2 3 3 1 1 1 2 2	responses*  "His people or interpersonal skills— he must be able to inspire people, his communication skills, (and) his integrity."  "Bo en behalwe die tegniese vaardighede (van die leier) sal ek wil kyk hoe die persoon met mense oor die weg kom, hoe die persoon optree wanneer dit sleg
5. Benefits of leader development	5.1 Benefits of leader development (question 35)	<ul> <li>Organisations are lead</li> <li>Organisational success</li> <li>Organisational sustainability</li> <li>Better economy</li> </ul>	2 6 1 1	gaan"  "Jy kry goeie leiers—dis goed vir die besigheid en die mense."  "Sustainability in the workplace, longevity in the workplace, meeting of shareholders' criteria."
6. Personal experiences with leadership	6.1 Personal experiences with leadership (question 40)	<ul> <li>Leadership leads to the development of others</li> <li>Leadership improves interpersonal skills</li> <li>Gaining of self-insight</li> <li>Leadership leads to personal growth</li> </ul>	2 3 2 4	"I've learnt to stop and smell the roses. I've learnt to listen a bit more."  "'n Baie positiewe ondervinding as 'n leier in die werksplek was (die les) dat 'n mens 'n balans moet hê"

<sup>\*</sup>The examples of responses are provided in the language that the participants gave it—in either English or Afrikaans.



## 4.2.3.1 Discussion of Table 4 per main theme

## 1. Perceptions

The first main theme that was identified from the interview data was that of perception. Participants' perceptions of leader development, leadership, leader, and leader versus manager were identified and the following were found in terms of the subthemes:

#### 1.1 Leader development

Four of the participants perceived the concept of leader development as the process of identifying a person with leadership potential and the intellectual ability to lead. This perception is not specifically supported by the literature of this study, but with further research it can probably be supported. Five of the six participants perceived leader development as the manner of developing someone into a better leader, which is supported by the research of Day (2001, p.584) who states that through leader development a person can progress into a leader with the appropriate qualities. Two participants perceived this concept as the way to take a person to a high level of excellence, which is confirmed by Day (2001) who states that leader development has the focus of building a person's competence (thereby taking him/her to a high level excellence).

Four of the six participants also mentioned the requirement of mentoring for leader development. This last perception is somewhat supported by the references used for this study, as Yukl (2010) mentioned mentoring as a way to develop leaders, and Day (2001) stated that mentoring is seen as an especially effective component of development in context, but within the definition of what leader development is and entails, mentoring is not named specifically.

To sum up the majority perception of what leader development is: Leader development is the process of identifying a person with leadership ability and the intellectual ability to lead and developing this person into a better leader, which will require mentoring.



#### 1.2 Leadership

One participant perceived the concept of leadership to be the ability to take a group progressively from one level to the next. This perception is in accord with Smit (2007, p.596) who describes leadership as an ability to change others' behaviour and move them towards action in terms of a specified goal, thereby taking them from one level to the next. Three of the participants perceived leadership to be about inspiring people, which is supported by Weiss (cited in Smit, 2007) who uses the term "influences" to describe how a leader motivates others. Three participants considered leadership to imply strategic leading, which is implied by Yukl's (2010, p.21) description of leadership: "Leadership is about articulating visions, embodying values, and creating the environment within which things can be accomplished." Being driven by a vision implies being a strategic leader.

Two of the participants perceived leadership to imply being visionary. This is confirmed by Robbins and Judge (2007). Half of the participants perceived leadership to be about engaging actively with others, which is in accord with Stanley (cited in Taylor, 2009, p.1) who describes leadership in terms of unifying people, which would imply engagement. One participant felt that leadership implied the contribution of specialist skills, which can be confirmed by the statement of Barlow et al. (2003) that the foundation of leadership is the leader's character, and that the leader's character is made up of a collection of dispositions, habits and attitudes, which may also include specific skills.

The participants' majority perception of what leadership is, is that it is a strategic act whereby a leader inspires others and engages actively with others.

#### 1.3 Leader

Two of the participants perceived the concept of *leader* as a person with leadership qualities. This perception of what a leader is, is very broad as leadership qualities can constitute many qualities and characteristics—of a personal and work-related nature. Half of the participants perceived a leader to be someone with expert skills and knowledge, which is confirmed by Barlow et al. (2003) who mention the importance for a leader to be intelligent and competent; three participants mentioned the aspects of good communicator and listener, which are also indicated by Bergh and Theron (2003). Four of the participants



described a leader as a person of high integrity, and this notion is confirmed by Barlow et al. (2003) who state the importance for a leader to act with integrity.

Three participants felt that a leader is a visionary person, and this is confirmed by Robbins and Judge (2007). Four of the participants described a leader as a person who is actively involved and visible. This is similar to the notion of Bergh and Theron (2003) who state that a leader needs to encourage and motivate his/her followers (which can indicate active involvement), and provide direction (which can indicate being visible). One participant described a leader as a calculated risk taker, which is in accord with Bergh and Theron (2003) who mention the need for a leader to take risks when a good opportunity arises; while five of the six participants perceived *leader* to be synonymous with leadership.

To sum up the majority perception of what a leader is: A person with leadership skills who acts with high integrity and is actively involved and visible.

#### 1.4 Leader versus manager

All of the participants felt that there is a definite difference between a leader and a manager. Five of the participants described a leader as someone who leads and inspires others to do tasks, while a manager is someone who manages tasks and daily functions.

For the purpose of this study it was only necessary to determine whether there is a difference between a leader and a manager according to the perceptions of the participants in this study. From the interview data it was clear that all of the participants felt that such a difference definitely exists between the two concepts.

#### 2. Leader

The second main theme that was identified from the interview data was that of leader. Participants were asked to identify the personal and work-related characteristics of a leader, as well as the work-related functions of a leader, and the following were found in respect of the subthemes:



#### 2.1 Personal characteristics

The *personal characteristics* of a leader were described by four of the six participants as the characteristic of integrity. Two participants identified competence as a characteristic and Barlow et al. (2003) confirm both of these characteristics. The following characteristics were identified once by individual participants: Fairness, which can be related to the characteristics of honesty and integrity as mentioned by Barlow et al. (2003); respectfulness, which is in accord with the characteristics of being sensitive and compassionate as stated by Bergh and Theron (2003); determination, which is supported by Barlow et al. (2003) who mention the characteristic of conscientious; and decisiveness, which is also supported by Barlow et al. (2003).

