

**DECENTRALISING THE CODIFICATION OF
RULES IN A DECISION SUPPORT EXPERT
KNOWLEDGE BASE**

by

Erika de Kock

presented in partial fulfilment of the requirements for the degree

Master of Scientiae
(Computer Science)

in the

Faculty of Engineering, Built Environment and Information Technology
University of Pretoria

Promoter: Professor J.M. Bishop

March 2003

Abstract

Title: Decentralising the codification of rules in a decision support expert knowledge base
Author: Erika de Kock
Promoter: Professor J.M. Bishop
Department: Computer Science
University: University of Pretoria
Degree: Master of Scientiae (Computer Science)

The paradigm of Decision Support Systems (DSS) is to support decision-making, while an Expert System's (ES) major objective is to provide expert advice in specialised situations. Knowledge-Based DSS (KB-DSS), also called Intelligent Decision Support Systems (IDSS), integrate traditional DSS with the advances of ES. A KB-DSS' knowledge base usually contains knowledge expressed by an expert and captured by a knowledge engineer. The indirect transfer between the domain expert and the knowledge base through a knowledge engineer may lead to a long and inefficient knowledge acquisition process.

This thesis compares 11 DSS packages in search of a (KB-) DSS generator where domain experts can specify and maintain a Specific Decision Support System (SDSS) to assist users in making decisions. The proposed (KB-) DSS-generator is tested with a university and study-program prototype. Since course and study plan programs change intermittently, the (KB-) DSS' knowledge base enables domain experts to set and maintain their course and study plan rules without the assistance of a knowledge engineer. Criteria are set to govern the (KB-) DSS generator search process. Example knowledge base rules are inspected to determine if domain experts will be able to maintain a set of production rules used in a student registration advice system. By developing a prototype and inspecting knowledge base rules, it was found that domain experts would be able to maintain their knowledge in the decentralised knowledge base, on condition that the objects and attributes used in the rule base were first specified by a builder/programmer.

Keywords:

Decision Support, Decision Support Systems, Expert Systems, Knowledge-Based Decision Support Systems, Intelligent Decision Support Systems, Knowledge Management, Knowledge Representation, Decision Support Generator, Rule-Based Systems, Knowledge base

Acknowledgements

I thank the following companies, who kindly sent evaluation versions of their software packages:

- Arlington.
- Distributed Computing Sys
- Expert Choice Inc.
- ILOG
- Infoharvest Inc
- Intellix
- Stasoft
- Vanguard
- Rule Machines Corp, and
- The Haley Enterprise

I extend my appreciation to my promoter, Prof Judy Bishop, for her patience and encouragement, and to my friends: Dr Susan van Zweel, Mr James Thackrah and Mrs Alex Koutsouvelis who edited my use of language.

I acknowledge the financial assistance of the National Research Foundation under Grant No 2053401.

Contents

	<i>Page</i>
Abstract.....	ii
Acknowledgements	iii
Contents	iv
List of figures.....	vi
List of tables.....	viii
List of acronyms.....	ix
Chapter 1 – Introduction	1
1.1 Background and the state of existing knowledge	1
1.2 Motivation	2
1.3 Problem definition.....	2
1.4 Research hypothesis and objectives	4
1.5 Structure of the thesis	4
Chapter 2 - Knowledge-based Decision Support Systems	6
2.1 Knowledge-based Decision Support Systems, Decision Support Systems and Expert Systems.....	6
2.2 Decision Support Systems (DSS) and Knowledge-based Decision Support Systems (KB-DSS).....	7
2.3 Expert Systems (ES)	19
2.4 Knowledge-based Systems or Intelligent Support Systems	23
2.5 Confirming the Intelligent Systems approach	27
2.6 The future of DSS, ES and KB-DSS	30
Chapter 3 - Constructing a DSS.....	32
3.1 Building the DSS	32
3.2 Building an ES.....	37
3.3 Building a KB-DSS	37
Chapter 4 - Constructing the advice KB-DSS	41
4.1 Selecting a suitable KB-DSS generator	41
4.2 Software packages evaluated	41
4.3 Comparison.....	50

University of Pretoria etd – De Kock, E (2003)

