

THE RELATIONSHIP BETWEEN TOTAL QUALITY  
MANAGEMENT AND SCHOOL IMPROVEMENT

By

SEAKE HARRY RAMPA

THESIS

Submitted in fulfilment of the requirements for the degree

PHILOSOPHIAE DOCTOR

in the

DEPARTMENT: EDUCATION MANAGEMENT AND  
POLICY STUDIES

in the

FACULTY OF EDUCATION

at the

UNIVERSITY OF PRETORIA

Supervisor: Dr. J Heystek

October 2004

## ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

I wish to express my gratitude and appreciation to the following people and organisations:

- Dr. Heystek, my supervisor, for his invaluable academic and professional guidance, expert advice and untiring support and inspiration displayed throughout the duration of this study.
- The financial contribution from Tshwane University of Technology (formerly Technikon Northern Gauteng).
- The principals, deputy principals, head of departments, educators and learners of the District D3 – Tshwane North Schools who allowed me to proceed with data collection under such difficult circumstances.
- The project: *Research Capacity Building (RCB)* for my capacity building regarding the projects in the Soshanguve schools.
- Mr. A Welman for the initial language editing of the first draft of the thesis.
- Dr. B Malan for the final editing, layout and re-typing part of the thesis.
- Mrs De-Klerk for transcription of interviews from audio to print documents.
- Lastly, my wife Lindiwe and children Suzan, Luvuyo, Lesego and Gontse. for the sacrifices a family inevitably makes to enable a father to study.

## Declaration

I declare that: *The relationship between Total Quality Management and School Improvement* is my own work, that all the sources used or quoted have been indicated and acknowledged by means of complete reference, and that this thesis was not previously submitted by me for a degree at another university

.....

Seake Harry Rampa  
Student No. 20232307

## **ABSTRACT**

The relationship between Total Quality Management  
and School Improvement

by

Seake Harry Rampa

Supervisor: Dr. J Heystek

Department: Education Management and Policy Studies

Degree: Philosophiae Doctor

The poor functioning of a large number of the black schools and the urgent need to transform them was identified as a problematic phenomenon particular to post apartheid South Africa. Notwithstanding various government interventions/initiatives (*COLTS, Tirisano, Call to Action, Batho-Pele*) for the improvement of schools aimed at correcting this situation, many schools remain dysfunctional and/or operate within a negative culture of teaching, learning and services.

The purpose of the study was to determine whether or not the adoption of a TQM philosophy that complemented previous interventions could rectify the current situation. To this end, an exhaustive literature review was conducted on COLTS, Tirisano and TQM prior to and during the empirical survey of dysfunctional schools in District D3 - Tshwane-North schools.

The empirical design is eclectic in the sense that it includes both qualitative and quantitative elements. Survey questionnaires, semi-structured interviews and unstructured observation were used to collect data in a case study of the District D3-Tshwane North schools, a triangulation process that enhanced the reliability and validity of the research findings.

Emerging from the survey and the literature review was the need for a different intervention strategy, one that would accommodate differences in and between schools rather than assuming the appropriateness of a 'one size fits all' intervention model. Based on the research findings emerging from the literature review and empirical survey it was concluded that such a model should be integrated into a TQM intervention framework that would be flexible enough to accommodate differences in schools with regard to contexts, needs, strengths and weaknesses. Drawing role players into new managerialism - and so into the new episteme may enhance the improvement of schools.

The primary outcome of this research project, and the contribution made to new knowledge in the field, is the development of such an integrated framework, one which is not only theoretically sound but one which has been customised for South African conditions.

### **Key words**

Total Quality Management

Culture of learning, teaching and services

Leadership

Transformation

School improvement

Dysfunctional schools

Tirisano strategy

Batho-Pele principle

Philosophy

Intervention strategies

<b>TABLE OF CONTENTS</b>	<b>PAGES</b>
<b>CHAPTER ONE: ORIENTATION</b>	
<b>1.1 Introduction</b>	<b>1</b>
1.1.1 Context	3
<b>1.2 Problem statement</b>	<b>7</b>
<b>1.3 Objectives</b>	<b>8</b>
<b>1.4 Empirical design and methodology</b>	<b>10</b>
1.4.1 Literature review	10
1.4.2 Empirical design and methodology	11
1.4.2.1 Quantitative methods	11
1.4.2.2 Qualitative methods	11
1.4.3 Sampling	12
<b>1.5 Clarification of concepts</b>	<b>12</b>
1.5.1 Total Quality Management	12
1.5.2 Culture of learning, teaching and services	13
1.5.3 Transformation	12
1.5.4 Principles	13
1.5.5 Philosophy	14
1.5.6 Dysfunctional school	14
<b>1.6 Summary</b>	<b>14</b>
<b>CHAPTER TWO: THE CULTURE OF LEARNING, TEACHING AND SERVICES</b>	
<b>2.1 Introduction</b>	<b>15</b>
2.2 What is a culture of learning, teaching and services	15
2.2.1 The role players in a culture of learning, teaching and services	17
<b>2.3 The negative culture of learning, teaching and services</b>	<b>25</b>