The following characteristics were identified by two of the six participants: Strong communication skills, which is confirmed by Bergh and Theron (2003); the ability to guide, which is supported by Bergh and Theron (2003) who state the characteristic of providing direction; and the ability to influence others, which is confirmed by Barlow et al. (2003); Johnson (2002); and Cacioppe (1997), but grouped under the roles and functions of a leader and not under the personal characteristics of a leader.

The characteristic of integrity was seen by the majority of the participants to be the most important personal characteristic for a leader to posses.

#### 2.2 Work-related characteristics

The work-related characteristics that a leader requires were described by individual participants as that of self-insight, balance, and altruism. Self-insight is confirmed by Barlow et al. (2003) as the characteristic of self-awareness. The characteristics of balance and altruism are not mentioned in the literature of this study and therefore require additional attention. Two of the participants identified the characteristic of dedication, which is in accord with Bergh and Theron (2003) who state the importance for a leader to have an active approach towards reaching his/her goals.

Three of the participants mentioned the importance of competence or being an expert; while four participants identified integrity, and both of these characteristics are confirmed by Barlow et al. (2003). Two participants felt that a leader requires a strong communication



ability; three participants mentioned the ability to make decisions; and the ability to influence, and the ability to guide were each identified by two of the six participants. The characteristics of strong communication; decisiveness; ability to influence; and ability to guide has previously been confirmed by the literature of this study.

The characteristic of integrity was seen by the majority of the participants to be the most important work-related characteristic for a leader to have.

#### 2.3 Work-related functions

Under the subtheme of *work-related functions* three of the participants identified the function of ensuring growth (for the organisation, the leader's followers and him/herself); and the function of inspiring others. Both of these functions are supported by Barlow et al. (2003); Johnson (2002); and Cacioppe (1997) who mention the role of a leader to inspire and motivate his/her followers to improve. Two of the six participants mentioned the function of acting as a role-model for others. This function is not mentioned *per se* in the literature of this study, but Shenkman (2008) does describe the necessity for a leader to correctly apply his/her personal values, beliefs and past experiences to decisions and to act with credibility, which relates to acting as a role-model.

The following functions were identified once by individual participants: Training (this function is not confirmed by the literature of this study and it therefore requires more attention); strategising (which is implied by Yukl's (2010, p.21) description of leadership, that states that a leader has to articulate visions, embody values, and create an environment within which things can be accomplished, thereby acting strategically); leading the group (which is supported by Bergh and Theron (2003) who state that a leader has to provide direction to others); monitoring a group (Barlow et al. (2003); Johnson (2002); and Cacioppe (1997) mention a leader's function of influencing others to improve their work, and this would imply the monitoring of the group); and being approachable (this function is not mentioned specifically in the literature of this study, but Bergh and Theron (2003) do refer to the importance for a leader to have a personal and active approach in terms of leading).



Based on the majority perceptions of the participants, ensuring growth and inspiring others are seen as the most important work-related functions of a leader.

#### 3. Success factors for leader development

The third main theme that was identified from the interview data was success factors for leader development. Participants were asked to identify the factors for successful leader development and the factors for leader success. The following were found in respect of this subtheme:

## 3.1 Factors for successful leader development

Three of the six participants identified leader characteristics as a factor that impacts on the success of leader development. This notion is supported by Shenkman (2008) who states that a leader will only be followed by others if he/she projects certain unchanging attributes of his/her character onto others. Three participants suggested that an organisational environment that is conducive to leader development is needed for leader development success, and this factor is confirmed by Yukl (2010) who describes the importance of a supportive learning environment. One participant mentioned the importance of organisational planning and policies for development to be in place for leader development to be successful, as confirmed by Yukl's (2010) notion of a supportive learning environment.

Two of the six participants identified correct leader identification (i.e. identifying those with leader potential for leader development) as a factor for successful leader development. This factor is not specifically supported by the literature of this study. The debate regarding this factor or perception could be about what actually constitutes *leader potential* in the first place. This can be linked to the matter of whether leaders are born or made, and even though there is still no consensus on the matter, it can be concluded from the research that was done for this study, that a leader can in fact be formed or developed. According to Smit (2007); and Barlow et al. (2003) anyone can be a leader given the proper training and development. It is recommended that further research be done on what constitutes leader potential.



The factors that have an impact on whether leader development is successful or not, as identified by the majority of the participants, include leader characteristics and the organisational environment.

## 3.2 Factors for leader success

All of the participants had the perception that specific leader characteristics are needed for a leader to be successful. This perception is supported by Bergh and Theron (2003); and Barlow et al. (2003) who describe these leader characteristics. Four of the six participants perceived a leader's success to be attributed to having followers, and this notion is confirmed by Shenkman (2008) who states that having followers is a leader's primary aim. One participant felt that a leader needs credibility to be successful, which is affirmed by Shenkman (2008). Two participants suggested that a leader's success can be seen in terms of his/her contribution to the organisation's success. Yukl (2010) confirms this notion by stating that the outcomes of a leader's influence on the organisation are indicative of the leader's effectiveness or success. One of the six participants suggested that the organisational environment has to be conducive to leader development for a leader to be able to achieve success, which is confirmed by Yukl (2010).

The participants' majority perceptions of the factors that impact on a leader's success included that of leader characteristics and having followers.

#### 4. Evaluating leader effectiveness

The fourth main theme that was identified from the interview data was evaluating the effectiveness of a leader. Participants were asked to identify criteria that could be used to evaluate leader effectiveness. The following were found in terms of this subtheme:

## 4.1 Criteria to evaluate leader effectiveness

Two of the six participants were of the opinion that a leader's effectiveness should be evaluated according to his/her level of competence (which includes his/her skills). Barlow et al. (2003); Johnson (2002); and Cacioppe (1997) suggest that a leader has to be able to apply resources appropriately, apply knowledge adequately to situations, and correctly utilise his/her interpersonal and communication skills, and all of these skills refer to his/her competence as a leader. Thus, it would seem that competence would be a good evaluator



of a leader's effectiveness. Three of the participants perceived a leader's ability to work with people (interpersonal skills) to be a good measure of his/her effectiveness. According to Bergh and Theron (2003) a leader has to have the ability to relate to people in a sensitive and compassionate way, thus implying the appropriate use of interpersonal skills. Therefore it can be concluded that a leader's interpersonal skills could be a good measure of his/her effectiveness.

