

Acknowledgements

Serial murder revisited: a psychological exploration of two South African cases

To Dave Beyers, friend, colleague and promoter, for his endless support and ability to put up with me in general (that's a joke Dave)

Gérard Nicholas Labuschagne

To Carlos De Meillon, for his friendship and assistance in the research process

Submitted in partial fulfilment of the requirements for the degree

The Department of Criminology, for their support and cooperation in this research endeavour.

Philosophiae Doctor

To the many individuals who participated in this research, for allowing me to put up with their "other" side.

in the

Faculty of Humanities

University of Pretoria

Pretoria

Promoter: Professor Dave Beyers

February 2001

UNIVERSITEIT VAN PRETORIA



2161987

Acknowledgements

- To Dave Beyers, friend, colleague and promoter, for his endless support and ability to put up with me in general (that's a joke Dave).
- To Cobus Du Plessis for his friendship and assistance in the research procedures.
- The Department of Correctional Services for their support and cooperation in this research endeavour.
- To the two individuals who participated in this research, for allowing me to get to know their 'other' side.

Title: Serial murder revisited: a psychological exploration of two South African cases

Candidate: Gérard Nicholas Labuschagne

Promoter: Dave Beyers

Department: Psychology

Degree: Philosophiae Doctor

Date: February 2001

Summary

The phenomenon of serial murder has fascinated people for many years. Despite this fascination, the body of scientific knowledge surrounding this topic seems quite limited. Research is often based on second-hand and anecdotal sources of information and not on direct contact with the individuals who commit these crimes. Based on this information, assumptions are made about these individual's mental state and personality. This research which was undertaken is unique in that it is an in-depth look at two individuals who committed serial murder. The research design, grounded in interactional theory, makes use of unstructured interviews, an interactional analysis, and psychological tests such as the South African Wechsler Adult Intelligence Scale, Thematic Apperception Test, Millon Clinical Multiaxial Inventory-IIIed, Minnesota Multiphasic Personality Inventory 2nd Edition, and 16 Personality Factor Questionnaire in an attempt to try and come to a psychological understanding and interactional description of these two individuals' behaviour. In doing so it revisits what has already been said about this phenomenon, makes comparisons, and provides a brief theoretical view of the phenomenon as part of man's social order.

Key terminology

Serial murder

Interactional analysis

Interpersonal considerations

Minnesota Multiphasic Personality Inventory 2nd Edition

Millon Clinical Multiaxial Inventory- 3rd Edition

Reciprocal causality

Dysfunctional systems

Communication theory

Antisocial personality disorder

In- depth interviews

Titel: Serial murder revisited: a psychological exploration of two South African cases

Kandidaat: Gérard Nicholas Labuschagne

Departement: Sielkunde

Graad: Philosophiae Doctor

Datum: Februarie 2001

Opsomming

Vir baie jare is mense gefasineerd met die fenomeen van reeksmoorde. Ongeag hierdie fasinerings blyk die versamelde wetenskaplike kennis oor hierdie onderwerp egter beperk te wees. Navorsing is meesal gebaseer op tweedehandse en anekdotiese bronne en nie op grond van navorsingsgegewens wat gebaseer is op grond van kontak met die individue wat hierdie misdaad gepleeg het nie. Op hierdie grondslag word aannames gemaak oor individue wat reeksmoorde gepleeg het se geestestoestand en persoonlikhede. Die navorsing wat onderneem is, was egter uniek in dié sin dat twee individue wat reeksmoorde gepleeg het, deelgeneem het aan die in-diepte ondersoek wat geloods is. Die navorsingsontwerp gegrond op interaksionele teorie, het ongestruktureerde onderhoude, interaksionele analyses, en sielkundige toetse as navorsingsprosedures ingesluit. Die toetse wat gebruik is, was die Minnesota Multiphasic Personality Inventory 2de Uitgawe, Millon Clinical Multi-axial Inventory 3de Uitgawe, 16 Persoonlikheidsfaktor Vraelys, die Tematiese Appersepsie Toets en die Suid Afrikaanse Wechsler Intelligensie Skaal vir Volwassenes. Die doel van die ondersoek was om te poog om tot 'n sielkundige begrip en interaksionele beskrywing van hierdie twee individue se gedrag te kom. Op hierdie wyse het die navorsing die reeds bestaande kennis oor hierdie onderwerp nagegaan, vergelykings getref en kort teoretiese gedagtes gewissel oor hierdie fenomeen se betekenis as deel van 'n gemeenskap se sosiale orde.