2.3.1	District D3 – Tshwane North Schools: A situation analysis	26
<b>2.4</b>	<b>Addressing dysfunctional schools in the transition period</b>	<b>30</b>
2.4.1	Towards principles for intervention	31
2.4.1.1	Culture of learning, teaching and services	31
2.4.1.2	Transition: From COLTS to Tirisano	35
2.4.2	Relationship between COLTS and Tirisano	36
2.4.2.1	Leadership and Management	38
2.4.2.2	Governance	39
2.4.2.3	Making schools work	39
2.4.2.4	Status and quality teaching	39
2.4.2.5	Schools safety	40
2.4.2.6	School infrastructure	40
2.4.2.7	Learner achievement	40
<b>2.5</b>	<b>Impact of the interventions and codes of ethics</b>	<b>40</b>
<b>2.6</b>	<b>Summary</b>	<b>41</b>
<b>CHAPTER THREE: TOTAL QUALITY MANAGEMENT FOR SCHOOLS</b>		
<b>3.1</b>	<b>Introduction</b>	<b>43</b>
<b>3.2</b>	<b>Total Quality Management for schools</b>	<b>43</b>
3.2.1	TQM culture	46
3.2.2	TQM vision	47
3.2.3	TQM principles and pillars	48
<b>3.3</b>	<b>TQM for schools</b>	<b>49</b>
3.3.1.	Deming's Fourteen Points	52
<b>3.4</b>	<b>The need for school change to be managed</b>	<b>58</b>

3.4.1	Sources of change	58
3.4.2	Objects of change	60
3.4.3	Methods of change	60
3.4.4	Resistance to change	63
3.4.5	Arguments against the use of TQM in schools	64
3.4.6	Benefits of TQM for schools	65
<b>3.5</b>	<b>The implementation to Total Quality management in schools</b>	<b>67</b>
3.5.1	Determine school's formal strategy for the implementation of TQM	68
3.5.2	TQM and continuous improvement of school	72
3.5.2.1	TQM pillars and school improvement	72
3.5.2.2	TQM strategies for continuous improvement	74
3.5.3	A TQM model for continuous improvement of schools	80
3.5.3.1	TQM culture and schools	85
3.5.3.2	TQM vision and school improvement	87
3.5.3.3	Institutionalising TQM and management of change	89
3.5.3.4	Guidelines for the implementation of TQM for schools	92
3.5.3.5	The importance of teams in the implementation phases	93
3.5.3.6	The role of leadership and the creation of quality culture	95
<b>3.6</b>	<b>Summary</b>	<b>99</b>
<b>CHAPTER FOUR: RESEARCH DESIGN, METHODOLOGY AND RESULTS</b>		
<b>4.1</b>	<b>Introduction to empirical study</b>	<b>100</b>
4.1.1	The literature review	100
4.1.2	The empirical study	101
<b>4.2</b>	<b>Research design and methodology</b>	<b>102</b>
4.2.1	Data collection methods	105
4.2.2	Population and sample size	108



4.2.2.1 Pilot study	108
4.2.3 Sampling procedures	110
4.2.4 Presentation and interpretation of results	113
<b>4.3 Research findings</b>	<b>113</b>
<b>4.3.1 Educators' biographical data</b>	<b>114</b>
4.3.1.1 Gender	114
4.3.1.2 Years of experience	114
4.3.1.3 Present position	115
4.3.1.4 Educators' qualifications	116
4.3.1.5 Management qualification	116
4.3.1.6 Area of specialisation	117
4.3.1.7 Area where school is situated	117
<b>4.3.2 Learners' biographical data</b>	<b>117</b>
4.3.2.1 Gender	118
4.3.2.2 Age	118
4.3.2.3 Field of study	118
4.3.2.4 Aggregate at Grade 10	119
4.3.2.5 Dropout rate	120
4.3.2.6 Reasons for dropping out	120
4.3.2.7 School location	121
4.3.2.8 Care giver	122
<b>4.3.3 Principals' biographical data</b>	<b>123</b>
<b>4.4 The prevailing culture of learning, teaching and services at schools</b>	<b>126</b>
4.4.1 Principals' opinions about COLTS as a concept	126
4.4.2 Educators, learners' and principals' about character traits of positive COLTS	127
4.4.3 Educators', learners' and principals' opinions regarding principals' roles in positive culture	128