Three of the six participants suggested that a leader's effectiveness could be evaluated in terms of the type of actions he/she performs, and these actions include: Being able to deal with difficult situations; acting proactively; acting with integrity; and inspiring others through his/her actions. These actions are confirmed by the literature (Bergh & Theron, 2003; Barlow et al., 2003) as actions that a leader has to perform. Therefore it would seem that the type of actions that a leader performs can be indicative of his/her effectiveness. One of the participants mentioned that a leader's effectiveness could be seen in terms of his/her track record, which is confirmed by Yukl (2010) who states that a leader's effectiveness can be evaluated by determining the extent to which he/she has had a successful career as a leader. Curiosity or showing an interest in the leader's field of work was suggested by one participant as a possible criterion to use to evaluate a leader's effectiveness, and this curiosity or constant search for better ways of doing something is confirmed by Barlow et al. (2003) as a quality that differentiates a leader from a follower. It can be concluded that such curiosity can be indicative of a leader's effectiveness.

The ability to communicate well was also mentioned by one participant. How well a leader communicates can be significant to the effectiveness of a leader, as suggested by Bergh and Theron (2003). Two of the six participants perceived others' opinions of a leader's effectiveness to be an indicative criterion, which is confirmed by Yukl (2010) who states that the attitudes and perceptions that followers hold of a leader can be an indicator of the developed leader's effectiveness. Two participants suggested that a leader's effectiveness can be evaluated in terms of the number of followers that he/she has, and this notion is confirmed by Shenkman (2008) who states that creating followers is a leader's primary role, and would therefore be indicative of his/her effectiveness as a leader.



# 5. Benefits of leader development

The fifth main theme that was identified from the interview data was regarding the benefits of leader development. Participants were asked to identify the specific benefits of leader development and the following were found:

# 5.1 Benefits of leader development

Two participants mentioned the benefit that organisations are lead (according to a vision) and not just managed. A benefit for the organisation that develops leaders, according to Cummings and Worley (2009), is that there is a greater focus on strategic thinking and goal setting, thus implying a long term approach according to a vision. All six participants identified organisational success as a benefit of developing leaders. Cummings and Worley (2009) summarise this perception within the benefits of increased organisational productivity, retainment of valuable talent, and improved knowledge and skills within the organisation. One participant suggested the benefit of organisational sustainability or continuity, which is implied by Cummings and Worley (2009) within the benefits of retainment of valuable talent, increased organisational productivity, improved knowledge and skills of the organisation, and increased sales.

One participant linked leader development to the benefit of a better and more productive economy. Although this benefit is not mentioned in so many words within the literature of this study, it encapsulates all that have been mentioned—that if organisations are to develop leaders and achieve the benefits as described by Cummings and Worley (2009), the economy as a whole could thrive.

### 6. Personal experiences with leadership

The participants were asked to describe their personal experiences with leadership in a work-related context, referring to why they are the leaders they are today. As these are personal experiences that the participants have gained over the years, it will not be interpreted with reference to the literature. The following personal experiences with leadership were mentioned by the participants:



# 6.1 Personal experiences with leadership

Two participants experienced their leadership to have lead to the development of others. Three participants mentioned that leadership taught them to improve their interpersonal skills and to become more people-oriented. Two participants experienced that their leadership forced them to be introspective and to address their shortcomings as leaders, thereby gaining better self-insight. Four of the participants experienced personal growth due to leadership—growth in terms of a better work-life balance, being a role-model, becoming more business mature, and receiving acknowledgement.

# 4.2.4 The connection between mentoring and leader development

The responses on questions 3 to 7 and 41 to 46 were analysed and the summarised result of the responses relating to the main concept of the connection between mentoring and leader development and its related questions is depicted in Table 5:

Table 5: A tabularised summary of results on the connection between mentoring and leader development

Main themes	Subthemes	Recurring responses/ perceptions	Participant responses	Examples of responses*
1. Connection between mentoring and leader development	1.1 Existence of connection (question 3)	Yes     Yes and no	3 3	"Mentorskap is 'n positiewe wyse om mense te ontwikkel"  "In my view it (mentoring) is one of the pillars of leader development."
	1.2 Mentoring contribution to leader development (question 4)	<ul> <li>Development tool</li> <li>Aim is on development</li> <li>Teaches mentee** (developing leader) to become a good/better leader</li> <li>Teaches by sharing knowledge, expertise and experiences</li> <li>Develops mentee by influencing and guiding him/ her</li> </ul>	6 6 4 4	"Een van die fokus areas van mentorskap is juis om iemand wat jy geïdentifiseer het te lei om sy leierseienskappe te ontwikkel."  "jy leer by jou mentor en dis een manier om 'n leier te ontwikkel—om by voorbeeld te sien wat 'n ander persoon doen"



Main themes	Subthemes	Recurring responses/	Participant responses	Examples of responses*
2. Effect of mentoring on leader development	2.1 Extent of the effect (question 5)	<ul> <li>Helping/assisting effect</li> <li>Critical</li> <li>Very positive/ beneficial role</li> </ul>	1 1 4	"in beginsel behoort dit 'n positiewe rol te speel"  "Volgens my is mentorskap 'n positiewe wyse van om <i>mense</i> te ontwikkel—nie net leiers nieso dit is effektief."
	2.2 Type of effect (question 5)	Development of leadership capability	6	"Good mentoring will make a good leader."  "by using the mentor as a sounding board it can help or contribute to (the mentee) becoming more effective."
	2.3 Mentee requirements for effect (question 5)	<ul> <li>Leadership potential</li> <li>Willingness to learn</li> <li>Driving of process</li> </ul>	2 3 2	"As jy iemand het wat potensiaal het en wat bereid is om te leer kan dit verseker 'n baie positiewe rol speel."  "we must identify (potential leaders) up front and start mentoring those who are keen to be mentored and developed."
	2.4 Mentor requirements for effect (question 5)	Adequate experience     Interest in mentee     Interest in building relationship	1 1 1	"dit hang ook af of die mentor daardie ervaring het"  "when I mentor you (the mentee) I must be curious about youabout what you have achievedabout your dreams"