Sleutelwoorde

Reeksmoorde

Interaksionele analise

Interpersoonlike oorwegings

Minnesota Multiphasic Personality Inventory 2de Uitgawe

Millon Clinical Multiaxial Inventory 3de Uitgawe

Wederkerige oorsaaklikheid

Disfunksionele sisteme

kommunikasie teorie

Antisosiale persoonlikheidsverstruring

In- diepte onderhoude

Contents

Acknowledgements	i
Summary	ii
Key terminology	iii
Opsomming	iv
Sleutelwoorde	v
Contents	vi
List of tables	xviii
List of figures	xix
Chapter 1: About this study	
1.1 Introduction	1
1.2 Previous studies	1
1.3 Aims of this study	2
1.4 The researcher and co- researchers	3
1.5 Method	3
1.6 Confidentiality and ethical considerations	4
1.7 Outlay of the thesis	5
Chapter 2: Serial murder: a literature survey	
2.1 Introduction	6
2.2 Epidemiology	8
2.3 Types of murder	10
2.4 Definition of serial murder	10
2.5 The serial murderer and the victim	13

2.5.1 Developmental themes in the serial murderer	14
2.5.2 Diagnosis: mad or bad?	20
2.5.3 Victims	25
2.6 Modus operandi, crime scene and signature	26
2.7 Serial murder and gender	27
2.8 Serial murder and its effects of the communities	30
2.9 Serial murder and technology	32
2.10 The role of profiling in serial murder	34
2.11 The role of different disciplines	37
2.11.1 Perspectives on crime and violence	38
2.11.1.1 The Classical School	38
2.11.1.2 The Positivist School	40
2.11.1.3 The Marxist View	41
2.11.1.4 Biological and physiological theories of crime	42
2.11.1.5 Psychiatric and psychological explanations of crime	47
2.11.1.6 Sociological theories of crime	55
2.12 Serial murder in South Africa	62
2.13 Conclusion	63
Chapter 3: Interactional theory	64
3.1 Introduction	64
3.2 Definition of interaction	64
3.3 Theoretical view	68
3.3.1 Reciprocal causality	68

3.3.2 Communicational concepts	69
3.3.3 Patterns of interaction	71
3.3.4 Relationship functioning	72
3.3.5 System functioning	73
3.3.6 Disordered behaviour	75
3.3.7 Dysfunctional systems	80
3.4 Conclusion	81
Chapter 4: Methodology	
4.1 Introduction	82
4.2 Aims of this research	82
4.3 Qualitative research	83
4.4 Designing the qualitative research	87
4.5 Procedures and methods	92
4.6 Tools used in the research process	94
4.6.1 Scrutiny of the competency to stand trial forensic evaluation file	94
4.6.2 Clinical impressions	95
4.6.3 The interview	95
4.6.4 Interactional analysis	96
4.6.5 The South African Wechsler Adult Intelligence Scale	99
4.6.6 Thematic Apperception Test	99
4.6.7 Millon Clinical Multiaxial Inventory IIIrd Edition	100
4.6.8 Minnesota Multiphasic Personality Inventory 2 nd Edition	100
4.6.9 The 16 Personality Factor Questionnaire	102

4.6.10 Integration	102
4.7 The South African Wechsler Adult Intelligence Scale	103
4.8 Projective techniques	104
4.8.1 Concepts involved in projective testing	104
4.8.2 Thematic Apperception Test	105
4.8.2.1 Using the TAT to assess level of object relations	107
4.8.2.2 Using the TAT to assess defence mechanisms	108
4.8.2.3 Reliability and validity of the TAT	108
4.9 The Millon Clinical Multiaxial Inventory III	109
4.9.1 Taxonomy	113
4.9.2 Instrumentation	118
4.9.2.1 Functional domains	118
4.9.2.2 Structural domains	119
4.9.2.3 Profile invalidity	121
4.9.2.4 Effects of demographic variables	121
4.9.2.5 Strengths and weaknesses	122
4.9.2.6 Clinical and research uses	123
4.10 The Minnesota Multiphasic Personality Inventory 2	123
4.10.1 Introduction	123
4.10.2 Administering the MMPI-2	124
4.10.3 Testability of the subject	124
4.10.4 International adaptations of the MMPI-2	125
4.10.5 The validity scales	126
4.10.5.1 Cannot Say (?) Score	127

4.10.5.2 The L- Scale	128
4.10.5.2.1 Summary of the descriptors for the L- Scale	130
4.10.5.3 The F- Scale	131
4.10.5.3.1 Summary of the descriptors for the F- Scale	132
4.10.5.4 The K- Scale	134
4.10.5.4.1 Summary of descriptors for the K- Scale	136
4.10.5.5 Back- page infrequency (Fb) Scale	138
4.10.5.6 Variable Response Inconsistency Scale (VRIN) and True Response Inconsistency Scale (TRIN)	138
4.10.5.7 The clinical scales	140
4.10.5.7.1 Scale 1: Hypochondriasis	140
4.10.5.7.2 Scale 2: Depression	142
4.10.5.7.3 Scale 3: Conversion hysteria	142
4.10.5.7.4 Scale 4: Psychopathic deviate	143
4.10.5.7.5 Scale 5: Masculinity- femininity	144
4.10.5.7.6 Scale 6: Paranoia	145
4.10.5.7.7 Scale 7: Psychasthenia	145
4.10.5.7.8 Scale 8: Schizophrenia	146
4.10.5.7.9 Scale 9: Hypomania	147
4.10.5.7.10 Scale 0: Social introversion	148
4.11 The 16 Personality Factor Questionnaire	149
4.12 Conclusion	149