4.4	An advice system for student registration.....	53
4.5	The application prototyped.....	61
Chapter 5 - A broader perspective to Decision Support Systems		74
5.1	Introduction	74
5.2	Decision-making and models	81
5.3	Understanding Decision Support Systems	83
5.4	Architecture of a DSS	90
5.5	Integrating the DSS in the organisation	101
5.6	A more comprehensive view of organisational decision-making.....	102
5.7	The future of DSS.....	103
Chapter 6 - Expert Systems and knowledge acquisition		107
6.1	Expert System definitions	107
6.2	Architecture of ES.....	112
6.3	ES and expert shells	121
6.4	Knowledge acquisition and knowledge base construction	122
6.5	Summary	124
Chapter 7 - Evaluating the prototype.....		126
7.1	Evaluating DSS.....	126
7.2	ES quality and validation	129
7.3	Testing and evaluation of the KB-DSS	134
7.4	Evaluating the prototype.....	137
7.5	Summary	139
Chapter 8 - Conclusions and final remarks		140
Bibliography		142
Appendix A – Sample rules.....		146
	External rules file generated from the syntactic editor used as input to the application.....	146
	The syntactical mode of the syntactic editor: rules from data/F02133221.ilr.....	158

List of figures

	<i>Page</i>
Figure 1-1	A conceptual model of Decision Support Systems (Turban 1995)3
Figure 1-2	Turban’s (1995) DSS model modified to include the focus of this study...3
Figure 2-1	The Decision-making/Modelling Process (Turban 1995; Turban et al 2001)8
Figure 2-2	Computerised support (MSS) for decision-making. IA - Intelligent Agents, ES= Expert Systems, EC = Electronic Commerce, DSS = Decision Support Systems, EIS = Executive Information Systems (Turban et al 2001)12
Figure 2-3	The characteristics and capabilities of DSS (Turban 1995).....13
Figure 2-4	Decision support framework showing the technology to be used (Turban et al 2001).....14
Figure 2-5	The DSS decision-making process (Shim et al 2002)14
Figure 2-6	Structure and process of an expert system (Turban et al 2001).....21
Figure 2-7	Expert shell architecture (Beynon-Davies 1991)22
Figure 2-8	Data flow diagram of a generic DSS (Mallach 1994).....23
Figure 2-9	Functional analysis of a KB-DSS application (Klein & Methlie 1995)26
Figure 2-10	Interaction between the user and the KB-DSS resources (Klein & Methlie 1995).....26
Figure 2-11	Transfer of information between resources and the application file (blackboard) (Klein & Methlie 1995)27
Figure 2-12	IS decision support spectrum (Mallach 1994)30
Figure 3-1	Phases in building a Decision Support System (Turban 1995).....34
Figure 3-2	The development process of a DSS constructed by end-users (Turban 1995)36
Figure 3-3	Methodology for the KB-DSS implementation process (Klein & Methlie 1995)40
Figure 4-1	Developing the business rules (Business Rule Studio1998)44
Figure 4-2	ILOG Builder's Agenda51
Figure 4-3	The ILOG Builder.....51
Figure 4-4	Interrelating Real World Example Fragments with model components (Haumer et al 1998)55
Figure 4-5	Context of the advice system.....56
Figure 4-6	Initial prototype of the student advice system in Delphi60
Figure 4-7	The user interface prototype after consulting the rules subsystem61
Figure 4-8	Working prototype of the advice system using ILOG JRules and Java..62
Figure 4-9	“What if” future semesters/years: Adding courses passed to results63

University of Pretoria etd – De Kock, E (2003)

Figure 4-10	Selection and Options after new "what-if" results	64
Figure 4-11	Using the textual mode of the syntactical editor.....	68
Figure 4-12	Using syntactic mode of the syntactical editor.....	68
Figure 4-13	A rule from the student advice prototype for a required course that has a prerequisite course	69
Figure 4-14	The textual mode of an example rule for the student advice system	70
Figure 4-15	Textual mode rule for a maximum number of 100 credits for level 100.	70
Figure 5-1	A knowledge model of planning and control (Finlay 1994)	77
Figure 5-2	Levels of information Requirements (Finlay 1994).....	77
Figure 5-3	Relationships between Decision Support Systems (Finlay 1994).....	86
Figure 5-4	Types of DSS (Finlay 1994).....	87
Figure 5-5	A new decision paradigm for DSS (Courtney 2001).....	102