Main themes	Subthemes	Recurring responses/ perceptions	Participant responses	Examples of responses*
3. Contribution of mentoring in the development of effective leaders	3.1 Existence of mentoring contribution (question 6, 43 and 46)	<ul><li>Yes</li><li>Yes, but only assists</li></ul>	3 3	"If it (mentoring) is present it enhances (the effectiveness of leaders)."  "the mentoring that they (mentees) receive may be of an aid to them"
	3.2 Role of mentoring in development of effective leaders (question 7, 44, 45 and 46)	<ul> <li>Can enhance         developing leader's         effectiveness</li> <li>Teaches developing         leader how to be more         effective</li> <li>More effective in terms         of skills, personal         characteristics and         self-insight</li> <li>Effectiveness is gained         through shared         experiences, transfer         of knowledge and self-         development</li> </ul>	6 3 6	"People come alive with sensitised leaders"  "(Mentoring leads to) self-development and this leads to a greater sense of responsibility."  "My character has been strengthened because of (the influences of) other people."
	3.3 Extent of mentoring contribution (question 45)	<ul> <li>Great extent</li> <li>To a certain extent</li> </ul>	5 1	"daar is by my geen twyfel dat ek 'n beter leier is as gevolg van mentorskap."  "mentoring builds one's character."
4. Role of mentoring in gaining of leadership position	4.1 Existence of mentoring role (question 41)	• Yes • No	3 3	"ek dink dit (mentorskap) speel 'n rol."  "No, it is not because of my mentoringthat I ended up in a leadership position"



Main themes	Subthemes	Recurring responses/ perceptions	Participant responses	Examples of responses*
4. Role of mentoring in gaining of leadership position	4.2 Role of mentoring in gaining of leadership position (question 42)	<ul> <li>Building knowledge</li> <li>Gaining experience</li> <li>Developing specific skills</li> </ul>	1 1 2	"Dit (mentorskap) het my interpersoonlike vaardighede verder ontwikkel en dit het my geleer hoe om te kommunikeer"  "(dit was 'n) meer informele mentorskap en tog dink ek speel dit 'n rol want jy leer mos maar so by mense"

<sup>\*</sup>The examples of responses are provided in the language that the participants gave it—in either English or Afrikaans.

# 4.2.4.1 Discussion of Table 5 per main theme

It is important to first note that most of the participants' perceptions that will be discussed under the following four main themes cannot be linked to the literature of this study, as very little literature could be found on the main concept of the connection between mentoring and leader development. Therefore, these perceptions and the interpretations thereof will add to the literature on this main concept, thus reducing this "knowledge gap", especially in terms of the South African literature pertaining to this concept.

#### 1. Connection between mentoring and leader development

The first main theme that was identified from the interview data was related to the connection between mentoring and leader development. Participants were asked whether mentoring can contribute to leader development (*existence of connection*) and how it can contribute (*contribution of mentoring to leader development*) and the following were found in respect of the subthemes:

# 1.1 Existence of connection between mentoring and leader development

The participants were asked whether mentoring contributes to leader development, implying a connection between the two concepts, and three participants were of the

<sup>\*\*</sup>For this discussion "mentee" and "developing leader" will be used synonymously to refer to a person who is in the process of being developed as a leader, and who is being mentored.



opinion that mentoring definitely contributes or leads to leader development. The other three participants were of the opinion that it sometimes can and sometimes cannot contribute to leader development. What was meant by these "yes and no" type of answers, was that mentoring is perceived as only one of the developmental tools that is used in leader development. It thus forms part of leader development, but on its own, mentoring cannot develop a person into a leader—leader development requires other "tools" as well. What was stressed by all of the participants with this perception was the fact that leader development is not possible in the absence of mentoring. It can therefore be concluded that mentoring does in fact foster leader development in some way.

The international literature supports the perception that mentoring is only a component of leader development, and that it is an effective component of leader development (according to Day, 2001). In terms of the perception that mentoring can contribute to leader development, international literature also supports this perception. Stone (2002, p.15) state that mentoring has worth in leader development; Day (2001) state that mentoring is particularly suited to develop leaders; and Shenkman (2008, p.181) state that no leaders can be created without mentors.

Overall, the conclusion can be made that there is a connection between mentoring and leader development and that mentoring can be used to develop leaders.

### 1.2 Contribution of mentoring to leader development

The participants were asked how mentoring could contribute to leader development and all six of the participants perceived mentoring to be a developmental tool that is used to assist individuals in developing themselves further. All six participants perceived the aim of mentoring to be on development. Four of the six participants perceived mentoring as a process to teach a person to become a good or better leader. Four participants mentioned that mentoring teaches or develops a person into a good or better leader through the sharing of (the mentor's) knowledge, expertise and experience. Four participants also mentioned that mentoring develops a person into a good or better leader by influencing and guiding him/her.



What can be concluded from these perceptions on the contribution that mentoring has on leader development specifically, is that it focuses on a person's development and teaches that person to become a good or a better leader.

# 2. Effect of mentoring on leader development

The first main theme that was identified from the interview data was regarding the effect that mentoring has on leader development. Participants were asked to describe their perceptions of the effect or impact that mentoring has on the development of leaders and the following subthemes emerged:

# 2.1 Extent of the effect of mentoring on leader development

One of the six participants described the effect that mentoring has on the development of leaders as a helping or assisting effect, meaning that mentoring only aids in the development of leaders. One participant perceived mentoring to have a critical effect in the development of leaders, implying that leader development is not possible in the absence of mentoring. Four out of six participants perceived mentoring to play a very positive or beneficial role in the development of leaders, as mentoring is specifically aimed at developing individuals.

Based on the majority perception of the participants it can be concluded that mentoring has the ability to positively impact or benefit the leader development initiative, which is supported by Stone (2002, p.15) who states that mentoring has worth or value in leader development.

### 2.2 Type of effect of mentoring on leader development

Regarding the type of effect that mentoring has on the development of leaders, all of the participants perceived that this effect lies in the ability of mentoring to develop a person's leadership capability and competence. Thus, with regard to leader development mentoring can be used to develop a person's ability to be a leader.

This perception is supported by both South African and international literature that state that mentoring can be used to develop leadership (Meyer & Fourie, 2004, p.11); and that



mentoring can develop intrapersonal competence, which is the aim of leader development (Day, 2001).