Chapter 5: Results	151
5.1 Introduction	151
5.2 Individual number 1	151
5.2.1 Brief history and background	151
5.2.2 Clinical impressions	152
5.2.3 Test behaviour	152
5.2.4 Medical investigations previously conducted	152
5.2.5 Intelligence level	153
5.2.6 Interactional analysis	153
5.2.6.1 How does he speak?	153
5.2.6.2 How does he speak about the problem?	154
5.2.6.3 In what context does the problem appear?	155
5.2.6.4 What has been done to solve the problem?	155
5.2.6.5 Nature of person's relationships with people	155
5.2.6.6 Context of the interview	156
5.2.6.7 Strong points of person	156
5.2.6.8 Negative points	156
5.2.6.9 Effect of person on researchers	156
5.2.6.10 Summary of interactional analysis results	157
5.2.7 Thematic Apperception Test	158
5.2.7.1 Card 1	158
5.2.7.2 Card 2	159
5.2.7.3 Card 3BM	160
5.2.7.4 Card 4	160

5.2.7.5 Card 6BM	161
5.2.7.6 Card 7BM	161
5.2.7.7 Card 8BM	162
5.2.7.8 Card 10	162
5.2.7.9 Card 13MF	162
5.2.7.10 Summary of the TAT	163
5.2.8 Millon Clinical Multiaxial Inventory III Edition: Interpretive Report	163
5.2.8.1 Capsule summary	163
5.2.8.2 Response tendencies	166
5.2.8.3 Axis II: personality patterns	167
5.2.8.4 Axis I: clinical syndromes	168
5.2.8.5 Noteworthy responses	168
5.2.8.6 Possible DSM-IV multiaxial diagnoses	170
5.2.8.7 Summary of the MCMI-III	171
5.2.9 Minnesota Multiphasic Personality Inventory 2 nd Edition (MMPI-2)	173
5.2.9.1 Profile validity	173
5.2.9.2 Symptomatic pattern	174
5.2.9.3 Profile frequency	175
5.2.9.4 Profile stability	176
5.2.9.5 Interpersonal relations	176
5.2.9.6 Diagnostic considerations	177
5.2.9.7 Supplementary score report	179
5.2.9.8 Experimental content component scales (Ben- Porath & Sherwood)	182
5.2.9.9 Critical items	183

5.2.9.9.1 Acute Anxiety Scale (Koss- Butcher Critical Items)	184
5.2.9.9.2 Depressed Suicidal Ideation (Koss- Butcher Critical Items)	184
5.2.9.9.3 Threatened Assault (Koss- Butcher Critical Items)	185
5.2.9.9.4 Situational Stress Due to Alcoholism (Koss- Butcher Critical Items)	185
5.2.9.9.5 Mental Confusion	185
5.2.9.9.6 Persecutory Ideas (Koss- Butcher Critical Items)	185
5.2.9.9.7 Antisocial Attitude (Lachar- Wrobel Critical Items)	186
5.2.9.9.8 Family Conflict (Lachar- Wrobel Critical Items)	186
5.2.9.9.9 Somatic Symptoms (Lachar- Wrobel Critical Items)	187
5.2.9.9.10 Sexual Concern and Deviation (Lachar- Wrobel Critical Items)	187
5.2.9.10 Omitted Items	187
5.2.9.11 Summary of the MMPI-2	188
5.2.10 The 16 Personality Factor Questionnaire	190
5.2.10.1 Warnings	191
5.2.10.2 Broad clinical dimensions	191
5.2.10.3 Summary of the 16-PF	195
5.3 Individual number 2	196
5.3.1 Brief history and background	196
5.3.2 Clinical impressions	196
5.3.3 Test behaviour	197
5.3.4 Medical investigations previously conducted	197
5.3.5 Intelligence level	199
5.3.6 Interactional analysis	199
5.3.6.1 How does he speak?	199