List of tables

	<i>Page</i>
Table 2-1	Phases and Stages according to Finlay’s (1994) model for problem tackling.....9
Table 2-2	Concepts underlying DSS definitions (Turban 1995)12
Table 2-3	Information System Characteristics (Mallach 1994).....28
Table 4-1	Software Vendors and Decision Support packages.....42
Table 4-2	Summary of software selection criteria52
Table 4-3	Pre-registration rule categories57
Table 4-4	BSc Computer Science requirement rules58
Table 4-5	Rules governing the courses.....58
Table 4-6	Course characteristics59
Table 5-1	Preferred decision-making techniques for personality types: (Dean 1992 in Mallach 1994).....80
Table 5-2	Different decision-making styles and their preferred technique to decision-making (Sauter 1999).....81
Table 5-3	Representative Structured Management Science Problems and Tools (Turban et al 2001)83
Table 5-4	The emphasis associated with types of DSS (Finlay 1994)88
Table 5-5	DSS risk factors and integration process (Sprague & Carlson 1982)....101
Table 7-1	Examples of measures for DSS Evaluation (Sprague & Carlson 1982) 126
Table 7-2	A framework for KB-DSS (Klein & Methlie 1995).....135
Table 7-3	Examples of measures for DSS Evaluation (Sprague & Carlson 1982) 137

List of acronyms

4GL	Fourth Generation Languages
AHP	Analytical Hierarchy Process
AI	Artificial Intelligence
API	Application Programming Interface
BAL	Business Action Language
BOM	Business Object Model
BRS	Business Rule Studio
CBIS	Computer Based Information Systems
CBR	Case Based Reasoning
CDSS	Customer Decision Support Systems
COM	Component Object Model
CSF	Critical Success Factors
DB	Databases
DBMS	Database Management System
DGMS	Dialogue Generation Management Software
DLL	Dynamic Link Library
DSS	Decision Support Systems
DTD	Document Type Definition
EC	Electronic Commerce
EDI	Electronic Data Interchange
EIS	Executive Information Systems
ES	Expert Systems
GDSS	Group Decision Support Systems
GSS	Group Systems Support
GUI	Graphical User Interface
IA	Intelligent Agents
IDDS	Intelligent Decision Support Systems
IRD	Information Requirement Definition
IRS	Information Reporting Systems
IS	Information Systems
ISP	Internet Service Provider
ISS	Intelligent Support Systems
IT	Information Technology
JESS	Java Expert System Shell
JVM	Java Virtual Machine
K-T method	Kepner-Tregoe method/process
KB	Knowledge Base
KB-DSS	Knowledge-based Decision Support Systems

University of Pretoria etd – De Kock, E (2003)

LAN	Local Area Network
LHS	Left-hand-side
MBMS	Model Base Management Software
MINTS	Management Intelligent Systems
MIS	Management Information Systems
MSS	Management Support Systems
NL	Natural Language
NLP	Natural Language Processing
PIM	Personal Information Systems
OAV	Object Attribute Values
OCX	ActiveX control
ODBC	Open Database Connectivity
OIS	Office Information Systems
OLAP	Online analytical Processing
OLE	Object Linking and Embedding
OOSM	Object-Oriented Structured Modelling
OOSML	Object-Oriented Structured Modelling Language
PRL	Production Rule Language
R&D	Research-and-Development
RDBMS	Relational Database Management Systems
SDLC	Systems Development Life Cycle
SDSS	Specific Decision Support System
SGML	Standard Generalised Mark-up Language
SIS	Storage Information Systems
SM	Structured Modelling
SQL	Structured Query Language
TD	Approval of Dean
TDH	Approval of Head of Department
TPS	Transaction Processing Systems
RAD	Rapid Application Development
RBR	Rule-Based Reasoning
RMI	Remote Method Invocation
RWE	Real world Example
UIMS	User Interface Management System
URL	Uniform Resource Link
VRS	Visual Rule Studio
WA	Work Area
Web	World Wide Web
WM	Working memory
XML	Extensible Mark-up Language