4.4.4	Educators', learners' and principals' opinions regarding educators' roles in positive culture	131
4.4.5	Educators', learners' and principals' opinions regarding learners' roles in positive culture	133
4.4.6	Educators', learners' and principals' opinions regarding parents' roles in positive culture	135
4.4.7	The improvement of schools	137
4.4.8	Total Quality Management principles	139
4.4.9	Deming Fourteen points for culture change	141
4.4.10	Opinions regarding TQM principles for continuous improvements	143
4.4.11	Quality of work life	144
4.4.12	Resistance to change	145
4.4.13	Opinions regarding indicators for the implementation of TQM for schools	146
4.4.14	Principals' opinions regarding benchmarking	147
<b>4.5</b>	<b>Summary</b>	<b>148</b>
<b>CHAPTER 5: SUMMARY, CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS</b>		
<b>5.1</b>	<b>Introduction</b>	<b>154</b>
<b>5.2</b>	<b>Summary of preceding chapters</b>	<b>154</b>
5.2.1	Problem statement and research findings	155
<b>5.3</b>	<b>A TQM Intervention Framework for SA schools</b>	<b>164</b>
5.3.1	Vision/mission	166
5.3.2	Objectives	167
5.3.3	Strategy	170
5.3.4	TQM pillars	174
5.3.5	Culture change	177
5.3.6	Lifelong learning	179
<b>5.4.</b>	<b>How to use the framework</b>	<b>181</b>
<b>5.5</b>	<b>Conclusion</b>	<b>183</b>

<b>5.6</b>	<b>Limitations of the study</b>	<b>184</b>
<b>5.7</b>	<b>Recommendations</b>	<b>184</b>
<b>5.8</b>	<b>Recommendations for further study</b>	<b>190</b>
<b>5.9</b>	<b>Summary</b>	<b>190</b>

**A list of figures**

<b>Figure</b>		<b>Page</b>
1.1	School improvement: A South African Context	5
2.1	Differentiation of COLTS into specialisation and autonomous priorities	38
3.1	The Five Pillars of TQM	49
3.2	A managed organisational change process	58
3.3	Results of a managed organisational change process	62
3.4	Success factors of the benchmarks	76
3.5	TQM model for school leadership	81
3.6	Productive learning cultures	83
3.7	Institutionalising TQM for managed change	89
3.8	BAU = TQM approach to TQM implementation	90
3.9	The interrelationship of theories and motivation	98
5.1	The TQM Intervention Framework	165

**A list of Tables**

Table	Page	
2.1	Pass rates of Grade 12 in black schools in the District D3	30
2.2	Relationship between COLTS and Tirisano	37
3.1	The three categories of control	51
3.2	A TQM implementation strategy for schools	93
4.1	Categories of respondents for the pilot study	109
4.2	The sum total sample of the population in the District D3	111
4.3	Gender of educators	114
4.4	Years of experience as educators	115
4.5	Present position at school	115
4.6	Highest qualification of educators	116
4.7	Management qualification of educators	116
4.8	Area of specialisation in different fields	117
4.9	School situation	117
4.10	Gender	118
4.11	Age	118
4.12	Field of study	119
4.13	Aggregate % of Grade 10 results	119
4.14	Dropout rates	120
4.15	Reasons for dropping out	121
4.16	Location of schools	122
4.17	Care giver	122
4.18	Biographical data and experience	123
4.19	Educators' opinions about character traits of positive COLTS	127
4.20	Learners' opinions about character traits of positive COLTS	127
4.21	Educators' opinions regarding principals' roles in positive COLTS	128
4.22	Learners' opinions regarding principals' roles in positive COLTS	128
4.23	Educators' opinions regarding educators' roles in positive COLTS	131
4.24	Learners' opinions regarding educators' roles in positive COLTS	131

4.25	Educators' opinions regarding learners' roles in positive COLTS	133
4.26	Learners' opinions regarding their own roles in positive COLTS	134
4.27	Educators' opinions regarding parents' roles in positive COLTS	135
4.28	Learners' opinions regarding their parents' roles in positive COLTS	135
4.29	Educators' opinions regarding efforts by schools in improving COLTS	137
4.30	Learners' opinions regarding efforts by schools in improving COLTS	137
4.31	Educators' opinions regarding TQM principles evident at schools	139
4.32	Learners' opinions regarding TQM principles evident at schools	139
4.33	Principals' opinions regarding TQM principles evident at schools	140
4.34	Educators' opinions regarding Deming Fourteen Points	141
4.35	Learners' opinions regarding Deming Fourteen Points	141
4.36	Principals' opinions regarding Deming Fourteen Points	142
4.37	Learners' opinions regarding elements of quality life	144
4.38	Educators' regarding variables about level of significant differences	149
4.39	Learners' regarding variables about level of significant differences	151