5.3.6.2 How does he speak about the problem?	200
5.3.6.3 In what context does the problem appear?	201
5.3.6.4 What has been done to solve the problem?	201
5.3.6.5 Nature of person's relationships with people	201
5.3.6.6 Context of the interview	201
5.3.6.7 Strong points of person	202
5.3.6.8 Negative points	202
5.3.6.9 Effect of person on researchers	202
5.3.6.10 Summary of interactional analysis results	202
5.3.7 Thematic Apperception Test	203
5.3.7.1 Card 1	203
5.3.7.2 Card 2	205
5.3.7.3 Card 3BM	205
5.3.7.4 Card 4	206
5.3.7.5 Card 6BM	206
5.3.7.6 Card 7BM	207
5.3.7.7 Card 8BM	208
5.3.7.8 Card 10	208
5.3.7.9 Card 13MF	209
5.3.7.10 Central themes in individual number 2's Thematic Apperception Test	209
5.3.7.11 Summary of the TAT	210
5.3.8 Millon Clinical Multiaxial Inventory III Edition	211
5.3.8.1 Capsule summary	211
5.3.8.2 Response tendencies	213

5.3.8.3 Axis II: personality patterns	214
5.3.8.4 Axis I: clinical syndromes	216
5.3.8.5 Noteworthy responses	218
5.3.8.6 Possible DSM-IV multiaxial diagnoses	220
5.3.8.7 Summary of the MCMI-III	221
5.3.9 Minnesota Multiphasic Personality Inventory 2 nd Edition (MMPI-2)	225
5.3.9.1 Profile validity	225
5.3.9.2 Symptomatic pattern	227
5.3.9.3 Profile frequency	227
5.3.9.4 Profile stability	228
5.3.9.5 Interpersonal relations	228
5.3.9.6 Diagnostic considerations	229
5.3.9.7 Supplementary score report	231
5.3.9.8 Experimental content component scales (Ben- Porath & Sherwood)	234
5.3.9.9 Critical items	235
5.3.9.9.1 Acute Anxiety Scale (Koss- Butcher Critical Items)	236
5.3.9.9.2 Depressed Suicidal Ideation (Koss- Butcher Critical Items)	237
5.3.9.9.3 Threatened Assault (Koss- Butcher Critical Items)	237
5.3.9.9.4 Situational Stress Due to Alcoholism (Koss- Butcher Critical Items)	238
5.3.9.9.5 Mental Confusion	238
5.3.9.9.6 Persecutory Ideas (Koss- Butcher Critical Items)	239
5.3.9.9.7 Antisocial Attitude (Lachar- Wrobel Critical Items)	240
5.3.9.9.8 Family Conflict (Lachar- Wrobel Critical Items)	241
5.3.9.9.9 Somatic Symptoms (Lachar- Wrobel Critical Items)	241

5.3.9.9.10 Sexual Concern and Deviation (Lachar- Wrobel Critical Items)	242
5.3.9.10 Omitted Items	243
5.3.9.11 Summary of the MMPI-2	243
5.3.10 The 16 Personality Factor Questionnaire	245
5.3.10.1 Warnings	245
5.3.10.2 Broad clinical dimensions	246
5.3.10.3 Summary of the 16-PF	253
Chapter 6: Discussion of results, critique and conclusions	
6.1 Integration and summary of results for individual number 1	256
6.2 Integration and summary of results for individual number 2	259
6.3 Case similarities and literature comparison	262
6.4 An interactional conceptualisation of serial murder	265
6.4.1 Reciprocal causality	265
6.4.2 Communicational concepts	266
6.5 Ideas regarding serial murder as part of man's 'social order'	268
6.6 Critique and recommendations on the research	269
6.7 Recommendations regarding the field of serial murder	269
6.8 Conclusion	270
Reference list	271

List of Tables

Table 1: Percentages of characteristics for individuals who committed serial murder	18
Table 2: FBI criminal personality profile	36
Table 3: Postulates of the research paradigms	84
Table 4: Cut- off points for the L- scale	129
Table 5: Cut- off points for the F- scale	131
Table 6: Cut- off points for the K- scale	135
Table 7: Supplementary score report	179
Table 8: Experimental content component scales (Ben- Porath & Sherwood)	182
Table 9: The 16 Personality Factor Questionnaire	190
Table 10: Composite scales	194
Table 11: Supplementary score report	231
Table 12: Experimental content component scales (Ben- Porath & Sherwood)	234
Table 13: The 16 Personality Factor Questionnaire	245
Table 14: Composite scales	250

Chapter 1

List of Figures

Figure 1: MCMI Profile	166
Figure 2: MMPI-2 Validity Pattern	174
Figure 3: MMPI-2 Basic and Supplementary Scales Profile	178
Figure 4: MMPI-2 Content Scales Profile	179
Figure 5: MCMI Profile	213
Figure 6: MMPI-2 Validity Pattern	226
Figure 7: MMPI-2 Basic and Supplementary Scales Profile	230
Figure 8: MMPI-2 Content Scales Profile	231