- 2.3 Mentee requirements for the effect of mentoring on leader development to be possible The majority (four out of six) of participants all mentioned specific requirements that had to be present if the effect of mentoring (in terms of developing a person's leadership capability) were to be achieved. In terms of a mentee or developing leader, two participants mentioned the requirement for a mentee to possess leadership potential. As previously mentioned, it is still unclear what is meant by leadership potential and therefore this perceived requirement requires further attention. Three out of six participants were of the opinion that a mentee requires a willingness to learn, meaning that he/she must have a desire to develop him/herself further. Clutterbuck (2005, p.7-8) also states that a mentee should have a commitment towards learning. Lastly, two participants mentioned the requirement for the development process to be driven by the mentee. This perception is somewhat supported by Clutterbuck (2005, p.7-8) who states that a mentee must have an active involvement in the development process, which can imply that the mentee has to drive the process.
- 2.4 Mentor requirements for the effect of mentoring on leader development to be possible. Three of the six participants were of the opinion that a mentor has to meet certain requirements if mentoring is to develop leadership capability. One participant perceived adequate experience and expertise (of a mentor) to be a requirement. This perception is confirmed by Janse van Rensburg and Roodt (2005); Truter (2008); and Meyer and Fourie (2004). Having an interest in a mentee was also mentioned as a requirement by one participant, and this perception is supported by Janse van Rensburg and Roodt (2005); Truter (2008); and Meyer and Fourie (2004), who describes having an interest in the development of people as a necessary work-related characteristic. Lastly, the requirement of having an interest in building a relationship with a mentee was mentioned by one of the participants, and confirmed by Johnson and Ridley (2004).
- 3. Contribution of mentoring in the development of effective leaders

The third main theme that was identified from the interview data was related to the contribution that mentoring has in the development of effective leaders. Participants were



asked whether mentoring can contribute to the development of effective leaders (existence of mentoring contribution), how it can contribute to the development of effective leaders (role of mentoring in the development of effective leaders), and to what extent mentoring can have an effect on the development of effective leaders (extent of mentoring contribution) and the following were found in respect of the subthemes:

### 3.1 Existence of mentoring contribution in the development of effective leaders

Three of the participants were of the opinion that mentoring can develop effective leaders. The other three participants were of the opinion that mentoring can only assist in the development of effective leaders (meaning that mentoring is only one of the developmental tools that are needed for the development of effective leaders), and that this does not guarantee that effective leaders will emerge.

It can therefore be concluded that mentoring can be used as one of the tools to develop effective leaders, but that it cannot assure the effectiveness of these leaders.

# 3.2 Role of mentoring in the development of effective leaders

Mentoring, as described by all six of the participants, has the ability to enhance the effectiveness of a leader. This is done (according to three participants) by teaching a person *how* to improve his/her effectiveness in terms of his/her leadership capability. Mentoring improves leadership capability in terms of skills, personal characteristics, and self-insight, according to all six participants. According to three of the participants these skills, characteristics and self-insight are taught by means of the sharing of (a mentor's) experiences, the transfer of (a mentor's) knowledge and through self-development.

The skills referred to that are taught by mentoring include business maturity, which refers to a person's ability or maturity to judge and deal with circumstances appropriately (as mentioned by one participant); listening and communication skills (as mentioned by three participants); alternative ways of thinking (as mentioned by one participant); interpersonal skills in terms of being more people-oriented (as mentioned by three participants); and influencing ability referring to the ability to influence and guide others (as mentioned by four participants).



The personal characteristics referred to that are developed by means of mentoring include the building of a person's character (as mentioned by two participants); being more understanding (as mentioned by one participant); calmness (as mentioned by one participant); discipline (as mentioned by one participant); and commitment (as mentioned by one participant). The research of Day (2001) supports the notion that mentoring can develop personal characteristics, such as those mentioned by the participants, but refers to the development of intrapersonal competence, instead of the development of personal characteristics.

The self-insight that is gained through mentoring refers to introspection (as mentioned by three participants); and personal growth (as mentioned by two participants). Mentoring forces a person to undertake introspection or self-analysis in order to gain more insight into him/herself and through this a person can become a better, more effective leader. As a person gains this insight it can help him/her to grow as a person.

The literature of this study does not state whether or not mentoring has the ability to enhance the effectiveness of a leader. It can be confirmed that mentoring teaches a person specific job-related skills, attitudes and behaviours (according to Van Dijk, 2008), but the literature does not state to what degree of effectiveness it does so. Truter (2008); Meyer and Fourie (2004); Janse van Rensburg and Roodt (2005, p.10); and Pinho et al. (2005, p.20) confirm that these skills, attitudes and behaviours are taught by means of sharing experiences, transferring knowledge, and through self-development (or psychological growth).

Based on the participants' majority perceptions, it can be concluded that mentoring has the ability to enhance the effectiveness of a leader in terms of specific skills, personal characteristics and self-insight.

# 3.3 Extent of mentoring contribution on the development of effective leaders

The participants were asked to describe to what extent mentoring affected their effectiveness as leaders. Five of the six participants perceived mentoring to have affected their effectiveness to a great extent, as it enabled them to become better listeners, to become more sensitised to people, to become better at guiding others, and as it facilitated



their growth as leaders. One of the participants perceived mentoring to have affected his effectiveness as a leader only to a certain extent.

Based on the majority perception of the participants, it can be concluded that mentoring as a developmental tool has the ability to develop leaders, and the ability to develop effective leaders.

# 4. Role of mentoring in the gaining of a leadership position

Participants were asked whether their part in a mentoring relationship played a role in their placement in a leadership position (existence of mentoring role), and if so, how it played a role (role of mentoring in the gaining of a leadership position) and the following were found on each of the subthemes:

## 4.1 Existence of mentoring role in the gaining of a leadership position

Three of the six participants perceived their part in a mentoring relationship to have played a role in their placement in a leadership position. The other three participants did not perceive their part in a mentoring relationship to have played a role in their placement in a leadership position, and their reasons included: The placement was due to the participant's functional expertise; the placement took place before becoming involved in a mentoring relationship; and the developmental effect of mentoring was only experienced long after the placement.

# 4.2 Role of mentoring in the gaining of a leadership position

Three participants perceived mentoring to have played a role in their placement in a leadership position, for the following reasons: Mentoring assisted in the building of knowledge; it assisted in the gaining of experience; and it assisted in the development of specific skills, such as interpersonal and communication skills. These factors, according to the participants, made them better equipped for leadership positions.

#### 4.3 SUMMARY

In this chapter the results gained from the data analysis were tabularised and discussed critically with reference to South African and international literature on mentoring, leader



development and the connection between mentoring and leader development. General conclusions on the main concepts under study were made based on literary support and the majority perceptions of the participants. What was found overall was that mentoring can be used to develop leaders (thus implying a connection between the two concepts); and that mentoring can positively impact on leader development. In the following chapter significant conclusions regarding the main concepts under study will be discussed and recommendations for further studies will be made.



# CHAPTER 5 CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

#### 5.1 INTRODUCTION

The purpose of this study was to determine the effect of mentoring on the development of leaders in the South African business context by utilising the perceptions and experiences of people who have been personally exposed to both mentoring and leader development. Their insights and perceptions provided the necessary information from which conclusions on the matter could be drawn.

In Chapter 4 the relevant and most informative results from the interview data were given and critically discussed. In this chapter the conclusions drawn from these results will be discussed and some recommendations for further studies will be made.

#### 5.2 CONCLUSIONS DRAWN FROM RESULTS

Based on the results from the interview data and the South African and international literature on mentoring, leader development and the connection between mentoring and leader development, the following significant conclusions could be made in terms of each of the main concepts:

## 5.2.1 Mentoring

One of the main objectives of the study was to determine what is meant by mentoring and the main components thereof and the following conclusions were made by the researcher:

- Mentoring is perceived as a process which encompasses coaching, counselling and training and that is aimed at helping a less experienced person develop personally and professionally, thereby adding value to this person.
- A mentor is perceived as an experienced and knowledgeable person who has the ability to teach, guide and challenge a mentee by providing him/her with knowledge, guidance, shared experiences and skills.



- A mentee is perceived as a person with a desire for learning and for personal and professional growth.
- The effect of mentoring on a mentee's growth and development is perceived to be the best indicator of the impact of mentoring.

# 5.2.2 <u>Leader development</u>

A main objective of the study was to determine what is meant by leader development and the main components thereof and the following conclusions were made by the researcher:

- Leader development is perceived as the process of identifying a person with leadership ability and the intellectual ability to lead, and developing this person into a better leader, which will require mentoring.
- A leader is perceived as a person with leadership acumen who acts with great integrity and is actively involved and visible.
- Leader characteristics and the organisational environment are perceived as the two
  most important factors to impact on the success of leader development.
- A conclusion could not be made about whether or not a person truly *requires* leader potential for leader development.

### 5.2.3 The connection between mentoring and leader development

This main concept addressed the core of the study in terms of its main purpose—to determine whether and to what effect mentoring can be used to foster leader development, specifically in the South African business context. In order to arrive at conclusions regarding this main concept, literature was consulted to determine if a connection exists between mentoring and leader development; interview data was critically analysed to determine the effect or impact that mentoring has on the development of leaders within South African organisations; and the "knowledge gap" in past research to describe the outcomes of mentoring in terms of its ability to develop leaders was addressed.

The following conclusions on this main concept were made by the researcher:

 There is a connection between mentoring and leader development and mentoring can be used to develop leaders.



- Leader development is not possible in the absence of mentoring.
- Mentoring can contribute to leader development by focussing on a person's development and teaching that person to become a good or a better leader.
- Mentoring has the ability to positively impact or benefit leader development.
- Mentoring has the ability to develop a person's leadership capability and competence (i.e. his/her ability to be a leader).
- Mentoring can be used as a tool to develop effective leaders.
- Mentoring has the ability to enhance the effectiveness of a leader in terms of specific skills, personal characteristics and self-insight, but it cannot guarantee the effectiveness of a leader.

#### 5.3 RECOMMENDATIONS

The study had certain shortcomings which should be addressed if future research is to be conducted on this study. Recommendations have been made to address the shortcomings of the study:

For future researchers who want to use the phenomenological research approach to understand certain phenomena, it is recommended to first determine whether the specific phenomena under study can in effect be commonly described (Watson and Welch-Ross, 2000). Thus, there has to be the possibility for a "commonality of meanings" (Watson & Welch-Ross, 2000, p.195) related to the specific perceptions and experiences of the phenomena under study.

It can be recommended that future researchers be trained in the phenomenological research approach prior to collecting their data, as a well trained researcher may find it easier to develop an accurate description of the participants' perceptions and experiences, than one whose training is limited (Watson & Welch-Ross, 2000).

In conducting this study, time constraints did not allow for follow-up meetings with participants to verify their answers and the interpretation of these answers. It is thus recommended that future researchers who want to follow a phenomenological research approach should incorporate time into their studies to clarify whether they have accurately



interpreted what their participants meant in their responses. This will ensure a greater phenomenal accuracy (Watson & Welch-Ross, 2000).

This study was not representative of both genders and therefore it is recommended that for further studies women should also be interviewed to determine whether gender plays a role in how mentoring and leader development are perceived in the business context. This might lead to some interesting insights about the phenomena being studied.

It is important that further research be done on the matter of coaching versus mentoring—whether the two concepts are the same, different, or merely connected. It is safe to say that the line between the two concepts is sometimes extremely blurry and that it is often very difficult to differentiate between the two concepts (Johnson, 2002, p.42). A clearer conclusion on the matter is needed in order to eliminate any further confusion on the theoretical and practical application of both coaching and mentoring.

It was evident from the interview data that there is a lot of confusion in the business environment surrounding the meanings of certain terminologies, for instance what is meant by *leadership development*, *leader development*, *coaching*, and *mentoring*. Terminology is being over-intellectualised which brings confusion and uncertainty to the business environment, instead of adding value to it. It is therefore recommended that terminology be simplified, or at least standardised to some degree, in order to make it easier to understand for those in both the academic and the business environments, as well as to make it more applicable in the business environment.

For this study it was difficult to find supporting literature for the theme of how to evaluate the effect of mentoring in an organisation. Although the interview data adds value to the understanding of this theme, further research is needed on how the effect of mentoring can be evaluated organisationally and in terms of the mentee.

In terms of leader development specifically, organisations need to keep in mind the focus of the leader development initiative—whether it is focussed on leader competencies or competence. For leader development to actually work the focus has to shift from the theoretical competencies that an effective leader requires, to a broader focus which



includes the results that a leader actually produces. These results reflect a leader's competence, and not only their competencies (Conger & Riggio, 2007).

It was evident from analysing and interpreting the interview data in relation to the relevant literature, that there is confusion regarding what constitutes leader potential and whether leader potential should be a prerequisite for leader development. Leader potential may be linked to the debate surrounding whether leaders are born or made, and it is recommended that additional research is required to clarify this confusion.

# 5.4 SUMMARY AND CONCLUSION

This chapter concludes the final phase of this study. Conclusions on the three main concepts under study were made and recommendations for further studies were given. The objectives of the study have been met, the research problem has been answered, and the "knowledge gap" in past research has been reduced by advancing the knowledge and understanding of these main concepts, especially in a South African business context.

Critically studying and understanding the phenomena of mentoring, leader development and its connection, has made it clear that mentoring has a strong ability to develop leaders, and that it has had many success stories to date. Organisations—both South African and international—need to commit to mentoring if their organisations are to thrive under good leadership. "Remember: no mentors, no leaders. Period." (Shenkman, 2008, p.181)



# LIST OF REFERENCES

Barlow, C.B., Jordan, M., & Hendrix, W.H. (2003). Character assessment: An examination of leadership levels. *Journal of Business and Psychology*, *17(4)*, 563-584.

Bergh, S.C., & Theron, A.L. (2003). *Psychology in the work context*. Cape Town: Oxford University Press South Africa.

Blunt, R.J.S., & Conolly, J. (2006). Perceptions of mentoring: Expectations of a key resource for a higher education. *South African Journal of Higher Education*, *20(2)*, 195-208.

Cacioppe, R. (1998). Leaders developing leaders: An effective way to enhance leadership development programs. *Leadership and Organisation Development Journal, 19(4)*, 194-198.

Cacioppe, R. (1997). Leadership moment by moment! *Leadership and Organisation Development Journal*, 18(7), 335-345.

Clutterbuck, D. (2005). Establishing and maintaining mentoring relationships: An overview of mentor and mentee competencies. *SA Journal of Human Resource Management*, *3*(3), 2-9.

Conger, J.A., & Riggio, R.E. (2007). *The practice of leadership: Developing the next generation of leaders*. California: Jossey-Bass Incorporated.



Creswell, J.W. (2009). Research design: Qualitative, quantitative, and mixed methods approaches. London: SAGE Publications Incorporated.

Creswell, J.W., Hanson, W.E., Clark Plano, V.L., & Morales, A. (2007). Qualitative research designs: Selection and implementation. *The Counselling Psychologist*, *35*(2), 252-255.

Cummings, T.G., & Worley, C.G. (2009). *Organisation development and change*. USA: Cengage Learning.

Day, D.V. (2001). Leadership development: A review in context. *Leadership Quarterly*, 11(4), 581–613.

Friday, E., Friday, S.S., & Green, A.L. (2004). A reconceptualisation of mentoring and sponsoring. *Management Decision*, *42*(5), 628-644.

Friday, E., & Friday, S.S. (2002). Formal mentoring: Is there a strategic fit? *Management Decision*, 40(2), 152-157.

Gibb, S. (1994). Evaluating mentoring. *Education and Training*, 36(5), 32-39.

Gibbs, T., Brigden, D., & Hellenberg, D. (2005). Mentoring in medical practice: Open forum. South African Family Practice, 47(8), 5-6.



Heimbrock, H. (2005). From Data to theory: Elements of methodology in empirical phenomenological research in practical theology. *International Journal of Practical Theology*, *9*(2), 273-299. Retrieved June, 30, 2011, from http://o-ejournals.ebsco.com.innopac.up.ac.za/direct.asp?ArticleID=48AEA44C413221336E94

Hopen, D. (2010). The changing role and practices of successful leaders. *Journal for Quality & Participation*, 33(1), 4-9.

Janse van Rensburg, K., & Roodt, G. (2005). A normative instrument for assessing the mentoring role. *South African Journal of Human Resource Management*, *3*(3), 10-19.

Johnson, H.E. (2002). *Mentoring greatness: How to build a great business*. USA: Griffin Publishing Group.

Johnson, W.B., & Ridley, C.R. (2004). *The elements of mentoring*. New York: Palgrave Macmillan.

Leedy, P.D., & Ormrod, J.E. (2010). *Practical research: Planning and design*. New Jersey: Pearson Education International.

Lewis, P., Saunders, M., & Thornhill, A. (2009). *Research methods for business students*. England: Pearson Education International.

Meyer, M., & Fourie, L. (2004). *Mentoring and coaching: Tools and techniques for implementation*. Johannesburg: Knowres Publishing.



Pinho, S.D.C., Coetsee, M., & Schreuder, D. (2005). Formal mentoring: Mentee and mentor expectations and perceived challenges. *SA Journal of Human Resource Management*, *3*(3), 20-26.

Pratt, M.G. (2009). For the lack of a boilerplate: Tips on writing up (and reviewing) qualitative research. *Academy of Management Journal*, *52(5)*, 856-862.

Robbins, S.P., & Judge, T.A. (2007). *Organisational Behavior*. New Jersey: Pearson Prentice Hall.

Shenkman, M. H. (2008). Leader mentoring. U.S.A: Career Press.

Smit, G. (2007). Paradigmaskuiwe in die huidige leierskapsdiskoers—enkele praktiesteologiese oorwegings. *Dutch Reformed Theological Journal*, *48*(3&4), 594-603.

Sondhi, R. (2009). Results oriented mentoring: Key leadership element. *Management Today*, *25(1)*, 41-43.

Stone, F. (2002). Coaching and mentoring. Oxford: Capstone Publishing.

Taylor, R. (2009). Leadership theories and the development of nurses in primary health care. *Primary Health Care.* 19(9), 40-45.



Truter, I. (2008). Responsibilities of a leader as a coach and mentor. *SA Pharmaceutical Journal*, *75(5)*, 58-61.

Van Dijk, H.G. (2008). The talent management approach to Human Resource Management: Attracting and retaining the right people. *Journal of Public Administration*, 43(3.1), 385.

Watson, N., & Welch-Ross, M.K. (2000). Measuring phenomenal accuracy: An empirical evaluation of a phenomenological method. *Journal of Constructivist Psychology, 13(3)*, 181-198. Retrieved June, 30, 2011, from http://dx.doi.org/10.1080/107205300405319

Werts, F.J. (2005). Phenomenological research methods for counselling psychology. *Journal of Counselling Psychology, 52(2),* 167-177.

Yukl, G. (2010). Leadership in organizations. New Jersey: Pearson Education.

APPENDIX A - Questionnaire -

# Questions pertaining to mentoring and leader development:

- 1. Please explain your understanding or perception of *mentoring* in as much detail as possible.
- 2. Please explain your understanding or perception of *leader development* in as much detail as possible.
- 3. \*Do you think that mentoring can contribute to leader development?
- 4. \*If you answered yes to the above question, *how* do you think mentoring can contribute to leader development?
- 5. \*What is your perception of the *effect* that mentoring has on the development of leaders?
- 6. \*If you do think that mentoring can be used to develop leaders, do you think that mentoring will develop *effective* leaders? (Describe effectiveness in terms of measurement criteria and desired outcomes)
- 7. \*If you answered yes to the above question, please explain why you think that mentoring will develop effective leaders.

# Questions pertaining to the concept of mentoring:

- 8. Please explain your understanding of a *mentor* in as much detail as possible.
- 9. Please explain your understanding of a *mentee* in as much detail as possible.
- 10. What, in your opinion, are the personal characteristics that a mentor should possess? (Please provide explanations)
- 11. What, in your opinion, are the work related *characteristics* that a mentor should possess? (Please provide explanations)
- 12. What work related *functions/roles*, in your opinion, should a mentor perform? (Please provide explanations)
- 13. In your opinion, what makes a mentoring relationship successful?
- 14. Based on your previous answer, what do you consider to be the most important aspect or element of a mentoring relationship?
- 15. What criteria would you use to evaluate the effect of mentoring in an organisation? (Please provide explanations)



16. What would you say are the benefits of the mentoring process?

# Questions pertaining to the personal involvement in a mentoring relationship:

- 17. What position are you currently working in?
- 18. Are you currently, or have you previously been involved as either a mentor or mentee in a mentoring relationship?
- 19. If you are, or have been involved in a mentoring relationship, what is/was your role in that relationship (i.e. mentor or mentee)?
- 20. Where do/did you perform your role as either mentor or mentee (i.e. which company)?
- 21. What job title do/did you possess at the time of partaking in the mentoring relationship?
- 22. What functions or roles do/did you have to perform in the above mentioned mentoring relationship?
- 23. Please tell me, in great detail, of your *personal* experiences with mentoring in a work related context.
- 24. Is there anything that you would like to add about mentoring?

# Questions pertaining to the concept of leader development:

- 25. Please explain your understanding of the concept *leadership* in as much detail as possible.
- 26. Please explain your understanding of a leader in as much detail as possible.
- 27. Is it your opinion that there is a difference between a "leader" and a "manager"?
- 28. What, in your opinion, are the personal *characteristics* that a leader should possess? (Please provide explanations)
- 29. What, in your opinion, are the work related *characteristics* that a leader should possess? (Please provide explanations)
- 30. What work related *functions/roles*, in your opinion, should a leader perform? (Please provide explanations)
- 31. What factors, according to you, are necessary for the successful development of leaders?



- 32. In your opinion, what makes a leader successful?
- 33. Based on your previous answer, what do you consider to be the most important aspect or element of leadership?
- 34. What criteria would you use to evaluate whether a person in your organisation is an effective/good leader? (Please provide explanations)
- 35. What would you say are the benefits of developing leaders?

# Questions pertaining to the personal involvement in leadership:

- 36. Are you currently, or have you ever been in a leadership position in the organisation that you are/were working for?
- 37. What is/was the job title of this leadership position?
- 38. At what company do/did you hold this leadership position?
- 39. What functions do/did you have to perform while holding this leadership position?
- 40. Please tell me, in detail, of your *personal* experiences with leadership in a work related context (referring to the kind of leader that you are/were).
- 41. Do you think that your part in a mentoring relationship played a role in your *placement* in a leadership position?
- 42. Please explain to what degree you would attribute your part in a mentoring relationship to your *placement* in a leadership position?
- 43.\*Has *your* personal involvement in a mentoring relationship contributed to your personal development as a leader?
- 44.\*If you answered yes to the above question, *how* did your involvement in a mentoring relationship contribute to your personal development as a leader? (Please be specific; and refer to the specific aspects of mentoring that contributed to your leader development)
- 45.\*Please explain, in detail, to what extent you consider mentoring to have affected the type of leader that you are/were? Meaning, are/were you a better or more effective leader because of mentoring?
- 46.\*Please answer the following question critically: From your personal experiences, do you think that you would have been the same type of leader if you did not take part in a mentoring relationship?
- 47. Is there anything that you would like to add about leadership/leader development?



48.Is there anything that you would like to add to the information that you have provided during this interview?

\*Key questions pertaining to the purpose of the study



APPENDIX B - Informed consent form -	





# Informed consent for participation in an academic research study

# **Dept. of Human Resource Management**

# THE EFFECT OF MENTORING ON THE DEVELOPMENT OF LEADERS: A QUALITATIVE STUDY.

Research conducted by: Miss. O.M. Swanepoel (26019508) Cell: 082 960 5557

#### Dear Respondent

You are invited to participate in an academic research study conducted by Olga Swanepoel, a Masters student from the Department of Human Resource Management at the University of Pretoria.

The purpose of the study is to determine if the mentoring of employees in the South African business context has an effect on their leader development.

#### Please note the following:

- This study involves an <u>anonymous</u> in-depth interview. Your name will not appear on any published documentation and the information you give will be treated as strictly <u>confidential</u>. You cannot be identified in person based on the information you give.
- Your participation in this study is very important to us. You may, however, choose not to participate and you may also stop participating at any time without any negative consequences.
- Should you agree to participate in the study, the researcher will contact you to arrange a suitable date and time for the in-depth interview.
- The results of the study will be used for academic purposes only and may be published in an academic journal. We will provide you with a summary of our findings on request.
- The data will be stored in the formats of hand written notes and audiotapes.
- Please contact my supervisor, Prof. H.E. Brand at 012 420 3433 if you have any questions or comments regarding the study.

#### Please sign the form to indicate that:

- You have read and understand the information provided above.
- You give your consent to participate in the study on a voluntary basis.

Respondent's signature	Date